

VISIONS OF UNITY
AFTER THE VISIGOTHS

VISIT...

LANZAROTE
Caliente.COM

CURSORMUNDI

*Cursor Mundi is produced under the auspices of the Center for
Medieval and Renaissance Studies, University of California, Los Angeles.*

Executive Editor

Blair Sullivan, *University of California, Los Angeles*

Editorial Board

Michael D. Bailey, *Iowa State University*

Christopher Baswell, *Columbia University and Barnard College*

Florin Curta, *University of Florida*

Elizabeth Freeman, *University of Tasmania*

Yitzhak Hen, *Ben-Gurion University of the Negev*

Lauren Kassell, *Pembroke College, Cambridge*

David Lines, *University of Warwick*

Cary Nederman, *Texas A&M University*

Teofilo Ruiz, *University of California, Los Angeles*

Previously published volumes in this series are listed at the back of the book.

VISIONS OF UNITY
AFTER THE VISIGOTHS

Early Iberian Latin Chronicles and
the Mediterranean World

by

Ksenia Bonch Reeves



BREPOLS

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

© 2016, **Brepols Publishers n.v., Turnhout, Belgium**

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

D/2016/0095/10

ISBN: 978-2-503-56509-5

DOI: 10.1484/M.CURSOR-EB.5.111940

e-ISBN: 978-2-503-57046-4

Printed on acid-free paper

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	ix
Abbreviations	xi
A Note on Texts	xiii
Introduction	1
After the Visigoths	4
Scope and Limits	10
Defining the Terms	21
The Mozarabic vs the Neo-Gothic	21
Spain or Iberia?	24
Rethinking Uniqueness	37
Approaching the Chronicle	41
Chapter 1. The Epic's Poor Cousins: Mediaeval Iberian Latin Chronicles in Twentieth-Century Philology	47
Chapter 2. The Mozarabic Chronicles, Islam, and the Mediterranean Apocalyptic	71
The Mozarabic Historiographical Enigma	73
Visigothic Spain and the Mediterranean	80
Peripheral Visions	87
Narrating the Apocalypse	93

Chapter 3. Between the Emirate and the Holy Land: Eulogius of Córdoba, the Culture of Martyrdom, and the Ideology of Iberian Cohesion	113
Seeking Unity in Times of Flux	118
Mediterranean Connections	125
Eulogius's Iberian Foundations	133
Eulogius's Logical Impasse and its Aftermath	144
Chapter 4. Visigothic Law, Sovereignty, and North-Eastern Iberian Political Rivalry in the Asturian Chronicle Tradition	153
Questioning Asturias	156
Asturias and its Political Neighbours: A Crowded Landscape	163
<i>Reges et leges</i> : Defining Legitimacy	170
Lawful Narratives	184
Chapter 5. Revisiting the Reconquest in Eleventh- and Twelfth-Century Leonese Chronicles: A Holy War or a Just War?	195
Locating the Muslims in Leonese Chronicles	202
Framing the Reconquest: Visigothic Political Thought Prior to 711	206
Ideologies of the Reconquest in Asturias-León	212
Chapter 6. Toward a Philosophy of Unity in Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada's <i>Historia de rebus Hispanie</i>	223
Castile: Toward a New Unity	229
Rodrigo and the Post-Gothic	250
Conclusion: In Search of Continuity	261
Select Bibliography	267
Index	275

Danieli magna cum dilectione

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is the result of several years of work during which I was fortunate to benefit from the wise counsel and support of many people. I would be remiss if I did not mention Benito Brancaforte, who first taught me to employ critical instruments that best respond to the demands of a text; Ivy Corfis, who introduced me to mediaeval Spanish chronicles; and John Nitti, whose passion for mediaeval Spanish manuscripts continues to illuminate my academic path. During the many years I worked on this project, I also benefited from the generous advice and encouragement of many individuals, including Jesús Rodríguez Velasco, Pablo Pastrana-Pérez, José Manuel Pérez-Prendes y Muñoz de Arraco, and Geraldo Sousa. In addition, I have been inspired by the work of Cyrille Aillet, Roger Collins, Luis A. García Moreno, Sidney H. Griffith, Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, José Eduardo López Pereira, Georges Martin, Lucy K. Pick, and Margarita Vallejo Girvés, among many others. Needless to say, none of the above-mentioned individuals bear any responsibility whatsoever for any and all of the flaws of this work.

The completion of this project would not have been possible without support from the College of Liberal Arts at Wright State University as well as my Department Chairs — David Garrison, Stefan Pugh, and Marie Hertzler, whose encouragement and flexibility in scheduling assignments have been invaluable in bringing this project to conclusion. The archival research has been made possible with grants from the Committee for Cultural Cooperation between Spain's Ministry of Culture and United States' Universities and the Office of Research and Sponsored Programs at Wright State University. I would also like to thank José Luis del Valle Merino of the Real Biblioteca del Monasterio de El Escorial for invaluable help and guidance in accessing chronicle manuscripts.

I would like to gratefully acknowledge the Editorial Board and the anonymous reviewers of the *Cursor Mundi* Series for the enormously helpful critique

of the manuscript; Guy Carney, Publishing Manager at Brepols for his expert guidance throughout the publication process; Tim Barnwell of Brepols, for meticulous copyediting; and Andrey Tolstoy for help in the elaboration of this manuscript. Finally, my most heartfelt thanks go to Alexandra, Victor, Nina, Angela, Laurie, Diane, Dan, Thomas, and Alec: this project would not have been possible without their love and support.

ABBREVIATIONS

<i>AEM</i>	<i>Anuario de Estudios Medievales</i>
<i>AM</i>	<i>Asturiensia Medievalia</i>
<i>AHDE</i>	<i>Anuario de Historia del Derecho Español</i>
<i>BH</i>	<i>Bulletin Hispanique</i>
<i>BHS</i>	<i>Bulletin of Hispanic Studies</i>
<i>BRABL</i>	<i>Boletín de la Real Academia de Buenas Letras de Barcelona</i>
<i>BRAH</i>	<i>Boletín de la Real Academia de la Historia</i>
<i>CA</i>	<i>Crónicas asturianas. Crónica de Alfonso III (Rotense y 'A Sebastián'). Crónica Albeldense (y 'Profética')</i> , ed. by Juan Gil Fernández, José Luis Moralejo, and Juan Ignacio Ruiz de la Peña, Universidad de Oviedo, Publicaciones del Departamento de Historia y Arte, Área de Historia Medieval, 11 (Oviedo: Universidad de Oviedo, 1985)
<i>CCCM</i>	<i>Corpus Christianorum, Continuatio Mediaevalis</i>
<i>CCM</i>	<i>Cahiers de civilization médiévale</i>
<i>CCSL</i>	<i>Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina</i>
<i>CHE</i>	<i>Cuadernos de Historia de España</i>
<i>CLCHM</i>	<i>Cahiers de linguistique et de civilization hispaniques médiévale</i>
<i>CLHM</i>	<i>Cahiers de linguistique hispanique médiévale</i>

CSCO	Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium
CSIC	Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas
CSM	<i>Corpus Scriptorum Muzarabicorum</i> , ed. by Juan Gil, 2 vols (Madrid: CSIC, Instituto Antonio de Nebrija, 1973)
EME	<i>Early Medieval Europe</i>
HS	<i>Hispania Sacra</i>
JMIS	<i>Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies</i>
MGH, AA	<i>Monumenta Germaniae Historica</i> , Auctores Antiquissimi
MGH, Capit. Reg. Fr.	<i>Monumenta Germaniae Historica</i> , Capitularia Regum Francorum
MGH, SS. Rer. Germ.	<i>Monumenta Germaniae Historica</i> , Scriptores Rerum Germanicarum
PL	<i>Patrologiae Cursus Completus. Series Latina</i> , ed. by Jacques-Paul Migne, 221 vols (Paris, 1844–64)
RABM	<i>Revista de Archivos, Bibliotecas y Museos</i>
RFE	<i>Revista de Filología Española</i>
RFH	<i>Revista de Filología Hispánica</i> (Buenos Aires)
RHM	<i>Revista Hispánica Moderna</i>
RLM	<i>Revista de Literatura Medieval</i>
SEMYR	Seminario de Estudios Medievales y Renacentistas, Universidad de Salamanca, Salamanca, Spain
Settimane	Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto medioevo (Spoleto: Centro Italiano di Studi sull'Alto Medioevo, 1954–)

A NOTE ON TEXTS

In keeping with the focus of this book, all primary texts, with a handful of exceptions, are listed under their Latin titles. English titles are preferred wherever they reflect the current state of scholarship regarding the chronicles' provenance and date of composition. Thus, the titles of the Mozarabic texts *Chronicle of 741* and *Chronicle of 754* are preferred over the *Chronica Byzantia-Arabica* and the *Chronica Muzarabica* respectively, in recognition of the current consensus about the Iberian origin of both chronicles. I refer to the Asturian *Chronicle of Alfonso III* by its English title, rather than by the Latin *Chronica Adefonsi*, in order to clearly distinguish this text from the Leonese-Castilian *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*.

Since 2012, scholars affiliated with the SEMH-Sorbonne (Séminaire d'études médiévales hispaniques directed by Georges Martin) and its online journal *e-Spania* have vigorously contested the imprecise nature of the title of the *Historia Silensis*. Compelling arguments have been put forth that the traditional title incorrectly points to the Castilian monastery of Silos as the place of composition, currently believed to have actually been León.¹ I maintain the newly proposed title *Historia Legionensis* alongside the traditional *Historia Silensis*.

The mediaeval Latin spelling of original quotations is preserved (for example, 'eclesia' vs the normative 'ecclesia' in some cases). Translations are mine, with the following exceptions: for John of Biclar's *Chronicle*, Isidore's *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, the *Chronicle of 754* (*Chronica Muzarabica*), and the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, I use the second revised edi-

¹ See, for example, Georges Martin, 'Ordoño Sisnández, autor de la *Historia legionensis* (llamada *silensis*). Notas histórico-filológicas sobre un fundador', *e-Spania* [online], online since 13 September 2012, DOI: 10.4000/e-spania.21711).

tion of *Conquerors and Chronicles of Early Medieval Spain*, trans., notes, and introd. by Kenneth Baxter Wolf, Translated Texts for Historians, 9 (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1990); for the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, I follow the *Chronicle of Alfonso the Emperor: A Translation of the Chronica Adefonsi imperatoris, with Study and Notes*, ed. by Glenn Edward Lipskey (Evanston, IL: Northwestern University, 1972). Translations of Prudentius are sourced from *Prudentius*, trans. by Henry J. Thomson, The Loeb Classical Library, 398, 2 vols (London: Heinemann, 1979), II.

The following editions are used for citations of original texts:

Visigothic Chronicles

- Isidore, archbishop of Seville, *Chronica*, in *Sancti Isidori, Hispalensi episcopi, opera omnia*, ed. by Faustino Arévalo, *PL*, LXXXIII (Turnhout: Brepols, 1807), pp. 1017–58
 —, *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, in *Las Historias de los godos, vándalos y suevos de Isidoro de Sevilla*, ed. and trans. by Cristóbal Rodríguez Alonso, Fuentes y estudios de historia leonesa, 13 (León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación ‘San Isidoro’, Archivo Histórico Diocesano, Caja de Ahorros y Monte de Piedad de León, 1975)
 John of Biclar, *Chronicle*, in ‘La Crónica de Juan Biclarense: versión castellana y notas para su estudio’, ed. by Pablo Alvarez Rubiano, *Analecta Sacra Tarraconensia*, 16 (1943), 7–38
 Julian of Toledo, *Historia Wambae*, in *Sancti Iuliani Toletanae sedis episcopi opera. Pars I*, ed. by Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, *CCSL*, 115 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1976), pp. 214–55

Mozarabic Chronicles and Hagiographical Texts

- Chronica Byzantia-Arabica*, in *CSM*, I, 7–15
Cronica Mozárabe de 754, ed. and trans. by José Eduardo López Pereira (Zaragoza: Anubar Ediciones, 1980)
 Eulogius of Córdoba, *Memoriale sanctorum*, in *CSM*, II, 363–458
 —, *Documentum Martyriale*, in *CSM*, II, 459–74
 —, *Apologeticus martyrurum*, in *CSM*, II, 475–94
 Paul Alvar, *Indiculus luminosus*, in *CSM*, I, 270–314

Asturian Chronicles

- Chronica Albeldensia*, in *CA*, pp. 153–88
Chronicle of Alfonso III, versions *Rotensis* and *Ad Sebastianum*, in *CA*, pp. 114–49
Prophetic Chronicle, in *CA*, pp. 182–87

Leonese Chronicles

- Historia Silense*, ed. by Justo Pérez de Urbel and Atilano González Ruiz-Zorrilla (Madrid: Escuela de Estudios Medievales, 1959)
- Lucas, bishop of Tuy, *Lucae Tudensis Chronicon mundi*, ed. by Emma Falque Rey, CCCM, 74 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003)
- Pelayo, bishop of Oviedo, *Crónica del obispo don Pelayo*, ed. by Benito Sánchez Alonso (Madrid: Imprenta de los sucesores de Hernando, 1924)
- Sampiro, *Chronicle*, in *Sampiro, su crónica y la monarquía leonesa en el siglo X*, ed., study, and notes by Justo Pérez de Urbel (Madrid: CSIC, 1952)

Leonese-Castilian Chronicles

- Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, in *Chronica hispana saeculi XII. Pars I*, ed. by Emma Falque, Juan Gil, and Antonio Maya, CCCM, 71 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1995), pp. 109–248
- Chronica Naiarensis*, in *Chronica Najerense*, ed. and study by Antonio Ubieto Arteta, 2nd edn (Zaragoza: Anubar, 1985)

Castilian Chronicles

- Jiménez de Rada, Rodrigo, *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, in *Roderici Ximenii de Rada Historia de rebus Hispaniae siue Historia gothica*, ed. by Juan Fernández Valverde, CCCM, 72 C (Turnhout: Brepols, 1987)
- Juan, bishop of Osma, *Chronica latina regum Castellae*, in *Crónica latina de los Reyes de Castilla*, ed. and trans. by Luis Charlo Brea (Madrid: Ediciones Akal, 1999)

INTRODUCTION

Late spring can be a chilly and rainy time of year in the small principality of Asturias in north-western Spain. The travelling season has not yet begun and a thick mist covers the mountaintops, but traffic is steady on a narrow serpentine road that snakes its way up the Peaks of Europe. Curious visitors and the devout from all over Spain and abroad flock to a Catholic sanctuary built in one of the most unlikely of places: a natural cavern sitting above a water stream that plummets from an imposing rock cliff into the River Sella below. We would know little about the historical significance of this place had it not been for an anonymous late ninth-century chronicle that portrays this geological formation as the site where Christians, protected by divine providence, won an important battle over Muslim troops around the year AD 722 — allegedly their first victory since Arabs and Berbers overran the Iberian Peninsula in AD 711.¹ For many today, these texts are evidence that the reconquest of Spain from the Muslims began here, and the cave at Covadonga, as it is known, represents the birthplace of Spain as a nation.

Since the last quarter of the twentieth century, as Spain completed its transformation to a democracy, an intense discussion has been underway about the true relationship between the country's mediaeval origins and the creation, dissemination, and appropriation of the Spanish national idea in modern times. But as Bernard F. Reilly points out, despite the central role attributed to the Middle Ages in the formation of Spanish political thought, 'the [...] attempts of the past chroniclers of the peninsula themselves to comprehend their own heritage have often been neglected, or overshadowed, by more modern preoc-

¹ *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, versions *Rotensis* and *Ad Sebastianum*, pp. 122–29.

cupations'.² Conceived from the post-national perspective of Mediterranean studies, which regards Christian power centres in religious, diplomatic, and cultural contact with communities on the Iberian Peninsula and beyond, this study highlights the problematic nature of regarding mediaeval Iberian society from the perspective of a modern-day political entity called Spain, when applied to that country's earliest and least studied narrative testimonies — its early chronicles and histories, the principal sources of Iberian political thought prior to the thirteenth century.³

Because they have long been seen as the first 'national' histories of Spain, the grand thirteenth-century Latin historical compilations, Lucas of Tuy's *Chronicon Mundi* (1236) and Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada's *Historia de rebus Hispanie* (1243–46), as well as subsequent Castilian histories, have traditionally received a great deal of critical attention. The recent surge of interest in mediaeval models of royal legitimation has also helped bring twelfth-century Leonese and Castilian Latin chronicles and histories such as the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, and the *Chronica Naiarensis* into critical focus.⁴ By contrast, although they played an essential role in the formation of post-Visigothic political ideologies, chronicle texts composed between the mid-eighth and late ninth centuries continue to remain somewhat enigmatic from the point of view of their ideological underpinnings. Despite — and likely because of — the extensive use and manipulation of these earlier texts in later historical compilations, they have not yet been sufficiently appreciated as true innovators of the historiographical genre on the Iberian Peninsula, either.⁵

² Bernard F. Reilly, 'Bishop Lucas of Tuy and the Latin Chronicle Tradition in Iberia', *The Catholic Historical Review*, 93 (2007), 767–88 (p. 770). On the importance of the Middle Ages to the modern-day ideology of Spanish nationalism, see Peter Linehan, 'Religion, Nationalism and National Identity in Medieval Spain and Portugal', *Studies in Church History*, 18 (1982), 161–99 (repr. in Peter Linehan, *The Process of Politics and the Rule of Law. Studies on the Iberian Kingdoms and Papal Rome in the Middle Ages* (London: Ashgate, 1983), pp. 161–99); Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, 'Spanish Historiography and Iberian Reality', *History and Theory*, 24 (1985), 23–43.

³ See Manuel A. Rodríguez de la Peña, 'Ideología política y crónicas monásticas: la concepción cluniacense de la realeza en la España del siglo XII', *AEM*, 30 (2000), 681–734 (p. 682).

⁴ The major outlet for studies of Leonese and Castilian Latin chronicle production is the online journal *e-Spania: Revue interdisciplinaire d'études hispaniques médiévales et modernes*, directed by Georges Martin of the Université Paris-Sorbonne <<http://e-spania.revues.org/>>.

⁵ The most comprehensive studies of early Iberian chronicles include José Eduardo López Pereira, *Estudio crítico sobre la Crónica Mozárabe de 754* (Zaragoza: Anubar, 1980) and its expanded version, *Continuatio isidoriana hispana: crónica mozárabe de 754*, Fuentes y estudios de historia leonesa, 127 (León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación San Isidoro, Caja España

This book undertakes a chronological examination of these post-Visigothic Iberian Latin historiographical testimonies, viewed collectively as a narrative practice defined by a search for an ideologically effective model of unity and institutional continuity. This practice is not seen from the perspective of Spain's eventual unification into a modern-day nation state but rather as a form of support for those post-Visigothic centres of power and learning that necessitated effective ideological platforms as they pursued local political objectives. These ideologically charged narratives played a fundamental role in negotiating the enduringly complex relationship between Iberian unity and diversity. Indeed, if there is a central and recurring feature in the corpus of sometimes fragmentary, often terse, and largely anonymous early mediaeval Iberian chronicles and histories it is the power and consistency with which these texts evoke memories of an Iberian Peninsula politically and confessionally unified by the Visigoths, while at the same time grappling with the conflicting demands of its diversity and political fragmentation.

I approach these texts from the vantage point of exploring patterns of narrative structure and style — one of the least studied aspects of chronicle writing in mediaeval Iberia, yet a crucial one in furthering our understanding of the scope and purpose of these texts as tools supporting Christian survival in Arab-dominated lands and the emergence of new centres of power and sovereignty in the post-Visigothic Iberian Peninsula. By examining several strands of narrative from their origins until the mid-thirteenth century, when they were purposely manipulated by Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada to create a Castile-centric ideology of peninsular unity, I highlight ways in which Iberian Latin chronicle culture underwent constant renovation in contact with a variety of non-chronicle genres and traditions that developed on the Iberian Peninsula and beyond. I interpret this ongoing contact between Iberian Latin textual communities and the broader Mediterranean as central to both the development of Iberian historical mythology and its historiographical renovation.

de Inversiones, Archivo Histórico Diocesano, 2009); José Ignacio Ruiz de la Peña, 'La cultura de la corte ovetense en el siglo IX', in *CA*, pp. 1–42. On the urgency of the study of ideological dimensions in representations of power produced before the thirteenth century, see José Manuel Nieto Soria, 'Ideología y poder monárquico en la Península', in *La Historia Medieval en España. Un balance historiográfico (1968–1998). Actas de la XXV Semana de Estudios medievales de Estella. 14 a 18 de julio de 1998*, ed. by Angel J. Martín Duque (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, Departamento de Educación y Cultura, 1999), pp. 335–82 (pp. 378–80), and José Angel García de Cortázar y Ruiz de Aguirre, 'Glosa de un balance sobre la historiografía española de los últimos treinta años', in *La Historia Medieval*, ed. by Martín Duque, pp. 807–24 (pp. 809 and 824).

After the Visigoths

For anyone concerned with the mediaeval origins of the ideologies of unity and sovereignty, Spain — ‘a country [...] that has persistently sought, and never quite succeeded, in reconciling the conflicting demands of unity and diversity in its own territory’ — is a particularly intriguing locus of investigation.⁶ When comparing Visigothic society (AD 507–711) with other formerly barbarian kingdoms, such as Anglo-Saxon England, Merovingian France, and Lombard Italy, Roger Collins remarks on two salient features of the Iberian Peninsula, both unique in Western Europe: (1) its unprecedented degree of political unity under a single source of secular authority despite poor communications between the centre and the periphery and enormous geographical and cultural diversity, and (2) the remarkable doctrinal and liturgical authority wielded by its bishops by the last quarter of the seventh century.⁷ Stanley Payne credits Isidore, the archbishop of Seville (AD c. 560–636), with a crucial political and ideological role in this process, since this influential thinker and statesman was the first to define the Visigothic kingdom as a ‘totally independent state — not beholden to Rome or to the Eastern Roman Empire’, one that possessed a coherent ideology, a precisely defined geographical territory, and an idea of a Christian monarchy. In Payne’s view,

the Visigothic monarchy represented as fully developed a political and religious model as could be found in the West. Moreover, the Visigothic form of society — the military aristocracy — would remain the dominant elite form of Spain for the next millennium and more, until the nineteenth century.⁸

However, this fragile and likely superficial political and religious unification of the Iberian Peninsula proved to be short-lived. Briefly achieved by the Visigoths in the seventh century and heralded by Isidore of Seville in the *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum* (c. 619–24) and by Julian of Toledo in

⁶ John H. Elliott, *History in the Making* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2012), p. 39. See also Roger Collins, *Early Medieval Spain: Unity in Diversity, 400–1000*, New Studies in Medieval History (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 1995), and Roger Collins, *Caliphs and Kings: Spain, 796–1031* (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012).

⁷ Roger Collins, *The Arab Conquest of Spain: 711–97* (Cambridge, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 1994; first publ. 1989), pp. 8–9. See also Sam Koon and Jamie Wood, ‘Unity from Disunity: Law, Rhetoric and Power in the Visigothic Kingdom’, *European Review of History: Revue européenne d’histoire*, 16 (2009), 793–808.

⁸ Stanley Payne, *Spain: A Unique History* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011), p. 55.

the *Historia Wambae* (c. 675), it was promptly overturned by the Arab invasion in 711–18. The rapid northward advances of Arab troops in the second decade of the eighth century resulted in the establishment of the Umayyad regime in Córdoba — first as an emirate (756) and later as a caliphate (976), which eventually broke up into rival *taifa* kingdoms after 1031. These factors, as well as subsequent Arab incursions (by the Almoravids in 1086 and the Almohads in 1147), meant that what we call ‘Spain’ today would not become even a superficially unified society again in the Middle Ages. Until, on the one hand, the collapse of the Almohad caliphate following a dynastic crisis that occurred in the first quarter of the thirteenth century, and, on the other hand, a string of victories beginning with the 1212 battle at Navas de Tolosa that cleared the way for the reconquest of Córdoba (1236), Seville (1248), and eventually Granada (1492) in the Iberian south, the Iberian Peninsula was a fragmented and chaotic place where, in addition to Muslims and Christians competing with each other for domination, rivalries often sprang up between religious brethren and political alliances of convenience were made across religious boundaries.⁹

Although the Visigothic state vanished in the early eighth century, the Visigoths survived and, long after they had ceased to be the dominant political force on the Iberian Peninsula, their descendants manifested a great deal of pride in their Gothic heritage and its only remaining institutional pillar, the Visigothic Church.¹⁰ While their range of reactions to Muslim domination varied from reconciliation by many to active resistance by a few, the earliest of the surviving post-Visigothic chronicle testimonies, composed in the mid-eighth century, share the acknowledgement of the *translatio imperii* to the Arabs and the narrative appropriation of Old Testament apocalyptic eschatology as a means to grapple with the magnitude of the political loss.¹¹ These constants will continue to colour historiographical narratives of those Iberian Christians who lived under Muslim rule in al-Andalus, the term Arabs used to designate the Iberian territory they had conquered. From the mid-eighth until the mid-ninth centuries, as Andalusí Christian communities faced growing Arabization and

⁹ See Francisco García Fitz, ‘Was Las Navas a Decisive Battle?’, *JMIS*, 4 (2012), 5–9.

¹⁰ Luis A. García Moreno, ‘Spanish Gothic Consciousness among the Mozarabs in al-Andalus (VIIIth–Xth Centuries)’, in *The Visigoths: Studies in Culture and Society*, ed. by Alberto Ferreiro (Leiden: Brill, 1999), pp. 303–23; Luis A. García Moreno, ‘Etnia goda y la iglesia hispana’, *HS*, 54 (2002), 415–42; Juan Gil, ‘Aproximación a la literatura latina de los mozárabes’, in *Actas del I Congreso Nacional de Cultura Mozárabe*, org. by Schola Gregoriana Cordubensis (Córdoba: Publicaciones Obra Social y Cultural Cajasur, 1996), pp. 89–104 (p. 89).

¹¹ See Chapters 2, 3, and 4 of this study.

Islamization, a vocal minority consisting of clerics, monks, and laymen formulated an ideology of resistance to Islam and Arabization based on the superiority of Christian doctrine and adherence to the Latin language. Such resistance took the form of voluntary self-sacrifices known as the movement of Cordovan martyrs. Although the movement was soon extinguished, it serves as an example of an organized effort to preserve the continuity of Visigothic identity and a cohesive Christian community.¹²

The Christians of the Iberian north-west, on the other hand, initially appeared to have manifested a less solid connection to the Visigothic past than their Andalusi co-religionists. And for Andalusi Christians, in Luis A. García Moreno's words, these northerners were scarcely even part of *Hispania*, the Visigothic political homeland.¹³ Payne describes the post-Visigothic north-western society as 'a remarkable new symbiosis [...] between the largely free native inhabitants, groups of émigré Visigoths who clung to independence, and Christian refugees from the south'.¹⁴ Their political contestants were, aside from the Cordovan emirate, the Carolingians, who, particularly in the late eighth–early ninth centuries, possessed their own Iberian political interests, as well as other emerging local chieftains, both Christian and Muslim, who claimed Visigothic ancestry. There is no evidence that between 711 and the late 880s the Asturian ruling elites had in fact concerned themselves with their Visigothic heritage, nor do we see traces of any claims of post-Visigothic political continuity during the period between 711 and the end of the ninth century. Instead, as Pierre David and Georges Martin point out, the late-eighth century sources from Lusitania and Frankish Septimania, such as the *Annales Portucalenses Veteres*, the *Chronology of the Kings of Goths* (*Chronologia regum Gothorum*), and the *Chronicle of Moissac* proclaim the definitive end of the Visigothic kingdom on the Iberian Peninsula.¹⁵ Yet at the end of the ninth century, Asturias, in Julio Escalona's words, 'made a radical u-turn' by proclaiming its leaders as sovereigns with uninterrupted Visigothic descent.¹⁶

¹² See Chapter 4.

¹³ García Moreno, 'Gothic Consciousness', p. 113.

¹⁴ Stanley Payne, *Spanish Catholicism: An Historical Overview* (Madison, WI: The University of Wisconsin Press, 1984), p. 7.

¹⁵ Pierre David, *Etudes historiques sur Galice et le Portugal du VI.^e au XII.^e siècle* (Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1947), p. 317; Georges Martin, 'La chute du royaume visigothique d'Espagne dans l'historiographie chrétienne des VIII.^e et IX.^e siècles', *CLHM*, 9 (1984), 208–33; see also Roger Collins, *Caliphs and Kings*, pp. 50, 59–60, and the discussion in Chapter 4.

¹⁶ Julio Escalona, 'Family Memories: Inventing Alfonso I of Asturias', in *Building Legitimacy*:

There is an iconic episode in the late ninth-century Asturian *Chronicle of Alfonso III* in which the two communities, and the two distinct post-Visigothic narratives, come into antagonistic contact. Having taken refuge in the Peaks of Europe, local chieftain Pelagius (Pelayo), whom the chronicle identifies as a descendant of the Visigoths and the arms-bearer of the last Visigothic kings Witiza and Rodrigo, responds to another Visigoth, Toledan bishop Oppa, whom the chronicle calls Witiza's son. Acting as a proxy of an Arab governor, Oppa urges Pelagius to accept Muslim tutelage by emphasizing that Visigothic sovereignty has been irrevocably lost:

Puto te non latere, confrater et fili, qualiter omnis Spania dudum in uno ordine sub regimine Gotorum esset ordinata et pre ceteris terris doctrina atque scientia rutilaret. Et quum [...] omnis exercitus Gotorum esset congregatus, Ismaelitarum non ualuit sustinere impetum; quamto magis tu in isto montis cacumine defendere te poteris.

(I assume it is not lost on you, my nephew and [spiritual] son, how previously all of Spain was governed by a single law under the rule of the Visigoths, and shined beyond other lands in doctrine and knowledge; and how, when the entire Gothic army came together, it was unable to resist the onslaught of the Ishmaelites. How much better will you be able to defend yourself on top of this mountain?)

To this solicitation, Pelagius responds: 'Spes nostra Christus est quod per istum modicum monticulum quem conspicias sit Spanie salus et Gotorum gentis exercitus reparatus [...] hanc multitudinem despicio et minime pertimesco' ('We put our hope in Christ that by means of this little mountain that you see the well-being of Spain and the army of the Gothic people will be restored [...]). I despise this multitude [of Arabs] and do not fear them in the least'.¹⁷

The Asturian chronicler crafted this scene by portraying both Oppa and Pelagius as Visigoths who, despite belonging to the same kin, hold opposing views on the future of post-Gothic Iberia. Oppa advocates accepting Arab power by treaty under the threat of military action, which was a common practice during the early years of the Islamic conquest of the Iberian Peninsula.¹⁸

Political Discourses and Forms of Legitimacy in Medieval Societies, ed. by Isabel Alfonso, Hugh Kennedy, and Julio Escalona (Leiden: Brill, 2004), pp. 223–62 (p. 222). See also Hans Messmer, 'Menéndez Pidal y la Reconquista, su ideología y realidad', in *Actas del Coloquio hispano-alemán Ramón Menéndez Pidal. Madrid, 31 de marzo a 2 de abril de 1978*, ed. by Wido Hempel and Dietrich Briesemeister (Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag, 1982), pp. 201–17 (p. 211).

¹⁷ *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, *Rotensis* version, pp. 120, 122, 124, and 126.

¹⁸ Alfred M. Howell, 'Some Notes on Early Treatises between Muslims and the Visigothic

Finding himself in service to the Arab governor of Córdoba on whose charges he was sent to Asturias, Oppa ruminates nostalgically about the past Visigothic splendour. As a representative of the surviving ecclesiastical hierarchy, Oppa, in his own eyes, embodies continuity with Spain's past and thus counts on his authority to convince Pelagius to surrender to Iberia's new political masters. By contrast, Pelagius chooses military resistance. Whereas Oppa accepts the *translatio imperii* from the Visigoths to the Arabs, Pelagius believes in political continuity and revival. Pelagius prevails. The Asturians and, later, as the young kingdom of Asturias expanded southward to become the kingdom of León, the Leonese developed a chronicle narrative of sovereignty and pan-Iberian military and political leadership that transcended its time, while the Andalusí Christian culture was eventually cast into oblivion.

This book is primarily concerned with these two strands of post-Visigothic political discourse, which for purposes of distinction I will term here the Mozarabic (that which first developed in Muslim-dominated al-Andalus between the mid-eighth and the mid-ninth centuries) and the neo-Gothic (which corresponds to the late ninth-century Asturias and the eleventh- and twelfth-century León and was fruitfully exploited by Lucas of Tuy and Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada in the second third of the thirteenth century from Leonese and Castilian perspectives). Both terms have been problematized in contemporary scholarship and I discuss the potential pitfalls of their use in the next section. I term these narratives 'visions of unity', in recognition of their fundamental role in shaping Iberian political ideology. This process is viewed in a manner much different than was imagined throughout most of the twentieth century, when historiography was believed to progressively reflect the formation of modern nation states, and reading mediaeval chronicles meant selectively searching for the earliest signs of their formation.¹⁹ This has long led to several outcomes: the privileging of Visigothic Latin chronicles, which were believed to have laid the foundation of Spanish nationhood; the long-standing critical fascination with 'the fall of Spain', or the demise of the Visigothic kingdom and its last king Rodrigo in 711, with the Muslim invasion being seen as a catastrophic event that interrupted the process of national creation; and the

Rulers of al-Andalus', *Actas del I Congreso de Historia de Andalucía, diciembre de 1976*, ed. by Emilio Cabrera Muñoz, 10 vols (Córdoba: Monte de Piedad y Caja de Ahorros de Córdoba, 1978), 1: *Andalucía medieval*, pp. 3–14. On this, see Chapter 2 of this study.

¹⁹ For example, in Benito Sánchez Alonso, *Historia de la historiografía española*, 2nd edn, 2 vols (Madrid: CSIC, 1947), II, p. ix.

consideration of the Astur-Leonese claims of Visigothic political continuity as the only narrative documenting Spain's birth as a nation.²⁰

By contrast, examining post-Visigothic concerns regarding Iberian unity through the lens of the interconnectedness that existed between Iberian textual communities and the Mediterranean world creates a broader narrative and cultural context against which we can better understand the success of the myth of Spain's Visigothic origins in its various reincarnations in Asturian, Leonese, and Castilian traditions. Such a context includes the sophisticated and widely circulated mid-eighth century Mozarabic chronicles, a reflection of a tradition that survived until the thirteenth century and was not, at the time of its origins, fundamentally different from counterparts originating elsewhere in Christian communities dominated by Islam. Composed in an absence of a political centre, Mozarabic chronicles emphasized institutional continuity with the Visigothic Church, and their reliance on narratives of Christian survival from elsewhere in the Muslim-dominated Mediterranean suggests that these texts can best be approached from the perspective of their cultural integration into the broader world of Dar al-Islam, or the formerly Christian lands that found themselves ruled by Muslims beginning with the second third of the seventh century. Likewise, understanding the emergence of the narrative of Visigothic political continuity in Asturias, the area typically associated with the neo-Gothic revival, calls for a re-examination of the kingdom's chronicles. Long considered a product of political isolation, these texts benefit from being examined in light of the dispute that arose among several Christian and Muslim power nuclei that emerged in the Iberian north-east after the dissolution of the Visigothic state. Because all of these power centres could, and apparently did, claim Visigothic ancestry for their ruling elites, understanding why the Asturian legitimization narrative was successful is contingent on questioning whether claims of genealogical continuity alone could have been a sufficient legitimization strategy.

The decoupling of one's critical perspective from the limiting optic of modern-day boundaries of the Spanish nation state brings into critical focus the period after the fall of Visigothic Spain as a crucial time of an intense search for models of social cohesion. This book challenges the notion that these ideologi-

²⁰ See, for example, Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *El rey Rodrigo en la literatura* (Madrid: Tipografía de la RABM, 1924); Patricia Grieve, *The Eve of Spain: Myths of Origins in the History of Christian, Spanish, and Jewish Conflict* (Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2009); Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, *The Visigoths in History and Legend*, Studies and Texts, 166 (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 2009), esp. Chapters 6–8 on the use of the Visigothic legend between the fifteenth and twentieth centuries.

cal constructs developed in culturally isolated Christian enclaves, severed from the outside world by surrounding Muslim-dominated areas, or that post-Visigothic Iberian chroniclers relied primarily on earlier peninsular historiographical sources to construct their accounts. Rather, Latin textual communities, which served the propagandistic needs of the emerging centres of power, remained attuned to political and cultural developments elsewhere on the Iberian Peninsula, the eastern Mediterranean, North Africa, Carolingian France, and papal Rome long after the Muslim conquest of the Iberian Peninsula. As a result, Mozarabic chronicle authors incorporated Near Eastern apocalypses and martyrdom literature, Asturian chronicles were composed with an eye on the Carolingian model of kingship and sovereignty, and Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada dealt with the dilemma of Spain's unity and diversity by incorporating Muslim and Jewish philosophy and crusader spirit into the ideology of Iberian reunification and, more broadly, his own approach to writing history. The continued interconnectedness between the centres of power and learning in Mozarabic Spain, Asturias, León, and Castile and the broader Iberian and Mediterranean world is viewed here as key to the emergence, construction, and, ultimately, the survival of the neo-Gothic narrative and its integration into the Castile-centric ideological model of Iberian unity as it was first developed by Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada in the *Historia de rebus Hispanie*.

Scope and Limits

I approach the chronicles in this study as complex narrative spaces that sought to organize the seemingly fragmented and unstable social landscape around them, to provide ideological support for nascent centres of power, and to create ideologically viable models of social cohesion in an age of intense conflict. Such a focus is instrumental in examining how political narratives are born, take shape, and either die or prosper, and it furthers our understanding of compositional techniques that account for the powerful ways in which these narratives illuminate or, conversely, obscure our understanding of the mediaeval past. Because chronicles originating from one centre of power and learning typically exhibit similar narrative strategies, the analysis is organized chronologically by the *loci* of chronicle production. Each chapter attempts to answer the following questions: what historical circumstances and ideological objectives prompted the use of particular narratives? How did certain compositional tools become available and why were they chosen? How did their appropriation affect the selection of events and characters, the structuring of time, and chronicle compo-

sition? How can uncovering these strategies deepen our understanding of the processes involved in reconciling unity and diversity on Iberian soil and, more broadly, Spain's mediaeval experience?

The works of two authors define the chronological limits of this investigation. In his *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, the Archbishop of Seville Isidore (d. AD 636) was the first historian to put forth the vision of an Iberian Peninsula politically and confessionally unified under Visigothic rule, a vision that was to last a little over half a century. It proved tremendously influential in shaping post-Visigothic ideologies of Spanish statehood and survived, albeit in a fragmented shape, through the mid-thirteenth century. By then, the recapture of Córdoba (1236) and Seville (1248) in the Iberian south signalled the impending end of the reconquest, as only the small Nazrī enclave in Granada would remain in Muslim possession, holding out until 1492. It was also then that Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada developed a new vision, laid out in the *Historia de rebus Hispanie* (1243), of the Iberian Peninsula as a territory integrated under Castilian leadership.²¹ Because Rodrigo's ideological construct would inform Castilian and, by extension, Spanish political thought throughout the modern era, Rodrigo's oeuvre provides a convenient chronological cut-off point for this study.²²

²¹ Major studies thereof include Peter Linehan, *History and the Historians of Medieval Spain* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993) and Lucy K. Pick, *Conflict and Coexistence: Archbishop Rodrigo and the Muslims and Jews of Medieval Spain*, History, Languages, and Cultures of the Medieval Spanish and Portuguese Worlds (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2004). See also Peter Linehan, 'On Further Thought: Lucas of Tuy, Rodrigo of Toledo and the Alfonsine Histories', *AEM*, 27 (1997), 415–36; Peter Linehan, 'The Invention of Toledo', in Peter Linehan, *Historical Memory and Clerical Activity in Medieval Spain and Portugal*, Variorum Collected Studies, CS1011 (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 123–41 (first publ. in *La fractura historiográfica: las investigaciones de Edad Media y Renacimiento desde el tercer milenio*, ed. by Francisco Javier Burguillo and Laura Mier (Salamanca: SEMYR, 2008), pp. 123–41; Georges Martin, 'Noblesse et royauté dans le *De rebus Hispaniae* (livres 4 à 9)', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 101–21. See Chapter 6 for additional bibliography.

²² Some of the earliest observations on issues in the translation of Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada's *Historia de rebus Hispanie* and Lucas of Tuy's *Chronicon Mundi* as sources of the *Estoria de España* are to be found in Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *La Crónica general de España que mandó componer el rey Alfonso El Sabio* (Madrid: Impr. Clásica Española, 1916), pp. 29–35. On the *Historia de rebus Hispanie* being the Alfonsine source of choice, see Peter Linehan, 'From Chronicle to History: Concerning the *Estoria de España* and its Principal Sources', in *Historical Literature in Medieval Iberia*, ed. by Alan Deyermond (London: Queen Mary and Westfield College, Department of Hispanic Studies, 1996), pp. 7–33.

What remains beyond the scope of this book is the subsequent vernacular historiographical tradition, which begins in Castile with late thirteenth-century historical compilations commissioned by Alfonso X the Wise (r. 1253–84) — the *Estoria de España* and the *General historia* — and in Navarre with the composition of the *Liber regum* in Aragonese Romance (c. 1200). The adoption of Romance dialects as new languages of historical writing not only occasioned the need to find vernacular equivalents to all notions and concepts previously expressed in Latin, but also profoundly affected the nature of the accumulation, classification, and organization of knowledge. This linguistic and social development adds layers of complexity to our understanding of historiographical discourse that would be more properly addressed in another study.²³

What Iberian chronicles and histories composed prior to the mid-thirteenth century most conspicuously share is their use of Latin, which allows for a systematic exploration of discourse modalities that developed in support of chronicle negotiation of unity and diversity. Although the texts included here surpass the chronological limits of the early Middle Ages, I call the Mozarabic, Asturian, Leonese, and Castilian Latin historiographical accounts examined here ‘early Latin chronicles’ in order to distinguish this period of historiographical writing from the fifteenth-century renaissance of Iberian Latin historiography, which produced works such as *Anacephaleosis* and *Rerum in Hispania gestarum Chronicon* by Alfonso de Cartagena (1384–1456), *Compendiosa historia hispanica* by Rodrigo Sánchez de Arévalo (1404–70), and *Gesta hispaniensia* by Alfonso de Palencia (1423–91).

Apart from the language of composition, the chronicles in this study partake in the Isidorian tradition of historical writing. It is not only that virtually all post-Visigothic chronicles and histories, regardless of where they were composed, either purport to be continuators of Isidore’s *Historia de regibus*

²³ For a thorough review of vernacular practices of translation, accumulation, and compilation, see José Perona, ‘Lenguas, traducción y definición en el *Scriptorium* de Alfonso X’, *CLHM*, 14–15 (1989), 247–76. See also Fernando Gómez Redondo, ‘Terminología genérica en la *Estoria de España* alfonsí’, *RLM*, 1 (1989), 53–76. On additional complexity stemming from the need to coordinate the learned Latin and popular poetic versions of legends of Castilian origins as both were incorporated into historical texts composed in Castilian Romance, see José Javier Rodríguez Toro, ‘Las *Estorias* alfonsíes y sus fuentes latinas’, *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 241–57, and David Pattison, ‘Los equipos alfonsíes y post-alfonsíes frente a Jiménez de Rada: problemas y soluciones’, *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 259–66. On Alfonsine textuality, see also Elisa Ruiz García, ‘*Rex scribens*: discursos de la conflictividad en Castilla (1230–1350)’, in *La monarquía como conflicto en la Corona castellano-leonesa (c. 1230–1504)*, dir. by José Manuel Nieto Soria (Madrid: Silex, 2006), pp. 359–422.

Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum or his universal *Chronicle*, as is the case with Mozarabic and Asturian chronicles, or rely heavily on Isidore as a source, as do Bishop Lucas of Tuy in his *Chronicon* and Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada in the *Historia de rebus Hispanie*. There is more: both Mozarabic and neo-Gothic historiographical texts manifest Isidore's approach to writing history. To illustrate this commonality, I will briefly consider the *exordia* from four post-Isidorian historiographical texts — one from Visigothic Spain, another from the mid-ninth-century Arab-dominated Córdoba, and the other two from the kingdom of León.

The first text, the late seventh-century *Historia Wambae regis* penned by Julian, bishop of Toledo (642–90), is identified as *historia* and is local in scope, since it is chiefly dedicated to narrating the insurgence of Duque Paul in the trans-Pyrenean Visigothic province of Gallia Narbonensis, which took place in 673, early in the reign of King Wamba (672–80). The purpose of this work was to motivate *iuuenes* (troops of the royal army) to emulate the military exploits of Wamba's army at a time when recruitment for Visigothic military campaigns on the Iberian periphery was particularly difficult.²⁴ The second text, the *Memoriale sanctorum*, composed by Eulogius of Córdoba c. 856, is hagiographical in scope and was dedicated to the martyrdom of Andalusí Christians who rebelled against the Muslim administration of Córdoba. According to the author, the value of this text was to immortalize the refusal of young Christians to accept Islam and the Muslim way of life ('ut nostri quoque gaudii futura generatio particeps fiat').²⁵ The last two anonymous texts, the Leonese *Historia Silensis (Legionensis)* (c. 1160) and the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris* (c. 1150), are geographically limited to León and Castile, with each *récit* comprising the reign of one monarch, Alfonso VI (1065–1109) and Alfonso VII (1126–57), respectively. Despite the variety of scope and purpose, the *exordia* of all five chronicles exhibit a consistent set of generic *topoi*, which include:

1. A subject matter that features people and deeds, which, by virtue of being outstanding in some aspect, are worthy of being commemorated;
2. A declaration that the text is destined for the benefit and education of posterity;

²⁴ Gregorio García Herrero, 'Sobre la autoría de la *Insultatio* y la fecha de composición de la *Historia Wambae* de Julián de Toledo', in *4 Jornadas internacionales 'Los visigodos y su mundo'. Ateneo de Madrid. Noviembre de 1990*, ed. by Antonio Méndez, Teresa Montoro, and Dolores Sandoval, Serie de la Consejería de Educación y Cultura (Madrid: Comunidad de Madrid, 1998), pp. 185–214 (p. 200).

²⁵ Eulogius, *Memoriale sanctorum*, II, 1. 6, p. 401.

3. A statement that the style of the text is brief and its sources are trustworthy in cases when the author was not an ocular witness of the events being described.²⁶

These precepts are fully consistent with the definition of history found in Isidore's *Etymologies*, insofar as (1) history is considered to be a narration of bygone deeds and events that serves as a source of knowledge and perpetuates memory of the past; (2) its utility consists in teaching; (3) preference for ocular witnesses of the events serves as a guarantor of historical veracity.²⁷ There is thus evidence that prior to the emergence of grand historical compilations, such as Lucas's *Chronicon mundi* and Rodrigo's *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, which depend heavily on Isidore as a source, Iberian chroniclers already shared a generic awareness that was firmly rooted in Isidore's definition of history.

Taking into consideration these criteria — Latin composition, the manifestation of a Gothic consciousness, and the reliance on Isidorian models of historiographical writing — this book eschews a focus on the historiography of mediaeval Navarre, Aragon, and Catalonia, except where it is directly relevant

²⁶ 1. 'Solet uirtutis esse praesidio triumphorum relata narratio animosque iuuenum ad uirtutis ad tollere signum, quidquid gloriae de praeteritis fuerit praedicatum. Habet enim ipsa humani moris instantia pigrum quendam internae uirtutis affectum, et inde est, quod non tam citatior ad uirtutes quam ad uitia proclibior reperitur. Quae nisi iugi exemplorum utilium prouocatione instructa persisterit, frigida remanet et torpescit. Hac de re, ut fastidiosius mentibus mederi possit relatio praeteritae rei, nostris temporibus gestum inducimus, per quod ad uirtutem subsequi uae saecula prouocemus.' Julian, bishop of Toledo, *Historia Wambae regis*, p. 218.

2. 'Conticua hujus secundi operis breuitas martyrum tantummodo beatorum gesta exponens nomina, aetates, ortus diesque, allisionum fideli proferet relatione, quo prudens lector [...] quos praeconio suo extulerit, siue e contra quos zelo Dei armatus incesse, facilius possit conicere.' Eulogius of Córdoba, *Memoriale sanctorum*, II, p. 397.

3. 'Res gestas domini Adefonsy, orthodoxi Ispani inperatoris, vitamque eiusdem carptim perscribere primo quia ipsius nobiliora facta memoria digna uidentur, secundo quia, vitam fragili iam tempore toto uite sue curriculo, pre omnibus regibus ecclesiam Christi catolice gubernantibus celeberrimus uidetur.' *Historia Silensis (Legionensis)*, p. 119.

4. 'Quoniam semper ab historiographis antiquis historiarum memoria, quae posteris per scripturam traditur, regum et imperatorum, consulum et potestatum aliorumque insignia heroum facta de veteribus nova faciunt, optimum factu gesta Adefonsi Imperatoris, immo quae Deus omnipotens, per eum et cum eo, ut salus in medio terrarum populi Christi daretur operatus est, sicut ab illis qui uiderunt, didici et audiui, describere ratus sum.' *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, p. 3.

²⁷ Isidore, *Etymologiae*, in *Etimologías: Edición bilingüe*, ed. and trans. by José Oroz Reta and Manuel-A. Marcos-Casquero, 3rd edn, 2 vols (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2000), I, 41. 1–2 and 42, pp. 358–59.

to the emergence of the Asturian political narrative. Perhaps this is a limitation. Thus I only tangentially address the very interesting late tenth-century *Genealogies of Roda*, the earliest source of our knowledge about the origins of the Navarrese royal dynasty, and omit the *Liber regum*, another exponent of the north-eastern Iberian genealogical tradition composed in Aragonese Romance c. 1194–1209.²⁸ The same is true for the genealogical model of comital power articulated in the late twelfth-century *Gesta Comitum Barcinonensium*. Because Catalan historiography, rather than partaking in the Isidorian tradition, is principally concerned with the counts of Barcelona as former vassals of the dynasty of Charlemagne who had gained political emancipation from the Franks, it is perhaps best viewed in the context of Carolingian historiography.²⁹ The formation of these royal genealogies is well covered in recent research, and there exists an established tradition of regarding the mediaeval Iberian north-east from the perspective of its integration into Mediterranean networks of trade, kingship, crusading warfare, and knowledge.³⁰ My main concern with

²⁸ See José M. Lacarra, 'Textos navarros del Códice de Roda,' *Estudios de Edad Media de la Corona de Aragón*, 1 (1945), 194–284; 'Liber regum' or 'Crónicón villarense', ed. by M. Serrano y Sanz, in *Boletín de la Real Academia Española*, vi (Madrid: Tipografía de la RABM, 1919), pp. 192–220; see also 'Le *Liber regum* (ou *Libro de las generaciones y linajes de los reyes*)', special issue of *e-Spania*, posted 9 June 2010, dir. by Georges Martin, <<http://e-spania.revues.org/19306>> [accessed 27 June 2015].

²⁹ Nathaniel L. Taylor, 'Inheritance of Power in the House of Guifred the Hairy: Contemporary Perspectives on the Formation of a Dynasty', in *The Experience of Power in Medieval Europe, 950–1350: Essays in Honor of Thomas N. Bisson*, ed. by Robert F. Berkhofer III, Alan Cooper, and Adam J. Kosto (London: Ashgate, 2005), pp. 129–51; Jaume Aurell, 'From Genealogies to Chronicles. The Power of the Form in Medieval Catalan Historiography', *Viator*, 36 (2005), 235–64.

³⁰ See, for example, Jaume Aurell, *Authoring the Past: History, Autobiography, and Politics in Medieval Catalonia* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012). Aurell's study contains an exhaustive bibliography of earlier studies of mediaeval Catalan history and literature. See also Pierre Bonnassie, *La Catalogne du milieu du x^e à la fin du x^e siècle: Croissance et mutations d'une société*, 2 vols (Toulouse: Association des publications de l'Université de Toulouse-Le Mirail, 1975–76); Josep Maria Salrach, 'La legitimación del poder condal en los orígenes de Cataluña', in *La construcción medieval de la memoria regia*, ed. by Pascual Martínez Sopena and Ana Rodríguez (Valencia: Publicaciones de la Universitat de València, 2011), pp. 21–32.

For mediaeval Aragon, see *Jews, Muslims, and Christians in and around the Crown of Aragon. Essays in Honor of Professor Elena Lourie*, ed. by Harvey J. Hames, *The Medieval Mediterranean*, 52 (Leiden: Brill, 2009); Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, *Spain and the Mediterranean in the Later Middle Ages: Studies in Political and Intellectual History*, *Variorum Collected Studies*, 764 (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003); Ernest Marcos Hierro, 'Bizancio en el imaginario político de la Corona de Aragón', in *Bizancio y la Península Ibérica. De la antigüedad tardía a la edad mod-*

Latinate culture also compels me to leave aside manifestations of Islamo-Gothic consciousness by Iberian Arab elites such as ‘Umar ibn Ḥaṣṣūn (c. 850–917) and Ibn al-Qūṭīyya (c. 890–977), a matter that has much intrigued contemporary scholars.³¹

Instead, this study focuses on Mozarabic, Asturian, and Leonese chronicles, which have long suffered from critical neglect owing to the belief that these texts had been composed in areas that were isolated from Mediterranean and European influences and were thus manifestations of a culture locked into a pattern of perpetual impoverishment and decline.³² As outlined in Chapter 1, ‘The Epic’s Poor Cousins: Mediaeval Iberian Latin Chronicles in Twentieth-Century Philology’, such a perspective was influenced by the origins of Hispanic philology in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries as a tool employed for the purpose of vindicating Spain’s imperial decline vis-à-vis other European industrialized nations. From this period onward, Iberian Latin chronicles and histories were intentionally neglected or overlooked in favour of Castilian epic and, later, vernacular historiography — genres that were considered true repositories of the primordial Spanish spirit and the very essence of the *españolía*, translated as ‘Spanishness’ or ‘Hispanicity’. Latin chronicles and histories fared poorly with proponents of *convivencia*, or Iberian multiculturalism, as well, having been dismissed as elite and biased narratives that failed to represent mediaeval Iberia as a melting pot of Christian, Jewish, and Muslim cultures. Finally, because these texts were composed in Latin prior to the emergence of Castilian Spanish as a written language, and because Castilian Spanish,

erna, ed. by Inmaculada Pérez Martín and Pedro Bádenas de la Peña (Madrid: CSIC, 2004), pp. 303–22; David Abulafia, *The Western Mediterranean Kingdoms: The Struggle for Dominion, 1200–1500* (London: Routledge, 1997). See also Gabrielle Spiegel, *The Past as Text: Theory and Practice of Medieval Historiography* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997), pp. 99–110.

³¹ See Maribel Fierro, ‘Les genealogies du pouvoir en al-Andalus’, in *Islamisation et arabisation de l’Occident musulman médiéval (VII^e–XII^e siècle)*, ed. by Dominique Valérian, Bibliothèque historique des pays d’Islam, 2 (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2011), pp. 265–94; Denise K. Filios, ‘Playing the Goth Card in Tenth-Century Córdoba: Ibn al-Qūṭīya’s Family Traditions’, *La Corónica*, 43 (2015), 57–84; David J. Wasserstein, ‘Inventing Tradition and Constructing Identity: The Genealogy of ‘Umar ibn Ḥaṣṣūn between Christianity and Islam’, *Al-Qanṭara*, 23 (2002), 269–97.

³² This point has been most vehemently argued by Francisco Márquez Villanueva, *El concepto cultural alfonsí* (Madrid: MAPFRE, 1994), pp. 49–59. The view that Christian centres of learning on the Iberian Peninsula were inward-looking enclaves relatively isolated from Western Europe prior to the eleventh century has more recently been echoed by Simon Barton, *A History of Spain*, 2nd edn (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), p. 56.

and not Latin, has traditionally been regarded as the language of national writing and cultural hybridity in Spain, early chronicles and histories developed on the Iberian Peninsula have until recently been treated as unsophisticated suppliers of historical facts, while their authors have been credited with more or less feeble attempts to create cohesive textual spaces. By contrast, this study collectively considers these mostly terse, fragmented, and often anonymous accounts with complicated histories of manuscript transmission as a systematic narrative practice reflecting persistent attempts by emerging Christian power centres to situate themselves (and, in broader terms, *Hispania*) in universal history, articulate territorial claims, and project sovereignty and social cohesion.³³

The remaining portion of the book explores how this practice was employed in search of ideologically effective models of Iberian unity, a process characterized by ever-shifting definitions of political centre and political periphery, as centres of power and learning moved from Visigothic and Mozarabic Spain to Asturias, León, and eventually Castile. Chapter 2, 'The Mozarabic Chronicles, Islam, and the Mediterranean Apocalyptic', applies the Mediterranean perspective to resolving several seemingly intractable critical issues surrounding the first testimonies of Iberian contact with Islam. From the long-standing Ibero-centric critical perspective, the earliest extant testimonies of Spain's encounter with Islam, the *Chronicle of 741* (*Chronica Byzantia-Arabica*) and the *Chronicle of 754* (*Chronica Muzarabica*), have been regarded as exhibiting an inexplicably — and, for some, unacceptably — conciliatory stance toward the loss of Visigothic political sovereignty to the Arabs. Evidence of political, commercial, and cultural contacts between early Iberia and the Byzantine Mediterranean suggests that these texts can be productively read as participants in an apocalyptic literary movement that developed on the outer circle of the Byzantine empire in the seventh and eighth centuries as a response to the Persian wars and the surge of Islam. Coptic, Jacobite (West Syrian), and Armenian Monophysite histories that developed this world view collectively provide a narrative context for the conceptual and compositional genesis of the Mozarabic chronicles. Mediterranean cultural traffic illuminates the narrative enigmas of these texts, their political neutrality toward Islam, and the notorious obscurity of their Latin.

By the ninth century, the rural landscape of al-Andalus was dominated by Islamicized populations (*muwalladūn*), while urban centres such as Córdoba

³³ See review articles by Georges Martin, 'Después de Pidal: medio siglo de renovación en el estudio de la historiografía hispánica medieval (siglos XII y XIII)', *e-Spania*, 10 December 2010, DOI: 10.4000/e-spania.20185; Aengus Ward, 'Past, Present and Future in the Latin and Romance Historiography of the Medieval Christian Kingdoms of Spain', *JMIS*, 1 (2009), 147–62.

and Seville maintained Visigothic institutional continuity through the agency of the surviving Christian Church, with local bishops acting as leaders of the local Christian community (*dhimma*).³⁴ Chapter 3, 'Between the Emirate and the Holy Land: Eulogius of Córdoba, the Culture of Martyrdom, and the Ideology of Iberian Cohesion', analyses an important ramification of the Mozarabic world view in hagiographical testimonies of the movement of voluntary martyrs — Christians living in mid-ninth-century Córdoba under Muslim rule. Despite their highly divisive and incendiary rhetoric, the treatises *Documentum martyriale*, *Memoriale sanctorum*, and *Apologeticus martyrurum*, composed by Eulogius of Córdoba between 852 and 857, disguise a complex notion of unity and institutional continuity with universal Christianity. Eulogius's vision is seen as being anchored in two traditions: the Mediterranean neo-martyrdom literature that developed in Melkite Syria/Palestine and Coptic Egypt in the seventh century, and the local Iberian cult of paleo-Christian martyrs, which was already Mediterranean in its scope as it included saints from the Iberian Peninsula proper, North Africa, Rome, and the Near East. Considered jointly, these two traditions help illuminate the question of why the discourse on martyrdom thrived in Córdoba in the mid-ninth century. This chapter also views the logical controversy of Eulogius's polemic as resulting from the grafting of the contemporary Mediterranean discourse on martyrdom onto the local cult of paleo-Christian *passiones*.

While the Mozarabs had reconciled themselves with the loss of statehood, their chronicles fully maintained that the Catholic Church had survived the onslaught of Islam and was thus a guarantor of Visigothic continuity. The Mozarabic apocalyptic narrative survived in Asturias and was incorporated into the late ninth-century *Chronica Albeldensia*, but it ceased to be productive as the nascent kingdom of Asturias staked its survival on the narrative of Visigothic political, rather than religious, continuity. Cyrille Aillet attributes the rejection of the Mozarabic narrative in the neo-Gothic chronicle discourse to the refusal by the nascent Asturian monarchy to coexist with another source of authority and legitimacy on the Iberian Peninsula, since it projected itself as the only true heiress to the Visigothic state.³⁵ Chapter 4, 'Visigothic Law, Sovereignty, and North-Eastern Iberian Political Rivalry in the Asturian Chronicle Tradition',

³⁴ Cyrille Aillet, 'La formación del mozarabismo y la remodelación de la Península Ibérica (s. VIII–IX)'; in *De Mahoma a Carlomagno. Los primeros tiempos (siglos VII–IX). Actas de la XXXIX Semana de Estudios Medievales de Estella. 17 al 20 de julio de 2012*, ed. by Philippe Sénac (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2013), pp. 285–310 (pp. 296–97).

³⁵ Aillet, 'La formación del mozarabismo', p. 289.

does not fully support this view. Instead, as this chapter argues, the incorporation of the small Mozarabic segment known as the *Prophetic Chronicle* into the *Chronica Albeldensia* demonstrates that the Mozarabic apocalyptic narrative was not altogether incompatible with Asturian political ideology; rather, the decision to reject it was a practical outcome of a complex interplay among the nascent northern Iberian centres of power and the need for Asturias to emancipate itself from Carolingian tutelage.

In considering this process, genealogical claims of Visigothic continuity have long been regarded as the principal legitimisation strategy in two late ninth-century Asturian sources, the *Chronica Albeldensia* and the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*. Chapter 4 argues that the Asturians did not view genealogy alone as a sufficient legitimisation tool, since their principal rivals, the Banū Qāsi of Saragossa and the Christian counts of the Carolingian Hispanic March could, and in some cases did, claim Visigothic heritage. Instead, Asturian kings opted to rely on Visigothic law as the anchor of stability in order to project their sovereignty over the kingdom's subjects and leverage the political uncertainty of a frontier society. By adapting key provisions that regulated royal power in the *Lex Wisigothorum* as a narrative framework for structuring and styling royal biographies, the chroniclers legitimize Asturian kings vis-à-vis other north-eastern Iberian potentates as exemplary custodians of Visigothic law. This chapter considers the circulation of Visigothic legal manuscripts in the ninth-century Iberian north, the implications of applying seventh-century Visigothic law in the context of ninth-century models of kingship, law-making, and law-giving that developed north and south of the Pyrenees, and the extent to which the Carolingian model of kingship could have illuminated the ideology of sovereignty that developed in Asturias.

Chapter 5, 'Revisiting the Reconquest in Eleventh- and Twelfth-Century Leonese Chronicles: A Holy War or a Just War?', addresses the historiographical production that began in 914 with the transfer of the royal see from Oviedo to León by Ordoño II. Eleventh- and some early twelfth-century Leonese texts, such as the chronicle of Abbot Sampiro, the *Chronicon Pelagianum*, and the *Historia Silensis (Legionensis)* are believed by some to exhibit a lack of reconquest ideology. For some scholars, including Richard A. Fletcher and Simon Barton, such an ideology was first given impetus at the end of the eleventh century under Cluniac and crusader influences.³⁶ This chapter argues that Leonese

³⁶ Richard A. Fletcher, 'Reconquest and Crusade in Spain, c. 1050–1150', in *The Crusades: The Essential Readings*, ed. by Thomas F. Madden (Oxford: Blackwell, 2002), pp. 51–88 (p. 58); Simon Barton, 'Islam and the West: A View from Twelfth-Century León', in *Cross, Crescent and*

chronicles did possess an ideologically coherent response to Islam stemming from the model of royal power that had developed in Asturias. Seen through the prism of the *Lex Visigothorum*, which defined the scope of the kingdom's adversaries and legitimized military action against them, Arabs and Muslims represented one of, but not the only, challenge to the stability of the kingdom, with dynastic wars and internal seditions being considered equally disruptive in undermining royal power.

Secondly, despite considering Arabs and Muslims as only one among various threats to the monarchy, the Astur-Leonese chronicle tradition does formulate and continuously manifest a distinctive ideology to the extent that it constructs the response to Arabs and Muslims as a symbiosis of *bellum iustum* (a conflict of political interests) and *bellum sanctum* (a holy or religious war). The foundations of such a symbiosis are located in the political ideology developed by Isidore of Seville for the Visigothic state at the pinnacle of its territorial expansion and religious unification. The main tenets of Visigothic political theology — territorial expansion and spiritual sublimation — were adapted to the ideology of a Christian war against Muslims in Asturias-León. They continued to be influential and complementary until the thirteenth century, despite the ever-increasing chronicle evidence of Cluniac and crusader influences on the Castilian vision of the reconquest.

Chapter 6, 'Toward a Philosophy of Unity in Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada's *Historia de rebus Hispanie*', discusses how this historian both develops a philosophy of history that legitimizes secular power in Castile and manipulates Mozarabic and Astur-Leonese sources to assert Toledo's pre-eminence in Iberian ecclesiastical affairs. Taking a closer look at Rodrigo's elaboration of the concept of political power as it fits into his philosophy of history is instrumental for our understanding of the tenuous balance Rodrigo seeks to establish between the reality of Spain's fragmentation and diversity and his desire, illuminated by crusading ideals, for political and confessional unity. Rodrigo's interpretation of Spain's historical calling is examined in light of Neoplatonic philosophical thought, developed by Iberian Muslims, Jews, and Christians between the twelfth and thirteenth centuries and diffused through translation at the Castilian royal court of Toledo. Averroës, Ibn Gabirol, Jehuda Halevi, and Dominicus Gundissalinus shared the view that all objects in the visible world are manifestations of the single Creator, and that by studying these various manifestations, one could arrive at the understanding of God. As he examines

Conversion: Studies on Medieval Spain and Christendom in Memory of Richard Fletcher, ed. by Simon Barton and Peter Linehan (Leiden: Brill, 2007), pp. 153–74.

the material signs of Spain's past — in particular the landmarks left by invading Greek, Phoenician, Roman, Arab, and Frankish civilizations — Jiménez de Rada contrasts the multiplicity of nations that had successively sought to dominate the Iberian Peninsula with Spain's everlasting fidelity to its true origin and historical purpose. For Rodrigo, *Hispania* is a place where all manifestations of the Creator find their home under the patronage of the Castilian monarchy.

Taking into the account Rodrigo's conscious strategy, as established by Peter Linehan and argued by Lucy K. Pick, to promote the primacy of Toledo among other Iberian metropolitan sees and his own archiepiscopal powers, I propose that Rodrigo felt deeply ambivalent about his primatial claims given Toledo's Mozarabic heritage, and he therefore afforded unequal treatment to Mozarabic and Asturian historiographical sources. This was done by purposely associating Mozarabic religious practices with cessation or defilement and by casting Asturias in favourable terms of continuity and spiritual renewal. Rodrigo's complex historiographical manipulation, and the influence he exerted on the Castilian vernacular historiography as Castile's last major Latin historian, is key to our understanding of why the Asturian myth of origins enjoyed the privileged status as the principal, if not the only, post-Visigothic narrative until modern times. Not only did Rodrigo promote the north-western strand of the post-Gothic narrative but he also shaped the history of Castile as we have known it: a story of an uninterrupted Visigothic genealogical and spiritual succession.

Defining the Terms

When speaking of post-Visigothic narratives in Latin chronicles of mediaeval Spain, one inevitably uses several terms that are imprecise, contradictory, and every bit as elusive as the Iberian Middle Ages themselves. I will briefly review the terminology used in this study, including the terms 'Mozarabs'/'Mozarabic' and 'neo-Gothic', 'Spain', 'Iberia', and, finally, the term 'chronicle' itself.

The Mozarabic vs the Neo-Gothic

The terms 'Mozarabic' and 'neo-Gothic' are traditionally used to distinguish between two major strands of the post-Visigothic chronicle discourse that developed on the Iberian Peninsula in the aftermath of 711. In this book, the word 'Mozarabic' designates those post-Visigothic chronicle narratives which acknowledge the transfer of Iberian political power from the Visigoths to the Arabs. They are distinguished from the narratives termed here 'neo-Gothic' — chronicles and histories originating from Asturias, León, and Castile that

project political sovereignty. Both terms, however, are highly problematic, not least because both groups of texts were produced by those who considered themselves to be legitimate Visigothic descendants, but also because the scholarly usage of these terms inevitably reflects modern-day concerns with historical writing on the Iberian Peninsula.

The term 'Mozarab' derives from *musta'rib* (meaning 'to make themselves similar to the Arabs') or *musta'rab* (having assimilated Arabic customs while not being of pure Arab blood).³⁷ Its precise meaning with reference to the post-Visigothic period has been highly contested because the degree of assimilation of Christians to their new rulers in the eighth and especially ninth centuries varied from Arabization and Islamization to active resistance to both, and neither Andalusí Christians nor the Arabs themselves are known to have used this term. Christians in al-Andalus may have called themselves *Gothi*, *Latini*, or *Catholici* while the Arabs referred to the subjected Christian and Jewish populations as *dhimmī*, or protected communities subject to tax. In addition, the religiously coloured term *naṣāra* (Nazarenes) was used by Arabs to refer to Christians, while speakers of Latin or Romance were sometimes referred to as '*ajam*'.³⁸

Andalusí Christians began migrating to the northern kingdoms in the late ninth and tenth centuries as a consequence of, among other factors, the increased political instability in al-Andalus, and for some, like Richard Hitchcock, it is only those transfers, as well as those who found themselves under Christian rule as the northern kingdoms expanded southward, who could be properly called 'Mozarabs'.³⁹ Indeed, the term 'Mozarab' appears for the first time in

³⁷ Richard Hitchcock, *Mozarabs in Medieval and Early Modern Spain: Identities and Influences* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008), pp. ix–x. For the historical overview of the use of the term 'Mozarab', see Cyrille Aillet, 'Islamisation et évolution du peuplement chrétien en al-Andalus (VIII^e–XII^e siècle)', in *Islamisation et arabisation de l'Occident musulman médiéval (VII^e–XII^e siècle)*, ed. by Dominique Valérian, Bibliothèque historique des pays d'Islam, 2 (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2011), pp. 151–87; Emilio Cabrera, 'Reflexiones sobre la cuestión mozárabe', in *Actas del I Congreso Nacional de Cultura Mozárabe*, org. by Schola Gregoriana Cordubensis, pp. 11–25.

³⁸ See Cyrille Aillet, *Les Mozarabes: Christianisme, islamisation et arabisation en Péninsule Ibérique (IX^e–XII^e siècle)*, Bibliothèque de la Casa de Velázquez, 45 (Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, 2010), p. 3; Hitchcock, *Mozarabs*, pp. 48–58.

According to Aillet, the term *musta'rib* was originally used by the Arabs to refer to those ethnic Arabs who were Christians. Cyrille Aillet, 'Islamisation et arabisation dans le monde musulman médiéval: une introduction au cas de l'Occident musulman (VII^e–XII^e siècle)', in *Islamisation et arabisation*, ed. by Valérian, pp. 7–34 (pp. 12–13). See also discussion in Chapter 3.

³⁹ Hitchcock, *Mozarabs*, p. 1.

eleventh-century León.⁴⁰ It was also used in the Toledan *fueros* in order to distinguish those Andalusí Christians who became royal subjects after the ancient Visigothic capital was conquered by Alfonso VI (1085) from the city's new Castilian settlers.⁴¹ Toward the end of the twelfth century, Toledan Mozarabs and Castilians each had their own mayor and enjoyed equal privileges, but the Mozarabic community of Toledo vanished in the course of the thirteenth century.⁴² Chapter 6 argues that as the archbishop of Toledo, Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada had much to do with this, since he consciously sought to deprive the Mozarabs of their historical narrative in pursuit of his own primatial powers. This book therefore uses the term 'Mozarabs' in Chapter 6 with reference to Rodrigo's treatment of the long-time Christian residents of Toledo and al-Andalus. In earlier chapters, I prefer the more neutral term 'Andalusí Christians' with reference to those who resided in Muslim-conquered lands and considered themselves descendants of the Visigoths.⁴³

By contrast, some today describe neo-Gothicism as 'the ideology of "Gothic revival", based on ideas of political rebirth and reaffirmation, the restoration of a legitimate, Christian order'.⁴⁴ This partly stems from the twentieth-century scholarly tradition of accepting Astur-Leonese chronicle claims of Visigothic continuity, and even the providential rebirth of a Christian state as a leader in the reconquest, at face value. Many advances have recently been made that question Asturian kings' claims of genealogical continuity with the last Visigothic rulers. In particular, analyses of royal charters from Asturias and of eighth-century chronicles from the Iberian Peninsula and formerly Gothic

⁴⁰ Jean-Pierre Molénat, 'Los mozárabes, entre al-Andalus y el norte peninsular', in *Minorías y migraciones en la historia: XV Jornadas de Estudios Históricos organizadas por el Departamento de Historia Medieval, Moderna y Contemporánea*, ed. by Ángel Vaca Lorenzo (Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 2004), pp. 11–24 (p. 19); Aillet, *Les mozarabes*, pp. 4–5.

⁴¹ Hitchcock, *Mozarabs*, p. 84.

⁴² Hitchcock, *Mozarabs*, p. 96.

⁴³ More agreement exists with regard to the term 'Mozarabic' as it refers to the cultural production such as the styles of art and architecture influenced by oriental forms and motifs, regardless of whether they were created in the Arab-dominated south or Christian north. Alongside the term 'Visigothic', 'Mozarabic' also describes the style of liturgy that survived the dissolution of the Visigothic state and was practised in al-Andalus. In Toledo, it survived the imposition of the Roman liturgical rite from 1080 onward and was in use in the mid-thirteenth century. Kenneth B. Wolf, 'Mozarabs', in *Medieval Iberia: An Encyclopedia*, ed. by Michael Gerli (London: Routledge, 2003), pp. 590–91; Hitchcock, *Mozarabs*, pp. xvii–xviii, 77–79.

⁴⁴ John Victor Tolan, *Saracens: Islam in the Medieval European Imagination* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002), p. 180.

Septimania have been instrumental in questioning Asturian claims of uninterrupted Visigothic succession, given that these sources acknowledge the cessation of Visigothic royal power in Iberia.⁴⁵ Another, still debated, point of contention is whether the political structure and institutions that were resurrected in Asturias-León were equal to the ones that had been lost by the Visigoths.⁴⁶ Finally, there are those who believe that the neo-Gothic ideology could have been given an impulse by those Andalusi Christians who fled northwards in an attempt to resist accelerating Arabization and Islamization, although so far no specific arguments have been levelled in support of this claim.⁴⁷ Chapter 4 sees the essence of neo-Gothicism as a profound revision of the Visigothic political order as it was adapted to the realities of the ninth-century Iberian north-west. In particular, I seek to understand how the ancient Visigothic legal code was used to counter claims of political sovereignty by both Christian and Muslim power nuclei on the Iberian Peninsula, and to what extent the Asturian political ideology may have modelled its use of laws on the nearest major power player, Carolingian France, from which the nascent kingdom of Asturias had been in the process of emancipating itself in the ninth century.

Spain or Iberia?

The very use of the modern terms ‘Spain’ and ‘Iberia’ as geographical and political designations with reference to the mediaeval Iberian Peninsula and its civilization poses several challenges. On one hand, early mediaeval chroniclers followed the Roman division of the Iberian Peninsula into *Hispania citerior* — the Mediterranean coastal areas of the *Tarraconensis*, and *Hispania ulterior*, a term used to designate its Atlantic periphery, the provinces of *Baetica* and *Lusitania*.⁴⁸ Later these terms marked the distinction between Leonese/Castilian and Portuguese Iberian dominions. Prior to the Visigothic unifica-

⁴⁵ Collins, *Caliphs and Kings*, pp. 50 and 59–60; Martin, ‘La chute’, pp. 222–23. See also Chapter 4.

⁴⁶ Hillgarth, *Visigoths in History and Legend*, p. xi; Thomas Deswarte, *De la destruction à la restauration: l’idéologie dans le royaume d’Oviedo-Léon (VIII–XI siècles)*, Cultural Encounters in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages, 3 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2004).

⁴⁷ See Maribel Fierro, ‘Les genealogies du pouvoir en al-Andalus’, p. 275; see also Stanley Payne, ‘Nationalism, Regionalism, and Micronationalism in Spain’, in *The Impact of Western Nationalisms. Essays Dedicated to Walter Z. Laqueur on the Occasion of his 70th Birthday*, ed. by Jehuda Reinharz and George L. Mosse (London: SAGE, 1992), pp. 125–38 (p. 126).

⁴⁸ See this distinction, for example, in the *Chronicle of 754*, 62 (pp. 78, 80) and 69 (p. 84).

tion of the Iberian Peninsula, the Byzantines designated by the word *Hispania* their colonies on its south-eastern coast. In the first centuries following the Arab invasion of Spain, the ethnonym *Hispani* was used by the Carolingians with reference to Christians who fled Muslim-dominated areas of the peninsula and established themselves in Frankish Septimania. *Hispania*, for those residing north of the Pyrenees, was the portion of the peninsula under Arab rule and the equivalent of 'al-Andalus'.⁴⁹ The Carolingian term *Marca Hispanica*, found in use in the early and mid-ninth century, originally designated the unstable buffer zone between al-Andalus and the kingdom of the Franks; it was subsequently used by the counts of Barcelona to refer to the zone under their control as they liberated themselves from Carolingian tutelage.⁵⁰ Finally, in Leonese and

⁴⁹ On the equivalency of the term *Hispania* with al-Andalus, see Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *Orígenes del español. Estado lingüístico de la península Ibérica hasta el siglo XI*, 5th edn (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1964), p. 442. The earliest monograph about the settlement of the *hispani* in Septimania was published by Émile Cauvet, 'Étude historique sur l'établissement des Espagnols dans la Septimanie aux VIII^e et IX^e siècles et sur la fondation de Fontjoncouse par l'Espagnol Jean, au VIII^e siècle', *Bulletin de la Commission Archéologique et littéraire de l'arrondissement de Narbonne*, 1 (1876–77), pp. 347–520. See also Ernesto Pastor and Juan José Larrea, 'El curioso devenir historiográfico de los *Hispani*', in *Mundos medievales. Espacios, sociedades y poder*, ed. by Beatriz Arízaga Bolumburu and others, 2 vols (Santander: Publican, Universidad de Cantabria, 2012), 1, 767–94; Jacques Fontaine, 'Mozarabie Hispanique et le monde carolingien (Les échanges culturels entre la France et l'Espagne du VIII^e au X^e siècle)', *AEM*, 13 (1983), 17–46; Paul Aebischer, *Etudes de stratigraphie linguistique*, *Romanica Helvetica*, 87 (Berne: Francke, 1978), p. 255; Philippe Depreux, 'Les préceptes pour les *Hispani* de Charlemagne, Louis de Pieux et Charles la Chauve', in *Aquitaine-Espagne (VIII^e–XIII^e siècle)*, ed. by Philippe Sénac (Poitiers: Centre d'Études Supérieures de Civilisation Médiévale, 2001), pp. 19–38; Luis A. García Moreno, 'Los *Hispani*: emigrantes y exiliados ibéricos en la Francia carolingia. Realidad y mito historiográfico', in *Movimientos migratorios, asentamientos y expansión (siglos VIII–XI): en el centenario del profesor José María Lacarra, XXXIV Semana de Estudios Medievales, Estella, 16 a 20 de julio de 2007*, ed. by José Ángel Sesma Muñoz (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, Institución Príncipe de Viana, 2008), pp. 53–76. See also Armando Besga Marroquín, 'El concepto de España en el reino de Asturias', *Boletín del Real Instituto de Estudios Asturianos*, 61.170 (2007), 7–17; Alexander Pierre Bronisch, 'El Concepto de España en la historiografía visigoda y asturiana', in *Guerre, pouvoirs et ideologies dans l'Espagne chrétienne aux alentours de l'an mil*, ed. by Thomas Deswarte and Philippe Sénac (Turnhout: Brepols, 2005), pp. 7–24. The modern-day term *españoles* ('Spaniards') is strongly believed to be of fourteenth-century Provençal origin (Aebischer, 'Hispanus, Hispaniscus, Español', *Etudes de stratigraphie linguistique*, pp. 254–78).

⁵⁰ See Michel Zimmermann, 'Le concept de *Marca Hispanica* et l'importance de la frontière dans la formation de la Catalogne', in *La Marche Supérieure d'al-Andalus et l'Occident chrétien*, ed. by Philippe Sénac (Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, Universidad de Zaragoza, 1991), pp. 29–49; Ramón d'Abadal y de Vinyals, *Dels visigots als catalans*, 2 vols (Barcelona: Edicions 62, 1969),

Castilian chronicles we find both the term *Spania/Yspania/Hispania*, which designates a territory circumscribed by the geographical limits of the Iberian Peninsula, and its plural variant *Hispaniae*, which additionally subsumes the formerly Visigothic spheres of influence in North Africa and Septimania.⁵¹

On the other hand, scholarly uses of the terms ‘Spain’ or ‘Iberia’ with regard to the Middle Ages are not neutral, as either choice can reveal a great deal about the authors’ own approaches to mediaeval history. Both, however, have historically reflected a modern concern that has consistently dominated the discussion of Spain’s post-Visigothic past: the perception of Spain’s uniqueness. The notion that Spain’s history is radically different from that of the surrounding civilizations dates back to the Romantic period, when historians abandoned the Enlightenment tradition of emphasizing general tendencies of historical development in the formation of distinct national entities, and focused instead on what was distinctive about the European nations.⁵² But unlike other European powers, which cultivated their unique identities in an age of national consolidation and rapid economic development fuelled by industrialization, Spain searched for its own in an age of national decline. This was caused by a long series of events — a succession of wars of independence in the Indies that led to the liberation of the former Spanish American colonies in the first half of the nineteenth century, the disastrous Spanish-American War of 1898, the resulting loss of the last of those colonies — Cuba, Puerto Rico, and the Philippines, and Spain’s general decline relative to other industrialized European empires such as Britain, France, and Germany. Consequently, in the work of writers, journalists, and thinkers of the crestfallen ‘generation of 1898’, the notion of Spain’s distinctiveness took the shape of a search for clues to the nation’s essential spiritual values, seen as the unshakeable foundation on which Spain could be rebuilt.

1, 173–79. On the formation of the Hispanic March, see also Joseph Calmette, *La question des Pyrénées et la Marche d’Espagne au moyen âge* (Paris: J. B. Janin, 1947).

⁵¹ For example, the *Historia Silensis (Legionensis)* names Alfonso VI ‘Emperor totius Hispaniae’ (pp. 120, 184); see also Eloisa Ramírez Vaquero, ‘Pensar en el pasado, construir el futuro: Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada’, in *1212–1214: el trienio que hizo a Europa. XXXVII Semana de Estudios Medievales. Estella, 19 a 23 de julio de 2010*, ed. by Eloisa Ramírez Vaquero (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2010), pp. 13–46 (pp. 30, 32).

⁵² Stefan Berger, ‘The Comparative History of National Historiographies in Europe: Some Methodological Reflections and Preliminary Results’, in *Nations and their Histories: Constructions and Representations*, ed. by Susana Carvalho and François Gemenne (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), p. 40.

Among that cohort was the prolific Spanish historian and philologist Ramón Menéndez Pidal (1869–1968), who became the first Spaniard to systematically develop the ideological premise that Spain had always been destined to be a nation united under Castile — a military leader of the Spanish reconquest and the political heiress to the Visigothic kingdom. Its chief postulate was the existence of a primordial set of uniquely Spanish moral qualities (such as sobriety, energy, idealism, austerity, selflessness), which continually manifested themselves throughout history and left their imprint in mediaeval Castilian literature.⁵³ This ideology was formed as a response by Spanish intellectuals to what was widely perceived as ‘the problem of Spain’, that is, its decline relative to other industrialized European empires.

In the aftermath of the traumatically divisive Spanish Civil War, as the authoritarian government of Francisco Franco (1939–75) sought to achieve a sense of national unity, Castile-centrism, coupled with the ideas of Menéndez Pidal about the existence of unique and constant Spanish values, became official Spanish ideology. The thinkers of the ‘generation of 1948’, as they were nicknamed by the Catalanian historian Jaime Vicens Vives, promoted the idea of the ‘España única’, meaning both a unique and a homogenized, unified Spain.⁵⁴ Working from this perspective, Menéndez Pidal’s contemporary José Antonio Maravall (1911–86) equated in *The Concept of Spain in the Middle Ages* (*El Concepto de España en la Edad Media*, 1953) the terms *Hispania* and *hispanos* with the modern-day *españoles*.⁵⁵ He insisted that from its origins in Roman Spain, the name *Hispania*, apart from a geographical designation, referred primarily to a community of people united by a collective sentiment that remained constant throughout history. The splicing of *Hispania* into two distinct entities, a geographical and a moral one, allowed Maravall to skirt the inconvenient subject of the Arab conquest of Spain. According to this historian, when the term *Hispania* designated an Arab-dominated portion of the Iberian Peninsula, it did so in a purely geographical sense, but never referred to

⁵³ See Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *España en su historia* (Madrid: Ediciones Minotauro, 1957), pp. 14–63. See also Nadia Altschul, *Geographies of Philological Knowledge: Postcoloniality and Transatlantic National Epic* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012), p. 8.

⁵⁴ See Menéndez Pidal, *España en su historia*, pp. 124–25.

⁵⁵ For Maravall’s valuation of Menéndez Pidal’s thought, see his *Menéndez Pidal y la historia del pensamiento* (Madrid: Arión, 1960), esp. Chapter 2; José Antonio Maravall, ‘Menéndez Pidal y la renovación de la historiografía’, *Revista de Estudios Políticos*, 105 (1959), 49–99. See also Francisco Javier Caspístegui, ‘José Antonio Maravall entre el medievalismo cultural y el historiográfico’, *Revista de Historia Jerónimo Zurita*, 82 (2007), 99–138.

the realm of honour, fame, customs, or historical destiny of unification as it did when used with reference to mediaeval Christian kingdoms. In dealing with the dialectic of unity and diversity in the Iberian Middle Ages, Maravall postulated the underlying and formative character of Spanish unity, which, according to him, always dominated over the factionalism of any given historical moment. For Maravall, the seven centuries of Arab presence on the peninsula were a parenthetical moment, and while Iberian political unity was lost in 711, its moral unity remained constant throughout Spain's history.

By the mid-twentieth century, there was solid agreement that Spain had a national history, but its precise features became the subject of an acrimonious internal debate among a group of thinkers divided by the trauma of the Civil War. From his North American exile, Américo Castro (1885–1972) wrote the influential *España en su historia: Cristianos, moros y judíos* (*Spain in its History: Christians, Moors, and Jews*, 1948), in which he proposed that the origins of the distinctive Spanish character were to be sought in the mediaeval *convivencia*, a term designating the peaceful and productive living together of peninsular Christians, Muslims, and Jews. This meant that 'Spain' as a nation developed several centuries after the fall of the Visigothic kingdom. His staunch opponent Claudio Sánchez Albornoz (1893–1984), also an exile, retorted in 1957 with a multivolume work titled *Spain: An Historical Enigma* (*España, un enigma histórico*), in which he reiterated that the Spanish nation was born as early as in the Roman period. For this scholar, it became solidified over the course of the Middle Ages in reconquest battles against peninsular Arabs and Muslims, and through the Christian repopulation of recovered lands.⁵⁶

As a result, two distinct, contradictory, and highly influential concepts of Iberian society emerged in the second half of the twentieth century. One emphasized political and confessional division, with Muslim and Christian zones divided into siloed compartments along northern and southern horizontal lines and separated by a stretch of no-man's land. The other postulated the existence of an Orientalized civilization, termed 'Iberia' as opposed to 'Spain' in recognition of its hybrid cultural character — the result of a generally harmonious blending together of Christian, Jewish, and Muslim communities.⁵⁷

⁵⁶ See also Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *El drama de la formación de España y los españoles: otra nueva aventura polémica*, 2nd edn (Barcelona: EDHASA, 1977; 1st edn 1973), p. 24.

⁵⁷ For recent examples, see a collection of articles in 'Theories of Medieval Iberia', a special issue of *Diacritics*, 36.3–4 (2006), ed. and introd. by Oscar Martín and Simone Pinet. Recent studies that explore the hybrid character of Iberian culture include David Wacks, *Framing Iberia: Maqāmāt and Frametale Narratives in Medieval Spain*, *The Iberian and Early Modern Iberian World*, 33 (Leiden: Brill, 2007); Michelle M. Hamilton, *Representing Others in Medieval Iberian*

Despite these differences, the concepts both shared the premise of Spain's singularity, and the belief that the Middle Ages held the key to the formation of a set of uniquely Spanish, or Iberian, characteristics. For the proponents of early nationalism, this unique character was formed during the Visigothic period, which ended in 711 with the Muslim invasion of Spain. For the supporters of *convivencia*, the Muslim invasion of the Iberian Peninsula was a watershed moment that would eventually result in the unique blending of Christian, Muslim, and Jewish cultures.

Mediaeval Latin chronicles of Spain have proven to be a challenging and contradictory object of study when seen from either of these perspectives, a predicament that, at the time, only exacerbated their critical neglect. A formidable set of incongruities has traditionally awaited scholars who approached Latin chronicles through the optic of the modern state boundaries of a political entity called Spain, since such an approach inevitably resulted in a search for mediaeval clues to the formation of Spain as a modern nation. But exactly when Spanish national writing began is a question that is inextricably linked to our understanding of what constitutes Spanish nationhood, and there has hardly existed a more dauntingly perplexing, contradictory, and ideologically charged concept in the field of Hispanic studies.⁵⁸ At one extreme of the chron-

Literature, The New Middle Ages (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2007); *Under the Influence: Questioning the Comparative in Medieval Castile*, ed. by Cynthia Robinson and Leyla Rouhi, The Iberian and Early Modern Iberian World, 22 (Leiden: Brill, 2005); María Rosa Menocal, *The Ornament of the World: How Muslims, Jews, and Christians Created a Culture of Tolerance in Medieval Spain* (Boston: Back Bay Books, 2002; repr. 2003).

⁵⁸ Among those who locate the origins of the Spanish nation outside the chronological boundaries of the Middle Ages, Spanish nationhood owes its emergence to the political unification of the mediaeval kingdoms of Aragón and Castile during the reign of the Catholic Monarchs Ferdinand (r. 1475–1504) and Isabella (r. 1474–1504). See John Lynch, *Spain 1516–1598: From Nation State to World Empire* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1991); Luis Moreno, *The Federalization of Spain* (London: Frank Cass Publishers, 2001), p. 36. Henry Kamen argues against this view by claiming that Spain did not become a politically united nation until the Bourbon dynasty superseded the Habsburgs on the Spanish throne, when Philip V (1700–24) issued a new constitution known as *La nueva planta* (1716), effectively ending the independence of Aragon and Catalonia. Henry Kamen, *Spain 1469–1714: A Society of Conflict*, 3rd edn (Harlow: Pearson/Longman, 2005; 1st edn 1983), p. 291. Still others, including José Álvarez Junco, link the emergence of Spain as a modern nation to nineteenth-century liberal nationalism, a movement that arose in the wake of Napoleon's defeat in 1813, and prevailed in Britain and France, but not in Spain, where it was overcome by traditional Catholicism toward the end of the nineteenth century. But even from this perspective, mediaeval narratives such as the reconquest (the recovery of the mediaeval Iberian Peninsula from the Muslims) and its iconic symbols, including St James the Moorslayer and the Cid, are seen as foundational ideological

ological spectrum, it has been held, as early as by AD 375, while in search of its own geographical territory, the Visigoths exhibited a level of social and legal cohesion typical of a well-organized political community at a proto-national stage of development.⁵⁹ Conversely, some have argued that, if understood in the modern sense of the term, as an entity whose national boundaries coincide with its ethnic limits, Spain hardly qualifies as a nation even today, since it consists of a conglomerate of several distinct political and linguistic autonomies with variously developed claims to nationhood.⁶⁰

Those who attempt to locate the beginnings of national writing in the early Middle Ages do so based on a highly elaborate ideology of Iberian political and confessional unity developed in the Visigothic kingdom during the reigns of Leovigild (568–86) and Reccared (586–601). For proponents of early nationalism, its first manifestations are found in several seventh-century Visigothic texts: John of Biclar's *Chronicle*, Isidore's *Historiae de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum* and his universal *Chronicle*, as well as Julian of Toledo's *Historia Wambae regis*.⁶¹ It is generally accepted that these chroniclers manifest a Visigothic national or proto-national concept by diminishing the significance of the Roman Empire and exalting the Visigothic kingdom, as well as by celebrating the *translatio imperii* from the Romans.⁶² However, those who support this view also underscore the illusory nature of the Visigothic dream, which

pillars. José Álvarez Junco, *Mater Dolorosa. La idea de España en el siglo XIX* (Madrid: Taurus, 2001). See also Stephen Jacobson, 'The Head and Heart of Spain': New Perspectives on Nationalism and Nationhood, *Social History*, 29 (2004), pp. 393–407 (pp. 395–98).

⁵⁹ José Manuel Pérez Prendes y Muñoz de Arraco, 'Rasgos de afirmación de la identidad Visigótica desde Atanarico', *Antigüedad y cristianismo: Monografías históricas sobre la Antigüedad tardía*, 3 (1986), pp. 27–45.

⁶⁰ See Barton, *A History of Spain*, pp. xvi–xvii.

⁶¹ See, for example, Pedro Juan Galán Sánchez, 'La *Chronica* de Juan de Biclaro: primera manifestación historiográfica del nacionalismo hispano-godo', in *4 Jornadas internacionales 'Los visigodos y su mundo'. Ateneo de Madrid. Noviembre de 1990*, ed. by Antonio Méndez, Serie de la Consejería de Educación y Cultura (Madrid: Comunidad de Madrid, 1998), pp. 51–60; Suzanne Teillet, *Des Goths à la nation gothique: Les origines de l'idée de nation en Occident du V^e au VI^e siècle*, Collection d'Etudes Anciennes (Paris: Société d'Édition 'Les Belles Lettres', 1984), pp. 463 and 585; Isabel Velázquez, 'Pro patrie gentisque Gothorum statu', in *Regna and Gentes: The Relationship between Late Antique and Early Medieval Peoples and Kingdoms in the Transformation of the Roman World*, ed. by Hans-Werner Goetz, Jörg Jarnut, and Walter Pohl, with the collab. of Sören Kaschke (Leiden: Brill, 2003), pp. 161–218 (pp. 162–63).

⁶² For a recent perspective, see Jamie Wood, *The Politics of Identity in Visigothic Spain: Religion and Power in the Histories of Isidore of Seville*, Brill's Series on the Early Middle Ages, 21 (Leiden: Brill, 2012).

failed as a result of the unstable nature of the Visigothic monarchy. Visigothic royal power, and its ability to cement the Iberian political foundations, was variously weakened by internal rebellions, tensions among nobles, and competition from local elites.⁶³ Critics of early nationalism further insist on the secondary, imitative nature of Visigothic political ideology, resulting from its heavy reliance on Roman and Byzantine models.⁶⁴

But if we do not find anything resembling modern-day perceptions of nation or nationalism in the Iberian Latin chronicles it is not because the Visigothic imperial project failed. Whereas the Latin terms *nation*, *Hispania*, and *Hispani* have been in existence since at least the early Middle Ages, their meanings constantly evolved throughout history, and among the several available ways to designate collectivities and identify allegiances in the Iberian Middle Ages, none bear resemblance to the modern-day concept of nationhood. It appears that the inhabitants of the Iberian Peninsula were far less concerned than modern scholars with what they called themselves, and while their chroniclers maintained and perpetuated the memory of Iberian unification by Visigothic kings, such efforts had to be pondered against the reality of peninsular fragmentation and the imperative to legitimate local forms of government, constants that defined peninsular experience since the collapse of the Visigothic state.⁶⁵ Following Isidore, chronicles use the terms *natio* or *gens* to designate Iberian peoples by their ethnic origins (for instance, 'natione gotus sed ritu Mahometanus', 'Goth by origin but Mohammedan [Muslim] by faith').⁶⁶ The sixth- and seventh-century Visigothic political discourse, which is preserved in the proceedings of church councils, had gradually transformed the term *gens* from referring to a

⁶³ Velázquez, 'Pro patrie', pp. 216–17.

⁶⁴ Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, 'Historiography in Visigothic Spain', *Settimane*, 17 (Spoleto, 1970), pp. 261–311. In Hillgarth's eyes, Isidore's loyalty to a Catholic Gothic monarchy and regional patriotism, both expressed in his panegyric 'Laus Spanie' ('The Praise of Spain') and incorporated into the *Histories of the Goths*, represents a continuation of the earlier Hispano-Latin tradition of Orosius and Prudentius, except that, rather than exalting Spain, Isidore pays tribute to the Goths, its new rulers.

On the Byzantine influence on the material attributes of royal power in Visigothic Toledo, see Ramón Teja Casuso, 'Los símbolos del poder: el ceremonial regio de Bizancio a Toledo', in *Toledo y Bizancio*, coord. by Miguel Cortés Arrese (Cuenca: Ediciones de la Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha, 2002), pp. 112–21. The first Visigothic monarch who styled his politics in imitation of Byzantium was Leovigild (Antonio Bravo García, 'La España visigoda y el mundo bizantino', in *Toledo y Bizancio*, pp. 123–65 (p. 132).

⁶⁵ Collins, *Caliphs and Kings*, p. 62.

⁶⁶ *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, *Rotensis* version, pp. 144–45.

lineage or an origin (as it did at the Third Council of Toledo in AD 589) to meaning *populus*, a body of people participating in a social contract with the king. *Populus*, in turn, was contrasted with *alieni* or *hostes* — enemies of the crown or those not bound by such obligation.⁶⁷ Revived in the ninth century by Asturian kings, this concept was subsequently adopted in the kingdom of León, where, during the reigns of Bermudo II (982/85–99) and Alfonso V (999–1028) a dichotomy of *potestas regia* and *populi universitas* served as the framework for integrating discrete groups of settlers into the political fabric of the kingdom.⁶⁸ The concept of a *regnum*, however, was a fluid one in that it designated an entity that lacked identifiable borders and roughly corresponded to the realm of jurisdiction of the *rex*, which in itself was mutable, transient, and in constant need of legitimation vis-à-vis other such power nuclei that competed for the title of a successor to the defunct Visigothic kingdom.⁶⁹

This situation radically changed with the onset of a vigorous expansion of the Christian realm in the first half of the thirteenth century, when the unification of Castile and León by Fernando III (r. 1230–52) and his successful Andalusian reconquest campaigns (Córdoba, 1236; Jaén, 1246; Seville, 1248) called for a new model of royal legitimacy. The term *patria*, appearing in Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada's *De rebus Hispanie*, refers to the political realm of Castile as a space under the jurisdiction of the first judges of Castile. For Rodrigo, the election of the judges during the reign of Fruela II (924–25) marked the beginning of Castile as a political entity.⁷⁰ In a model that emphasized the jurisdictional powers of the aristocracy, royal power would be defined as a social contract between a just and generous ruler and a loyal nobility.⁷¹ The concept of *naturalaleza*, denoting a nobleman's connection to his place of birth, first appears in the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris* (1149) and the early thirteenth-century *Chronica latina regum Castellae*, attributed to Juan of Osma (d. 1246), as well

⁶⁷ See Velázquez, 'Pro patrie', pp. 162–63.

⁶⁸ See Dolores Mariño Veiras, 'Poder y pueblo en la génesis de la monarquía feudal: El reino-imperio leonés entre mediados del siglo IX y mediados del siglo XI', in *Mundos medievales*, ed. by Arizaga Bolumburu and others, 1, 693–704, p. 701.

⁶⁹ José Antonio Maravall, *Estudios de historia del pensamiento español. Edad Media* (Madrid: Ediciones Cultura Hispánica, 1973), p. 42–43.

⁷⁰ Georges Martin, 'La invención de Castilla (Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, *Historia de rebus Hispaniae*, v). Identidad patria y mentalidades políticas', posted 12 November 2006, <http://hal-univ-paris13.archivesouvertes.fr/docs/00/11/32/84/PDF/LA_INVEncI_N_DE_CASTILLA.pdf> [accessed 25 June 2014], p. 11.

⁷¹ Georges Martin, *Les juges de Castile: Mentalités y discours historique dans l'Espagne médiévale* (Paris: Klincksieck, 1992), p. 294.

as in Aragonese legal documents and historical compositions. In the words of José Manuel Nieto Soria, *naturaleza* implies that ‘by being born within the space of the kingdom of Castile, one acquired certain political responsibilities, some inescapable duties.’⁷² The imperative to respect, love, and obey the legitimate sovereign within whose jurisdiction lay one’s birthplace came to form the basis of royal power in Castile, defining its relationship with the class of nobility and creating the foundation of a new model of statehood based on the principle of territoriality. The Castilian legal code *Siete Partidas*, implemented by Fernando’s son Alfonso X (r. 1252–84), uses the notion of *patria*, identified as the land of birth (‘su tierra que dicen en latín “patria”’, Partida I, 1. 2), and *naturaleza* as an affective connection to one’s land of birth (‘aquella naturaleza que [...] los homes han con la tierra por nacer en ella’), further consolidating the connection between one’s birthplace and allegiance.⁷³ This would have profound consequences for the early modern conception of nationality and citizenship, when, according to Tamar Herzog, distinct but interconnected forms of belonging that originated in the Middle Ages, *vecindad* and *naturaleza*, became the basis for the construction of a national identity in Spain and its colonies.⁷⁴

Frustratingly, however, for those who prefer the term ‘Iberia’ over ‘Spain’ as more adequately reflecting the diverse, hybrid character of the region’s mediæval civilization, Latin chronicles resist any attempt to contextualize them within the tolerant, inclusive limits of a multicultural Iberian Peninsula. When reading Spanish chronicle accounts composed over a span of several centuries, one cannot escape the impression that the concept of diversity and plurality (at least as we understand them today) was unbearable to their authors. We see it early on in Isidore’s seventh-century account of Euric’s assembly in the *Histories of the Kings of Goths, Vandals, and Suevi*. The king notices that the heads of the

⁷² José Manuel Nieto Soria, ‘La monarquía como conflicto de legitimidades’, in *La monarquía como conflicto*, dir. by Nieto Soria, pp. 13–72 (p. 26).

⁷³ Alfonso X, king of Castile, *Siete Partidas* (Madrid: Real Academia Española, 1807), Partida II, 20, 1. In Francisco Márquez Villanueva, *El concepto cultural alfonsí* (Madrid: MAPFRE, 1994), pp. 32–33. See Georges Martin, ‘Le concept de “naturalité” (naturaleza) dans les *Sept parties* d’Alphonse X le Sage’, *e-Spania*, 5 (2008), DOI: 10.4000/e-spania.10753; also published in *Construir la identidad en la Edad Media: poder y memoria en la Castilla de los siglos VII a XV*, ed. by José Antonio Jara Fuente, Georges Martin, and Isabel Alfonso Antón (Cuenca: Ediciones de la Universidad Castilla-La Mancha, 2010), pp. 145–62; Carlos Estepa Díez, ‘Naturaleza y poder real en Castilla’, in *Construir la identidad*, ed. by Jara Fuente and others, pp. 183–208.

⁷⁴ Tamar Herzog, *Defining Nations: Immigrants and Citizens in Early Modern Spain and Spanish America* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003).

spears wielded by the Visigothic magnates have changed from previously uniform colours of iron to several distinct shades of patina:

Iste [Euricus] quodam die, congregatis in conloquio Gothis tela, quae omnes habebant in manibus, a parte ferri uel acie, alia uiridi, alia roseo, alia croceo, alia nigro colore naturalem ferri speciem aliquandiu non habuisse mutatam comperiit. Sub hoc rege Gothi legume statuta in scriptis habere coeperunt, nam antea tantum moribus et consuetudine tenebantur.⁷⁵

(One day, when the Goths had gathered in assembly, Euric noticed that the weapons which they all held in their hands had changed from the natural appearance of the iron of the metal part of the blade, some to the colour green, some to pink, some to yellow, and some to black. Under that king, the Goths began to record the statutes of their laws in writing whereas previously they had been bound only by tradition and custom.)

Isidore's source for this episode is the Hispano-Roman historian Hydatius (c. AD 400–69). Writing from his remote outpost in the north-western Iberian province of Gallaecia, he refers to this incident as a noteworthy portent — an episode of barbarian wars and a harbinger of future calamities.⁷⁶ Two centuries later, the archbishop of Seville uses the legend to convey a moral message: the unity of laws is preferable to the diversity of mores and customs.

⁷⁵ Isidore, *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, 35, p. 228. On Visigothic historians' part in ensuring unity and suppressing disunity, see also Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, 'Coins and Chronicles: Propaganda in Sixth-Century Spain and the Byzantine Background', *Historia*, 15 (1966), 483–508 (repr. in Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, *Visigothic Spain, Byzantium, and the Irish*, Collected Studies, 216 (London: Variorum Reprints, 1985), pp. 494–96); Hillgarth, 'Historiography in Visigothic Spain', pp. 275–76.

⁷⁶ 'Legati de rege Gothorum reuersi referunt portenta in Gallis uisa aliquanta: in conspectu similem ipsi de continuo paruissse solem alium uisum solis occasu; congregatis etiam quodam die concilii sui Gothis tela que habebant in manibus a parte ferri uel acie alia uiridi, alia roseo, alia croceo, alia nigro colore naturalem ferri speciem aliquandiu non habuisse mutata; medio Tolose ciuitatis hisdem diebus e terra sanguinem erupisse totoque diei fluxisse curriculo.' ('Envoys returning from the king of the Goths brought back news of a number of portents seen in Gaul. <They said> that before their eyes [...] another sun, like the real one, seemed to have appeared immediately [...] at sunset; that, when the Goths had gathered together on a certain day for their assembly, the iron sections and the blades of the spears which they carried in their hands had for a time not kept their natural appearance of iron but changed colour: some were green, some red, others yellow or black; and that at this time in the city of Tolosa blood had burst forth from the ground and flowed for an entire day.') Hydatius, *Chronicle*, in *The Chronicle of Hydatius and the Consularia Constantinopolitana: Two Contemporary Accounts of the Final Years of the Roman Empire*, ed. and trans. by Richard W. Burgess (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993), p. 121.

Post-711 peninsular Latin chroniclers give a plethora of evidence of linguistic, cultural, and social diversity in the Iberian world around them, where political and social frontiers are made and unmade in a constant movement of troops, supplies, volatile alliances, bilingual informants, and religious converts to and from Islam. Jiménez de Rada's vivid description of Ṭāriq's 711 expedition, an event that ended Visigothic statehood, betrays an awareness of a new, heterogeneous character of the Iberian space, where the clearly defined limits and allegiances envisioned by Isidore are no longer discernible; where former Christians, recruited from the Berber tribes of Morocco, have become Muslims, and Visigothic horses have been appropriated by the Saracens:

Tunc comes Iulianus Taric consuluit ut de suo exercitu bellatoribus compartitis per diuersas partes Hispania uastaretur et ipse daret de suis complicitibus qui ducatu et auxilio Arabes adiuuarent. Tunc Taric diuisit exercitum et misit quendam qui de Christiano factus fuerat Sarracenus, qui dicebatur arabice Mogey Arromi [...] et duxit secum DCC milites et Cordubam est profectus. Vix enim inter Arabes pedes quispiam reperiebatur, nam ex quis Gothorum de pedestri ordine milites fuerant facti.⁷⁷

(Then Count Julian advised Ṭāriq to divide his forces and ravage diverse areas of Spain, and he gave Ṭāriq several of his accomplices who would be of use in leading and assisting the Arabs. Then Ṭāriq divided his troops and sent a certain Saracen who had formerly been a Christian and who in Arabic was called Mogey Arromi [...] and he took 700 soldiers and left for Córdoba. For among the Arabs one could hardly find any foot soldiers because the infantry men had turned into cavalry using the Visigoths' horses.)

This image of confusion and disarray is emblematic, for in Rodrigo's view the Arab invasion of 711 represents the onset of a political chaos that penetrates even the most intimate spheres of daily life. Rodrigo sees it as a tragic sign of a violated Iberian space that during the reign of Sancho the Great of Navarre (1004–35), when Arab incursions became particularly frequent, counts and kings placed horse stables inside their residences, in some cases near matrimonial beds, in order to be able to arm themselves without delay in case of a sudden attack.⁷⁸

It might be tempting to attribute Rodrigo's dislike of religious hybridity to the influence of crusader ideology. However, his contemporary Bishop Lucas of Tuy, whom we cannot suspect of being a champion of the crusades, similarly

⁷⁷ Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, II. 23, p. 109.

⁷⁸ Jiménez de Rada, *Historia*, v. 26, pp. 175–76.

perceives linguistic hybridity as a sign of defeat in his *Chronicon mundi*. The episode in question is based on a popular source in Romance, in which a fisherman deplores the surrender to the Christians of late tenth-century Muslim leader al-Manṣūr by intermingling Arab and Romance words:

Mirabile est dictu quod ipsa die, qua in Canatanazor succubuit Almazor, quidam quasi piscator in ripa fluminis de Guadalquivir quasi plangens modo Caldayco sermone, modo Yspanico clamabat dicens: 'En Canatanazor perdio Almazor el tambor', id est, in Canatanazor perdidit Almazor timpanum siue sistrum, hoc est, leticiam suam. [...] Hunc credimus diabolum fuisse, qui Sarracenorum plangebatur deiectionem.⁷⁹

(There was marvellous word that day that in Calatañazor the king surrendered: a fisherman on the shore of Guadalquivir, as if wailing, called out words at one time in Chaldean [Arabic] language and at another in the Hispanic one, saying: 'En Calatañazor perdió Almanzor el tambor', which means in Calatañazor al-Manṣūr lost his tambourine, or rattle, which is his joy. [...] We think it was the devil who was bewailing the defeat of the Saracens.)

Lucas, and Latin chronicle writers, were apparently not content with the linguistic plurality of the Iberian Peninsula, even as Ibero-Romance and Arabic show signs of penetrating into the Latin fabric of their narratives.⁸⁰

Examples such as the ones above leave little doubt that the Latin chroniclers of Spain, from Isidore of Seville to Lucas of Tuy and Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, manifest awareness of the cultural hybridity of the Iberian space. However, it is not the cultural symbiosis that captures their attention, but rather indications and proofs of the (re-)establishment of political and confessional homogeneity, which had been proclaimed by the Visigothic kings and articulated in Isidore's *Historia de regibus Gothorum* and Julian of Toledo's *Historia Wambae regis*. One of the most vivid images includes Lucas's depiction of Fernando III's triumphant entry into Córdoba (1236). This king orders that the bells from the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela, which had previously been captured by al-Manṣūr and converted to serve as lamps in the Cordovan mosque, be carried on the backs of Muslims back to Galicia.⁸¹ Likewise, Lucas dedicates

⁷⁹ Lucas, bishop of Tuy, *Chronicon mundi*, IV. 39, p. 271.

⁸⁰ See Roger Wright, *A Sociophilological Study of Late Latin* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2002), pp. 247–48, on traces of Ibero-Romance in the Leonese *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris* (c. 1148).

⁸¹ Lucas, *Chronicon*, IV. 60, pp. 295–96. Jiménez de Rada dedicates a chapter to this event, 'De restauratione et dote ecclesie Cordubensis et campanis relatis ad Sanctum Iacobum', *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, IX. 17, pp. 299–300.

several passages to recording ancient names of peninsular localities that had been changed by Muslims ('ciuitates et opida quorum nomina antiquitas uel Sarraceni mutauerunt').

In a similar fashion, Jiménez de Rada, relating the defeat of Christian troops at Uclés (1108), notes that Muslims named the location of the battlefield *Septem Porcos* ('Seven Pigs') in order to dishonour the slain Castilian magnates, but the locality was to be eventually renamed *Septem Comites* ('Seven Counts').⁸² Another one of Rodrigo's images includes the body of El Cid, the Castilian conqueror of Valencia: rescued by his army from the midst of derisive Arab soldiers who had regained control of the city following the Cid's death in 1099, it is transferred to the monastery of San Pedro de Cardeña in Castile.⁸³ The list of symbolic actions that celebrate the end of the hybridization of the Christian and Muslim realms is long and indicative of a systematic narrative practice of separating and homogenizing the Iberian space. For Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, in particular, the diversity in which he is proud to assume a mediating role is that of a multitude of Christian soldiers who represent diverse geographical and linguistic origins and are identified by the sign of the cross on their garb — not exactly a modern-day image of tolerance and inclusivity.⁸⁴

Rethinking Uniqueness

The notion of Spain as a unique civilization, whether this singularity was attributed to an early national awareness, Castile-centrism, or *convivencia*, long led to the perception of Iberian Latin post-Visigothic chronicles as a somewhat incongruous object of study — until, in the last quarter of the twentieth century, amid new political and social developments and rapid technological advances, a new critical path began to emerge: one that questions the fundamental premise of Spain's exceptionalism. Among the first to chart the new course was José Angel García de Cortázar (b. 1939), an historian of mediaeval rural Spain. By integrating fields as diverse as mediaeval archaeology, historical anthropology, topography, and rural economy, by 1973 he challenged the prevailing notion that the Valley of the Duero was depopulated by King Alfonso I of Asturias (r. 739–57) and subsequently repopulated under the auspices of

⁸² Lucas, *Chronicon*, III. 20, pp. 183–84; Jiménez de Rada, *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, VI. 32, p. 216.

⁸³ Jiménez de Rada, *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, VI. 28, p. 213.

⁸⁴ See Chapter 6. See also Wright, *Late Latin*, p. 181.

the Asturian-Leonese monarchy in the course of the reconquest.⁸⁵ Instead, García de Cortázar uncovered a variety of patterns of spatial appropriation by Christians and Muslims in Iberian frontier zones, leading to the notion that the period between the eighth and ninth centuries witnessed an increased autonomy and expansion of peasant dominions in the absence of structured Christian or Islamic centres of power.⁸⁶

By contrast with this early post-Visigothic period, the late ninth and early tenth centuries are now regarded as the age of an intense organization of northern Iberian space by monarchy, aristocracy, and the Church around distinct markers such as the royal see, urban nuclei, castles, forts, and monasteries, with written sources being seen as vehicles of articulation in this process.⁸⁷ With regard to the Muslim-dominated south, recent archaeological evidence, such as remnants of structures and public works, numismatic findings, and burial suites, suggests that Muslim presence may have caused a gradual change in the patterns of settlement over time, rather than a wholesale abandonment of rural regions by their former settlers in the wake of 711. Since gradual Islamization is

⁸⁵ Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *Despoblación y repoblación del Valle del Duero* (Buenos Aires: Universidad de Buenos Aires, Facultad de Filosofía y Letras, 1966). Also see Chapter 1 in Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, in *El reino astur-leonés (722–1037)*, in *Historia de España Menéndez Pidal*, dir. by José María Jover Zamora (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1980), VII, 1–60; Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *España, un enigma histórico* (Buenos Aires: Editorial Sudamericana, 1957), published in English as *Spain, a Historical Enigma*, trans. by Colette Joly Dees and David Sven Reher (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 1975).

⁸⁶ José Angel García de Cortázar, *La época medieval. Historia de España Alfaguara*, II (Madrid: Alianza Editorial, 1973); José Angel García de Cortázar and others, *La organización social del espacio en la España medieval* (Barcelona: Ariel, 1985); José Angel García de Cortázar, *La sociedad rural en la España medieval* (Madrid: Siglo XXI, 1988); José Angel García de Cortázar, *Sociedad y organización del espacio en la España medieval* (Granada: Universidad de Granada, 2004). See also Martín F. Ríos Saloma, 'Los trabajos de García de Cortázar (1966–1978): Una apuesta por la renovación historiográfica del medievalismo español', in *Mundos medievales*, ed. by Arízaga Bolumburu and others, I, 37–47 (pp. 43–44), and a review article by Emilio Cabrera, 'Población y poblamiento, historia agraria, sociedad rural', in *La Historia Medieval en España*, ed. by Martín Duque, pp. 659–746. See also James F. Powers, 'Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz y Mendiña', in *Medieval Scholarship: Biographical Studies of the Formation of a Discipline*, ed. by Helen Damico and Joseph B. Zavadal (New York: Garland, 1995), pp. 233–45.

⁸⁷ José Avelino Gutiérrez González, 'Procesos de transformación del poblamiento antiguo al medieval en el norte peninsular astur', in *Mundos medievales*, ed. by Arízaga Bolumburu and others, I, 599–614; Igor Santos Salazar, 'Obispos, abades, presbíteros y aldeas. Una aproximación a las formas y las bases del dominio social en Álava del siglo IX', in *Mundos medievales*, I, 885–900.

now believed to have begun in the eighth century and continued until the late tenth–early eleventh, some scholars have gone as far as to suggest that the term ‘Muslim domination’, which implies a violent and abrupt transfer of power from Visigothic to Arab and Berber elites, ought to be replaced with that of ‘Muslim protectorate’, defined as the exertion of power by delegation to local magnates.⁸⁸ Consequently, the former notion of the frontier in the period between the eleventh and early thirteenth centuries as ‘no-man’s land’ is now becoming reconceptualized as ‘nobody’s and everybody’s land’, reflecting the perceived aperture, fluidity, and uncertainty of demarcation between Christian and Muslim realms.⁸⁹

The resulting paradigmatic shift of perspective on mediaeval Spain was formulated early on by García de Cortázar himself as a tongue-in-cheek, subversive allusion to a slogan promoted by the Spanish government during the final years of the Franco era: ‘España no es tan diferente’ (‘Spain is not that different’ [from mediaeval societies elsewhere]).⁹⁰ In a parallel development, the concept of *convivencia* has been undergoing a revision as well. We are being urged to consider whether the unequal position of Christian and Jewish minorities under Islamic law in al-Andalus truly makes mediaeval Spain a model of tolerance and peaceful cohabitation, one that might be emulated by today’s

⁸⁸ Preliminary results of archaeological excavations from Vega Baja, a lower suburb of Toledo, suggest that the former capital of the Visigothic kingdom was not abandoned until the very end of the ninth century, when large groups of resident Mozarabs fled to Asturias and León. See Ricardo Izquierdo Benito, ‘Toledo entre visigodos y omeyas’, in *De Mahoma a Carlomagno*, ed. by Sénac, pp. 99–130 (p. 128). See also Luis Serrano Piedecabras Fernández, ‘El primer siglo de la meseta bajo el dominio islámico’, in *Mundos medievales*, ed. by Arízaga Bolumburu and others, 1, 901–13 (pp. 904, 912); Sonia Gutiérrez Lloret, ‘De Teodomiro a Tudmīr. Los primeros tiempos desde la arqueología (ss. VII–IX)’, in *De Mahoma a Carlomagno*, pp. 229–84 (pp. 244–46).

⁸⁹ Manuel José Recuero Astray, ‘Los ámbitos fronterizos castellano-leoneses frente al Islam entre los siglos XI y XII’, in *Mundos medievales*, ed. by Arízaga Bolumburu and others, 1, 793–833 (pp. 793–94). See also Iñaki Martín Viso, ‘Espacios sin estado: los territorios occidentales entre el Duero y el Sistema Central (siglos VIII–IX)’, in Iñaki Martín Viso, *¿Tiempos oscuros?: Territorio y sociedad en el centro de la Península Ibérica (siglos VII–X)* (Madrid: Sílex Ediciones, 2009), pp. 107–35. This study draws on archaeological excavations to present a nuanced and complex picture that modifies the previous view of a complete Visigothic power vacuum in the Duero basin put forth by José María Mínguez, ‘Ruptura social e implantación del feudalismo en el noroeste peninsular (siglos VIII–IX)’, *Studia historica. Historia medieval*, 3 (1985), 7–32. See also Manuel Rúa Rúa, ‘Aportación de la arqueología medieval a la historia d España’, in *La Historia Medieval en España*, ed. by Martín Duque, pp. 403–30.

⁹⁰ José Angel García de Cortázar, *El dominio del monasterio de San Millán de la Cogolla (siglos X–XIII). Introducción a la historia rural de Castilla altomedieval* (Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 1969), p. 349.

multicultural societies.⁹¹ In its original meaning of a 'peaceful coexistence', *convivencia* is now a term only used to refer to short-term instances of cooperation between Christian, Muslim, and Jewish elites on matters concerning the transmission of knowledge found in learned texts. Such cooperation is believed to have been localized in the city of Córdoba and limited to the mid-tenth century.⁹² Instead, we are reminded that *conveniencia*, a form of coexistence defined not by harmony, but rather by social and political expediency, may be a more accurate framework in which to view majority-minority relations.⁹³ It has also been suggested that mediaeval Iberian culture was as much a product of *convivencia* of Christian, Muslims, and Jews as it was of *contravivencia*, a term David Wacks uses to describe a polemical and combative relationship among majority/minority groups, central to the construction of each group's cultural identity.⁹⁴ Scholars now propose to decouple analyses of Christian-Muslim-Jewish relations from the outdated notion of Spain's uniqueness and focus instead on the similarities in the Christian treatment of religious minorities in Spain and the rest of Europe.⁹⁵

Finally, the diminished focus on Spain's uniqueness helped position the mediaeval Iberian society as one defined not by political, religious, and ethnic isolation but rather by its integration into the larger structures of mediaeval

⁹¹ See the review article by Francisco García Fitz, 'Las minorías religiosas y la tolerancia en la Edad Media hispánica: ¿mito o realidad?', in *Tolerancia y convivencia étnico-religiosa en la península Ibérica durante la Edad Media. III Jornadas de Cultura Islámica*, ed. by Alejandro García Sanjuán (Huelva: Universidad de Huelva, 2003), pp. 13–56. Another useful source is Alex Novikoff, 'Between Tolerance and Intolerance in Medieval Spain: An Historiographic Enigma', *Medieval Encounters*, 11 (2005), 7–36.

⁹² Collins, *Caliphs and Kings*, pp. 1–2; Payne, *Spain*, p. 57.

⁹³ For a comprehensive critical review of current approaches to mediaeval Spain's ethnic and religious diversity, see Maya Soifer's 'Beyond *convivencia*: Critical Reflections on the Historiography of Interfaith Relations in Christian Spain', *JMIS*, 1 (2009), 19–35. See also John Tolan, 'Using the Middle Ages to Construct Spanish Identity: 19th and 20th Century Spanish Historiography of Reconquest', in *Historiographical Approaches to Medieval Colonization of East Central Europe*, ed. by Jan M. Piskorski (Boulder, CO and New York: East European Monographs, 2002), pp. 329–47. Brian Catlos, in *The Victors and the Vanquished: Christians and Muslims in Catalonia and Aragon, 1050–1300* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), suggests that the culture of Christian-Muslim tolerance was a matter of political convenience. On the role of *conveniencia* in Christian-Jewish relations in Castile, see Rica Amrán, 'El Arzobispo Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada y los judíos de Toledo: la concordia del 16 de junio de 1219', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 73–85.

⁹⁴ Wacks, *Framing Iberia*, p. 5.

⁹⁵ See Soifer, 'Beyond *convivencia*'.

Europe and the Mediterranean and into broad networks of knowledge, diplomacy, and commerce.⁹⁶ Increasingly, researchers are encountering similar patterns of Islamic conquest, settlement, administration, and Muslim-Christian relations across the Mediterranean, from Spain and Sicily to Egypt and Syria.⁹⁷ From the post-national optic of the Mediterranean, the Arab and Berber invasion of the early eighth century, long considered to have been the most exclusive feature of mediaeval Iberian history, is ceasing to be seen as a watershed event that makes Spain unique among European nations; rather, it is beginning to be interpreted as a specific instance of the great human migrations that shaped Mediterranean communities. This book prefers to use the terms 'Spain' and 'Iberia' with reference to the Iberian Peninsula as a geographical area where Mozarabic, Asturian, Leonese, and Castilian texts were produced, while recognizing that it may not be altogether possible to avoid the modern-day ideological colouring of these terms.

Approaching the Chronicle

It remains to be said exactly what it means to speak of the mediaeval Iberian chronicle, since the answer to this question is of direct consequence for the scope and methods of one's study. Although there was likely awareness in Roman *Hispania* of the classical distinction between different subgenres of historiography and their differentiation from other narrative forms, early in the Middle Ages this distinction appears to have been forgotten or blurred. By the seventh century, the chronological organization of material remains the only criterion of distinction between annals and history, according to Isidore's *Etymologies*, but Isidore's intent to clarify the difference between the two seems contradictory. Although the archbishop of Seville states that history is writ-

⁹⁶ Recent examples include Nicholas Everett, 'Lay Documents and Archives in Early Medieval Spain and Italy, c. 400–700', in *Documentary Culture and the Laity in the Early Middle Ages*, ed. by Warren C. Brown, Marios Costambeys, Matthew Innes, and Adam J. Kosto (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 63–94; Adam J. Kosto, 'Sicut mos esse solet: Documentary Practices in Christian Iberia, c. 700–1000', in *Documentary Culture*, pp. 259–82; Paulino Iradiel Murugarren, 'Fernando III y el Mediterráneo', in *Fernando III y su tiempo (1201–1252). VIII Congreso de Estudios Medievales*, ed. by Fundación Sánchez-Albornoz (Ávila: Fundación Sánchez-Albornoz, 2003), pp. 157–82; and *In and of the Mediterranean: Medieval and Early Modern Iberian Studies*, ed. by Michelle M. Hamilton and Nuria Silleras-Fernández (Nashville, TN: Vandebuilt University Press, 2015).

⁹⁷ These are discussed in Chapter 3.

ten about the present whereas annals and chronicles are devoted to the past, he later adds that annalistic entries were recordings of events made by ocular witnesses.⁹⁸ From the annals of Hydatius (c. AD 400–68) to the thirteenth century, short chronological recordings of events contain narrative sections, while elaborate narrative compositions occasionally include brief excerpts of annalistic nature.⁹⁹

By contrast with Isidore's attempt to establish a practical distinction between history as a narration whose chronological aspect is subordinated to the line of argument and the chronicle as a compendium of events inserted into a timeline, it appears that mediaeval authors were not always certain whether what they were composing should be correctly called chronicles or histories; nor did they excessively worry about generic nomenclature. Thus we should not be surprised that the late ninth-century *Chronicle of Alfonso III* uses the terms *cronica* and *istoria* interchangeably when it refers to Isidore's *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*:

Aldefonsus rex Sabastiano nostro salutem. Notum tibi sit **de istoria Gotorum**, pro qua nobis per Dulcidium presbiterem notuisti [...]. Et **quia Gotorum cronica** usque ad tempore gloriosi Uuambani regis Ysidorus Spalensis sedis episcopus plenissime edocuit, et nos quidem ex eo tempore, sicut ab antiquis et a predecessoribus nostris audiuius et uera esse cognouimus, tibi breuiter intimabimus.¹⁰⁰

(King Alfonso sends a greeting to our Sebastian. Take note of the *History of the Goths*, for which you sent us a request through Presbyter Dulcidius [...]. And because Isidore, bishop of Seville, fully developed the *Chronicle of the Goths* until the time of the glorious King Wamba, we as well, as we heard and learned it to be true from the ancients and our predecessors, will briefly inform you [about events that have occurred] from that time on.)

In much the same way, the *Chronica Naiarensis* refers to Orosius's *Seven Books of History* as a 'chronicle' ('Orosius ad Agustinum scribit in cronica'), while Lucas of Tuy, in the prologue to his *Chronicon mundi*, refers to Isidore's historiographical works as chronicles ('libros cronicorum a doctore Yspaniarum Ysidoro editos') but loosely identifies the works of Julius Africanus, Eusebius of Caesarea, Jerome, and Victor of Tunnuna as histories:

⁹⁸ Isidore, *Etymologiae*, I. 44. 4, pp. 359–60 and I. 1–4, p. 358.

⁹⁹ See Francisco Rico, 'Las letras latinas del siglo XII en Galicia, León y Castilla', *Abaco*, 2 (1969), 9–92 (p. 52).

¹⁰⁰ *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, version *Ad Sebastianum*, p. 115, emphasis added.

Breuem temporum annotationem per generationes et regna primus ex nostris Iulius Affricanus [...] simplice **historie** stilo elicuit, dehinc Eusebius Cesariensis episcopus atque sancte memorie Iheronimus presbiter **ronicorum multiplicem ystoriam** ediderunt regnis simul ac temporibus ordinatum. [...] Victor ecclesie Tunnensis episcopus recensitis predictorum **ystoriis** gesta sequentium etatum usque ad consulatum Iustiniani iunioris expleuit.¹⁰¹

Although Lucas uses the term *cronica* with reference to any account organized chronologically by regnal years and written with the purpose of committing the deeds of the nobility to memory, what he seems to understand by history may be properly described as a compendium, or *summa chronicarum*: ‘Cronica “antiqua series” interpretatur, et dicitur a “cronos”, quod est “tempus” uel “series”, siue “longum”, et scriptis continet opera nobilium hominum, ne more labencium aquarum ab humanis mentibus dilabantur’.¹⁰²

The distinction between the mediaeval Latin genres of *historia* and *chronica* (*cronica*) is further complicated by their apparent overlap with what appear to be manifestations of other narrative genres that are now considered forgotten or lost.¹⁰³ The author of the early twelfth-century *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*) never refers to his own composition as a *chronica* or *historia*; instead, he prefers to use the generic terms *gestae* (with reference to actions protagonized by Christians) and *vita* (referring to the life and deeds of Alfonso VI).¹⁰⁴ Conversely, when Eulogius of Córdoba informs readers in *Apologeticus martyrum* that during his trip to Lleida, while browsing manuscripts in a monastic library he came upon a ‘brief anonymous history’ about the Prophet Muḥammad (‘apud Legerense coenobium [...] de nefando uate **historiolam** absque auctores nomine reperi’), he refers to what we would term *vita* today.¹⁰⁵ Additionally, the generic term *chronica* may refer to a biography, as in the passage from the *Rotensis* redaction of the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, which also appears in the *Chronica Naiarensis*. Here, the author uses the term *cronica* to allude to the portion of his own text containing a biographical sketch of Alfonso: ‘Mauricato

¹⁰¹ *Chronica Naiarensis*, II. 13, p. 50; Lucas, *Chronicon*, I. 1, p. 11.

¹⁰² Lucas, *Chronicon*, Prologue, p. 10.

¹⁰³ Mentions of up to thirty-three distinct generic denominations have been identified in the work of Alfonso X (*razón, fazañas, fablas*); most of them are now believed to have been forgotten. Fernando Gómez Redondo, ‘Terminología genérica en la “Estoria de España” alfonsí’, *RLM*, 1 (1989), pp. 53–57.

¹⁰⁴ For example, *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), p. 119.

¹⁰⁵ Eulogius, *Apologeticus martyrum*, 15, p. 483.

mortuo Ueremudus Froilane filius, cuius prius in **cronica** Adefonsi maioris mantionem fecimus, quia frater eius fuit, in regno elegitur' ('Upon the death of Mauregato, Bermudo, son of Fruela, is elected to be king, of whom previously, in the **chronicle** of Alfonso the Great, we said that he was his brother').¹⁰⁶

This apparent lack of distinction between histories, chronicles, and *vitae* suggests that for mediaeval Latin authors, hagiography likely formed part of a single broadly defined historiographical genre, and that they did not necessarily draw sharp distinctions between pragmatic, or apologetic, and narrative history.¹⁰⁷ Such a distinction arose in modern times, when the construction of modern national identities led to the emergence of a class of professional historians and the emancipation of institutional historiography from theology.¹⁰⁸

¹⁰⁶ *Chronicle of Alfonso III, Rotensis version*, p. 212; *Chronica Naiarensis*, II. 20, p. 53.

¹⁰⁷ With regard to the dialectic relationship between hagiography and historiography, Patrick Henriet notes that the former incorporates civil, political, monarchical, comital, and other aristocratic elites with the aim of sacralizing their dominions. With the same goal, historiographical narration includes stories of saints and relics. The two narrative modalities differ in focus: whereas historiography comprises universal time and space (e.g. the world, Christianity, or a particular kingdom or kingdoms), the hagiographic *récit* is anchored in a locality it aims to sacralize. However, the *chronica* may defend the importance of a certain locality, while the *vita* on occasions extends the sacred character associated with a person to an ample space. Henriet argues that the relationship between hagiography and history is particularly close on the Iberian Peninsula, where 'the saint is never too far from a king'. Patrick Henriet, 'Hagiographie et historiographie en Péninsule Ibérique (XI–XIII siècles). Quelques remarques', *CLHM*, 23 (2000), 53–86 (pp. 55–57). In selecting texts for this study, I follow Hillgarth, who goes even further in stating that, given this close relationship between history and hagiography, one must also consider the passions of martyrs and the lives of saints produced in Spain as part of Spanish historiography ('Historiography in Visigothic Spain', p. 261).

¹⁰⁸ Berger, 'National Historiographies', p. 39. The distinction between pragmatic, or apologetic, and narrative history is found in Zacarías García Villada, *Historia Eclesiástica de España*, 4 vols (Madrid: Compañía Ibero-Americana de publicaciones; Razón y Fe, 1929), II (1932), p. 268.

Cf. the following observation made about mediaeval European historiographical genres: 'The classical distinction between "history", "chronicle", "annals", and the like tended to yield to a new genre of history that arose in the Carolingian period called the *gesta*, an account of "deeds" made memorable by virtue of those who performed them, whether kings, bishops, saints, or sinners, rather than by their chronological scope or intrinsic importance. [...] Medieval Europe was able to sustain an enormous variety of historiographical genres, including universal chronicles, monastic histories, biographies, hagiographies, imperial, royal, and dynastic chronicles, as well as aristocratic, urban and scholastic texts, but it cared little for the formal distinctions that might be thought important to their definition.' Gabrielle M. Spiegel, 'Historical Thought in Medieval Europe', in *A Companion to Western Historical Thought*, ed. by Lloyd Craker and Sarah Maza (Oxford: Blackwell, 2002), pp. 78–98 (pp. 80–81).

This was not the case in mediaeval Iberia, where Mozarabic *vitae sanctorum* such as the *Documentum martyriale* composed by Eulogius of Córdoba (c. 851) fully adapted the subject matter of pagan histories — great deeds by warriors and rulers — to the purpose of composing apologetic accounts of Cordovan martyrs. There, epithets and expressions typical of statesmen and warriors, for example *milites Christi, certamina, gesta bellatorum, bellatores, praelium Dei*, applied to both male and female martyrs. Eulogius vividly describes a moment of hesitation in titling his own work as he recognizes its synthetic nature, wherein apology and history are closely intertwined: ‘potius Apologeticus sanctorum quam Gesta solummodo martyrum appellari decrevi’ (‘I decided to call it *Apologeticus sanctorum* rather than only *Deeds of the Martyrs*’).¹⁰⁹ Conversely, the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*) exemplifies how political history adapted *vitae sanctorum* to descriptions of military leaders and royal figures. The Leonese chronicler confesses that while relating the episode of the transfer of Isidore’s body from Seville to León in 1063, he fought the temptation to expose the saint’s miracles: ‘Sed mihi, qui regnum gesta tantummodo scribere proposui, non est intentio in presentiarum euoluere, quanta et quam creba miracula [...] a diuino opifice sunt perpetrare’ (‘But since I proposed only to write about the great royal deeds, it is not my intention at this time to elaborate on how many miracles were performed [by him] and how frequently through the divine artifice’).¹¹⁰ The author reveals that his awareness of his initial purpose, to glorify the deeds of Alfonso VI of León and Castile, weighed heavily on his decision as he selected events to be included in the chronicle.

The notable kinship between history, chronicle, and hagiography as varieties of a genre that defines itself as distinct from fiction is a characteristic of Iberian Latinity that subsequently dissolves in Romance historiographical production. Whereas in the Castilian works of Alfonso the Wise, the terms *historia* and *crónica* are still used without distinction, from the late thirteenth century onward ‘history’ begins to be associated with literary fiction whilst the term ‘chronicle’ continues to be understood in the traditional sense of an historiographical account.¹¹¹ This study therefore considers hagiography, along with

¹⁰⁹ Eulogius, *Apologeticus*, 15, p. 476.

¹¹⁰ *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), p. 204. This passage is recorded in the *Chronica Naiarensis*, III. 24, p. 106.

¹¹¹ ‘La denominación de *crónica* se aplica a la historiografía en romance de los ss. XIV–XV mientras que *historia* se aplica a los libros creados desde una voluntad de ficción. Las crónicas pueden estar formadas por estorias, mientras que el caso inverso no se plantea. Estoria y crónica constituyen, por tanto, dos polos opuestos en el problema de la representación literaria de la

chronicles and histories, as a participant in a group of texts that share traits such as chronological organization, various degrees of narrative extension, and a focus on events, deeds, and characters worthy of being committed to memory. These include important political, military, and ecclesiastical matters and those protagonized by both lay and ecclesiastical figures. Forgoing the modern-day distinction between apologetic (pragmatic) and narrative history is advantageous, since the inclusion of hagiographical accounts provides important additional insights into the negotiation of unity and diversity in post-Visigothic Spain.

realidad. Entre las dos visiones caben, entonces, la mayor parte de las posibilidades genéricas creadas entre 1270 y 1340.' Fernando Gómez Redondo, 'Terminología genérica', p. 63. For the evolution of historiography into fiction, see also James Fogelquist, *El Amadís y el género de la historia fingida* (Madrid: José Porrúa Turanzas, 1982).

THE EPIC'S POOR COUSINS: MEDIAEVAL IBERIAN LATIN CHRONICLES IN TWENTIETH-CENTURY PHILOLOGY

Mediaeval Iberian Latin chronicles and histories are among the principal narrative sources of knowledge about seventh- and early eighth-century Visigothic society, its demise after the Arab invasion of Spain in 711, and the subsequent development of power nuclei in Asturias, León, and Castile between the eighth and mid-thirteenth centuries. Alongside records of church councils, legal documents, and royal charters, Latin chronicles are a fundamental source on the development of political thought in the region, particularly in León and Castile, where they served as lessons in *ars regendi* prior to the emergence of the genre of *specula principum*.¹ Although they have been thoroughly exploited by historians of mediaeval Spain, Latin chronicles and histories as *literary* compositions have, until recently, had little place in Spain's philological tradition.

The reasons for this neglect are to be found in the early years of Spain's modern medievalism, which developed as a response to the unflattering image of Spain that had formed in nineteenth-century European Romantic scholarship. European Romantics were a product of fundamental socio-political changes

¹ See Georges Martin, *Les Juges de Castile: Mentalités et discours historique dans l'Espagne médiévale* (Paris: Klincksieck, 1992), p. 205; Manuel A. Rodríguez de la Peña, 'Ideología política y crónicas monásticas: la concepción cluniacense de la realeza en la España del siglo XII', *AEM*, 30 (2000), 681–734 (p. 682).

that had been underway in Europe in the aftermath of the French Revolution and the Napoleonic wars. At that juncture in history, a continent that, in the words of John H. Elliott, had consisted of a 'patchwork of polities, running all the way from prince-bishoprics to large composite monarchies' saw the formation of centralized European nation states.² To the extent that Romantics constructed medievalism as a field that interpreted historical origins of nations and national identities, philology, one of its particular branches, combined

the linguistic study of the particular dialect that a nation-state has elevated as its own national language (its language of culture, bureaucracy, and education), and the study of the literary compositions that use this language, starting with the very first examples and following with what are considered its greatest accomplishments.³

Epic poetry became the preferred object of study by European medievalists, since it was believed to be the earliest and least mediated expression of an emerging nation's spirit and values. It was the existence of early mediaeval vernacular epic poems such as the *Beowulf* in Britain, the *Song of the Nibelungs* in Germany, and the *Song of Roland* in France, rather than the availability of a mediaeval body of literature in Latin, that was perceived as bolstering those industrialized powers' political claims of nationhood.⁴

Unlike England, France, and Germany, Spain had been experiencing a long period of decline throughout the nineteenth century. Having reached its apogee in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, the Spanish empire had slowly been disintegrating as Latin American independence movements gained momentum starting in the late eighteenth century. The elites of the new nations that would soon be created in Spain's former colonies looked to England and France, and not their former metropolis, in search of political models of nationhood. In the nineteenth century, as Spain became perceived as a poor cousin at the table of European nations, so did its early literature: European philologists denied Spain the existence of an early literary tradition by arguing that its earliest vernacular

² John H. Elliott, *History in the Making* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2012), p. 76.

³ Nadia Altschul, *The Geographies of Philological Knowledge: Postcoloniality and the Transatlantic National Epic* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013), pp. 7–8. The image of Spain in Romantic scholarship has been thoroughly explored in this work. I therefore limit myself to a brief summary of its major points as they relate to the study of Latin chronicles of mediaeval Spain.

⁴ Altschul, *Geographies*, p. 86.

epic, the *Poema de Mío Cid*, lacked originality, being instead an imitation of French models.⁵ Because the genre of the epic was believed to be a repository of national character and testimony to its primordial existence, denying Spain an epic tradition was, in the words of Nadia Altschul, tantamount to 'colonializing Spain within a European context'.⁶

The first scholar to counter the European view that Spain had not possessed early epic poetry was the Catalan professor of aesthetics Manuel Milà y Fontanals (1818–84). Considered one of the chief exponents of Spanish Romanticism, Milà passionately defended the existence of a series of Castilian epic songs as proof of the early independent spirit of Spain. For Milà, such spirit was due to the weak, belated, and incomplete character of Castilian feudalism. Its defining features were the existence of strong royal power, an aristocracy without privileges, and the lack of the principle of primogeniture in the division of lands, which in turn created a class of impoverished nobility.⁷ On the other hand, Milà held that an abundance of free men willing to reconquer Muslim-occupied lands and settle frontier zones produced a class of independent landowners so numerous that their spirit of chivalry became shared by the common people.⁸ Apart from the Cidian epic tradition, whose early existence he defended, Milà postulated an early existence of epic cycles commemorating Astur-Leonese and Castilian legendary heroes. Milà argued that following the peak of its production in the eleventh and twelfth centuries, epic poetry did not disappear in Spain but was preserved, in fragmented form, in the *romancero*, the Spanish ballad tradition.

⁵ For example, Reinhard Dozy, *Recherches sur l'histoire politique et littéraire de l'Espagne pendant le moyen âge* (Leiden: Brill, 1849; rev. edns 1860 and 1881); Ferdinand Joseph Wolf, *Studien zur Geschichte der spanischen und portugiesischen Nationalliteratur* (Berlin, Leipzig: A. Asher & Co., 1859); Gaston Paris, *Histoire poétique de Charlemagne* (Paris: Franck, 1865).

⁶ Altschul, *Geographies*, p. 93.

⁷ The idea of the immaturity of Spanish feudalism was later reiterated by José Ortega y Gasset in *La España invertebrada* (Madrid: Calpe, 1922) (*The Invertebrate Spain*, trans. by Mildred Adams (New York: Fertig, 1974)). See also Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *España, un enigma histórico* (Buenos Aires: Editorial Sudamericana, 1956), and its English version *Spain, an Historical Enigma*, trans. by Colette Joly Dees and David Sven Reher, 2 vols (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 1975), II, 621–706. See also Henry Kamen, *Spain 1469–1714: A Society of Conflict*, 3rd edn (Harlow: Longman/Pearson, 2005; 1st edn 1983), pp. 11–12.

⁸ Manuel Milà y Fontanals, 'Oración general acerca del carácter general de la literatura española, leída ante el Claustro de la Universidad de Barcelona en la apertura del curso de 1865 a 1866', in *De la poesía heroico-popular castellana. Estudio precedido de una oración acerca de la literatura española* (Barcelona: Librería de Alvaro Verdaguier, 1874), pp. i–xxxvii (pp. vi–vii).

Milà adopted a neutral, if guarded, stance toward Spanish Latin letters. For him, Latin and vernacular mediaeval compositions expressed different but complementary facets of the Spanish national spirit:

Si se abren las páginas de la historia, escrita por graves clérigos y letrados, se reconoce la inspiración del principio monárquico y de la guerra nacional, que era el blanco más noble de las acciones de aquellos tiempos; mas si se oye una rapsodia heroica, se percibe a menudo diverso acento. [...] No tanto un sistema político, como un sentimiento popular y guerrero y en cierta manera moral, imprimió este sello en determinadas narraciones.

(If one opens the pages of history, written by sombre clerics and men of letters, one recognizes the inspiration of the monarchical principle and national war, which was the most noble goal of the [human] deeds in those times; but if one hears a heroic song, one often perceives a different emphasis. [...] Not so much a political system as a popular, warlike, and in some measure moral spirit left its mark on certain narrations.⁹)

It was not kings and courtiers but rebel heroes such as Bernardo del Carpio, the *Infantes de Lara*, Fernán González, and the Cid, members of warfaring, unlearned nobility, ‘which was also people’ (‘que era también pueblo’), who embodied this independent character.¹⁰ Still, unlike his philological successors, Milà did not draw sharp divisions between Latin and vernacular literature, noting instead occasional instances of their fusion. Such examples included the *mester de clerecía*, a genre of thirteenth-century vernacular didactic poetry that was based on principles of Latin verse composition, and the fourteenth-century vernacular composition *Poema de Alfonso XI*, a blend of history and epic.

Milà’s disciple Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo (1856–1912), an aestheticist and literary critic who became a professor of literature and director of the National Library of Spain (1898–1912), adopted a similar non-exclusionary approach to Latin literature in the context of the history of Spanish letters. His *Bibliografía hispano-latina clásica*, a comprehensive listing of Classical Latin works published in 1902, was supplied with a commentary on their aesthetic influence on Spanish vernacular letters. It testifies to the fact that early in the twentieth century, Latin models were still seen as integral to the development of vernacular literature.¹¹

⁹ Milà y Fontanals, ‘Oración general’, pp. x–xi.

¹⁰ Milà y Fontanals, ‘Oración general’, p. xi.

¹¹ Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo, *Bibliografía hispano-latina clásica: códices, ediciones, comentarios, traducciones, estudios críticos, influencia de cada uno de los clásicos latinos en la literatura española* (Madrid: Tipografía de Vda. e Hijos de M. Tello, 1902).

Menéndez Pelayo admitted, albeit reticently, a place for the mediaeval Latin literature of Spain in his *Programme for the History of Spanish Literature* (*Programa de Historia de Literatura Española*), an early twentieth-century document in which he outlined the future of Spanish national literary historiography. According to the *Programme*, the goal of Spain's national literature was to celebrate its own unity in the diversity of regional and vernacular compositions produced on the Iberian Peninsula. Consistent with this purpose, such a corpus had to include works created not only in Castilian, but also in Galician Portuguese, Catalan, Hebrew, Arabic, and Latin.¹² By Latin works, Menéndez Pelayo understood primarily poetry, which he valued as an indispensable source of knowledge about the origins of the vernacular rhyming and metric systems.¹³

By early twentieth-century standards, the mediaeval Latin chronicles of Spain were considered to be less sophisticated versions of their classical predecessors. This made them a suitable study aid for students of Classical Latin. The first modern edition of Spanish Latin chronicles, which appeared in 1913, was a practical manual consisting of primary texts supplied with a line-by-line Spanish translation.¹⁴ Its compiler, the Jesuit scholar of Latin and Arabic Ambrosio Huici Miranda (1880–1973), advocated that studying the Latin of mediaeval Spanish chronicles was advantageous compared to the study of a more complex Classical Latin in that it familiarized Spanish pupils with their country's linguistic and cultural heritage.¹⁵ At the time, Iberian Latin chronicles were still valued as examples of the Spanish cultural tradition, much in the same way that they had been in pre-modern Spain: the bulk of Huici's anthology derived from the *España Sagrada*, a pre-modern edition of Spanish Latin chronicles compiled by the Augustinian scholar Enrique Flórez (1701–73).¹⁶

The first scholar to draw a sharp division between Latin and vernacular literary production was Spain's most influential modern philologist, Ramón Menéndez Pidal (1869–1968). The ultimate goal of Menéndez Pidal's research

¹² The *Programa* remained unpublished until 1924. See Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo, *Antología de estudios y discursos literarios*, ed. by Mario Crespo López (Madrid: Cátedra, 2009), pp. 22–25; Xoán González-Millán, 'Menéndez Pelayo y su proyecto historiográfico de una "nacionalidad literaria" española plurilingüe', *Boletín de la Biblioteca de Menéndez Pelayo*, 82 (2006), pp. 393–428.

¹³ González-Millán, 'Menéndez Pelayo', p. 404.

¹⁴ Ambrosio Huici, *Las crónicas latinas de la reconquista. Estudios prácticos de latín medioeval*, 2 vols (Valencia: Hijos de F. Vives Mora, 1913).

¹⁵ Ambrosio Huici, *Crónicas*, I, 8.

¹⁶ *España Sagrada*, ed. by Enrique Flórez (Madrid: Rodríguez, 1747–75).

was to critically avenge contemporary Spain against those European scholars who denied it the existence of an early epic and, consequently, the emergence of an early national literature and national identity. Otherwise put, his aim was to 'decolonise' Spain from European views that employed comparative philology to deny Spain the status of a select European nation.¹⁷ In the earliest of his many major works, *La leyenda de los Infantes the Lara* (1896), he fully developed Milà's thesis of the origins of Castilian romances in lost epic songs (*cantares de gesta*), and he dedicated much of his career to a passionate vindication of the Spanish epic, as well as the *romancero*, as proof of the antiquity and uninterrupted character of the Spanish literary tradition.¹⁸ In 1898, Menéndez Pidal became the first modern scholar to catalogue manuscripts of Spanish chronicles and histories from the National Library collections, but the main thrust of this work was to further his argument about the historicity of the Spanish epic and ballads.¹⁹ One of his early works, *The Castilian Epic in Spanish Literature* (*La epopeya castellana a través de la literatura española*), which began as a series of lectures delivered at Johns Hopkins University in 1909, was ostensibly composed for foreign audiences; its first edition appeared in French.²⁰ The purpose of the work was to prove the superiority of Spanish epic over its French generic equivalent in historical realism, ability to reflect the national character, and capacity to evolve and transmit such character to modern times. Menéndez Pidal postulated that these qualities of the Spanish epic were preserved unchanged over the centuries and became reflected in late mediaeval romances, Renaissance theatre, and modern Romantic literature.

¹⁷ Altschul, *Geographies*, p. 93.

¹⁸ Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *La España del Cid*, 2 vols (Madrid: Plutarco, 1929); Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *Floresta de leyendas heroicas españolas*, 3 vols (Madrid: Ediciones de La Lectura, 1925–27); Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *Historia y epopeya* (Madrid: Librería y Casa Editorial Hernando, 1934); Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *La epopeya castellana a través de la literatura española* (Buenos Aires-México: Espasa-Calpe Argentina, 1946); Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *Romancero Hispánico* (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1953). See Menéndez Pelayo's praise of Menéndez Pidal in his speech, 'La primitiva poesía heroica', delivered in 1902, in Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo, *Antología*, pp. 429–44.

¹⁹ Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *Crónicas generales de España. Catálogo de la Real Biblioteca*, 1 (Madrid: Rivadeneyra, 1898); subsequent editions appeared in 1900 and 1918. See Ángel Gómez Moreno, 'Ramón Menéndez Pidal', in *Rewriting the Middle Ages in the Twentieth Century*, ed. by Jaume Aurell and Francisco Crosas (Turnhout: Brepols, 2005), p. 75.

²⁰ Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *L'épopée castillane à travers la littérature espagnole*, trans. by Henry Mérimée (Paris: A. Colin, 1910), publ. in Spanish as *La epopeya castellana a través de la literatura española* (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1959).

One of the consequences of this lifelong dispute with a generation of Europeans that had denied Spain the existence of a vernacular epic tradition was that Menéndez Pidal systematically elevated the significance and originality of the Spanish epic and denied the significance and originality of Spanish Latin culture.²¹ His passionate dispute with European scholars had profound consequences for the study of Latin chronicles and histories of Spain, as it set the parameters according to which Spanish Latin poetic and prose production would be examined throughout most of the twentieth century. In the early 1900s, Menéndez Pidal constructed mediaeval history as a genre auxiliary to that of the epic, which he regarded as Spain's original history. Born out of the necessity to possess an historical narrative in a society that lacked the use of writing, the epic was the 'sung history' ('la historia cantada'), a 'historiographic poem' ('un poema historiográfico') destined for use by people who were ignorant in Latin. The epic either competed with codified history ('la historia escrita') or coexisted alongside it, as prosified interpolations of lost epic poems were incorporated into historiographical texts.²²

When Menéndez Pidal turned to historical prose his goals were twofold: (1) to prove the historical character of the Castilian epic and (2) to study prosified versions of Spanish epic in twelfth-, thirteenth-, and fourteenth-century histori-

²¹ Menéndez Pidal's later works, *Los godos y la epopeya española. 'Chansons de geste' y baladas nórdicas* (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1956) and *La épica francesa y el tradicionalismo. Lecciones profesadas los días 10, 11 y 12 de febrero de 1958 en la Cátedra Milà y Fontanals* (Barcelona: Imprenta Clarasó, 1958) were a continuation of a polemical dialogue with Joseph Bédier and Gaston Paris, who, having granted Spain the existence of an early epic tradition, now argued in favour of the individual, rather than collective, process of composing epic poetry. This, for Menéndez Pidal, was unacceptable, for only works composed collectively could have served the noble mission of formulating and transmitting the national spirit and values of Spain. For Menéndez Pidal, the *Poema de Mio Cid*, whose earliest manuscript version is dated to 1207, represented the first of such unmediated expressions. Inconveniently, however, there existed a late eleventh-century Latin epic poem composed in the Cidian tradition. The anonymous *Carmen Campidoctoris* (*The Song of the Campeador*), as it came to be known (Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, Latin MS 5132, dated between 1082 and 1093), pre-dates the first known vernacular version of the *Poema de Mio Cid* and is thus the earliest of extant epic compositions from the Iberian Peninsula. See *Carmen Campidoctoris*, ed. by Juan Gil, in *Chronica hispana saeculi XII*, 2 vols, ed. by Emma Falque, Juan Gil, and Antonio Maya, CCCM, 71 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1995), I, 101–08 (p. 101). Menéndez Pidal resolved this difficulty by describing the *Carmen Campidoctoris* as 'a Latin imitation' of a putatively lost earlier vernacular version of the Cidian epic. Menéndez Pidal, *La épica francesa*, p. 72.

²² Menéndez Pidal, *La épica francesa*, p. 75; *La España del Cid*, 6th edn (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1967), p. 203.

cal compilations. Such findings were thought to bolster claims of the superiority of the epic over Latin historical compositions in veracity, informative value, and creative capacity. Thus, in one of his most influential works, titled *The Cid and his Spain* (*La España del Cid*), first published in 1929 and numerous reprinted, Menéndez Pidal draws multiple comparisons between the early twelfth-century Latin prose chronicle *Historia Roderici* and the *Poema de Mio Cid*. In doing so, he purports to support his postulate regarding the historicity of the epic poem and, simultaneously, to declare its superior literary value compared to the Latin chronicle in terms of plot structure and character development.

His passionate defence of the Spanish epic led Menéndez Pidal to define mediaeval Spanish Latin historiography by what it was not, and throughout the twentieth century Spanish Latin chronicles and histories were consistently found both unimportant and underdeveloped from a philological standpoint, lacking elaboration in each of their constitutive components, including purpose, chronology, selection and organization of material, and the logical relationship of cause and effect.²³ The first post-Civil War years, which were

²³ Eloy Benito Ruano echoes Menéndez Pidal when he states that the Spanish Latin chronicle has no capacity for self-reflection, in 'La historiografía en la Alta Edad Media española. Ideología y estructura,' *CHE*, 17 (1952), 50–104 (p. 55). Bernard Guenée believes that prior to the twelfth century, history was a subproduct of religion and during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries became a subproduct of literature. Guenée regarded historiography as an inconsequential genre in the mediaeval public discourse, 'fatalement de seconde main' compared to theological, hagiographical, rhetorical, poetic, philosophical, and legal texts ('Y a-t-il une historiographie médiévale?', *Revue Historique*, 258 (1977), 261–75 (p. 267). Pedro Juan Galán Sánchez laments that the chronicles by Eusebius, Prosperus, Hydatius, John of Biclar, and Isidore lack any literary pretention and could have been written by anyone who knew how to write, in *El género historiográfico de la chronica: las crónicas hispanas de la época visigoda* (Cáceres: Universidad de Extremadura, 1994), pp. 20–21. Even Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, whose vision of Spain's mediaeval history was to a great extent based on a rigorous study of Latin chronicle sources, deplored the 'defects' of Astur-Leonese historiography. In particular, he singled out Sampiro's Leonese chronicle for its poor narrative quality, contrasting the composition unfavourably to contemporary Arabic and French chronicles (Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *La España cristiana de los siglos VIII a XI: sociedad, economía, gobierno, cultura y vida*, in *Historia de España Ramón Menéndez Pidal*, ed. by José María Jover Zamora (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1935–2005), VII (1980), pp. 695–98). Jacques Horrent was similarly underwhelmed by the frugality of the Leonese *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), the *Chronicon mundi* by Lucas of Tuy and the *Historia de rebus Hispanie* by Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, in 'L'invasion de l'Espagne par les musulmans selon l'*Historia Silense*, le *Chronicon Mundi* et l'*Historia de rebus Hispaniae*', in *Studia in honorem prof. M. de Riquer*, ed. by Carlos Alvar and Martín de Riquer, 4 vols (Barcelona: Cuaderns Crema, 1987), II, 373–94. Jocelyn N. Hillgarth echoed the sentiment of insignificance felt with regard to the Latin historiography of Spain when he said: 'Written

marked by the Castile-centric dictatorship of Francisco Franco (1939–75) and Spain's international isolation in the 1940s and 1950s, proved particularly unfruitful for the study of Spanish Latin chronicles. It was during this time that Menéndez Pidal furthered his claim regarding the political and linguistic primacy of Castile in the creation of the Spanish nation — an idea that would later be looked on with suspicion by those who interpreted it as a form of ideological support for Francoism.²⁴

One of the essential theses in Menéndez Pidal's argument for Castilian pre-eminence was its linguistically innovative character vis-à-vis the rival kingdom of León. In his seminal work *The Origins of the Spanish Language* (*Orígenes de la lengua española*), the first systematic study of the emergence of Iberian Romance dialects, which first appeared in 1926 and was significantly revised in 1950, Menéndez Pidal underscores the unusual survival of vulgar Latin in tenth- and eleventh-century Leonese notarial documents as proof of the kingdom's archaic, calcified character compared to the dynamic and innovative political and linguistic culture of Castile.²⁵ He believed that the Leonese variant of Latin had been spoken in the southern Iberian Peninsula in the fifth and sixth centuries and was brought north in the ninth century by Andalusí Christians who had lived under Muslim rule. Because Mozarabic Latin, as this southern Iberian variant of Latin came to be known, reappeared in the north

history in Visigothic Spain should be seen in perspective, as occupying a place in the arsenal of royal propaganda — a *minor* place because only few men could be reached by the written word in the seventh century, compared to the crowds which could be dazzled by the churches erected by kings in Toledo, their sanctuaries adorned by hanging votive crowns, providing the setting for the Church Councils, the Coronation service or the “Order when the king goes out to battle” in the *Liber Ordinum*.’ Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, ‘Historiography in Visigothic Spain’, in *Visigothic Spain, Byzantium, and the Irish*, Collected Studies, 216 (London: Variorum Reprints, 1985), pp. 261–311 (p. 273) (first publ. in *La storiografia altomedievale*, Settimane, 17 (Spoleto, 1970), pp. 261–311), emphasis by the author.

²⁴ Peter Linehan, in ‘The Court Historian of Francoism: La *leyenda oscura* of Ramón Menéndez Pidal’, *BHS*, 73 (1996), 437–50. See also Michael Gerli, ‘Inventing the Spanish Middle Ages: Ramón Menéndez Pidal, Spanish Cultural History, and Ideology in Philology’, *La Corónica*, 30 (2001), 111–26; Maya Soifer, ‘Beyond *convivencia*: Critical Reflections on the Historiography of Interfaith Relations in Christian Spain’, *JMIS*, 1 (2009), 19–35; John Tolan, ‘Using the Middle Ages to Construct Spanish Identity: 19th and 20th Century Spanish Historiography of Reconquest’, in *Historiographical Approaches to Medieval Colonization of East Central Europe*, ed. by Jan M. Piskorski (Boulder, CO: East European Monographs, 2002), pp. 329–47.

²⁵ Menéndez Pidal, *Orígenes del español. Estado lingüístico de la península Ibérica hasta el siglo XI* (Madrid: Librería y Casa Editorial Hernando, 1926).

after centuries of presumed isolation from the outside world, it was perceived as an inferior language that would in turn ‘contaminate’ the phonetics, morphology, and syntax of scholastic Latin, a variety that was used to compose chronicles, hagiography, laws, and other erudite texts in the Iberian north. Since the use of vulgar Latin had disappeared in France during Charlemagne’s time, Menéndez Pidal perceived the widespread use of Latin in the kingdom of León in the tenth and eleventh centuries not as evidence of the robust and productive character of that kingdom’s Latin culture, but rather as proof of its retrograde nature.²⁶ By contrast, Castile, whose political culture and the use of Romance Menéndez Pidal considered dynamic and innovative, would overcome the cultural belatedness of mediaeval Spain and would act as a unifying force for other peninsular Christian kingdoms.

Menéndez Pidal’s view of mediaeval Spanish Latin culture as one locked into a pattern of progressive impoverishment and decline stemmed from his perception of Spain as a closed society during the centuries of Muslim domination. The longest of such periods of isolation, according to Menéndez Pidal, began with the arrival of the first Muslims in the early eighth century and lasted until the dissolution of the caliphate of Córdoba in the tenth. It was pre-Islamic Spain that, for Menéndez Pidal, was the ‘daughter of the Mediterranean culture’ (*hija de la cultura mediterránea*), which he associated with Greek and Latin antiquity and African Christian Latinity. As that culture was superseded by Islam, and as North Africa ceased to be a source of renewal for Iberian Latinate culture, Spain purportedly also failed to participate in the new ‘Nordic’, or Germanic, Latinity that developed in Carolingian Europe and whose currents would arrive on the peninsula only belatedly and in their already near-exhausted form.²⁷

This image of a mediaeval society left to cultivate its *ipsedad*, or ‘sameness’ — understood as the impermeability to foreign cultural and linguistic influences — was Menéndez Pidal’s projection of Spain’s post-World War II isolation from the Western and Transatlantic world.²⁸ However, despite his isolationist views on the country’s past, he conceded mediaeval Spain a modest degree of integration into the cultural mainstream of the Mediterranean. Thus, he believed

²⁶ Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *Orígenes del español. Estado lingüístico de la península Ibérica hasta el siglo XI*, 5th edn (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1964), pp. 441–45.

²⁷ Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *Los españoles en la historia. Ensayo introductorio de Diego Catalán* (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1982; first publ. 1947), pp. 193–94.

²⁸ Diego Catalán, introduction to Menéndez Pidal, in *Menéndez Pidal, Los españoles en la historia*, pp. 61–62.

that the calcified Leonese variant of Latin would eventually be bolstered by its assimilation into the European Latinate culture during the Cluniac reform toward the end of the eleventh century.²⁹ For Menéndez Pidal, the choice of Castilian vernacular over Latin in royal *scriptoria* made by Alfonso X of Castile (r. 1252–84) was a delayed response to the European tendency toward the secularization of learning, which began in the early thirteenth century. In Castile, the first manifestation of this trend was the translation of laws from the Latin by Alfonso's father Fernando III (r. Castile 1217–52). Another belated form of participation in Mediterranean cultural currents was the translating activity undertaken in the multilingual court of Alfonso X. For Menéndez Pidal, the Alfonsine translating activity mirrored two European tendencies: the patronage of Sicilian Romance by the learned King Frederick II of Italy (1194–1250) and the transition to the vernacular in France, where the first Romance historical compositions and translations appeared in the early thirteenth century.³⁰

It was not so for Américo Castro, who, in his *España en su historia* (1948), postulated that the unique mediaeval Iberian culture was born out of *convivencia*, a peaceful coexistence of Christians, Jews, and Muslims. Castro made it a particular point to emphasize his disagreement with Menéndez Pidal over the process that led to the choice of Castilian as a language of learned composition. He insisted that the use of Castilian was a deliberate decision made by Jewish translators working in the Alfonsine *scriptoria*, rather than by the learned king himself, and therefore was a uniquely Iberian development. Castro believed that Arab-speaking Jews would have loathed Latin, the language of Catholic doctrine. Instead, they embraced Castilian, their 'mother tongue', since as the Christian reconquest advanced, the Jews would have found in Castile, and particularly in Toledo, reconquered in 1085, a safe haven from Muslim persecution.

Since for Castro, the Castilian language was the common denominator of Spain's three constitutive groups (Christians, Muslims, and Jews), it corresponded to the reality of *convivencia* while Latin did not. Latin was therefore not instrumental in the emergence of 'Spain' as a distinct civilization, and Latin chronicles were generally not a worthwhile object of philological study.³¹ In

²⁹ Menéndez Pidal, *Orígenes del español*, p. 458.

³⁰ These include *La conquête de Constantinople*, composed in 1207 by Geoffroi de Villehardouin (1160–c. 1212), the translation of the Bible from the Latin toward 1235, an anonymous universal history *Livre des histoires*, and the encyclopedic *Image du monde* by Gautier de Metz (1245). Menéndez Pidal, *Los españoles en la historia*, pp. 737–38; Menéndez Pidal, 'España y la introducción de la ciencia árabe en Occidente', *Estudios segovianos*, 2 (1952), 22–23.

³¹ Américo Castro, *España en su historia: Cristianos, moros y judíos* (Buenos Aires: Editorial

his *Spaniards. An Introduction to their History* (1971), a revised and expanded version of *The Structure of Spanish History* (1954), Castro mines Latin chronicles and histories of Spain for two purposes. The first is to establish that a collective entity subsumed by the vernacular term *españoles* in late thirteenth-century texts, such as the Castilian *Estoria de España* and the Aragonese *Chronicle* by Bernard Desclot, was absent in Latin historical prose. The second goal is to prove that Latin chronicles and histories of Spain witness the formation of a caste of Christians, one of the three major groups responsible for Spain's uniqueness. Because of his interest in the nation-building agency of the Castilian language, Latin historical prose was of little interest to Castro, and because mediaeval Spain, for him, was a profoundly orientalized society, Latin cultural production was again relegated to the margins of literary study. Castro repeatedly underscored the paucity of Latin literary production in Spain compared to other European mediaeval societies, a condition he attributed to a lack of interest in the study of Latin in mediaeval Castile.³²

Castro's staunchest opponent, historian Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, was perhaps the most assiduous reader of early Latin historiographical accounts. For this scholar, chronicles were the principal sources of information on the history of Spanish feudalism, the evolution of institutions, the development of royal power in Asturias-León, and the formation of Castile as a frontier society. Like Castro, Sánchez-Albornoz postulated the uniqueness of Spain, but contrary to Castro, he squarely rejected the idea of the peaceful coexistence of Christians, Muslims, and Jews. Central to Sánchez-Albornoz's argument of the 'new uniqueness' ('unicidad nueva') was the idea that contemporary Spain originated in Roman and Visigothic times, and that the essence of Spanishness was preserved and distilled in the course of the Middle Ages through two processes that played a quintessential role in creating the Spanish nation — the reconquest of the Iberian Peninsula from the Muslims and its repopulation by the Christians.³³ Latin chronicles, for Sánchez-Albornoz, were a source of indisputable facts regarding purported Muslim barbarity and Christian resilience.³⁴ The

Losada, 1948), p. 461; 'Discrepancias y mal entender', in *Dos ensayos* (México: Porrúa, 1955), p. 60. See also Francisco Márquez Villanueva, *El concepto cultural alfonsí* (Madrid: MAPFRE, 1994), p. 43.

³² Américo Castro, *Spaniards. An Introduction to their History*, trans. by Willard F. King and Selma Margaretten (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1971), p. 16.

³³ Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *Spain*, I, 28–29.

³⁴ Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *Orígenes de la nación española. Estudios críticos sobre el reino de Asturias*, 3 vols (Oviedo: Instituto de Estudios Asturianos, 1972–75).

bulk of his studies was dedicated to the kingdom of Asturias-León, to which he attributed a central role in preserving the essence of Visigothic Spain in its purest, untainted form through leadership in reconquest and repopulation.

Both images of Spain — as a place of peaceful cohabitation by Christians, Muslims, and Jews created by Castro, and as a civilization forged in reconquest battles advocated by Sánchez-Albornoz — were projections of the country's post-Civil War present onto its past. In constructing their paradigms of Spain's uniqueness on the ideological platform of cultural isolation from the non-Iberian world during the Middle Ages, both the *castrista* scholars and their opponents utilized the autarkic blueprint first developed by Menéndez Pidal. Where the two paradigms of mediaeval Spain really differed was in the kinds of extrapeninsular influences that their advocates rejected in order to bolster their respective arguments. Because Sánchez-Albornoz equated Spain's essence with its Christian culture, he positively valued contacts between the Middle East and the Iberian Peninsula prior to the onset of Islam, but would not accept the notion that any such contacts occurring after 711 could have had long-term consequences for the development of the Spanish civilization. For him, 'Mediterranean' was a pejorative term denoting Muslim and Arab influences that threatened Spanish Catholic culture and prevented Spain from developing in step with the European Occident.³⁵ As a result of Muslim domination, Castile and León were isolated from Europe, and Spain became a place of resistance to alien cultural influences, a buffer between Islam and the European West. For Castro, and, later, for his disciple Francisco Márquez Villanueva, Iberian Latinity experienced little contact with the rest of the Mediterranean. With the exception of the Iberian north-east, where the monastery of Ripoll served as the principal point of contact with Mediterranean culture, Spain, already a geographical periphery of Europe, was an outlier of Christian Latin consciousness. Although the Iberian aperture to Cluny in the eleventh and twelfth centuries would constitute a significant external influence on peninsular Latin, Márquez Villanueva dismissed it as a 'semi-colonial' experience that put principal bishoprics and abbeys of Castile and León in the purview of the French clergy. Only the Castilian language was able to finally accommodate the reality of intra- and extrapeninsular cultural exchanges.³⁶

³⁵ Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *El drama de la formación de España y los españoles: otra nueva aventura polémica*, 2nd edn (Barcelona: EDHASA, 1977; 1st edn 1973), p. 25. See also Sánchez-Albornoz, *Spain*, I, 28.

³⁶ Márquez Villanueva, *El concepto alfonsí*, pp. 49–50, 223.

The long shadow cast by Ramón Menéndez Pidal on the study of mediaeval Iberian Latin culture meant that when historiography as a field of inquiry finally came into its own in the second half of the twentieth century, it was positioned as an area of study auxiliary to that of the epic.³⁷ As Castilian vernacular historiography became valued as a source of critical renewal of Cidian studies, Latin chronicles such as the early twelfth-century *Historia Roderici* (also known as *The Latin Chronicle of the Cid*) and the late twelfth-century *Chronica Naiarensis* were treated as source material that supported the notion of the epic's historical veracity.³⁸ Menéndez Pidal had famously made only one exception in assigning a higher value to the epic relative to chronicles and histories in that he declared the *Estoria de España*, a history commissioned by King Alfonso X the Wise of Castile, to be of superb literary value because it incorporated epic legends and was the first historical compilation written in the Castilian language.³⁹ Alfonso's use of Castilian rather than Latin was, for Menéndez Pidal, a serendipitous decision that resolved the perennial shortcoming of Latin chronicles and histories as texts written in a dead language ('la muerta lengua latina') for consumption by a marginal minority of clerics.⁴⁰

Following Menéndez Pidal's valuation, the *Estoria de España* became universally considered to be the first properly national history, one that would infuse all of the Alfonsine subjects with a sense of shared collective destiny, for in the king's own words, it versed not only about royal characters and their deeds but also included those of Iberian Christians, Muslims, and Jews ('de todos los reyes [...] et de todos los sus fechos [...] tan bien de moros como de cristianos, et aun de judíos si y acaesciesse').⁴¹ One of Menéndez Pidal's fol-

³⁷ Diego Catalán, *El Cid en la historia y sus inventores* (Madrid: Fundación Menéndez Pidal, 2002), p. 256.

³⁸ Catalán, *El Cid*, p. 277.

³⁹ Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *La Crónica General de España que mandó componer el rey Alfonso el Sabio* (Madrid: Impr. Clásica Española, 1916), pp. 38, 52.

⁴⁰ Menéndez Pidal, *La épica francesa*, p. 77.

⁴¹ Alfonso X, king of Castile and León, *Primera crónica general: Estoria de España que mandó componer Alfonso el Sabio y se continuaba bajo Sancho IV en 1289*, ed. by Ramón Menéndez Pidal (Madrid: Bailly/Baillière, 1906), p. 653. See Diego Catalán, *La Estoria de España de Alfonso X: creación y evolución*, Fuentes cronísticas de la historia de España, 5 (Madrid: Seminario Menéndez Pidal, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 1992), pp. 30–31; José Antonio Maravall, *El concepto de España en la Edad Media* (Madrid: Instituto de Estudios Políticos, 1954), pp. 33–34; Márquez Villanueva, *El concepto alfonsí*, pp. 16, 136–41; Peter Linehan, 'From Chronicle to History: Concerning the *Estoria de España* and its Principal Sources', in *Historical Literature in Medieval Iberia*, ed. by Alan Deyermond (London: Department of Hispanic Studies, Queen

lowers, historian José Antonio Maravall (1911–86), argued that the *Estoria de España* marked the inception of a ‘properly Spanish historiography’ (‘la historiografía española propiamente tal’), because its emphasis on the various peoples that successively populated the Iberian Peninsula was indicative of an historical moment when essential Spanish national values purportedly became ‘calcified and widely shared’ (‘fijados y compartidos’). By contrast, the preceding Latin historiographical tradition had primarily been focused on kings (with the exception of hagiography, which was focused on saints) and ‘minimized’ everything around them, including what was felt by ‘the people.’⁴² Maravall, however, was compelled to admit that the Alfonsine model was first developed by Lucas of Tuy and Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada.⁴³ Therein lay a contradiction, since the primordial Spanish values — chief among them the sentiment of honour — meant that every Latin chronicler and historian since Orosius would have revealed the existence of those immutable values in Roman, Visigothic, Mozarabic, and Leonese-Castilian historiographical production. Faced with this logical stumbling block, Maravall made it a particular point to reject the notion that the idea of Spain was born in erudite minds such as those that composed historical accounts; he insisted instead that the historical and political idea of Spain’s unity had always been present, and that the achievement of the erudite community was to finally articulate it.

In twentieth-century Alfonsine scholarship, the *Estoria de España* and thirteenth-century Castile became universally associated with the origins of Spanish national writing. In this light, the particularism of Latin chronicles was juxtaposed unfavourably with Alfonsine universalism; biblical providentialism, projected by Latin clerical authors, was contrasted with the secular character of Castilian monarchy; and a dynastic model that focused on the Goths and their royal descendants was deemed inferior to the Alfonsine concept of the *sennorio*, or the politically significant presence on the Iberian Peninsula of different peoples, from Greeks and Romans to Africans and Arabs.⁴⁴ Because it could not

Mary and Westfield College, 1996), pp. 7–25 (p. 8).

⁴² Maravall, *El concepto de España*, pp. 27–34, 68; Márquez Villanueva, *El concepto cultural alfonsí*, pp. 138–41.

⁴³ José Antonio Maravall, *El concepto de España*, pp. 22, 38.

⁴⁴ Diego Catalán was the earliest Spanish scholar to regard the *Historia de rebus Hispanie* as the first national history, although he admits that Rodrigo’s model was not ‘national’ in the contemporary sense of the term, given that it had little to do with modern European national histories; instead, he argues, Rodrigo’s history places the new chosen people, *gens Gothorum*, within the framework of a biblical providential history (Diego Catalán, *Estoria de España*, 29).

be denied that the *Estoria de España* builds on narrative models developed in Lucas of Tuy's *Chronicon mundi* and Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada's *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, the two historians were credited with the creation of coherent textual spaces, but the wholesale disdain for Latin led critics to claim that Alfonsine precursors were severely limited in their capacity to faithfully reflect Iberian reality.⁴⁵

In a system of thought that postulated the primordial existence of Spanish national values, whether exemplified in the Castilian language, an ethos of reconquest and repopulation, or a synthesis of Christian, Muslim, and Jewish culture, there was little place for Latin historiographical production. It would not be until the end of the twentieth century that Latin precursors to the *Estoria de España* would be brought under consideration by scholars of Spanish literature. Several critical developments contributed to this shift, chief among them the growing availability of up-to-date critical editions of major Latin chronicle texts, the lack of which until recently had complicated possibilities of their study.⁴⁶ Also instrumental to the re-evaluation of the importance of peninsular

Catalán follows Menéndez Pidal, 'Universalismo y nacionalismo. Romanos y germanos', in *Historia de España*, ed. by Ramón Menéndez Pidal (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1940), III, pp. xxiii–xxiv. On the proto-national character of the *De rebus Hispanie* as a model for Alfonso X, see also José Manuel Nieto Soria, 'La monarquía fundacional de Fernando III', in *Fernando III y su tiempo (1201–1252): VIII Congreso de Estudios Medievales*, ed. by José Manuel Nieto Soria (León: Fundación Sánchez-Albornoz, 2003), pp. 31–66.

⁴⁵ Fernando Gómez Redondo, 'Relaciones literarias entre la historiografía latina y las crónicas romances del siglo XIII', in *Actas del I Congreso de la Asociación Hispánica de Literatura Medieval. Santiago de Compostela, 2 al 6 de diciembre de 1985*, ed. by Vicente Beltrán (Barcelona: PPU, 1988), pp. 305–20.

⁴⁶ These include the edition of the *Chronicle of 741*, the *Chronicle of 754*, and apologetic works of Alvar and Eulogius of Córdoba by Juan Gil, *Corpus scriptorum muzarabicorum*, 2 vols (Madrid: CSIC, Instituto 'Antonio de Nebrija', 1973); *Chronica Albeldensia* and the *Chronicle of Alfonso III (Crónicas asturianas. Crónica de Alfonso III (Rotense y 'A Sebastián'))*. *Crónica Albeldense (y 'Profética')*, ed. by Juan Gil Fernández, José L. Moralejo, and Juan I. Ruiz de la Peña (Oviedo: Universidad de Oviedo, 1985); *Historia Compostellana*, ed. by Emma Falque Rey, CCCM, 70 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1988); editions of the *Historia Roderici*, the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, and the *Chronica Naiarensis* in *Chronica hispana saeculi XII*, ed. by Emma Falque, Antonio Maya, and Juan Antonio Estévez Sola, CCCM, 71, 2 vols (Turnhout: Brepols, 1995); Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, *Historia de rebus Hispaniae sive Historia gothica*, ed. by Fernández Valverde, CCCM, 72 C (Turnhout: Brepols, 1987); Juan, bishop of Osmá, *Chronica latina regum Castellae*, ed. by Luis Charlo Brea, CCCM, 73 (Turnhout: Brepols), 1997; Lucas, bishop of Tuy, *Chronicon mundi*, ed. by Emma Falque Rey, CCCM, 74 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003). See also Mario Huete Fudio, *La historiografía latina medieval en la península Ibérica (siglos VIII–XII). Fuentes y bibliografía* (Madrid: Universidad Autónoma, 1997); Aengus Ward, 'Past,

Latin culture was the growing awareness that the themes, structure, and style of Spain's emblematic epic poem, the *Poema de Mio Cid*, exhibit several highly erudite features shared with Latin learned compositions: liturgical accounts of virgin martyrs, legal documents, and Latin epic poems. This new awareness helped further raise the profile of the mediaeval Iberian Latin culture.⁴⁷

* * *

A secondary factor that contributed to the sidelining of Spanish Latin historical writing as an impoverished form of literary Latin was the belief that classical rhetoric had ceased to be taught in mediaeval Iberia.⁴⁸ Such a view was supported by two factors: (1) the lack of contemporary evidence that rhetorical treatises continued to circulate on the Iberian Peninsula during and after the Visigothic period; and (2) the lack of testimonies to the existence of organized schools where rhetoric could have been taught, or of the curriculum such schools might have followed.⁴⁹ This dearth of evidence that there existed a peninsular rhetorical tradition prior to the fourteenth century contributed to the perception that Iberian Latin chronicles and histories represented increasingly impoverished versions of their classical predecessors.

Present, and Future in the Latin and Romance Historiography of Medieval Christian Kingdoms of Spain', *JMIS*, 1 (2009), 147–62.

⁴⁷ John Walsh, 'Religious Motifs in the Early Spanish Epic', *RHM*, 36 (1970–71), 165–72; 'Epic Flaw and Final Combat in the Poema de mio Cid', *La Corónica*, 5 (1977), 100–09; Colin C. Smith, 'Latin Histories and Vernacular Epic in Twelfth-Century Spain: Similarities of Spirit and Style', *BHS*, 48 (1971), 1–19. Smith's *The Making of the Poema de Mio Cid* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983; repr. 2010) is perhaps the strongest argument for the learned, single authorship of the *Poema*.

⁴⁸ Jacques Fontaine, *Isidore de Séville et la culture classique dans l'Espagne wisigothique*, 2nd edn, 2 vols (Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1983; 1st edn 1959), II, 810–11.

⁴⁹ In his comprehensive study of the rhetorical tradition on the Iberian Peninsula, Charles Faulhaber did not find overt evidence of rhetorical instruction until the early fifteenth century. The oldest Iberian manuscript of the Ciceronian *De inventione* is dated to 1273, although its ninth- and tenth-century versions can be found in European libraries. There is no direct evidence that the Aristotelian *Poetics* and *Rhetoric* were known before the thirteenth century, and there were only seven mentions of classical treatises on rhetoric in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, including four of *De inventione*, two of *Rhetorica ad C. Herennium*, and one of the Aristotelian *Rhetoric*. The most ancient of the extant manuscripts of Quintilian's *Institutiones oratoriae* dates back to the thirteenth century and is thought to be of French origin. See Charles Faulhaber, *Latin Rhetorical Theory in Thirteenth and Fourteenth Century Castile* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1972); 'Retóricas clásicas y medievales en bibliotecas castellanas', *Abaco*, 4 (1973), 151–300.

Paradoxically, however, the high level of education of Latin chronicle authors has consistently impressed scholars, and many have encountered evidence of the chroniclers' solid background in classical rhetoric.⁵⁰ In some instances, in order to explain this apparent controversy, it became necessary to isolate these authors against the supposed general educational poverty of mediaeval Hispanic clergy. Menéndez Pelayo, for example, justified the arid form of the chronicles of Isidore and John of Biclar as being fruits of an era that called for abbreviations, summaries, and *sententiae*, while Bernard Guenée attributed the expressive frugality of the chronicles to their authors' desire to meet the expectations of a readership that was less illustrious than the authors themselves.⁵¹ Manuel Díaz y Díaz put his finger on the glaring contradiction between the relative critical underappreciation of Latin chronicles and the perception of the literary sophistication of their authors when he remarked:

We should rather ask ourselves why the schematic style of Isidore in his *Historiae* or of both Isidore and Ildefonsus in their respective *De viris illustribus* changes radically when they compose other texts, such as the *Synonyms* or the *Treatise on*

⁵⁰ Luis Vázquez de Parga noted that Asturian chronicles were 'a long way from a simple annalistic chronicle', in 'La Biblia en el reino Astur-Leonés', *La Bibbia nell'alto Medioevo*, Settimane, 10 (Spoleto, 1963), pp. 257–80 (p. 260). The author of the *Chronica Albeldensia* has been described as 'uncommonly cultured', and a speculation has been put forth about his Mozarabic origin. See Manuel Díaz y Díaz, 'Isidoro en la Edad Media hispana', in *Isidoriana: Estudios sobre San Isidoro en el XIV centenario de su nacimiento*, ed. by Manuel Díaz y Díaz (León: Centro de Estudios 'San Isidoro', 1961), pp. 345–87 (p. 371). Sampiro, the eleventh-century Leonese chronicler, has been noted to possess 'a literary training uncommon at the time'; his biblical and liturgical Latin is said to exhibit a high level of grammatical correctness. See *Sampiro, su crónica y la monarquía leonesa en el siglo X*, ed. and study by Justo Pérez de Urbel (Madrid: CSIC, 1952), pp. 32, 243. The anonymous author of the *Historia Silense* has been qualified as 'gramático y ritorizante', 'de memoria felicísima', and thought to have possessed a rare knowledge of classical authors and, perhaps, formal schooling in rhetoric: see *Historia Silense*, ed. and study by Justo Pérez de Urbel and Atilano González Ruiz Zorrilla (Madrid: Escuela de Estudios Medievales, 1959), pp. 32, 54–60. This chronicle has been named as one of the first known examples of a literary renaissance, modelled on Romans and especially Salustius, in Manuel Gómez Moreno, *Introducción a la Historia Silense, con versión castellana de la misma y de la crónica de Sampiro* (Madrid: Rivadeneyra, 1921), pp. xxvi–xxviii. Francisco Rico ascribed to the *Historia Compostellana* a 'splendid literary exuberance' uncommon for contemporary Spanish chronicles, in 'Las letras latinas del siglo XII en Galicia, León y Castilla', *Abaco*, 2 (1969), 9–92 (p. 56).

⁵¹ Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo, 'San Isidoro', in Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo, *San Isidoro, Cervantes y otros estudios*, 2nd edn (Buenos Aires, Mexico: Espasa-Calpe Argentina, 1944; 1st edn 1942), pp. 13–26 (p. 23). Bernard Guenée, 'Histoires, annales, chroniques. Essai sur les genres historiques au Moyen Âge', *Annales: Economies. Sociétés. Civilisations*, 28 (1973), 997–1016 (p. 1010).

the Virginity of Mary? The schematic style of the former works cannot be attributed either to caprice or incompetence, nor should the elaboration of the latter be seen as the result of an inability to attain simplicity.⁵²

This apparent contradiction may be re-examined in light of Martin Irvine's recent argument that in the Middle Ages it was knowledge of the *grammatica*, rather than of *rhetorica*, that 'provided the exclusive access to literacy, the understanding of scripture, the knowledge of literary canon, and membership in an international Latin textual community'.⁵³ This was made possible because the pragmatics of history were radically transformed at the turn of the fifth century by Augustine, who converted the Roman *grammatica* into a *grammatica christiana* by placing the biblical canon into the centre of learning and textual interpretation of classical texts.⁵⁴ St Augustine put both the *grammatica* and the *rhetorica* to the service of understanding scripture in *De doctrina christiana*, a treatise, written in AD 396 and revised in AD 426, on the Christian method of learning, reading, composing, and interpreting texts. Since then, the *grammatica*, defined as a way of discovering what is to be understood and comprising both language and literature in the modern sense, assumed most of the functions of the *rhetorica*. The latter, by contrast, became closely associated with preaching.

The sources of the study of *grammatica*, from which mediaeval clergymen were able to learn how to read and interpret Latin writings, were both abundant and diverse throughout the Middle Ages.⁵⁵ Peninsular epigraphic evidence confirms the existence of *rhetorici*, along with *ludimagistri* (elementary tutors), and *grammatici* (tutors in Greek and Latin languages who imparted knowledge through the reading of texts).⁵⁶ The school system may have been similar to the one that had existed in Roman North Africa in the second half of the fourth century, as described in Augustine's *Confessions* (AD 401), given that the geographical closeness of *Hispania* contributed to its reputation as a relatively safe haven for African clerics who fled the invasions of Alans, Vandals,

⁵² Manuel Díaz y Díaz, 'Literary Aspects of the Spanish Liturgy', in *Visigothic Spain: New Approaches*, ed. by Edward James (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1980), pp. 61–76 (p. 68).

⁵³ Martin Irvine, *The Making of Textual Culture*, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Literature, 19 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006), p. 1.

⁵⁴ Irvine, *Textual Culture*, p. 178.

⁵⁵ Irvine, *Textual Culture*, pp. 3, 9; for a list of mediaeval sources on the study of *grammatica*, see pp. 10–11.

⁵⁶ See Fontaine, *Isidore de Séville et la culture classique*, I, 7–9; Christine Mohrman, 'Le problème de la continuité de la langue littéraire', in *Il passaggio dall'antichità al medioevo in Occidente*, Settimane, 9 (Spoleto, 1962), pp. 329–49 (pp. 342–43).

and Suevi in AD 409.⁵⁷ By the end of the seventh century, according to Julian, bishop of Toledo, the discipline of *grammatica* included phonology, morphology, metric, and stylistics, and was delivered using the method of questions and answers.⁵⁸ In the same century, drawing on Augustine, Isidore classified history as a subgenre of *grammatica*, which he understood as one of letters.⁵⁹

Augustine's vindication of pagan letters as a useful element of Christian education fully projected itself onto the seventh-century Visigothic cultural renaissance. Visigothic Spain abounded in clerics of Roman and Gothic origins who knew the *trivium* and the *quadrivium* and prided themselves on eloquence.⁶⁰ Writing history was recognized as a prestigious task among the many illustrated activities of Visigothic clergy, as evidenced by Isidore's treatise *Of Learned Men* (*De viris illustribus*). Among the many poetic and prose works composed by Maximus, bishop of Saragossa (r. AD 592–619), Isidore mentions an historiographical work, which is now lost ('multa uersu prosaque componere dicitur'; 'scripsit et breui stilo historiolum de iis quae temporibus Gothorum in Hispaniis acta sunt, historico et composito sermone'); he praises the *Chronicle* of John of Biclar (c. AD 540–621), the first Visigothic historian, as being of great utility ('historico compositoque sermone ualde utilem historiam').⁶¹ Like

⁵⁷ Jorge Luis Cassani, 'Aportes al estudio del proceso de la romanización de España. Las instituciones educativas', *CHE*, 18 (1952), 50–70. See also Robert A. Kaster, *Guardians of Language: The Grammarian and Society in Late Antiquity* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1988). On the education of St Augustine, see Irvine, *Textual Culture*, pp. 169–71.

⁵⁸ Julián of Toledo, *Ars Iuliani Toletani Episcopi: una gramática latina de la España visigoda*, ed. by María A. H. Maestre Yenes, Instituto Provincial de Investigaciones y Estudios Toledanos, 2nd ser., Vestigios del pasado, 5 (Toledo: Diputación Provincial, 1973), p. 113.

⁵⁹ Isidore, *Etymologiae*, in *Etimologías: edición bilingüe*, ed. and trans. by José Oroz Reta and Manuel-A. Marcos-Casquero, 3rd edn, 2 vols (Madrid: Biblioteca de autores cristianos, 2000), I, 41. 2, p. 359. Cf.: 'Augustine [...] termed *grammatica* the *custos historiae*, the guardian of the textual forms of memory that constitute a cultural tradition, and Isidore of Seville, drawing from Augustine, stated that whatever was committed to writing as worthy of memory, including histories, necessarily became the subject of *grammatica*' (Irvine, *Textual Culture*, p. 4). On the theory of literary fiction and history in Isidore, see Irvine, *Textual Culture*, pp. 234–41.

⁶⁰ Isidore, archbishop of Seville, *El 'De viris illustribus' de Isidoro de Sevilla. Estudio y edición crítica*, ed. by Carmen Codoñer Merino (Salamanca: CSIC, Instituto 'Antonio de Nebrija', 1964), pp. 143, 149; Ildefonso, bishop of Toledo, *El 'De viris illustribus' de Ildefonso de Toledo: Estudio y edición crítica*, ed. by Carmen Codoñer Merino, Acta Salmanticensia, Serie Filosofía y Letras, 65 (Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 1972), pp. 118–19, 130–31.

⁶¹ Isidore, *De viris*, pp. 151–53. The generic term *historiola* was used in the Middle Ages to denote a brief history. See Jan Frederik Niermeyer, *Mediae latinitatis lexicon primus* (Leiden: Brill, 1976), p. 489.

classical historians, Christian historians of Spain saw the purpose of writing history as providing examples of praiseworthy and blameworthy conduct for the benefit of future generations, and Isidore's commentary on contemporary chronicles contains a strong apologetic component of Christian history as established in the works of Eusebius (*Historia Ecclesiastica*), St Augustine (*De civitate Dei contra paganos*), and Orosius (*Historiarum adversum paganos libri septem*).⁶² The historian's task, as articulated by Isidore, is an exercise of Christian humility, its ultimate goals being the encouragement of charity, the eradication of greed, and eternal salvation.⁶³

Given that such cultural splendour coincided with the political and confessional unification of the Iberian Peninsula, it would be tempting to assume the precipitous decline of Latin culture after the loss of Visigothic statehood in 711. Yet various strains of evidence indicate that this was not the case. The memory of Visigothic writing is pervasive in post-711 chronicles, and recollections of the highly developed state of Latin ecclesiastical culture are present in passages where chroniclers reminisce about the loss of Iberian unity under Visigothic government. The author of the Mozarabic *Chronicle of 754*, as he deplores the devastation suffered in Baetica and Toledo, nostalgically recalls the wisdom, eloquence, and literary craft of seventh-century Visigothic Bishops Isidore of Seville, Braulio of Zaragoza, and Ildefonso of Toledo.⁶⁴ In the mid-ninth century, Alvar of Córdoba extols his friend Eulogius for his comprehensive knowledge of Latin poetic, prose, and historiographical traditions ('Ubi libri erant metrici, ubi prosatici, ubi historici qui ejus investigationem effugerent?').⁶⁵ Like their Mozarabic precursors, Asturian and Leonese chronicles continued to reference Visigothic cultural splendour, which they saw as inseparable from the political and religious unity achieved by the Visigoths.⁶⁶

⁶² M. J. Wheeldon, "'True Stories': The Reception of Historiography in Antiquity", in *History as Text: The Writing of Ancient History*, ed. by Averil Cameron (London: Duckworth, 1989), pp. 33–63 (p. 38).

⁶³ Isidore, archbishop of Seville, *De fide catholica contra judaeos*, in *Sancti Isidori, Hispalensi episcopi, opera omnia*, ed. by Faustino Arévalo, PL, LXXXIII (Turnhout: Brepols, 1807), pp. 450–538, III. x. 15). See also Eulogius of Córdoba, *Documentum martyriale*, I, p. 462.

⁶⁴ *Chronicle of 754*, 17, p. 34 and 36, p. 54.

⁶⁵ Alvar, *Vita Eulogii*, 8, p. 335.

⁶⁶ 'Omnis Spania dudum in uno ordine sub regimine Gotorum esset ordinata et pre ceteris terris doctrina atque scientia rutilaret', *Chronicle of Alfonso III, Rot.*, p. 126; 'Cum olim Yspania omni liberali disciplina vbertim floreret, ac in ea studio literarum fontem sapientie sitiens passim operam darent, inundata barbarorum fortitudine, studium cum doctrina funditus euauit.

Asturias and León abounded in books from which the writing of history could have continued to be learned.⁶⁷ Liberal education continued to be imparted by private tutors, and although the precise curriculum these tutors may have followed remains unknown, chroniclers underscore the enlightened disposition of several Asturian and Leonese kings.⁶⁸

* * *

With today's scholars operating outside the confines of all-encompassing paradigms, the study of Latin chronicles and histories takes many forms, with particular attention being paid to issues in textual criticism, poetics, and pragmat-

Hac itaque necessitudine ingruente, et scriptores defuere et Yspanorum gesta silentio preteriere', *Historia Silensis (Legionensis)*, p. 113.

⁶⁷ Thus, monastic inventories register three donations of Isidorian *Etymologies* of Andalusí origin made to the monasteries of San Pedro de Montes in Abeliare, León (915 and 927), Caaveiro in Pontevedra (936), Celanova in Ourense (942), and Guimaraes in Oporto (959). A donation of Eusebius's *Ecclesiastical History* was made to the Guimaraes monastery in the tenth century, and several donations of Julian's *Ars grammaticae* were made between the eighth and tenth centuries. Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, 'Notas sobre los libros leídos en el reino de León hace mil años', *CHE*, 1–2 (1944), 222–38 (p. 231); Manuel Díaz y Díaz, 'Isidoro en la Edad Media hispana', p. 367; See also Manuel Díaz y Díaz, 'La historiografía en España después de la invasión árabe hasta el siglo X', in *La storiografia altomedievale. 10–16 aprile 1969*, Settimane, 17 (Spoleto, 1970), pp. 313–43, and Manuel C. Díaz y Díaz, 'La historiografía hispana desde la invasión árabe hasta el año 1000', in *De Isidoro al siglo XI: ocho estudios sobre la vida literaria peninsular* (Barcelona: Ediciones El Albir, 1976), pp. 203–34; Ana Suárez González, 'Un fragmento de manuscrito visigótico con texto de las "Etimologías"', *Estudios humanísticos: geografía, historia, arte*, 18 (1996), 105–24. After the devastation of León in 988 by Andalusí ruler al-Manṣūr (r. 981–1002), Urraca, sister of King Alfonso VI, restored the monastery of Eslonza and donated a copy of the *Etymologies* among other works by Isidore of Seville and Ildefonso of Toledo. Justo Pérez de Urbel, *Los monjes españoles en la Edad Media*, 2 vols (Madrid: Impr. de E. Maestre, 1933–34), II, IV, iv, p. 402.

⁶⁸ The *Chronica Albeldensia* names Alfonso III of Asturias 'scientia clarus' (p. 178); the *Historia Silensis (Legionensis)* informs us that the edification Bermudo I of León in literary studies was ordered by his father Fruela Pérez ('ab ipsis puerilibus annis iussione patris literarum studiis traditus', p. 142). Both the *Silensis* and *Naiarensis* claim that Fernando I of León and Castile studied liberal disciplines and ordered the instruction of his children ('Rex uero Fernandus [Ferrandus] filios suos et filias ita censuit instruere [instituere], ut primo liberalibus disciplinis, quibus et ipse studium dederat, erudirentur.') *Historia Silensis (Legionensis)*, p. 184; *Chronica Naiarensis*, III, 20, p. 95. Some doubt has been cast on the veracity of this notice about Fernando I in the *Chronica Silensis (Legionensis)*, given that the passage appears to be copied from Einhard's *Vita Caroli Magni. Introducción a la Historia Silense, con versión castellana de la misma y de la crónica de Sampiro*, ed. by Manuel Gómez Moreno (Madrid: Rivadeneyra, 1921), pp. xxvi–xxxviii.

ics. Some of the major tendencies in the study of Latin chronicles have been to deeply engage with individual texts and authors, or, alternatively, to consider Latin chronicles in the context of, and with methods applied to, Castilian historiographical production.⁶⁹ What contemporary approaches have in common is the recognition of the creative capacity of Latin and Romance chroniclers and historians, and the awareness of an historiographical account as a composition whose narrative architecture, rhetorical embellishment, and symbolic value exhibit a degree of complexity that approaches the realm of literature. Still, for historical reasons outlined above, twelfth- and thirteenth-century Leonese and Castilian Latin chronicles, especially those that appear to incorporate epic legends and those that were heavily utilized as sources of thirteenth- and fourteenth-century vernacular histories and chronicles, have been receiving greater attention compared to their less numerous Mozarabic and Asturian predecessors. Because chronicle texts that do not draw on vernacular myths and legends are believed to call for vastly different methods of scholarship, they sometimes continue to be singled out for their compositional and stylistic poverty.⁷⁰ The closing of the perceived gap between these earlier chronicle traditions and those developed in León and Castile requires a comprehensive reassessment of Mozarabic and Asturian chroniclers as agents of historiographical renovation.

⁶⁹ For example, Martin, *Les Juges de Castille*; Aengus Ward, *History and Chronicles in Late Medieval Iberia: Representations of Wamba in Late Medieval Narrative Histories* (Leiden: Brill, 2011). See also special issues of *e-Spania*, 'La *Chronica Adefonsi imperatoris* y la *Historia Roderici*' (2013), '*Historia Legionensis*' (llamada *Silensis*)' (2012), '*Chronica Naiarensis*' (2009), '*Chronica regum Castellae*' (2006), and thematic clusters in the *CLHM*, 'Rodrigue Jiménez de Rada (Castille, première moitié du XIII^e siècle): histoire, historiographie', 26 (2013), and 'Luc de Tuy: chroniqueur, hagiographe, théologien', 24 (2001), 201–309.

⁷⁰ Smith, 'Latin Histories', p. 18; Georges Martin, 'Después de Pidal: medio siglo de renovación en el estudio de la historiografía hispánica medieval (siglos XII y XIII)', *e-Spania*, online since 10 December 2010, DOI: 10.4000/e-spania.20185, p. 1; Alberto Montaner Frutos, 'El proyecto historiográfico del Archetypum Naiarense', *e-Spania*, online since 26 July 2011, DOI: 10.4000/e-spania.18075.

THE MOZARABIC CHRONICLES, ISLAM, AND THE MEDITERRANEAN APOCALYPTIC

The Mozarabic historiographical tradition spans several centuries, languages, and continents, with its surviving manuscripts having been traced to Europe and North Africa. Although most Mozarabic chronicles were composed in Latin, there also exists an historiographical fragment in Arabic, the so-called Raqqāda 2003/02, which was discovered in the Tunisian city of Kairawan.¹ Composed in the tradition of a universal chronicle with references to Isidore, Orosius, and Jerome, it relates the conquest of Spain by the Arabs at the conclusion, which, along with other sections of the manuscript, is heavily damaged.² Some believe that it is related to another Mozarabic text

¹ See Arabic text and Italian translation in Giorgio Levi Della Vida, *Noti di storia letteraria arabo-hispanica. A cura di Maria Nallino*, Pubblicazioni dell'Istituto per l'Oriente, 65 (Rome: Istituto per l'Oriente, 1971), pp. 133–92 (first publ. as 'Un texte mozarabe d'histoire universelle', in *Études d'orientalisme dédiées à la mémoire de Lévi-Provençal*, ed. by Francia Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, 2 vols (Paris: Maisonneuve et Larose, 1962), 1, 175–83). See also Mayte Penelas, 'Noticias sobre el MS Raqqada 2003/2 (olim Gran Mezquita de Qayrawan 120/829): el "doble hallazgo" de un código largo tiempo desaparecido', *Collectanea Christiana Orientalia*, 5 (2008), 201–15.

² Fols 28^r–31^v, in Levi Della Vida, *Storia letteraria*, pp. 190–92; see p. 127 of this work for Isidorian influences. Disagreement exists as to whether this text was composed by an Andalusí Christian or by someone residing in Kairawan in the eleventh century. See Dominique Valérián, 'La permanence du christianisme au Maghreb: l'apport problématique des sources latines', in *Islamisation et arabisation de l'Occident musulman médiéval (VII^e–XII^e siècle)*, ed. by Dominique

known as the *Chronica Pseudo-Isidoriana* (Paris, BnF, Latin MS 6113, fols 27^r–49^r), which is preserved in Latin and was putatively composed in Toledo or the Levant between the tenth and mid-twelfth centuries.³ In this chapter, I focus on other, earlier, texts — not because they may better reflect the origins of Mozarabic ideology but because their highly coherent and rhetorically accomplished world view lends itself to a more fruitful exploration of Andalusī Christian ideology and the literary models that developed as a means of its support.

Much of what we know about the first decades of Arab and Muslim presence in Spain is owed to the peculiarities of two short chronicle texts, the so-called *Chronicle of 741* (*Chronica Byzantia-Arabica*) and the *Mozarabic Chronicle* (*Chronica Muzarabica*), composed c. 754.⁴ Though enormously valuable as the first witnesses of Islamic Spain, these texts stand out in the corpus of Iberian Latin histories and chronicles as, perhaps, its biggest conundrum. Their lack of reconquest fervour, and the degree of political pessimism they project as they seemingly come to conciliatory terms with the loss of Visigothic political sovereignty to the Arabs is so great that, for much of the twentieth century, the Mozarabs were believed to be an unfortunate and inexplicable stumbling block on Spain's otherwise straightforward path to nationhood. Although the Mozarabic chronicles have recently undergone a systematic re-evaluation by historians of Muslim Spain, their authorship, provenance, sources, and narrative structure continue to present problems, and have so far thwarted attempts to identify their precise ideological underpinnings.

These critical challenges can be fruitfully addressed by examining the Mozarabic chronicles' contribution to the apocalypse — a conceptual framework that, as Sidney H. Griffith has compellingly shown, represents the first narrative response to the challenge brought upon eastern Mediterranean and African Christian communities by Islam since the second third of the seventh centu-

Valérien, *Bibliothèque historique des pays d'Islam*, 2 (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2011), pp. 131–49 (p. 134 and notes 16–19).

³ Levi Della Vida, *Storia letteraria*, p. 130; Fernando González Muñoz, 'Hacia una nueva edición de la *Crónica Pseudo-Isidoriana*', in *Edición y anotación de textos: Actas del Primer Congreso de Jóvenes Filólogos*, coord. by Antonio Chas Aguión and others, Cursos, congresos e simposios, 49 (A Coruña: Universidade da Coruña, 1998), pp. 299–313. The newest edition of the text is by Fernando González Muñoz, *La chronica gothorum pseudo isidoriana (ms. Paris BN 6113): edición crítica, traducción y estudio*, ed. and trans. by Fernando González Muñoz, Biblioteca Filológica, 6 (Muros La Coruña: Toxosoutos, 2000).

⁴ Hereinafter, I refer to the *Mozarabic Chronicle* by its alternative title of *Chronicle of 754*, in recognition of the current consensus about the Mozarabic provenance of both this chronicle and the *Chronicle of 741*.

ry.⁵ Scholars have long been aware of textual affinities between the Mozarabic chronicles and seventh-century West Syrian (Jacobite) and African (Coptic) sources.⁶ However, so far, and perhaps owing to the long-standing tradition of regarding the Mozarabic chronicles from the perspective of the modern political boundaries of Spain, which dictated their contextualization vis-à-vis Visigothic, Asturian, Leonese, and Castilian Latin chronicles and histories, the mid-eighth-century Mozarabic narratives have curiously not been brought into the apocalyptic framework of the broader Mediterranean in a systematic and sustained way.⁷ I demonstrate how these texts' chronological layout, narrative organization, and choice of tropes partake in the Mediterranean apocalyptic movement. I also expand the list of sources that could have influenced the Mozarabic chronicles by considering the close resemblance between the eschatological frameworks in the *Chronicle of 754* and the Armenian-Byzantine Monophysite history attributed to Sebeos (c. 660). This text contributes significantly to clarifying the narrative genesis of the Mozarabic chronicles although perhaps also adds an additional layer of complexity to the enigmatic history of their composition and transmission.

The Mozarabic Historiographical Enigma

The many uncertainties surrounding the interpretation of the eighth-century Mozarabic chronicles merit a brief overview, explaining why the texts have acquired a reputation as ambiguous and unyielding in their assessment of Spain in the first decades of Muslim rule. The *Chronicle of 741*, originally titled *Continuatio Byzantia-Arabica* by Theodor Mommsen, survives in one thirteenth-century and three sixteenth-century manuscripts.⁸ It begins with

⁵ Sidney H. Griffith, *The Church in the Shadow of the Mosque: Christians and Muslims in the World of Islam* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2008), pp. 33–35.

⁶ For example, César Dubler, 'Sobre la crónica arábigo-bizantina de 741 y la influencia bizantina en la península Ibérica,' *Al-Andalus*, 11 (1946), 283–350 (pp. 329, 326–37); Roger Collins, *The Arab Conquest of Spain: 710–97* (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 1995), pp. 55–57; José Carlos Martín, 'Los *Chronica Byzantia-Arabica*. Contribución a la discusión sobre su autoría y datación, y traducción anotada,' *e-Spania*, online since 22 August 2010, DOI: 10.4000/e-Spania, pp. 2–3.

⁷ This has been implicitly done through the inclusion of these texts in an anthology of Mediterranean responses to Islam: Robert G. Hoyland, *Seeing Islam as Others Saw it: A Survey and Evaluation of Christian, Jewish, and Zoroastrian Writings on Early Islam* (Princeton: Darwin, 1997).

⁸ Theodor Mommsen, *MGH*, AA, 11 (Berlin: Weidmann, 1894), pp. 323–30. A review of

the death of King Reccared in AD 601 and ends with the beginning of the rule of Umayyad caliph Hishām (724–43). The bulk of the chronicle deals with events in Byzantium and North Africa. The scant notices of Iberian kings from Reccared I (r. 586–601) to Suinthila (r. 621–31) are positioned at the beginning of the text, while a notice of the Battle of Toulouse (721) appears at the end.⁹ Because the chronicle mentions the death of Byzantine emperor Leo III (r. 717–41), the year of this emperor's demise was widely assumed as its composition date. More recently, however, a hypothesis was advanced that the text could have been completed during the reign of Walid II (743–44), based on the chronicler's attempt to legitimate Walid's rule.¹⁰ It has also been suggested that a more appropriate title for the chronicle should be the *Chronica hispana-orientalia ad annum 724*, given that the notice of Walid's reign appears to be indicative of a posterior interpolation.¹¹ Although this chronicle is commonly referred to as a continuation of Isidore's *Historia de regibus Gothorum*, which it follows throughout its first chapters, some see it as a continuation of the *Chronicle* by John of Biclar, based on shared structural similarities between the two texts and on the fact that the *Chronicle of 741* begins with the reign of Visigothic king Reccared, the same notice with which the *Biclarense* chronicle ends.¹²

The *Chronica Muzarabica*, now predominantly known as the *Chronicle of 754*, received its former title from Ramón Menéndez Pidal, who was the first scholar to counter the nineteenth-century notion of its Arabic or Syrian authorship that had been advanced in German scholarship.¹³ The earliest of the chroni-

the manuscript transmission of the *Chronicle of 741* is found in Collins, *The Arab Conquest of Spain*, pp. 53–54. Dubler's 'Sobre la crónica árabe-bizantina' is the most thorough discussion of its sources to date, although a valuable update was offered in 2006 by Martín, 'Los *Chronica Byzantia-Arabica*', pp. 2–3.

⁹ *Chronicle of 741*, 1, 2, 3, 9, and 14, pp. 7–9; *Chronicle of 741*, 42, p. 14.

¹⁰ Collins, *The Arab Conquest of Spain*, pp. 55, 57; Martín, 'Los *Chronica*', p. 5. *Chronicle of 741*, 34, 36, 38, pp. 12–13.

¹¹ Cyrille Aillet, 'La formación del mozarabismo y la remodelación de la península ibérica (s. VIII–IX)'; in *De Mahoma a Carlomagno. Los primeros tiempos (siglos VII–IX). Actas de la XXXIX Semana de Estudios Medievales de Estella. 17 al 20 de julio de 2012*, ed. by Philippe Sénac (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2013), pp. 285–310 (p. 304).

¹² Collins, *The Arab Conquest of Spain*, p. 53; Martín, 'Los *Chronica*', p. 1.

¹³ Menéndez Pidal, *El Rey Rodrigo en la literatura* (Madrid: Tipografía de la RABM, 1924), p. 8 n. 1. Theodor Nöldeke, *Epimetrum*, in *Crónica Mozárabe*, ed. by Theodor Mommsen, in *MGH*, AA, 11, pp. 368–69; Pius B. Gams, *Kirchengeschichte von Spanien* (Regensburg: Manz, 1862–79), pp. 261–67. Modern editions of this chronicle include *Corpus Scriptorum Muzarabiorum*, ed. by Juan Gil, 2 vols (Madrid: Instituto Antonio de Nebrija, 1973), I, 15–54;

cle's surviving manuscripts is divided between Madrid and London and dated to the ninth century.¹⁴ Carmen Cardelle de Hartmann, who has recently revisited the complicated transmission history of this chronicle, believes that in the mid-eighth century, the chronicler appended his text to an historical collection that comprised an epitome of Eusebius-Jerome, the chronicles of Prosper, Victor of Tunnuna, and John of Biclar, as well as Isidore's *Historia de regibus Gothorum*.¹⁵ This chronicle covers events between 611 and 754, and is believed to be a continuation of Isidore's *History*, which conclude in 611.¹⁶ Because it contains significantly more information on Iberian events than the *Chronicle of 741*, the *Chronicle of 754* has been universally regarded as a more valuable source of historical information on Spain's first decades of coexistence with Islam than the former text. Although it was believed earlier that the *Chronicle of 741* served as a source for the *Chronicle of 754*, the discrepancies between the two texts in recounting Byzantine events are now being seen as proof that the latter was an independent account.¹⁷ While Roger Collins likewise believes that the two chronicles were written independently of each other, he nevertheless points out textual similarities between the two in their descriptions of the 721 Arab expedition against Toulouse as an indication that both chronicles could have been subsequently united in at least one strand of manuscript transmission.¹⁸

It remains unknown who composed the chronicles and where the writing took place. For over a century, scholars assumed that the Arabs had an intermediary role in the transmission of eastern Mediterranean sources of the two chronicles to the Iberian Peninsula. Nineteenth-century scholarship identified the author of the *Chronicle of 741* as an Egyptian from Alexandria or, perhaps, a Syrian, given the heavy focus on events in North Africa and the eastern

a parallel Latin/Spanish edition by José Eduardo López Pereira, *Crónica mozárabe de 754* (Zaragoza: Anubar, 1980), with an accompanying volume by the same author, *Estudio crítico sobre la Crónica Mozárabe de 754* (Zaragoza: Anubar, 1980), and a revised edition and commentary by José Eduardo López Pereira, *Continuatio Isidoriana Hispana. Crónica mozárabe de 754* (León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación 'San Isidoro', Archivo Histórico Diocesano, 2009). An English version is found in *Conquerors and Chronicles of Early Medieval Spain*, ed., trans., and commentary by Kenneth Baxter Wolf, *Translated Texts for Historians*, 9, 2nd rev. edn (Liverpool: University of Liverpool Press, 1999; 1st edn 1990), pp. 111–60.

¹⁴ Carmen Cardelle de Hartmann, 'The Textual Transmission of the Mozarabic Chronicle of 754', *EME*, 8 (1999), 13–29 (p. 20).

¹⁵ De Hartmann, 'Textual Transmission', p. 28.

¹⁶ Collins, *The Arab Conquest of Spain*, pp. 59–60.

¹⁷ Dubler, 'La crónica', p. 332; López Pereira, *Estudio Crítico*, p. 96.

¹⁸ Collins, *The Arab Conquest*, p. 54.

Mediterranean. César Dubler was the first to abandon the notion of extrapeninsular authorship in favour of the idea that the chronicler was a recent convert to Islam. Such a perception was based on the author's surprising 'neutrality' with regard to Iberian events and, at the same time, his favourable attitude to Islam, Muḥammad, and the Muslims.¹⁹ Most recently, José Carlos Martín cited the scarcity of Spain-related information and the insertion of the notice regarding the conquest of Spain into the narrative of the reign of Walid I (705–15) to support his hypothesis that the chronicle was a collaborative work. Martín believes it was initiated by a high-ranking Muslim government official, who could have commissioned an Andalusí Christian to write the chronicle, and perhaps made available to him Arabic and Byzantine sources from his own library.²⁰

More certainty exists about the author of the *Chronicle of 754*. Based on the chronicler's knowledge of the Visigothic church councils (of which he inserted notices at the beginning of each Visigothic reign), his familiarity with ecclesiastical hierarchies, and the inclusion of references to important doctrinal works of the Visigothic era, there is universal consensus that he was probably a Christian cleric.²¹ However, there is much disagreement about where exactly the *Chronicle of 754* was composed. Menéndez Pidal identified the chronicle's origin as either Córdoba or Toledo.²² José Eduardo López Pereira, the most recent editor of the chronicle, believes that the author was from the Iberian Levant, possibly Guadix, based on his mention of a certain Fredoarius, bishop of Guadix, who does not appear in other sources of Iberian history.²³ De Hartmann attempts to reconcile both hypotheses by suggesting that while the author was originally from Guadix, where he became familiar with the local clergy, he later could have moved to Toledo, where he composed the chronicle.²⁴ Kenneth Baxter Wolf believes that the author, still a Christian cleric, had close ties to a Muslim governor of Córdoba, having served, perhaps, in a ministerial capacity.²⁵

The two chronicles exhibit notable similarities. Both, for example, conspicuously abandon the Ibero-centric world view of earlier, seventh-century Visi-

¹⁹ Dubler, 'La crónica', p. 331.

²⁰ Martín, 'Los *Chronica*', p. 4.

²¹ López Pereira, *Estudio crítico*, pp. 52–74.

²² Menéndel Pidal, *El Rey Rodrigo*, p. 8 and n. 1.

²³ López Pereira, *Estudio*, p. 16; *Continuatio*, p. 58.

²⁴ De Hartmann, 'Textual Transmission', p. 19.

²⁵ Wolf, *Conquerors and Chroniclers*, pp. 31–32.

gothic histories — the last sources of Iberian political thought prior to the Muslim invasion of the peninsula.²⁶ Instead, they collate Iberian, Byzantine, and Arabic events and employ multiple chronological systems. The abundance of information on Arab and Byzantine rulers in these chronicles has led to an intense search for their sources, which, as is the case with authorship and places of origin, have not been definitively established. Textual comparison led Dubler to postulate the existence of a common source for the *Chronicle of 741* and the *Short History* by Nikephoros (c. 758–828), patriarch of Constantinople (r. 806–15). He also proposes a common source for the *Short History*, the *Chronicle of 754*, and the *Chronicle* of Theophanes the Confessor for Byzantine events.²⁷ The peculiarities of transliteration of Arab names led Dubler to consider a putative oral source for Arabic history on the Iberian Peninsula.²⁸ Additionally, he believes in the existence of a North African *Chronicon mundi* composed in Greek and translated into Latin as a source of information on the reign of Heraclius (610–41) and the Arab conquest of Egypt.²⁹ Collins lists three likely sources for the *Chronicle of 741*: Isidore's *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum* (as a source of information about Visigothic kings), an unnamed Byzantine chronicle source, and a no longer extant *History of the Arabs*, which, according to this scholar, could have been written in Spain or North Africa during the reign of Hishām (724–43) and whose structure could have resembled Isidore's *History*.³⁰ This putative source, according to Collins, underlies the similarities between the *Chronicle of 741* and the *Chronicle of 754*, while the unnamed Byzantine source accounts for portions of both chronicles that contain legendary material on the rule of Heraclius.

Although both chronicles are universally appreciated as the only Christian testimonies of the first decades of Islamic rule on the Iberian Peninsula, what their authors truly thought of the loss of Visigothic statehood has puzzled scholars a great deal. The chronological framework of both chroniclers clearly proves the authorial intent to continue the earlier, triumphant Visigothic chronicle tradition of Isidore of Seville and John of Biclar; however, the per-

²⁶ On the Ibero-centrism of seventh-century Visigothic chronicles and histories, see Jamie Wood, *The Politics of Identity in Visigothic Spain: Religion and Power in the Histories of Isidore of Seville* (Leiden: Brill, 2012), Chapter 4, pp. 132–90.

²⁷ Dubler, 'La crónica', pp. 326–37.

²⁸ Dubler, 'La crónica', p. 329.

²⁹ Dubler, 'La crónica', p. 328.

³⁰ Collins, *The Arab Conquest*, pp. 55–57.

ceived ideological disparity between these two chronicles and the previous tradition is so great that the Mozarabic chronicles have often been described in terms of the kind of information they fail to include and the propagandistic impetus they lack. The *Chronicle of 741*, for example, has often been cited for its surprisingly brief mentions of Iberian events prior to 621, for which, according to Collins, the chronicler could have relied exclusively on Isidore's *History* and his universal *Chronicle*.³¹ In López Pereira's view, the compiler's indifference toward Spain's plight following the Arab conquest and his lack of interest in the Iberian events after 621 makes the *Chronicle of 741* inferior to the *Chronicle of 754*, whose author shows a much greater knowledge of and sympathy toward Spain.³² Unlike López Pereira, Collins finds similarity in both chroniclers' secular and neutral depiction of the Prophet Muḥammad and his followers. Such neutrality, according to Collins, could have been a necessary expedient in Muslim-dominated areas, where publicly reviling the prophet and his followers would have constituted a capital offence; alternatively, it could have been an indication that the first decades of Christian-Muslim contact on the Iberian Peninsula did not produce overt religious antagonism.³³ Although Collins believes the peninsular authorship of the *Chronicle of 741* to be 'incontrovertible', based on its continuation of John of Biclar's *Chronicle* and its use of the Spanish era in dating, he, too, is astounded at the paucity of the chronicle's Iberian portion compared to the detailed summaries of events related to the Byzantine empire and the Arab expansion. For Collins, the *Chronicle of 741* 'is a confused and confusing work that fails to integrate the elements of which it is composed in a workmanlike and satisfying way'.³⁴

Wolf has a similar opinion about the *Chronicle of 754*, saying it 'records what happened without trying to fit it all into a single, overarching narrative scheme'.³⁵ Among the narrative shortcomings that most puzzle Wolf with regard to events in Byzantium and Spain is the seemingly inconsistent application of the scourge paradigm: while the chronicler treats Arab conquests in Byzantium as providential punishment, he does not see the conquest of Spain in the same light. This surprises Wolf, since, in his opinion, the author's interpretation of the conquest of Spain in strictly political terms is incongruous with his strong

³¹ Collins, *The Arab Conquest*, p. 56.

³² López Pereira, *Estudio*, p. 12.

³³ Collins, *The Arab Conquest*, p. 62.

³⁴ Collins, *The Arab Conquest*, p. 57.

³⁵ Wolf, *Conquerors and Chroniclers*, p. 45.

interest in ecclesiastical matters manifested in 'disproportionally large entries' dedicated to church councils and Visigothic bishops.³⁶

Unlike Wolf, Collins credits the *Chronicle of 754* with a coherent attempt to unify diverse chronological systems and put the new political reality on the Iberian Peninsula in a broad historical context. However, he, too, finds incongruity in the chronicler's criteria for event selection, particularly in the exclusion of Italy and France, and of the rise of the Carolingian empire, from his otherwise comprehensive account of Mediterranean history.³⁷ López Pereira, in turn, regards the inclusion of four solar eclipses in the *Chronicle of 754* as not fitting with the rest of the text, given the compiler's primary focus on political, military, and ecclesiastical events.³⁸ Finally, the perceived obscurity of the chroniclers' Latin, in particular the variant forms in the *Chronicle of 741* and the exaggerated, 'bombastic' expressions in the *Chronicle of 754*, compared to the clarity and straightforward character of earlier Visigothic writings, has only added to the view of the Mozarabic chronicles as problematic texts whose authorial intent is unclear and disputable.³⁹

These uncertainties surrounding the dating, authorship, and geographical origins of the texts are formidable and will, perhaps, never be definitively resolved. But if an effort is to be made, anyone attempting to solve the mysteries of these texts has to grapple with largely circumstantial evidence, and therefore a deeper understanding of the Mozarabic chronicles calls for a broader approach than what has hitherto been systematically employed. Abandoning an optic firmly enclosed within contemporary Iberian national boundaries is particularly beneficial, since it can dispel many notions of the incongruences in these texts, including their perceived lack of reconquest spirit, their inclusion of certain geographical areas and not others, their seemingly neutral stance toward the Muslim conquerors, their alleged lack of a narrative structure, and the obscurity of their Latin.

Conversely, a perspective that takes into consideration Spain's long-lasting legacy of integration as the westernmost area of the Mediterranean firmly positions these texts as highly accomplished narrative pieces integrated into the

³⁶ Wolf, *Conquerors and Chroniclers*, pp. 34, 43–45.

³⁷ Collins, *The Arab Conquest*, pp. 56, 60.

³⁸ López Pereira, *Estudio*, pp. 47–48.

³⁹ See Manuel Díaz y Díaz, 'La historiografía hispana desde la invasión árabe hasta el año 1000', in Manuel Díaz y Díaz, *De Isidoro al siglo XI: ocho estudios sobre la vida literaria peninsular* (Barcelona: El Albir, 1976), pp. 203–34 (p. 317); de Hartmann, 'Textual Transmission', p. 17; López Pereira, *Estudio crítico*, p. 77; Martín, 'Los Chronica', p. 4.

literary tradition that swept through the outer circle of the Byzantine empire in the seventh and eighth centuries: the Mediterranean apocalyptic. The apocalyptic discourse developed in the Byzantine empire throughout the seventh century as a response to a crisis of dynastic and political imperial legitimacy caused by the Persian wars and the Arab conquests. Its basic tenets were the acceptance of defeat as God's plan for the eventual renewal and restoration of the empire, and the expectation that this would take place coincidentally with the end of historical time. Such rhetorical models of imperial legitimation relied on the use of biblical apocalyptic imagery and narratives, in particular those found in the Old Testament prophetic books.⁴⁰ Below I will outline how Coptic, Jacobite (West Syrian), and Armenian Monophysite histories that developed this world view collectively provide a narrative context for the conceptual and compositional genesis of the Mozarabic chronicles. It is from this perspective that we must begin to understand the Mozarabic contribution to the Iberian historiographical renovation.

Visigothic Spain and the Mediterranean

It has become increasingly apparent in recent years that in centuries preceding the Arab conquest, Visigothic Spain formed a complex and interconnected network of military, commercial, ecclesiastical, and possibly lay exchanges with the broader Mediterranean, which included the Eastern Roman Empire and its provinces in North Africa, the Balearic Islands, and on the Iberian Peninsula proper.⁴¹ Although sporadic contacts between the Visigoths and the Eastern

⁴⁰ David Olster, 'Ideological Transformation and the Evolution of Imperial Presentation in the Wake of Islamic Victory', in *The Encounter of Eastern Christianity with Early Islam*, ed. by Emmanouela Grypeou, Mark Swanson, and David Thomas, *The History of Christian-Muslim Relations*, 5 (Leiden: Brill, 2006), pp. 45–71. On the prevalence of eschatological and apocalyptic concerns throughout the Byzantine seventh century, see also Walter E. Kaegi, 'The Early Muslim Raids into Anatolia and Byzantine Reactions under Emperor Constans II', in *The Encounter*, 73–93.

⁴¹ The earliest comprehensive treatment of military, diplomatic, ecclesiastic, and cultural relations between the Visigothic state and Byzantium based not only on narrative and documentary sources, but also on numismatic, epigraphic, and archaeological evidence was the doctoral dissertation by Spanish Egyptologist Francisco J. Presedo Velo (1923–2000), 'España y Bizancio en la Edad Media. La España bizantina' (Madrid, 1954). Because Presedo Velo advanced the thesis of the profound Byzantinization of the Visigothic state against the prevalent scholarly tradition of regarding that state as a precursor to the modern Spanish nation, it remained unpublished until its appearance as Francisco J. Presedo Velo, *La España bizantina. Prólogo de*

Roman Empire existed prior to the mid-sixth century (as evidenced, for example, by Hydatius, who mentions the arrival of Greek clerics to the north-western Iberian Roman province of Gallaecia in AD 435 in his *Chronicle*),⁴² Visigothic contact with the eastern Mediterranean intensified with Byzantine military presence, when Emperor Justinian (r. 527–65) established garrisons on the south-eastern coast of Spain as part of a far-reaching *renovatio imperii*, or the recovery of former Roman imperial provinces.⁴³ The Byzantine army disembarked on the south-eastern coast of Spain c. 552 at the behest of Visigothic royal contender Athanagild (r. 554–67), who relied on the Byzantine army in his rebellion against rival King Agila (r. 549–54). The Byzantines settled an extensive geographical area of the Iberian south-east, including the former Roman provinces of Baetica and Cartaginiensis, and, despite a history of tension and conflict with the emerging Visigothic state, defended their territory largely by diplomatic means. These included participation in internal disputes within the Visigothic royal elite, establishing treaties, and exchanging embassies with Visigothic rulers.⁴⁴ Attempts by Visigothic kings to regain control of the

Genaro Chic García. Edición de Aurelio Padilla Monge (Seville: Universidad de Sevilla, 2003), by which time it had already been superseded by contemporary studies. According to Presedo Velo, whereas the Byzantine military presence was limited to coastal areas of the Iberian Peninsula, commercial and cultural contacts reached far into the interior and peaked in the late seventh–early eighth centuries (p. 167). Among the new studies the most important one is by Margarita Vallejo Girvés, *Bizancio y la España tardoantigua* (ss. V–VIII). *Un capítulo de historia mediterránea* (Alcalá de Henares: Universidad de Alcalá de Henares, 1993). It reaches the conclusion that Byzantine influence receded with the gradual reduction of the Byzantine presence on the Iberian Peninsula. See also Pedro Bádenas de la Peña, ‘Los estudios bizantinos en España’, in *Toledo y Bizancio*, coord. by Miguel Cortés Arrese (Cuenca: Ediciones de la Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha, 2002), pp. 15–42.

⁴² Hydatius, bishop of Chaves, *Chronicle*, in *The ‘Chronicle’ of Hydatius and the ‘Consularia Constantinopolitana’: Two Contemporary Accounts of the Final Years of the Roman Empire*, ed. and trans. by Richard W. Burgess (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993), p. 92.

⁴³ Vallejo Girvés differentiates between three periods of Byzantine settlements in Spain: (1) from the barbaric invasions of the Roman world to the beginning of Justinian’s *renovatio imperii* (from the early fifth to the first third of the sixth centuries); (2) from the *renovatio imperii* until the Persian invasion of Syria, Palestine, and Egypt in the early seventh century; (3) during the Sassanid and Arab invasions of Syria, Palestine, and Egypt in the seventh century. Margarita Vallejo Girvés, ‘El exilio bizantino: Hispania y el Mediterráneo occidental (siglos VI–VII)’, in *Bizancio y la Península Ibérica. De la antigüedad tardía a la edad moderna*, ed. by Inmaculada Pérez Martín and Pedro Bádenas de la Peña (Madrid: CSIC, 2004), pp. 117–54 (p. 132).

⁴⁴ Jamie Wood, ‘Defending Byzantine Spain: Frontier and Diplomacy’, *EME*, 18 (2010), 292–319. On the administrative and military organization of Byzantine Iberian provinces, see Vallejo Girvés, *Bizancio y la España tardoantigua*, pp. 349–90, and, by the same author, ‘Las

entire peninsula met with gradual success and culminated *c.* 624, when, according to Isidore's *History*, Suinthila (r. 621–31) finally expelled the Byzantines from Spain.⁴⁵ It is now believed that the reign of Constantine IV (668–85) was a period of a relatively cordial relationship and cultural exchange between Toledo and Byzantium.⁴⁶

Archaeological evidence, such as pottery, weights, jewellery of eastern Mediterranean provenance, and epigraphic inscriptions in Greek, indicates that the military conquest facilitated the establishment of commercial colonies in the Byzantine garrison cities of Traducta (modern-day Algeciras), Carteya (San Roque), Malaca (Málaga), and Carthago Spartaria (Cartagena) between the second half of the sixth and the first quarter of the seventh centuries.⁴⁷ In accordance with the Visigothic legal code, *negotiatores transmarini*, Byzantine merchants who traded gold, silver, clothing, and ornaments, paid yearly tax to the Visigoths if they employed a native, but were subject to Justinian laws governing matters such as dispute resolution and taxation by Byzantine collec-

relaciones políticas entre la España visigoda y Bizancio', in *Toledo y Bizancio*, coord. by Cortés Arrese, pp. 75–112; Vallejo Girvés, 'The Treaties between Justinian and Athanagild and the Legality of Byzantium's Peninsular Holdings', *Byzantion*, 66 (1996), 208–18.

⁴⁵ On the details of Byzantine military presence in Iberia in the fifth and sixth centuries, see Pablo C. Díaz, 'En tierra de nadie: visigodos frente a bizantinos. Reflexiones sobre la frontera', in *Bizancio y la Península Ibérica*, ed. by Pérez Martín and Bádenas de la Peña, pp. 37–60. On Comentiolus, the Byzantine governor of Cartagena and Málaga *c.* 589, see Presedo Velo, *La España bizantina*, pp. 62–77. Based on epigraphic and documentary sources, Presedo Velo identifies Comentiolus (Comitiolus) as a *magister militum* who also served in Thrace and Persia during the reign of Emperor Maurice (582–602).

⁴⁶ Vallejo Girvés, 'Las relaciones políticas', pp. 110–11.

⁴⁷ See the review by Darío Bernal Casasola, 'Bizancio en España desde la perspectiva arqueológica. Balance de una década de investigaciones', in *Bizancio y la Península Ibérica*, ed. by Pérez Martín and Bádenas de la Peña, pp. 61–99, and Luis A. García Moreno, 'Colonias de comerciantes orientales en la Península Ibérica: siglos V–VII', *Habis*, 3 (1972), pp. 127–54. Outside the commercial settlement pattern in the Iberian south-east, lively trade with the eastern Mediterranean may have supported local economies in other areas of the peninsula during the same period. Such is the case of Vigo in north-western Spain, where archaeologists recently uncovered the largest proportion of eastern Mediterranean pottery in all of Western Europe, dated between the mid-sixth and mid-seventh centuries. See José Carlos Sánchez Pardo, 'Power and Rural Landscapes in Early Medieval Galicia (AD 400–900): Towards a Re-Incorporation of the Archaeology into the Historical Narrative', *EME*, 21 (2013), 140–68 (p. 157). See also Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, 'Coins and Chronicles: Propaganda in Sixth-Century Spain and the Byzantine Background', in Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, *Visigothic Spain, Byzantium and the Irish* (London: Variorum Reprints, 1985), pp. 483–508 (first publ. in *Historia*, 15 (1966), 483–508).

tors.⁴⁸ Apart from commercial exchanges, the approximately seventy-year-old Byzantine military presence on the Iberian Peninsula likely led to the establishment of Byzantine communities in areas beyond the Iberian south-east. The declaration in the fourth clause of the Council of Narbonne (589) that 'no man, whether free or slave, Goth, Roman, Syrian, Greek or Jew, should do work on Sundays' ('ut omnis homo tam ingenuus quam servus ghotus, romanus, syrus, graecus vel iudaeus die dominico nullam operam faciant') suggests that there could have been sizable population of eastern Mediterranean origin in the north-eastern Visigothic province of Septimania.⁴⁹ Apart from the coastal areas, which also include the urban nuclei of Elche and Tarragona in the Iberian Levant, evidence of Byzantine settlements has also been found in the interior of Spain. Epigraphic inscriptions of the Visigothic era found in Mérida suggest a considerable presence of Greek families in the south-western city.⁵⁰

Much of the contact during the reign of Justinian also occurred through Byzantine North Africa, and in particular through the port of Gades (modern-day Cádiz), when, after the fall of the kingdom of the Vandals (AD 533), victims of religious persecution by Byzantine imperial authority fled northwards to the Iberian Peninsula.⁵¹ These migrations may explain why some architectural patterns found in Mérida's Visigothic churches strongly resemble those across the Gibraltar, despite having no known equivalents in the central and northern areas of the peninsula.⁵² As an area of the Mediterranean situated on

⁴⁸ Presedo Velo, *España bizantina*, pp. 98–99.

⁴⁹ *Concilios visigóticos e hispano-romanos*, ed. by José S. Vives, Tomás Marín Martínez, and Gonzalo Martínez Díez (Barcelona: CSIC, Instituto Enrique Flórez, 1963), iv, 147. On the social and ethnic composition of Visigothic Gaul, see Herwig Wolfram, *History of the Goths*, trans. by Thomas J. Dunlap (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1987), pp. 231–43. See also Presedo Velo, *España bizantina*, p. 98.

⁵⁰ Díaz y Díaz, 'La historiografía hispana', p. 52; Presedo Velo, *España bizantina*, pp. 158–59.

⁵¹ Collins, *The Arab Spain*, pp. 19–20; Bernal Casasola, 'Bizancio en España', pp. 66–67.

⁵² Collins, *The Arab Spain*, pp. 21–22. The discussion of architectural parallels between Visigothic Spain and North Africa has been focused on two basilicas, the Visigothic structure in Zorita de Canes (province of Guadalajara), erected during the reign of Leovigild, and a basilica discovered in 1884 in Aïn Beïda, Numidia. Presedo Velo, in *La España bizantina* (pp. 146–47), gives a detailed treatment of the notice by Maurice Pinard, 'Chapiteaux byzantins de Numidie actuellement au Musée de Carthage', *Cahiers de Byrsa*, 1 (1950), 231–68, drawing a contrast between the decline of Byzantine military presence on the Iberian Peninsula and the peak of its cultural influence on the Visigothic state. On the relationship between St Ildefonso of Toledo and Lybia, see Vallejo Girvés, 'Relaciones políticas', p. 105 and n. 83.

the Western edge of Byzantium, Spain, along with North Africa, became a destination for those Byzantines, mostly clerics but also lay courtiers, who were exiled from the centres of power by papal or imperial authority. It is unclear whether the exiles predominantly settled in Byzantine-occupied or Visigothic areas of the peninsula, and how much contact those exiled to Byzantine North Africa had with the local population, but there is no indication that such contact would have been impossible. On the contrary, it is believed that Justinian I's prohibition of pagan, Jewish, and heretical practices in the recently conquered North Africa in the course of the Three Chapters controversy could have triggered the arrival of Jews and Arians to the Iberian Peninsula, which was then ruled by Arian kings.⁵³ The seventh-century hagiographic text *Vitae sanctorum patrum Emeretensium*, dedicated to the struggle between Catholic clergy and Arian monarchy in Visigothic Spain, mentions a certain Nactus, an abbot from North Africa ('ab Africanis regionibus') who arrived in Mérida via Lusitania during the reign of Leovigild, became a hermit, and was martyred.⁵⁴ Another *vita* in the collection is dedicated to Paul, a physician of Greek origin ('natione graecum'), who came from the East ('de Orientis partibus'), settled in Mérida and later became bishop of that city. His successor was his nephew Fidel, who came to Mérida in the course of a trans-Mediterranean commercial expedition.⁵⁵

As the Visigothic monarchy rejected Arianism in favour of Catholicism in 589, Byzantine refugees who proselytized in Spain became sources of heresy themselves.⁵⁶ One such cleric, a bishop of Syrian origin, is recorded to have abjured the heresy of the 'acephals' (Monophysitism) at the Second Council of

⁵³ Vallejo Girvés, 'El exilio bizantino', pp. 138–39. On the Three Chapters controversy, see Presedo Velo, *España bizantina*, pp. 108–11; Vallejo Girvés, *Bizancio y la España tardoantigua*, pp. 408–12. See also J. Ignacio Alonso Campos, 'Sunna, Masona y Nepopis. Las luchas religiosas durante la dinastía de Leovigildo', *Antigüedad y cristianismo*, 3 (1986), 151–57.

⁵⁴ See anonymous deacon of Mérida, *Vitae sanctorum patrum Emeretensium*, ed. by A. Maya Sánchez, CCSL, 116 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1992), III, 21–24.

⁵⁵ *Vitae sanctorum patrum Emeretensium*, IV, I–III, pp. 25–33. The beginning of the Byzantine religious influence on the Iberian Peninsula is identified with the arrival of St Martin, who settled in the Iberian north-western province of Gallaecia in the second half of the sixth century AD, became bishop of Braga, and established a monastery in Dumio. Of Pannonian origin, he was instrumental in introducing Byzantine ascetic literature to the Iberian Peninsula. Presedo Velo considered St Martin among the principal agents of peninsular Byzantinization (*La España Bizantina*, pp. 102–05).

⁵⁶ José Luis Romero, 'San Isidoro de Sevilla: su pensamiento históricopolítico y sus relaciones con la historia visigoda', *CHE*, 8 (1947), 5–71 (pp. 16–20).

Seville in the year 619.⁵⁷ Some evidence exists that he may have been an exile who fled Persian-occupied Syria. Syria, Palestine, and Egypt had been conquered by the Sassanid king Chosroes II (590–628) between the years 614–28, and migrations of clerics and possibly laymen to North Africa and Visigothic Spain likely intensified during that period. At the time, and especially between the fall of Carthage to the Arabs in 698 and until the Arab conquest of Spain in 711, the Iberian Peninsula could have briefly remained as one of the few safe havens for Byzantine Christians from North Africa and the eastern Mediterranean.⁵⁸ Two epigraphic inscriptions found in Tarragona, which are dedicated to clerics of Egyptian origin who settled on the eastern Iberian coast, possibly in the wake of the conquest of Egypt in 642, suggest that Egyptian monastic communities could have also found a safe haven in Spain.⁵⁹

With archaeological and literary evidence pointing at a likely increase of human migrations and cultural traffic between the Iberian Peninsula and the eastern Mediterranean in the years following Arab conquests in the East, it does not appear surprising that North Africa has been increasingly viewed as a place of importance for its mediating role in the composition and transmission of the two Mozarabic chronicles. Dubler was the first to suggest the *Universal Chronicle* by the Coptic bishop John of Nikiu as one of the sources of the *Chronicle of 741*.⁶⁰ Composed in Egypt in the Greek language at the end of the seventh century, it was promptly translated into Arabic and currently survives in a seventeenth-century Amharic translation. López Pereira follows Dubler in suggesting that for the first Umayyad military campaigns, the author of the *Chronicle of 754* may have depended at least in part on the Latin translation of John's *Chronicle*, and he names North Africa as an important hub for transmission of Greek texts, translated into Latin, to the Iberian Peninsula in

⁵⁷ *Concilios visigóticos*, ed. by Vives, cl. XII, p. 171. On the opposition to Monophysitism in Visigothic Spain, see Presedo Velo, *España bizantina*, pp. 112–14.

⁵⁸ Vallejo Girvés, 'El exilio bizantino', p. 153. On the African origins of peninsular Christianity, see Manuel C. Díaz y Díaz, 'En torno a los orígenes del cristianismo hispánico', in *Las raíces de España*, ed. by José Manuel Gómez-Tabanera (Madrid: Instituto Español de Antropología Aplicada, 1967), pp. 423–43; Luis A. García Moreno, 'Transformaciones de la Bética durante la tardoantigüedad', *Mainake*, 29 (2007), 433–71.

⁵⁹ Vallejo Girvés, 'El exilio bizantino', pp. 146–48. See also Yuen-Gen Liang and others, 'Unity and Disunity across the Strait of Gibraltar', in *Spanning the Strait: Studies in the Western Mediterranean*, ed. by Yuen-Gen Liang and others, *Medieval Encounters*, 19 (Leiden: Brill, 2013), pp. 1–40.

⁶⁰ Dubler, 'La crónica', p. 298. On Coptic influences in Visigothic art, see Presedo Velo, *España bizantina*, pp. 161–63.

the wake of the Islamic conquests of Byzantium.⁶¹ López Pereira claims that as the Arab invasions interrupted the commercial and cultural routes between Byzantium and Visigothic Spain, resulting in the decline of Greek culture on the Iberian Peninsula, the author of the *Chronicle of 754* could have depended on an unknown Syrian source, translated in North Africa, for the bulk of information about the history of the Umayyad caliphate. Luis A. García Moreno goes even further in suggesting that the first version of the *Chronicle of 741* was written in Egypt c. 721 by a native speaker of Greek, who, while not being a convert to Islam, was solidly informed on Byzantine matters and was able to obtain from Muslims information on their prophet. In his view, the chronicle would have arrived in Spain already composed and translated into Latin, and references to peninsular events would have been added upon arrival of the manuscript to Spain. This scholar attempts to account for the relative unity and coherence of the narrative with regard to Byzantine and Arab elements and the scarcity and poor integration of peninsular information. In support of his hypothesis, García Moreno cites the great interest shown by the chronicle in the Islamic conquest of Egypt and the ensuing African expeditions, as well as the authorial knowledge of specific events. These include the land tax imposed on Alexandria by the Arab conquerors and the pact that Cyrus, patriarch of Alexandria, made with the Arabs, allowing Byzantine garrisons to leave the city prior to its surrender in 641.⁶²

The claim of African authorship, however, seems redundant, since the conquest of Egypt and the nature of the agreement between Patriarch Cyrus and the Muslims are narrated in great detail by John of Nikiu, from whose chronicle all or most of the information that appears in the *Chronicle of 741* could have been culled.⁶³ More likely, as Collins asserts, given the high degree of Spain's integration into the wider Mediterranean world, the authors of both Mozarabic chronicles need not have been anybody other than peninsular Christians.⁶⁴

⁶¹ López Pereira, *Estudio crítico*, pp. 116–17.

⁶² Luis A. García Moreno, 'Elementos de la tradición bizantina en las Vidas de Mahoma mozárabes', in *Bizancio y la Península Ibérica*, ed. by Pérez Martín and Bádenas de la Peña, pp. 247–72 (pp. 256–58).

⁶³ John, bishop of Nikiu, *The Chronicle of John, Coptic Bishop of Nikiu*, ed., trans., and notes by Robert Henry Charles (London: Text and Translation Society, 1916), CXX. 1–33, pp. 191–95.

⁶⁴ Collins, *The Arab Spain*, p. 63.

Peripheral Visions

While the questions of authorship and place of composition cannot be resolved to ultimate satisfaction, more insights than have been made to date regarding the authorial intent and messages of these chronicles can be gleaned from an analysis of their narrative structure in light of contemporary Byzantine testimonies.⁶⁵ Surveying the Byzantine chronicle landscape that is contemporary with the Mozarabic chronicles is challenging, since the time of their composition coincides with a period of relative decline in Byzantine historiographical production. Just as the tumultuous Muslim invasion of the Iberian Peninsula contributed to the likely effacement of many peninsular testimonies, the intense Persian-Byzantine conflict and the first Arab conquests in seventh-century Byzantium played a major role in the decline, loss, and perhaps even lack of production of historical writing in the Christian East.⁶⁶ Additionally, the eighth-century iconoclastic conflicts that marked the reigns of Leo III (717–41), Constantine V (741–75), and Leo IV (775–80) likely had even more deleterious effects on the Mediterranean literary landscape.⁶⁷ That the Mozarabic chroniclers are singularly informed about the developments in the eastern Mediterranean and North Africa is indisputable, but the differences in details between these chronicles and the surviving Byzantine testimonies have so far thwarted attempts to make meticulous textual comparisons. These challenges notwithstanding, when read in context of Byzantine testimonies that both pre- and post-date them, the Mozarabic chronicles present a logically coherent and compositionally unified world view — even though it may not be the one twentieth-century Spanish nationalist scholarship would have embraced. Below, I will summarize the putative historiographical context of the Mozarabic chronicles as it stands and suggest that it can be fruitfully complemented by adding into consideration Sebeos's *History*.

⁶⁵ See Ann Christys, *Christians in al-Andalus: 711–1000* (Richmond, Surrey: Curzon, 2002), Chapter 3, 'Eastern Sources for the Eighth-Century Chronicles', pp. 38–51; see also Dubler, 'La crónica', pp. 298–321.

⁶⁶ On the problematic surrounding Byzantine and Arab seventh-century sources, see Walter E. Kaegi, *Byzantium and the Early Islamic Conquests* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), pp. 1–25.

⁶⁷ For an analysis of the Byzantine literary landscape and especially the decline of Byzantine historiography between the seventh and ninth centuries, see Michael Whitby, 'Greek Historical Writing after Procopius: Variety and Vitality', in *The Byzantine and Early Islamic Near East*, ed. by Averil Cameron and Lawrence I. Conrad, *Studies in Late Antiquity and Early Islam*, 6 vols (Princeton, NJ: Darwin, 1992–), II: *Problems in the Literary Source Material* (1999), pp. 25–80.

During the seventh and early eighth centuries, similar literary processes unfolded on the fringes of the Byzantine world, as chroniclers around the Mediterranean turned to Old Testament prophecies for explanations of the rise of Islam. Among the extant sources of Byzantine history cited to date, three were likely composed in Constantinople: the so-called *Chronicon Paschale*, or *Easter Chronicle*, an anonymous early seventh-century text, the *Short History* by Patriarch Nikephoros, and an early ninth-century chronicle attributed to Theophanes (c. 758–817/18). The *Easter Chronicle* immediately pre-dates and shares some factual information with the Mozarabic chronicles. It survives in one damaged tenth-century manuscript that covers AD 284–628; however, the original is believed to have also included an account of the restoration of the Cross to Jerusalem in March 630 and the Easter celebration that year.⁶⁸ The chronicle thus covers the reign of Heraclius (610–41), which is also treated extensively in the Mozarabic chronicles. According to the *Easter Chronicle*, in 628 the Saracens, who were at the time imperial subjects of the Byzantines, were paid to protect the stretch of border located at the entrance to the Arabian Desert.⁶⁹ The *Chronicle of 754* likewise mentions that Saracens paid tribute to the Byzantine empire until they rebelled.⁷⁰ The *Short History* by Nikephoros, which was composed at the end of the eighth century and covers the years 602–769, begins, like the Mozarabic chronicles, with the reign of Phocas (r. 602–10); however, the account of his dethronement by Heraclius is less detailed than in both of the Mozarabic texts.⁷¹ The *Short History* also provides detailed treatment of the Persian defeat by Heraclius, but its similarities with the Iberian chronicles end there.⁷²

Unlike Constantinople, which was able to withstand Arab attacks, the outskirts of the empire bore the brunt of the Arab onslaught. Therefore, chronicle accounts from those areas provide a much more fruitful interpretive context

⁶⁸ See the introduction to *Chronicon Paschale, 284–628 A.D.*, ed., trans., notes, and introd. by Michael Whitby and Mary Whitby, *Translated Texts for Historians*, 7 (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1989), p. xi.

⁶⁹ *Chronicon Paschale*, p. 185.

⁷⁰ *Chronicle of 754*, 8, pp. 28–29; 13, pp. 32–33.

⁷¹ Nikephoros, patriarch of Constantinople, *Short History*, ed., trans., and commentary by Cyril Mango, *Dumbarton Oaks Texts*, 10 (Washington, DC: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection, 1990), 1. 1, pp. 35–37; *Chronicle of 741*, 4, 6, and 7, pp. 7–8; *Chronicle of 754*, 1, pp. 24–25.

⁷² Nikephoros, *Short History*, 6–7, pp. 44–49; *Chronicle of 741*, 11, p. 8; *Chronicle of 754*, 3–6, pp. 26–29.

wherein one can locate the Mozarabic vision of Iberian history. The *Chronicle* of Theophanes, which covers the years 284–813, is a convenient starting point for a comparison between the Mozarabic chronicles and those of the Byzantine outer circle because it is highly likely that in their accounts of the rise of Islam both Theophanes and the Mozarabic compilers depended on the so-called *Syriac Common Source*, which is no longer extant.⁷³ According to one hypothesis, this source text would have been made available to Theophanes in Constantinople by monks who had fled the Muslim-occupied Holy Land in 813.⁷⁴ Its author has been identified as Theophilus of Edessa (c. 695–785), who in his later years was known as court astrologist in the service of the Arab caliph. The *Syriac Common Source* appears to have enjoyed the widest circulation, since there is a compelling case for its use by Syrian Orthodox patriarch Dionysius of Tel-Maḥrē (r. 818–45) and by the tenth-century Arab Christian historian Agapius of Manbij.⁷⁵

The *Chronicle* of Theophanes is remarkably similar to its Mozarabic counterparts in one aspect that is unique among the surviving Byzantine testimonies, namely its use of the most elaborate parallel chronological system. For each of the *anni mundi*, the Greek historian provides the regnal years of the Byzantine emperors, and either the years of the Sassanid kings of Persia or, following their defeat, those of the Arab caliphs. The *Chronicle of 741* lists years of the Spanish era, years of Byzantine emperors and Visigothic kings, and occasionally those of Arab rulers. The *Chronicle of 754* follows an even more elaborate chronological system by marking years of the Spanish era, *anni mundi*, years of Byzantine emperors, years of the Hegira, and regnal years of the caliphs and those of some Visigothic kings. Theophanes also lists the years of the patriarch of Constantinople and, where he has knowledge thereof, those of the pope and the patriarchs of Jerusalem, Alexandria, and Antioch.

Such a chronological system betrays an intent to achieve a structural balance between secular and church history, which, in turn, was a characteristic feature of the West Syriac tradition from the early eighth century onward. The first Syrian evidence of this dual interest in affairs of both the world and the

⁷³ See Dubler, 'La crónica', pp. 328–29; Theophanes the Confessor, *The Chronicle of Theophanes*, ed., trans., notes, and introd. by Harry Turtledove (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1982). Collins sees it as a likely source of information on the rule of Heraclius in the *Chronicle of 741*, while López Pereira refers to a Syrian source of the *Chronicle of 754* as a basis for all information on Arab history (López Pereira, *Estudio crítico*, p. 107).

⁷⁴ See Turtledove, introduction to *The Chronicle of Theophanes*, p. xv.

⁷⁵ For a discussion of the *Syriac Common Source*, see Hoyland, *Seeing Islam*, pp. 400–09.

Church is displayed in several short eighth-century chronological lists of secular and ecclesiastical authorities, believed to be the early precursors of Syrian chronicles.⁷⁶ The interest in church dignitaries also appears well-established in the anonymous *Chronicle of Zuqnīn*, dated to 775, where notices of the accession and death of bishops and patriarchs are interspersed with those of Islamic conquests and Byzantine secular affairs. It is also prominent in the chronicle of Dionysius of Tel-Mahrē, who interpreted church history as a key to understanding secular events. In a much similar fashion, the *Chronicle of 754* displays an elevated interest in ecclesiastical matters both prior to and following the conquest of Spain by the Arabs: it mentions five of the Visigothic church councils in some detail, including the Seville Council II (619) and the Toledan Councils IV (633), V (636), XI (675), and XV (688). Moreover, the portions of this chronicle dedicated to the councils of Toledo and Seville and to theological contributions by Visigothic church dignitaries far outweigh those devoted to the Visigothic kings.⁷⁷

One source that pre-dates the Mozarabic chronicles and has thus far eluded considerations of possible influence is a seventh-century Armenian Byzantine history attributed to Sebeos, bishop of the Bagratuni royal dynasty. Composed c. 660, Sebeos's history contains astoundingly detailed information regarding the Persian wars and the first Arab conquests in Byzantium and Transcaucasia, as well as a detailed account of Muḥammad's life and teachings.⁷⁸ Exactly how the Mozarabic chroniclers could have entered into contact with the Armenian Byzantine historiographical tradition cannot be established, but if such contact indeed took place, it would have likely occurred via the North African route. Sebeos mentions two high-ranking Armenians in the North African context. One is military commander Smbat Bagratuni, who was exiled to North Africa

⁷⁶ For Syriac annals *ad anni* 705, 724, and 775, view Hoyland, *Seeing Islam*, Chapter 10, pp. 391–99. The original chronicle of Dionysius does not survive but was partially preserved by Michael the Syrian and the chronicler of 1234. See the text in *The Seventh Century in the West-Syrian Chronicles*, ed., introd., trans., and annot. by Andrew Palmer, Translated Texts for Historians, 15 (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1993), pp. 85–221. For the *Chronicle of Zuqnīn*, see *The Seventh Century*, pp. 53–70.

⁷⁷ *Chronicle of 754*, 14, p. 32; 17, p. 34; 23, pp. 38–44; 36, p. 54; 38, p. 56; 41, p. 59; López Pereira presents compelling evidence that the chronicler depends on the *Acts of Visigothic Councils*, since he follows the format of the *Acts* by mentioning the year and the reign, the see in which the council was convened, the dignitaries present, and often the dogmatic questions and heresies discussed. López Pereira, *Continuatio*, pp. 122–30.

⁷⁸ See Kaegi, *Byzantium*, Chapter 8, pp. 181–204, on the Byzantine and Muslim conquests of Armenia and Armenian-Byzantine relations in the seventh century.

by Emperor Maurice (r. 582–602) for his efforts to extricate Armenia from service to the Byzantine Emperor.⁷⁹ His son Varaztirots, a deposed Armenian governor, found refuge at the Byzantine court c. 632–33, but was later also expelled to North Africa by Heraclius for his role in the plot against the Emperor that took place c. 636/37; he remained in exile until 645.⁸⁰ It is not far-fetched to assume that the African presence of members of the Armenian ruling dynasty of the Bagratids could have led to the availability of Armenian Byzantine chronicle texts in the region, wherefrom they could have arrived on the Iberian Peninsula via already established routes.

We also know that the Visigoths had been informed about Armenian affairs through Visigothic chronicler John of Biclar, who resided in Byzantium during the reign of Justin II (565–74) and fashioned his *Chronicle* as a continuation of a chronicle written by African bishop Victor of Tunnuna. In the opening portion of his text, John references events of 569 when he recounts one facet of the Persian-Armenian conflict: having been forced by Persian king Chosroes I (d. 579) to abandon Christianity and embrace idolatry, Armenians sought Byzantine sovereignty over their provinces, thus bringing an end to the fifty-year-long peace treaty between the Persians and the Romans.⁸¹ The *Chronicle of 754* contains a detailed account of the rebellion of Ardabastus, a general of Armenian origin in the court of Constantine V (r. 741–75). The *Chronicle* reports that while married to Constantine's sister, Ardabastus staged a rebellion as Constantine was about to rise to power, and after nearly three years of struggle, the rebel was eventually blinded and exiled.⁸² Intriguingly,

⁷⁹ Sebeos, *History*, in *The Armenian History Attributed to Sebeos. Historical Commentary by James Howard-Johnston*, trans. and notes by Robert W. Thomson, *Translated Texts for Historians*, 31, 2 pts (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1999), pt 1, 20. 92–93, pp. 38–40.

⁸⁰ Sebeos, *History*, 44. 133, pp. 92–93 and 44. 143, p. 107. See also Vallejo Gírvés, 'El exilio bizantino', pp. 124–25. By the 630s, in the aftermath of Heraclius's recovery of Syria, Palestine, and Egypt from the Persians, and just prior to the Muslim invasions of those provinces, Byzantine sources report an increased presence of Armenians, particularly Armenian pilgrims (Kaegi, *Byzantium*, p. 186).

⁸¹ John of Biclar, *Chronicle*, 1. 3, p. 17. According to Isidore, John of Biclar spent seven of his formative years in Constantinople studying Greek and Latin ('Hic, cum esset adolescens, Constantinoplam perrexit, ibique graeca et latina eruditione nutritus, septimo demum anno in Hispanias reuersus est', *El 'De viris illustibus' de Isidoro de Sevilla*, ed. by Carmen Codoñer Merino (Salamanca: CSIC, Instituto Antonio de Nebrija, 1964), pp. 151–52. On bilateral contacts between Visigothic Spain and Byzantium, see Presedo Velo, *La España bizantina*, pp. 101–05; Vallejo Gírvés, *Bizancio y la España tardoantigua*, pp. 9–15 and 447–61.

⁸² *Chronicle of 754*, 73, p. 153 and n. 193.

the Asturian *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, composed in the late ninth century, also recalls a certain Ardabastus, a seemingly high-ranking exile from the Byzantine empire, who appeared at the Visigothic court of King Chindasvinth (r. 641–53) and later fathered King Ervig (r. 680–87).⁸³

Given the similarity of the circumstances surrounding both of these characters, it has been questioned whether the Asturian chronicle may refer, albeit anachronistically, to the same character the notice of whom may have been preserved in Visigothic collective memory. Margarita Vallejo Girvés recently considered the tenuous possibility that the Ardabastus mentioned in the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* could be the transcription of the Armenian name *Artav(w)azd*. Given that during the seventh century, Byzantine emperors forced Armenian rebels into exile on the Western and African periphery of the empire, Vallejo Girvés thinks it credible that a high-ranking Armenian noble could have found refuge at the Visigothic court of Witiza (r. 694–710), rather than at the court of Chindasvinth, as claimed in the Asturian chronicle tradition.⁸⁴ Finally, the Asturian *Chronicle of Albelda*, which dates from the 880s and is known to use Mozarabic and Visigothic sources, contains a notice of the Armenians' conversion to Christianity during the reign of Justin II (565–78).⁸⁵ We thus have evidence that Armenian affairs were not unfamiliar to Christian chroniclers in Spain.⁸⁶

⁸³ *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, versions *Rotensis* and *Ad Sebastianum*, pp. 116–17.

⁸⁴ Vallejo Girvés, 'Las relaciones políticas', p. 108; see also Vallejo Girvés, 'Africa tardorromana como lugar de exilio y deportación', in *L'Africa Romana. Actas del XIV Convegno Internazionale di Studi. Sassari 7–10 dicembre 2000*, ed. by Mustapha Khanoussi, Paola Ruggeri, and Cinzia Vismara (Rome: Carocci, 2002), pp. 1027–34, and Vallejo Girvés, *Bizancio y la España tardoantigua*, pp. 311–14. See also Luis A. García Moreno, 'El linaje witizano de Ardaba(s)do', in *Os reinos ibéricos da Idade Média: livro de homenagem ao professor doutor Humberto Carlos Baquero Moreno*, coord. by Luis Carlos Amaral and Maria Fernanda Ferreira Santos, 3 vols (Porto: Universidade de Porto, 2003), I, 779–88.

⁸⁵ *Chronica Albeldensis*, p. 164.

⁸⁶ Presedo Velo, in *La España bizantina*, pp. 148–49, gives a detailed consideration to the discovery in Mérida of a building with a tetraconch layout, absent in paleo-Christian architecture. This pattern is particularly prevalent in Armenian Byzantine churches, including the fourth-century Cathedral of Echmiadzin, the principal Armenian Christian sanctuary, but also occurs in modern-day Georgia, Syria, and Tunisia.

Narrating the Apocalypse

The patterns of narration in the chronicles of Sebeos and Theophanes are important for our understanding of the genesis of the Mozarabic chronicles, for just like the Iberian chroniclers, these Byzantine authors conceptualize their accounts of the rise of Islam in the Near East on two levels: the factual and the eschatological. Theophanes, for example, attributes the formal cause of the first Arab incursion in Byzantium during the season of 632–33 to the exhaustion of the imperial fisc in the wake of the Persian wars and the resulting Byzantine inability to pay the Arabs for safeguarding the frontier.⁸⁷ However, like Sebeos, he partakes in the tradition of biblical exegesis that associates the rising power of Islam with the arrival of the last of the four empires according to the Book of Daniel. In Daniel 7, the last worldly empire is said to be the largest of all the earth's kingdoms and is allegorically imaged as a beast that devours and ravages the earth ('bestia quarta, regnum quartum erit in terra, quod majus erit omnibus regnis, et devorabit universam terram, et conculcabit, et comminuet eam', Daniel 7. 23).⁸⁸

In the Byzantine Near East, Daniel's divination that the new power would begin with the emergence of a false prophet who would challenge the existing religious order and attempt to change the times and the laws could have only been seen as an uncanny foreboding of the rise of Islam, which began with Muḥammad's teachings and brought about the introduction of Islamic law and the adoption of the new chronology based on the Hegira ('Et sermones contra Excelsium loquetur, et sanctos Altissimi conteret: et putabit quod possit mutare tempora, et leges', Daniel 7. 25). Theophanes echoes that sentiment when he calls Muḥammad a 'false prophet'.⁸⁹ A more straightforward affirmation that the Arab scourge had been 'clearly foretold by prophets' appears in the sermon on holy baptism delivered by Sophronius, patriarch of Jerusalem (d. c. 639) in the year 636 or 637.⁹⁰ Theophanes seconds that interpretation when he relates that upon seeing the Arab leader Umar enter Jerusalem in 637 clad only in a

⁸⁷ Theophanes, *Chronicle*, p. 36.

⁸⁸ Biblical quotes hereinafter follow the Vulgata, *Bibliorum Sacrorum Latinae versiones antiquae, seu Vetus Italica, et caeterae quaecunque in Codicibus Mss. & antiquorum libri reperiri potuerunt: Quae cum Vulgata Latina, & cum textu Graeco comparantur*, ed. by Peter Sabatier, 3 vols (Remis: apud Reginaldum Florentain, 1743–49; repr. Turnhout: Brepols, 1976). Mozarabic texts occasionally depend on other versions of the Bible, in particular the Vetus Latina, whose manuscripts are not sufficiently well preserved to enable a profitable linguistic comparison.

⁸⁹ Theophanes, *Chronicle*, p. 34.

⁹⁰ Hoyland, *Seeing Islam*, p. 72. See also Griffith, *The Church*, pp. 25–26.

fragment of camel hide, Sophronius evokes Daniel's prophecy about the abomination of a sacred space.⁹¹ Sebeos also alludes to the wild nature of the sons of Ishmael when he quotes Genesis 2 in his account of the first Arab conquests.⁹²

Prior to the rise of Islam, the four kingdoms of Daniel had been universally interpreted by the Byzantines to be those of the Babylonians, the Medes/Persians, the Greeks, and the Romans.⁹³ By the second half of the seventh century, as the Umayyads solidified their rule in the Near East and North Africa, it became clear that this succession scheme needed a revision that would take into account the new political challenge of Islam. This was resolved either by altering the established order of imperial succession to include Persians, Romans, Byzantines, and Ishmaelites, as in the Coptic Daniel, or by substituting Ishmaelites for Romans, as reflected in Sebeos's *History*:⁹⁴

Who could describe the fearful calamity of the Ishmaelite brigand who set fire to sea and land? However, the blessed Daniel had earlier prophesied such a disaster which befell the land. Through four beasts he indicated the four kingdoms which would arise on earth. First of all the kingdom of the west, the beast in human form, which is that of the Greeks. This is clear from his saying: 'The thick wings were plucked, and it was exterminated from the earth'. He speaks about the extermination of devilish idolatry: 'And it stood as on the feet of a man, and the heart of a man was given it'. 'And behold the second beast was like a bear, and it stood to one side', to the east; he means the Sassanian Kingdom. 'Having three ribs in his mouth', the Kingdoms of the Persians, Medes and Parthians. This is clear from what they were saying to him: 'Arise, eat the flesh of many', just as it ate, as all know. 'Now the third beast was like a leopard; there were four wings of a bird on it, and the beast had four heads'. He means the kingdom of the north, Gog and Magog and their two companions, to which was given authority to fly powerfully in their time in the northern regions. 'The fourth beast was fearful and amazing, and its teeth were of iron, and its claws of bronze. It ate and broke in pieces, and crushed the remnants under foot'. This fourth, arising from the south, is the Kingdom of Ishmael, just as the archangel explained: 'The fourth beast, the fourth kingdom, shall arise, which shall be greater than all [other] kingdoms; and it will consume the whole earth'. 'And the ten horns, the ten kings, shall arise. And after them will rise up another who is greater in evil than all the previous ones'.⁹⁵

⁹¹ Theophanes, *Chronicle*, p. 39.

⁹² Sebeos, *History*, 41, p. 95.

⁹³ Hoyland, *Seeing Islam*, p. 259.

⁹⁴ On the Coptic Daniel, view Hoyland, *Seeing Islam*, pp. 289–90.

⁹⁵ Sebeos, *History*, 44, pp. 105–06.

Another variation of the Old Testament theme of imperial succession, one that proved extremely influential not only in the Near East but also in Western Europe and the Slavic world, was developed in West Syrian tradition. Its chief exponent is the Syrian *Apocalypse* of Pseudo-Methodius, the most influential text in the Byzantine apocalyptic tradition, and the related apocalypses of Pseudo-Ephraem and the so-called 'fragment of Edessa'. This group of texts preserves the traditional notion that the Roman/Byzantine Empire was still the last one of the four. It does so by introducing the figure of the last Christian emperor who would defeat the Arabs prior to the end of times. Although the apocalypse of Pseudo-Methodius was originally written in Syriac between AD 644 and 691, it became widely available in Greek soon after its composition and survives in four Latin translations dated to the early eighth century.⁹⁶ One of these translations was done by Peter the Monk, an Easterner who fled to Merovingian Gaul.⁹⁷ This text blurs the boundaries between history and prophecy by combining a world history from Adam and Eve until Alexander the Great with a foretelling of the annihilation of Islam by the last Roman emperor, who will reside in Jerusalem and witness the second coming of Christ. The structural axis of the prophecy is twofold and consists of the division of the universal history into seven millennia and the succession of four empires according to the Book of Daniel. As he was writing in the wake of Arab conquests in the Near East and Egypt, Pseudo-Methodius associates these four empires with Ethiopia, Macedonia, Greece, and Rome:

Listen now how these four kingdoms were overpowered one by the other, that of the Cushites by that of the Macedonians and that of the Macedonians by that of

⁹⁶ For a summary of the text's history and transmission, see Paul J. Alexander, *The Byzantine Apocalyptic Tradition. Edited with an Introduction by Dorothy de F. Abrahamse* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1985), pp. 24–33, and Bernard McGinn, *Visions of the End: Apocalyptic Traditions in the Middle Ages* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1979), pp. 69–73. Alexander dates Pseudo-Methodius between AD 644 and 678 (p. 25), while Reinink pushes the date of composition forward to between AD 685 and 691, in Gerrit J. Reinink, 'Pseudo-Methodius: A Concept of History in Response to the Rise of Islam', in *The Byzantine and Early Islamic Near East: Papers of the First Workshop on Late Antiquity and Early Islam*, ed. by Averil Cameron and Lawrence I. Conrad (Princeton, NJ: Darwin, 1992), pp. 149–88 (p. 178). The Latin versions of Pseudo-Methodius form the basis of the critical edition by Ernst Sackur, *Sybillinische Texte und Forschungen. Pseudomethodius, Adso und die tiburtinische Sybille*, ed. by Ernst Sackur (Halle a. S.: M. Niemeyer, 1898), pp. 60–96.

⁹⁷ The Latin text of Peter the Monk is available in Sackur, *Sybillinische Texte*, pp. 59–60.

the Greeks, and that of the Greeks by that of the Romans. And these are the four winds of heaven which Daniel saw pouring forth the great sea.⁹⁸

There is ample evidence of the circulation of Pseudo-Methodius in Spain, although its first witness on the Iberian Peninsula dates to the ninth century and appears to be an adaptation of a translation different from that of Peter the Monk. An early version of the Latin translation, known as the *Reuelatio S. Methodii de temporibus nouissimis*, is believed to have circulated among the Mozarabs in the south of Spain, wherefrom it followed Mozarab migrations northwards to Asturias.⁹⁹ At the end of the ninth century, it was twice incorporated into the Asturian *Codex Rotensis*, the first time under the title *Tultu sceptrum de libro domni Metobii*, and the second time as what is believed to be the source underlying the so-called *Prophetic Chronicle*, a Mozarabic composition.¹⁰⁰

The Byzantine adaptation of the Old Testament apocalyptic discourse to chronicle Arab invasions was in itself not a novel narrative strategy, but rather a continuation and variation of some narrative practices used to relate episodes of the Byzantine-Persian wars. Byzantine accounts developed apocalyptic overtones during the last phase of the Persian wars, which extended from the death of Maurice in 602 through the reign of Phocas and the first part of the reign of Heraclius. During that period, the balance of power was tilted toward the Persians, leading to the loss of eastern provinces and the cities of Antioch, Alexandria, and Jerusalem.¹⁰¹ Antioch Strategos, a monk at the Mar Sabas monastery, employs the Old Testament apocalyptic allegory as a narrative framework in his account *The Capture of Jerusalem by the Persians in AD*

⁹⁸ Pseudo-Methodius, in Paul J. Alexander, *Apocalyptic Tradition*, p. 40.

⁹⁹ See L. Vázquez de Parga, 'Algunas notas sobre el Pseudo Metodio y España', *Habis*, 2 (1971), 143–64 (pp. 147–52); José Eduardo López, 'La cultura del mundo árabe en textos latinos hispanos del s.VIII', in *Islão e arabismo na Península Ibérica: Actas do XI Congresso da União Europeia de Arabistas e Islamólogos. Évora –Faro – Silves, 29 set. – 6 out. 1982*, ed. by Adel Sidarus (Évora: Universidade de Évora, 1986), pp. 253–71 (pp. 256–57).

¹⁰⁰ The Latin text of the *Tultu sceptrum de libro Domini Methobii*, along with the Spanish translation, is found in César de la Peña Izquierdo, 'Contribución al estudio sobre la "nota" titulada *Tultu sceptrum de libro Domini Methobii*', in *Actas del I Congreso Nacional de Cultura Mozárabe. Córdoba, 27 al 30 de Abril de 1995*, org. by Schola Gregoriana Cordubensis (Córdoba: Publicaciones Obra Social y Cultural Caja Sur, 1996), pp. 151–63. The title of *Crónica Profética* was given to the fragment by Manuel Gómez-Moreno, in 'Las primeras crónicas de la Reconquista: el ciclo de Alfonso III', *BRAH*, 100 (1932), 562–628 (p. 575). On this fragment, see Chapter 4, 'Questioning Asturias'.

¹⁰¹ Whitby and Whitby, *Chronicon Paschale*, p. xii.

614.¹⁰² For this seventh-century author, the bloodshed inflicted on Jerusalem by the Persian king Chosroes II exemplifies the Old Testament enmity between Babylonia and Israel as revealed in the Books of Ezekiel and Daniel.¹⁰³ As agents of providential punishment, the Persians are imaged in hyperbolic terms of cruelty, ferocity, and bestiality:

Et tum hostes mali intraverunt in civitatem cum ira magna sicut ferae iratae et sicut dracones depravati. Homines autem qui custodiebant murum civitatis fugiebant et abscondebantur in speluncis et foveis et cisternis ut se ipsos salvarent, et multitudo populi fugiebat in ecclesias et altaria, et inibi interficiebantur. Nam hostes intrabant cum furore magno et dentibus suis stridebant irati vehementer, et sicut ferae malae blaterabant et sicut leones rugiebant et sicut feroces viperae sibilabant, et totum quod inveniebant trucidabant, et sicut canes rabiosi carnem crudentium dentibus mandebant, et omnino nullius miserebantur, nec viri nec mulieres nec iuvenis nec senis nec pueri neque infantis nec sacerdotis nec monachi nec virginis nec viduae.¹⁰⁴

¹⁰² Originally composed in the Greek language, the text survives in three Georgian manuscripts. The two thirteenth-century manuscripts were first published by Nikoloz Marr, *Антиох Стратиг. Пленение Иерусалима персами в 614 году. Грузинский текст исследовал, издал, перевел и арабское извлечение приложил Н. Марр*, *Тексты и разыскания по армяно-грузинской филологии*, 9 (St Petersburg: Типография Императорской Академии наук, 1909). Citations follow Antioch Strategos, *La prise de Jérusalem par les perses en 614*, ed. by Gérard Garitte, *Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium*, 203, *Scriptores Iberici*, 12 (Louvain: Secrétariat du CorpusCO, 1960). Garitte based his Latin translation on Marr's two manuscripts and an additional eleventh-century manuscript housed at Bodleian Library in Oxford, Bodl. georg. 1 (AD 1050). The source of the translation is Frederick Cornwallis Conybeare, 'Antiochus Strategos' Account of the Sack of Jerusalem in AD 614', *English Historical Review*, 25 (1910), 502–17. On the relationship between Byzantine narratives of the conquest of Jerusalem by Persians and Arabs, see Margarita Vallejo Girvés, 'Sensaciones bizantinas: las dos caídas de Jerusalén en la literatura del siglo VII', *Erytheia: Revista de estudios bizantinos y neogriegos*, 27 (2006), 43–72, and 'Miedo bizantino: las conquistas de Jerusalén y la llegada del islam', <<http://www.ull.es/congresos/conmirel/VALLEJO.htm>>, published February 2000 [accessed 11 November 2013].

¹⁰³ 'Nam propheta Ezechiel prophetabat opus hoc et quod occurrit Hierosolymae, et dixit: "Fili hominis, dic Hierosolymae quoniam: Malum quod est inter te manet adhuc et permanens est usque modo. Hoc dicit Dominus: Coronam misericordiae tibi posui in capite tuo et deci te reginam, et exivit fama de te inter omnes gentes et erat gloria tua impedimentum eis; et accepisti thesaurum tuum et praeparavisti ex eo idolum sculptum et adornavisti illud [...] capitis tui. Et adduxisti filios tuos quos genuisti pro me, et sacrificavisti victimas idolorum in perditionem eorum; et multiplicavisti fornicationes tuas; propter hoc tradidit te Deus manibus inimicorum tuorum.'" Antioch Strategos, *The Capture of Jerusalem*, II. 5, p. 4. Antioch evokes Daniel's captivity (Daniel 1) in his account of two eloquent Phoenician monks who were taken hostage and interrogated by the Persians on the future of Jerusalem (v. 3, p. 8). Cf. Ezekiel 16.

¹⁰⁴ Antioch Strategos, *The Capture of Jerusalem*, VIII. 6–8, p. 14. Cf. Isaiah 2. 19: 'Et

(The evil foemen entered the city in great fury, like infuriated wild beasts and irritated serpents. The men however who defended the city wall fled, and hid themselves in caverns, fosses, and cisterns in order to save themselves; and the people in crowds fled into churches and altars; and there they destroyed them. For the enemy entered in mighty wrath, gnashing their teeth in violent fury; like evil beasts they roared, bellowed like lions, hissed like ferocious serpents, and slew all whom they found. Like mad dogs they tore with their teeth the flesh of the faithful, and respected none at all, neither male nor female, neither young nor old, neither child nor baby, neither priest nor monk, neither virgin nor widow.¹⁰⁵)

Byzantine political fortunes briefly changed in 628, as Heraclius's successful campaigns resulted in the conclusion of a peace treaty with the Sassanid empire and the death of Chosroes II in an internal coup. Jerusalem was liberated that year and the Cross returned in 630 in an elaborate procession and with much triumph described by Antiochus Strategos, Sebeos, and Theophanes, among others. But the prolonged war had exhausted the Persian and the Byzantine empires, leading to the precipitous fall of both to the Arabs. As in Old Testament history and prophecy, where the enemy of the people of Israel functions as an agent of divine punishment, in Byzantine accounts both Persians and Arabs act as a scourge by inflicting destruction and suffering whose scale and intensity surpasses all previously known calamities. Consequently, chroniclers show a preference for selecting events that exemplify Old Testament prophecies, especially Elijah (II Kings and II Chronicles), Jeremiah, Isaiah, Habakkuk, and Daniel. Natural disasters and large-scale political calamities comprise the bulk of the events in these chronicles, while the sequence of apostasy and retribution generates a narrative rhythm that mirrors the scourge paradigm of Old Testament prophecies.

This allegorical framework begets several characteristic tropes, such as frequent hyperbolic allusions to the uncountable multitude of the Persian/Arab invaders and their unmatched cruelty; the ineffability of divine providence; the inenarrability of events being recorded; and, in the most extreme cases, the trope of *mundus inversus* exemplified in ekphrastic passages that present an inversion of vital human routines. Among eastern Mediterranean authors, this technique is particularly salient in Antioch Strategos, who combines strings of rhetorical anaphoric questions with proclamations of the inability of a human being to narrate the scale of tribulations brought upon by the Persian conquest

introibunt in speluncas petrarum, et in voragine terrae a facie formidinis Domini, et a gloria majestatis ejus, cum surrexerit percutere terram.

¹⁰⁵ Conybeare, 'Antiochus Strategos' Account of the Sack of Jerusalem in AD 614', pp. 506–07.

of Jerusalem (for example, 'Et cur multum loquar? Nam ne potens quidem sum mensuram illius tribulationis narrare'; 'Quis posset tribulationem diei illius computare et notificare vobis?'; 'Et quisnam computaret multitudinem mortuorum?').¹⁰⁶ Among sources dealing with the rise of Islam, this technique is most pronounced in the account of Pseudo-Methodius, whose apocalyptic poetics features both hyperbolic language with references to the uncountability and extreme cruelty of Arab troops and the *topos* of the world turned upside down:

And they [the Ismaelites] laid waste and captured and conquered all the kingdoms of the nations, and the entire land of promise was subject to them, and the earth was full of them and of their camps. And like locusts they walked naked, and they ate meat in vessels of meat and they drank the blood of animals. And when the sons of Ishmael conquered and subjected the entire earth, they ravaged cities and towns and occupied all the kingdoms of the nations.¹⁰⁷

Given the short lapse of time between the end of the Persian wars and the beginning of Arab invasions in the Near East, it is not surprising that eastern chroniclers describe the Persian and Arab invasions in very similar terms.¹⁰⁸

It is precisely this highly mimetic narrative framework — one characterized by the blurring of generic boundaries between history and prophecy — that underlies the narrative genesis of the Mozarabic chronicles. It manifests itself

¹⁰⁶ Antioch Strategos, *The Capture of Jerusalem*, VIII. 9, p. 14; VIII. 20, p. 15; IX. 4, p. 16.

¹⁰⁷ Pseudo-Methodius, in Alexander, *Apocalyptic Tradition*, p. 38.

¹⁰⁸ John C. Lamoreaux locates the origin of apocalyptic writing about Islamic invasions in the Byzantine East in the fourth decade of the seventh century. The idea of providential punishment for the sins of Christians first appears in the letter to Peter the Illustrious by Maximus the Confessor (c. 634–40); similar views were expressed c. 634–37 by Sophronius (560–638), then patriarch of Jerusalem, who was the first to link Muslim invasions to Old Testament prophets. Lamoreaux draws a distinction between the responses of the Melkites, the dominant religious majority in Syria and Palestine who tended to regard the Muslim invasions in apocalyptic terms of punishment for Christian sins, and those of religious minorities, including Monophysites, Nestorians, and the Jews, whose initial responses indicate perceptions of Muslims as agents of justice. John C. Lamoreaux, 'Early Eastern Christian Responses to Islam', in *Medieval Christian Perceptions of Islam*, ed. by John Victor Tolan (New York: Garland, 1996), pp. 3–31 (pp. 14–15). However, the view that Christian minorities in the Mediterranean had reasons to greet Muslims as liberators has been challenged in recent scholarship. See Harald Suermann, 'Copts and the Islam of the Seventh Century', and Jan J. van Ginkel, 'The Perception and Presentation of the Arab Conquest in Syriac Historiography: How Did the Changing Social Position of the Syrian Orthodox Community Influence the Account of their Historiographers?', in *The Encounter of Eastern Christianity with Early Islam*, ed. by Emmanouela Grypeou, Mark Swanson, and David Thomas (Leiden: Brill, 2006), pp. 95–109 and 171–84.

both structurally and stylistically, guiding the choice of their chronological and metaphorical systems, the selection of events, and the organization of narrative space. While the *Chronicle of 741* adapts apocalyptic prophecies to Byzantine matters, which comprise the bulk of the text, the *Chronicle of 754* demonstrates a much more sophisticated apocalyptic world view by inscribing Visigothic history into the Near Eastern prophetic allegory.

Nowhere is this more apparent than in the frequently cited passage containing a lamentation of the destruction of Spain. It is located approximately at the mid-point of the chronicle and follows the notice of the destruction of Toledo and Zaragoza by the North African governor Mūsa ibn Nuṣayr in 711 and the establishment of the emirate of Córdoba. The passage opens with a manifestation of a creative tension, resulting both from the ineffability of divine providence that had directed the Arabs into Spain and the inenarrability of the events being recorded:

Quis enim narrare queat tanta pericula? Quis dinumerare tam inportuna naufragia? Nam si omnia membra uerterentur in linguam, omnino nequaquam Spanie ruinas uel eius toth tantaque mala dicere poterit humana natura. Sed ut in brebi cuncta legenti renorem pagella, relictis seculi innumerabilibus ab Adam usque nunc cladibus, quas per infinitis regionibus et ciuitatibus crudelis intulit mundus iste inmundus, quidquid historialiter capta Troia pertulit, quidquid Iherosolima predicta per prophetarum eloquia baiulabit, quidquid Babilonia per scripturarum eloquia substulit, quidquid postremo Roma apostolorum nouilitate decorata martirialiter confecit, omnia et toth ut Spania condam deliciosa et nunc misera effecta tam in honore quam etiam in dedecore experibit.¹⁰⁹

(Who can relate such perils? Who can enumerate such grievous disasters? Even if every limb were transformed into a tongue, it would be beyond human nature to express the ruin of Spain and its many and great evils. But let me summarize everything for the reader on one brief page. Leaving aside all of the innumerable disasters from the time of Adam up to the present, which this cruel, unclean world has brought to countless regions and cities — that which, historically, the city of Troy sustained when it fell; that which Jerusalem suffered, as foretold by the eloquence of the prophets; that which Babylon bore, according to the eloquence of the scriptures; that which finally Rome went through, martyrially graced with the nobility of the apostles — all this and more Spain, once so delightful and now rendered so miserable, endured as much to its honour as to its disgrace.¹¹⁰)

¹⁰⁹ *Chronicle of 754*, 55, pp. 72, 74.

¹¹⁰ Wolf, *Conquerors and Chroniclers*, pp. 132–33.

Like Byzantine authors, the Mozarabic chronicler describes the Arab invasion in hyperbolic terms of cruelty and intensity that surpasses all hitherto known calamities. His references to the human inability to narrate events of such magnitude can be regarded as a leitmotif, since they reappear further in the chronicle in the account of the civil war between the Syrian army led by Balj and the Andalusians led by Umayyah in the year 743: 'Tanta uero inter orientalia cum duce Belgi et occidentalia cum filio Humeia collecta exercita [...] quantum humana narrare iux preualeat lingua.'¹¹¹ ('So great were the battles that ensued between the armies gathered by the easterners under their leader Balj and the westerners under 'Abd-al-Malik's son Umayyah [...] that the human tongue is scarcely able to express it').¹¹² One more such remark is located further in the text, as the chronicler relates the attack of 'Abd ar-Rahmān al-Ghafiqi, governor of al-Andalus (r. 731–33), on Aquitaine: 'Solus deus numerum morientium uel pereuntium recognoscat' ('God only knows the number of those who died or fled').¹¹³

Although all Iberian chronicles composed in the wake of the Arab conquest of the peninsula deal extensively with the matter of Arab presence in Spain, such hyperbolic language is unique to the Mozarabic tradition. Its use in the Iberian context is particularly puzzling and can only be understood as an element of the apocalyptic allegory. This is because allusions to Arab cruelty and the large numbers of invading troops or of those fallen in combat (for instance, 'Sarracenorum copiosissima multitudo', 'inenarrabilia et copiosa [...] aduersum se inuicem proelia exercentes, innumerabilis ex utroque exercitu mutuis inter se proeliis agitatis hominum cecidit multitudo', and 'copiis uniuersarum gentium' in the *Chronicle of 741*; 'innumerabiles cateruas', 'tirannizantium multitudo', and 'Arabica multitudo' in the *Chronicle of 754*) seem to have little grounding in historical reality.¹¹⁴ There is an odd lack of correlation between what constitutes today our knowledge of the historical reality of the conquest and its description in the *Chronicle of 754*.

The chronicle bewails the violent devastation of both the Mediterranean coast and the interior of Spain by the Arabs ('non solum ulteriorem Spaniam, sed etiam et citeriorem usque ultra Cesaragustam') and paints the military advances of the Arab general Mūsa (711–12) in apocalyptic terms:

¹¹¹ *Chronicle of 754*, 86, p. 112.

¹¹² Wolf, *Conquerors and Chroniclers*, p. 149.

¹¹³ *Chronicle of 754*, 80, p. 98; Wolf, *Conquerors and Chroniclers*, p. 143.

¹¹⁴ *Chronicle of 741*, 13, p. 9; 31, p. 11; 36, p. 13; *Chronicle of 754*, 33, p. 50; 84, p. 106.

Ciuitates decoras igne concremando precipitat, seniores et potentes seculi cruci adiudicat, iubenēs atque lactantes pugionibus trucidat. Sicque dum tali terrore cunctos stimulat, pacem nonnullae ciuitates quae residue erant iam coacte proclamant adque suadendo et inridendo astu quoddam nec mora petita condonant. Sed ubi inpetrata territi metu recalcitrant, ad montana temti iterum effugientes fame et diuersa morte periclitant.¹¹⁵

(He ruined beautiful cities, burning them with fire; condemned lords and powerful men to the cross; and butchered youths and infants with the sword. While he terrorized everyone in this way, some of the cities that remained sued for peace under duress and, after persuading and mocking them with a certain craftiness, the Saracens granted their requests without delay. When the citizens subsequently rejected what they had accepted out of fear and terror, they tried to flee to the mountains where they risked hunger and various forms of death.¹¹⁶)

The chronicler states that such fate befell not only the Visigothic capital of Toledo, whose elites partly fled and partly were executed with the help of Bishop Oppa, son of King Egica ('seniores nobiles viros, qui utrumque remanserāt, per Oppam filium Egiche regis a Toletō fugam arripientes gladio patibuli iugulat et per eius occasionem cunctos esse detruncat'), but also all of Spain.¹¹⁷ Collins regards the destruction of Toledo recorded in the *Chronicle of 754* as highly likely, since it was politically expeditious to dismantle a symbolic centre of Visigothic power.¹¹⁸ With the exception of this caveat, however, the chronicler's testimony must be viewed with a critical eye, since much of the Arab conquest of Spain, like that of the Near East and North Africa, was achieved through diplomatic negotiations, with only a handful of cities apparently being subjected to harsh military takeovers.¹¹⁹ Treaties negotiated between the Arab governors and local overlords allowed both sides of the conflict to avoid major bloodshed and facilitated the conquest of large territories by relatively small Arab armies. Muslim willingness to offer favourable terms to local populations has been interpreted as a likely consequence of the small number of their troops compared to the number of locals, making it necessary for the Arabs to avoid large military losses.¹²⁰

¹¹⁵ *Chronicle of 754*, 54, pp. 70, 72.

¹¹⁶ Wolf, *Conquerors and Chroniclers*, p. 132.

¹¹⁷ *Chronicle of 754*, 54, p. 70.

¹¹⁸ Collins, *The Arab Conquest of Spain*, pp. 43–44.

¹¹⁹ On the use of this strategy during the Arab conquest of Syria, Palestine, and Egypt, see John C. Lamoreaux, 'Early Christian Responses to Islam', pp. 3–9.

¹²⁰ Wolf, 'Spanish Christian Views of Islam', p. 285.

At least four such treaties made by Visigothic authorities are mentioned in Arabic sources. The earliest of them, which is related by Ibn al-Qūṭīyya, was negotiated between the sons of Witiza and Ṭāriq on 19 July 711, and facilitated the Muslim takeover of Córdoba. The second agreement was made between Mūsa's son 'Abd al-Azīz and Theodemir, lord of Murcia, on 4 April 713, and is recorded in the *Chronicle of 754*.¹²¹ The surviving text of this treaty specifies the favourable terms offered to the local population: Theodemir would continue to exercise sovereignty over his subjects, who would retain their property and would not be killed, placed into captivity, separated from their families, or prohibited from practising their religion. The treaty covered seven cities, including Lorca, Orihuela, and Alicante, and specified a tax (*jizya*) on the local population. A third treaty between Mūsa and the city of Mérida was concluded on 30 June 713, following a protracted siege. The final treaty was made by Governor 'Anbasah with the citizens of Carcassonne, in Visigothic Septimania, which Collins dates to around 724.¹²² There is further evidence that in the first decades after the invasion of Spain, Arab and Berber contact with the Visigothic populations of conquered cities was limited due to the necessity to protect Islamic religious purity from the Christian majority. To that effect, Muslims established garrisons outside major cities and lived in virtual segregation from Christians.¹²³

We should therefore view the veracity of the chronicler's account through the mediating prism of an apocalyptic world view that informs Iberian and Byzantine chronicle accounts of the rise of Islam. This particularly applies to the descriptions of extreme physical and emotional suffering that accompanied the conquest of Spain and the Arab civil wars on its territory. The *Chronicle*

¹²¹ *Chronicle of 754*, 87, pp. 112, 114.

¹²² See the discussion of sources in Alfred M. Howell, 'Some Notes on Early Treaties between Muslims and the Visigothic Rulers of al-Andalus', in *Actas del I Congreso de historia de Andalucía, diciembre, 1976*, ed. by Emilio Cabrera Muñoz, 10 vols (Córdoba: Monte de Piedad y Caja de Ahorros de Córdoba, 1978), 1: *Andalucía medieval*, pp. 3–14, especially pp. 6–12; Collins, *The Arab Conquest of Spain*, p. 87. On Theodemir, see also Luis A. García Moreno, 'Teudemiro de Orihuela y la invasión islámica', in *Mundos medievales: espacios, sociedades y poder: Homenaje al Profesor José Ángel García de Cortázar y Ruiz de Aguirre*, ed. by Beatriz Arizaga Bolumburu and others (Santander: Universidad de Cantabria, PubliCan, 2012), pp. 529–44. The first study to contribute archaeological evidence about the kingdom of Tudmīr is by Sonia Gutiérrez Lloret, 'De Teodomiro a Tudmīr. Los primeros tiempos desde la arqueología (s. VII–IX)', in *De Mahoma a Carlomagno*, ed. by Sénac, pp. 229–84. See p. 250 for the discussion of the treaty and the precise geographic area it was believed to cover.

¹²³ Wolf, 'Spanish Christian Views of Islam', p. 285.

of 754 likens the fate of Spain to that of Jerusalem and, like the Holy City in Lamentations 1. 1 and Isaiah 1. 21–3, personifies its conquered territory in the image of a dishonoured and despoiled maiden:

Tunc in era DCCLXXII, anno imperii eius XIII^o, Arabum CXVI^o, Iscam XII^o, Abdelmelec ex nobili familia super Spaniam dux mittitur a principalia iussa. Qui dum eam post toth tantaque pericula repperit omnibus bonis opimam et ita floride post tantos dolores repletam, ut diceret augustalem esse malogranatam, tantam in eam pene per quattuor annos inrogat petulantiam, ut paulatim labefacta a diuersis ambagibus maneat executa. Iudicesque eius prærepti cupiditate ita blandiendo in eam inrogant maculam, ut non solum ex eo tempore declinando extet ut mortua, uerum etiam a cunctis optimis maneat usquequaque priuata adque a recuperandi spe omnimode desolata.¹²⁴

(In the era 772 (AD 734), in the fourteenth year [of Emperor Leo], the one hundred sixteenth of the Arabs and the twelfth of Hishām, ‘Abd al-Malik, from a noble family, was sent by order of the prince to be the governor of Spain. He found it, even after all it had been through, to be abundant with every good thing and, even after all its suffering, to be filled with beauty, so that you could say that it was like an August pomegranate. But he treated it so harshly for almost four years that little by little it was ruined, cut off from its neighbors. His judges, seized with cupidity, so defiled Spain with their deceit that not only did it decline from that time on as if moribund, but it remained deprived of all its best men, completely without hope for recovery.¹²⁵)

In another example, the description of suffering inflicted on Arab rebels by Andalusí governor al-Ḥurr (r. 715–18) is highly reminiscent of Isaiah 14. 11 and Jeremiah 6. 26: ‘[Alaor] Mauris dudum Spanias commeantibus penas pro thesauros absconsos inrogat, atque in cilicio et cinere, uermibus uel peduculis scaturrientibus alligatos in carcere et katenis honustos retemat et questionando uel diuersas penas inferendo flagellat’.¹²⁶ ([Al-Ḥurr] penalized the Moors who had long been dwelling in Spain on account of the treasure they had hidden. He

¹²⁴ *Chronicle of 754*, 8, p. 102. Cf.: ‘Quomodo sedet sola ciuitas plena populo: facta est quasi uidua domina gentium: princeps provinciarum facta est sub tributo’ (Lamentations 1. 1); ‘Quomodo facta est meretrix ciuitas fidelis, plena iudicii? Iustitia habitauit in ea, nunc autem homicidae. Argentum tuum uersum est scoriam: uinum tuum mistum est aqua. Principes tui infideles, socii furum: omnes diligunt munera, sequuntur retributiones. Pupillo non iudicant: et causa uiduae non ingreditur ad illos’ (Isaiah 1. 21–3).

¹²⁵ Wolf, *Conquerors and Chronicles*, pp. 144–45.

¹²⁶ *Chronicle of 754*, 64, p. 80. Cf.: ‘Subter te sternetur tineae, et operimentum tuum erunt vermes’ (Isaiah 14. 11); ‘Filia populi mei accingere cilicio, conspergere cinere: luctum unigeniti fac tibi, planctum amarum, quia repente ueniet vastator super nos’ (Jeremiah 6. 26).

kept them in sack cloth and ashes, infested with worms and lice, bound in jail and weighed down with chains, and he tortured them during interrogation').¹²⁷

The Old Testament apocalyptic framework makes equally unsurprising the authorial concern with astronomical phenomena and natural disasters, which figure prominently in the Byzantine chronicle tradition as manifestations of divine providence.¹²⁸ The *Chronicle of 754* mentions four solar eclipses, of which one occurred in Byzantium and three were observed in Spain: (1) an eclipse during the reign of Recceswinth following the Eighth Council of Toledo (653) that terrified all of Spain ('omnis Spania territat'); (2) another eclipse that occurred in Arab Spain during the reign of Alao or Zama around the year 730; and (3) a halo observed in Córdoba around 750, when three suns appeared simultaneously in the sky, followed by an episode of extreme hunger ('fame intolerabili omnes patrie Hispanii [...] fuerunt uastantes').¹²⁹ Another episode of hunger is mentioned during the rule of Ervig (680–87), and an outbreak of the plague is recorded during the rule of Egica (687–702).¹³⁰ López Pereira attributes the chronicler's unusual interest in natural disasters to his desire to continue the tradition of such authors as Gregory of Tours, Fredegar, Procopius, and Paulus Diaconus, among others. This, however, does not explain the absence of such interest on the part of earlier Visigothic and posterior Asturian chroniclers, unless we see it as a direct consequence of the adoption of Old Testament apocalyptic discourse.¹³¹ Again, the Mozarabs could have found a model for inclusion of such events in Byzantine histories. Sebeos, for example, echoes Old Testament prophecies when he compares the Arab armies with a windstorm arriving from arid areas of the Arabian desert ('sicut turbines ab Aphrico veniunt, de deserto venit, de terra horribili', Isaiah 21. 1):

That is the great and fearsome desert whence the tempest of those nations [descendants of Hagar] emerged in a storm and occupied all the land, trampled and smote it. So the saying was fulfilled: 'The fourth beast, the fourth kingdom will stand on earth, which surpasses in evil all kingdoms', which made the whole earth a desert.¹³²

¹²⁷ Wolf, *Conquerors and Chronicles*, p. 136.

¹²⁸ Cf. 'Et dixit Dominus ad me: Noli orare pro populo isto in bonum [...] gladio, et fame, et peste consumam eos' (Jeremiah 14. 11–12); 'In gladio et in fame et in peste visitabo super gente illam, ait Dominus, donec consumam eos in manu ejus' (Jeremiah 27. 8).

¹²⁹ (1) *Chronicle of 754*, 27, p. 46; (2) *Chronicle of 754*, 65, pp. 80, 82; (3) *Chronicle of 754*, 92, pp. 122, 124.

¹³⁰ *Chronicle of 754*, 37, p. 56; 41, p. 58.

¹³¹ López Pereira, *Estudio Crítico*, pp. 46–52.

¹³² Sebeos, *History*, 47, p. 133.

The historical basis for this allegory can be likely traced to intense meteorological activity, registered by both Sebeos and Theophanes, which took place in the years 634–35. According to Theophanes, during their conquest of Damascus that season, the Arabs were aided by a strong tailwind that stymied Byzantine resistance.¹³³ Theophanes episodically records Arab-associated natural disasters as a backdrop for political calamities, such as a windstorm in 647 or 648 (the year of successful Arab campaigns in Africa) or a dust storm that came from the sky in 652 or 653 (the year Heraclius's nephew Gregory died).¹³⁴ Like Sebeos, who frequently links Old Testament prophecies with political events — such as the rapid Arab expansion into regions previously reconquered from the Persians, the conquest of Armenia, the institution of a census in the conquered territories, or the violent division of the Arab world into two rival factions — the *Chronicle of 754* seeks to discern indications of impending political calamities in astronomical phenomena and natural disasters. To that end, the chronicle uses stock phrases referring to the instruments of providential punishment by sword, hunger, and plague (such as 'igne gladioque', 'fame ferroque', etc.).

Lastly, and, perhaps, most importantly for our consideration of the narrative genesis of the Mozarabic chronicles, the apocalyptic framework dictates both the geographical areas being covered as the locations of the four empires, as well as the use of multiple chronologies that correspond to the Visigothic era and the years of the Arab caliphs and Byzantine emperors. The eschatology underlying such an organization of the Mozarabic texts shares a feature with the *History* of Sebeos not found anywhere else in the Mediterranean apocalyptic tradition. As Robert G. Hoyland points out, whereas in Syrian and Coptic apocalypses the four empires succeed one another, Sebeos's kingdoms 'are not successive, but rather are connected with the four quarters of earth and are contemporaneous with one another, the Arab kingdom eventually usurping the other three'.¹³⁵ In Sebeos, the empires of the Byzantines, the Sassanids, Gog and Magog, and the Arabs correspond to the four cardinal points — west, east, north, and south. Both Mozarabic chroniclers, in turn, create a narrative space organized by the cardinal points corresponding to the Roman-Byzantine Empire (Rome, Troy, Jerusalem), Persia (Babylon), the Visigothic empire (the Iberian Peninsula), and Arabia. This quadrilateral organization of the narrative

¹³³ Theophanes, *Chronicle*, p. 38. Cf.: Sebeos does not link windstorms to Arab successes in particular battles; instead, he dwells extensively on meteorological conditions as proof of fulfilment of Old Testament prophecies (Sebeos, *History*, 47, pp. 132–34).

¹³⁴ Theophanes, *Chronicle*, pp. 43–44.

¹³⁵ Hoyland, *Seeing Islam*, p. 534.

space is supported with fourfold chronologies. The chroniclers do not mark the years of Persian rulers, since their accounts open with the destruction of Persia by Heraclius. Having commenced their accounts with extensive passages on the rule of Heraclius and his victories over the Persians, the Mozarabic chronicles create a symmetrical narrative structure comprising the four kingdoms in Danieline prophecy, which are interpreted to be the empires of the Byzantines, the Persians (implicit in Byzantine events), the Visigoths, and the Arabs.

It is impossible to prove beyond the shadow of a doubt that the Mozarabs had direct knowledge of Sebeos's *History* and the putative *Syriac Common Source* used by Theophanes, or that texts such as the apocalypse of Pseudo-Methodius circulated on the Iberian Peninsula prior to the ninth century. What can be stated with certainty, however, is that during the seventh and early eighth centuries, similar literary processes unfolded on the fringes of the Byzantine world, as chroniclers around the Mediterranean turned to Old Testament prophecies for explanations of the rise of Islam. In this regard, the similarities between the Mozarabic chronicles and the Near Eastern texts are striking. Pseudo-Methodius, who writes in the wake of the second civil war among the Arabs (685–87), responds to the restoration of Umayyad authority in Mesopotamia by Caliph 'Abd-al-Malik (692). Because the solidifying of Arab rule over Syria resulted in higher taxes on the local population and a fear of mass conversions to Islam by Syrian Christians, Pseudo-Methodius tries to prevent that outcome by defending the traditional view that the Roman-Byzantine Empire, rather than the newly emerging Islamic power, was the last of the four empires of the world.¹³⁶ Sebeos is primarily interested in Armenia's relationship with Persia, Byzantium, and the Arabs, and therefore provides detailed accounts of events that have an impact on Armenian affairs. He dwells in particular on Persian-Armenian and Persian-Byzantine wars, the capture of Jerusalem by the Persians in 614, and the liberation of the Holy City by Heraclius. In his account of the rise of Islam, he includes a detailed biography of Muḥammad, Islamic conquests in the Byzantine empire and Transcaucasia, and, finally, the first civil war among the Arabs.¹³⁷

In a much similar fashion, the Mozarabic chroniclers are interested in those events in the Byzantine and Arab world that directly impact Spain. As continuators of Isidore's *Historia de regibus Gothorum* and John of Biclar's chronicle, they are not directly interested in Persian events that occurred before 610 and are covered in John's chronicle; however, both Mozarabic chronicles contain

¹³⁶ Reinink, 'Pseudo-Methodius', pp. 179–80.

¹³⁷ Sebeos, *History*, 42–52, pp. 94–154.

detailed accounts of Persia's defeat by Heraclius in 627.¹³⁸ Like Sebeos, both chronicles contain biographical notes on the prophet of Islam: the *Chronicle of 741* calls Muḥammad one of the nobles of his tribe and a seer whom the Arabs consider to be their prophet ('de tribu illius gentis nobilissima natus, prudens admodum uir et aliquantorum futurorum prouisor gestorum').¹³⁹ The *Chronicle of 754* closely follows Daniel's prophecy of the appearance of an astute and powerful king during the last days of the four kingdoms:

Sarraceni in Era DCLVI, anno imperii Eraclii VII, Siriam, Arabiam et Mesopotamiam furtim magis quam uirtute Mammet eorum ducatore rebellia adortante sibi uindicant atque non tantum publicis irruptionibus quantum clanculis incursionibus perseuerando uicinas prouincias uastant. Sicque quoquo modo arte fraude non uirtute cunctas adiacentes imperii ciuitates stimulant et postmodum iugum a ceruice excutientes aperte rebellant.¹⁴⁰

(The Saracens rebelled in the era 656 (618), the seventh year of Emperor Heraclius, and appropriated for themselves Syria, Arabia and Mesopotamia, more through trickery than through the power of their leader Muḥammad, and devastated the neighbouring provinces, proceeding not so much by means of open attacks as by secret incursions. Thus by means of cunning and fraud rather than power, they incited all of the frontier cities of the empire and finally rebelled openly, shaking the yoke from their necks.¹⁴¹)

The above passage makes it apparent that the Mozarabs saw historical events through the prism of the Book of Daniel. But while Byzantine authors such as Sebeos and Pseudo-Methodius evoke Danieline and other Old Testament prophecies at various points in their texts, the Mozarabic chronicles, and particularly the *Chronicle of 754*, exploit the apocalyptic allegory much further: they turn the Old Testament apocalypse into an overarching compositional device as they structure their narratives and style their language in such a way as to inscribe Spain into the broader Mediterranean narrative of the rise of Islam. They do so by designing four narrative levels corresponding to the cardinal points of the

¹³⁸ *Chronicle of 741*, 10–12, p. 8; *Chronicle of 754*, 2–4, pp. 24–29.

¹³⁹ *Chronicle of 741*, 13, 17, p. 9.

¹⁴⁰ *Chronicle of 754*, 8, p. 28. Cf. Daniel 8. 23–25: 'Consurget rex impudens facie, et intelligens propositiones: et roborabitur fortitudo eius, sed non in viribus suis: et supra quam credi potest, universa vastabit, et prosperabitur, et faciet. Et interficiet robustos, et populum sanctorum secundum voluntatem suam, et dirigetur dolus in manu ejus: et con suum magnificabit, et in copia rerum omnium occidet plurimos: et contra principem principum consurget, et ne manu conteretur.'

¹⁴¹ Wolf, *Conquerors and Chronicles*, pp. 113–14.

earth, by placing Persian, Byzantine, Arab, and Iberian events into this scheme, and by adopting multiple chronologies that match these four empires.

By inscribing Spain into this quadrilateral narrative scheme, the Mozarabic chronicles present a highly skilled synthesis of the Western and Eastern Roman and Byzantine traditions of prophetic history. Daniel's prophecy was known in Roman Spain, since Orosius incorporated it in modified form into his *Seven Books of History Against the Pagans*, where the successive empires correspond to the four cardinal points: Babylon to the east, Macedonia to the west, Africa (Carthage) to the south, and Rome to the north.¹⁴² The Visigoths likewise did not separate history from prophecy but rather believed history to be an integral part of Old Testament books. To that effect, Isidore of Seville comments in *Quaestiones in Vetus testamentum* that prophecy was an integral part of the historical books of the Old Testament as it contained preannouncement of future events ('Historia sacrae legis non sin aliqua praenuntiatione futurorum gestae conscripta est').¹⁴³ Isidore's was essentially an apocalyptic view of history, underlying his attribution of the Visigothic origin to the people of Gog.¹⁴⁴ As an historian, Isidore himself episodically employs the Old Testament apocalyptic framework with its allegorical view of *mundus inversus*, such as when he narrates the incursion of Vandals, Alans, and Suevi in Spain. The destruction caused by these barbarian tribes is so intense that it inverts the fundamental vital functions of the Visigoths, causing an eruption of violence, cannibalism, and necrophagia:

AeraCCCCXLVIWandali,Alani etSueui Spanias occupantes neces uastationesque cruentisdiscursibusfaciunt,urbesincendunt,substantiamdireptamexhauriunt,ita ut humanae carnes ui famis deuorarentur a populis. Edebant filios suos matres, bestiae quoque morientium gladio, fame ac peste cadaueribus adsuetae etiam in uiuorum efferebantur interitum atque ita quattuor plagis per omnem Spaniam saeuientibus diuinae iracundiae per prophetas scripta olim praenuntiatio adinpletur.¹⁴⁵

¹⁴² Paulus Orosius, *Historiarum aduersum paganos libri VII*, in *Pauli Orosii Historiarum aduersum paganos libri VII: Accedit ejusdem Liber Apologeticus*, ed. by Carl Zangemeister, *Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum*, 5 (Vienna: apud C. Geroldi filium, 1882), 2. 1, pp. 82–83 and 7. 2, pp. 434–35. For the history of the Danieline prophecy in the Western Christian exegetic tradition, including Orosius, Jerome, and Augustine, see David Rohrbacher, *The Historians of Late Antiquity* (London: Routledge, 2002), pp. 145–46.

¹⁴³ Isidore, *Quaestiones Veteri Testamentum*, in *Sancti Isidori, Hispalensi episcopi, opera omnia*, ed. by Faustino Arévalo, *PL*, LXXXIII (Turnhout: Brepols, 1807), 207–434 (praefatio, 259.1, p. 207).

¹⁴⁴ Isidore, *Historiae Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, long version, 1, p. 172.

¹⁴⁵ Isidore, *Historiae Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, long version, 72, p. 290.

(In the era 446, the Vandals, Alans, and Suevi, who occupied Spain, caused violent death and devastation by their cruel raids; they burned and plundered cities taking away means of subsistence, causing people to eat human flesh because of hunger. Mothers ate their children, and animals who were used to eating those who died of sword, hunger, or plague, attacked the ones still living; and thus with Spain having become victim of the four plagues, the prediction of the divine wrath previously written by the prophets was fulfilled.)

However, nowhere in the Hispanic tradition but in the *Chronicle of 741* and the *Chronicle of 754* does this apocalyptic framework generate entire historical compositions. Isidore's use of it is an isolated episode and appears to have been borrowed from the *Chronicle* of Hydatius, perhaps owing to the fact that the invasion of the Vandals was the only large-scale calamity during the period of Visigothic arrival and expansion on the Iberian Peninsula from the fifth to the seventh centuries.¹⁴⁶ A few years after the composition of the Mozarabic chronicles, Beatus de Liébana composed a massive commentary on John's *Apocalypse* (c. 776), in which he reckons the end of the world would come in the year 800. Like Mozarabic chroniclers, the commentary draws on the Book of Daniel, but bears no relationship whatsoever to the political reality on the Iberian Peninsula. Beatus's is a purely scholarly exercise, which has gained the epithet 'self-sustaining', or existentially independent of any external stimulus such as the Arab conquest of Spain.¹⁴⁷ Rather than interpreting current events, Beatus composes a commentary on patristic literature and Isidore's works such as *De fide catholica contra judaeos*, *De ortu et obitu partum*, and *De officiis ecclesiasticis*. It is obvious that Beatus was not informed by Mediterranean accounts, and he likely did not know of the Mozarabic chronicles, which, as Collins points out, were to have no known successor or continuator.¹⁴⁸ It appears then that the Mozarabic chroniclers maintained closer cultural ties with the broader Mediterranean than they did with some of the remote areas of the Iberian Peninsula.

Such discrepancy may be seen first as a consequence of Spain becoming an atomized and isolated society, lacking clearly defined centres of power and a predominant ideology after the loss of Visigothic statehood in 711. But the comprehensive and careful adaptation of Byzantine historiographical tradition to Iberian events by Mozarabic chroniclers is unique in the Western

¹⁴⁶ Hydatius, *Chronicle*, xvi, p. 82.

¹⁴⁷ John Williams, 'Purpose and Imagery in the Apocalypse Commentary of Beatus of Liébana', in *The Apocalypse in the Middle Ages*, ed. by Richard K. Emmerson and Bernard McGinn (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press), pp. 217–33 (p. 233).

¹⁴⁸ Collins, *The Arab Conquest*, pp. 59–60.

Mediterranean, and suggests that post-Visigothic Spain continued to be firmly integrated into the Mediterranean world. The Sassanid invasion of the Mediterranean in the early seventh century, which triggered a migration of clerics to North Africa, and possibly also to the Iberian Peninsula, may have provided a starting point for the narrative transmission of the apocalyptic allegory to Spain.¹⁴⁹ Further contact with Byzantine texts may have occurred from the middle of the seventh century until 711, as Spain became the destination of choice for those Byzantines who fled from the eastern Mediterranean in the wake of Persian and Arab conquests.

Secondly, the narrative genesis of these chronicles in the Old Testament allegory suggests that we should not rely excessively on these first historical testimonies of Spain's encounter with Islam as highly reliable accounts, but instead appreciate them as extremely accomplished, if imitative, narrative pieces. In these testimonies, much like in Byzantine chronicles relating Arab conquests in Byzantine provinces, writing about Spain is conceived in terms of Old Testament apocalyptic discourse. This narrative framework provided the Mozarabic chroniclers with a context in which to situate events of a magnitude that may have otherwise been difficult to conceive. That these authors were able to inscribe Spain in the broader Mediterranean narrative of the Byzantine encounter with Islam, and that they did it so skilfully, suggests that the Mozarabs were a highly cosmopolitan and informed community. Not only did they look to the Christian East for an interpretation of current events, but they also possessed sophisticated narrative tools to transmit an intense foreboding of the end of the world, part of an eschatological frame of reference that had dominated the Mediterranean cultural space during the preceding decades. The notorious obscurity of the chroniclers' language is likely another consequence of these narratives, as the chroniclers pretend to share the darkness of the prophecies that inspired them.

Finally, the fact that the Mozarabs interpret the Muslim invasion in apocalyptic, rather than strictly political, terms makes it impossible to conceptualize an idea of the reconquering or rebuilding of Visigothic Spain as a political structure. The chroniclers were simply not preoccupied with the political or doctrinal response to Islam, since they believed they were witnessing the impending end of the world. *Spania*, which remained their primary concern, is first and foremost an eschatological entity, the dwelling place of the people of Gog, whose geographical boundaries and temporal dimension are conceptualized in biblical terms. In this textual tradition, geographical and political borders succumb to a giant sweep of divine providence.

¹⁴⁹ Vallejo Girvés, 'El exilio bizantino', pp. 146–48.

BETWEEN THE EMIRATE AND THE
HOLY LAND: EULOGIUS OF CÓRDOBA,
THE CULTURE OF MARTYRDOM, AND THE
IDEOLOGY OF IBERIAN COHESION

By the mid-ninth century, much had changed in the political landscape of al-Andalus. The early decades of Islamic presence on the Iberian Peninsula were characterized by ethnic divisions between Arab and Berber settlers, Arab tribal factionalism, and conflicts among the initial and subsequent waves of conquerors, of which we read in the *Chronicle of 754*. As had previously occurred in the Near East and North Africa, Muslim conquerors, who had nomadic roots and lacked experience in urban administration and agricultural development, initially relied on local elites for control of recently conquered provinces, instead of dismantling the existing administrative networks.¹ Whereas the first Muslim settlers of the Iberian Peninsula had preferred to live in military garrisons on the outskirts of cities ruled by loyal governors, including those of formerly Visigothic stock, the establishment of the emirate of Córdoba by the Umayyad prince ‘Abd-al-Rahmān in 756 marked the beginning of the solidification of Islamic administration on Iberian soil.² By the early ninth century, Muslims had settled in urban centres, where they succeeded in

¹ Mark N. Swanson, *The Coptic Papacy in Islamic Egypt, 641–1517* (Cairo, New York: The American University in Cairo Press, 2010), p. 5.

² See Roger Collins, *Caliphs and Kings: Spain, 796–1031* (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012), p. 6.

establishing jurisdiction over the *dhimmīs*, Christian and Jewish minorities that were considered protected communities while not being regarded as being legally, socially, or economically equal to Muslims.³

In this environment, some Christians found it to be increasingly politically advantageous to escape their unequal social condition by converting to Islam; others did so in an effort to find relief from the fiscal pressure of unequal taxation; and still others may have had eschatological reasons to convert, having discerned in the triumphant rise of Islam an expression of God's favourable disposition to Muslims and perhaps abandonment of Christians. The mid-ninth century thus saw a rapid increase in the rate of conversions. Although the Umayyad emirs of al-Andalus were no longer demolishing Christian sanctuaries, as their predecessors had done during the first decades of Muslim presence in Spain, and Christians were allowed to practise their religion and build new places of worship, one minority group in the Mozarabic community, known as the martyrs of Córdoba, developed a corpus of texts in support of Christian resistance to ongoing and accelerating Islamization (850–59).⁴

This movement, which involved some fifty Christians, most of whom sought to inflict upon themselves death by execution by openly challenging the Islamic doctrine, is the principal theme of three works by Eulogius of Córdoba: the *Memoriale sanctorum*, the *Documentum martyriale*, and the *Apologeticus martyrum*. The first two texts were authored in 851, during the reign of the Cordovan emir 'Abd-al-Raḥmān II (822–52), and correspond to the early years of the movement. The *Memoriale sanctorum* consists of three parts, the first representing an apologetic treatise in defence of martyrdom and against Islam, and the last two dedicated primarily to the martyrs' deeds ('gestae'), of which Eulogius

³ See Kenneth Baxter Wolf, *Christian Martyrs in Muslim Spain* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), pp. 9–10; Edward P. Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba (850–59): A Study of the Sources* (Washington, DC: University of America Press, 1962), p. 48; Manuel Nieto Cumplido, 'Estatuto legal de los mozárabes cordobeses', in *Actas del I Congreso Nacional de Cultura Mozárabe. Córdoba, 27 al 30 de Abril de 1995*, org. by Schola Gregoriana Cordubensis (Córdoba: Publicaciones Obra Social y Cultural Cajasur, 1996), pp. 27–36.

⁴ The now classic critical sources on the movement of the martyrs of Córdoba include Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*; Dominique Millet-Gérard, *Chrétiens mozarabes et culture islamique dans l'Espagne des VIII^e–IX^e siècles* (Paris: Études Agustinienues, 1984); Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*; Jessica Coope, *The Martyrs of Córdoba: Community and Family Conflict in an Age of Mass Conversions* (Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1995); Cyrille Aillet, *Les Mozarabes. Islamisation, arabisation et christianisme en péninsule Ibérique (IX^e–XII^e siècle)* (Madrid: Bibliothèque de la Casa de Velázquez, 2010).

claims to be an eyewitness.⁵ The second work, the *Documentum martyriale*, was composed by Eulogius during the imprisonment he suffered for his efforts to encourage two Christian virgins, Flora and María, to become martyrs. The third work, the *Apologeticus martyrum*, which is known to contain the first polemical life of the Prophet Muḥammad written in Europe, was composed in 856, in the aftermath of the execution of martyrs Rudericus and Salomon. This treatise corresponds to the second wave of the martyrdom movement that began with the reign of Emir Muḥammad I (852–86), a successor to Emir ‘Abd-al-Raḥmān II who adopted repressive policies against the Christian minority in an attempt to extinguish the first wave of voluntary self-sacrifices. Taxes on Christians were increased, recently built basilicas and churches were demolished, and Christians were banned from holding positions in the Muslim administration.⁶

Although Eulogius complains in the *Memoriale sanctorum* that the cult of martyrdom was already on the wane, his efforts to incite new Christians to sacrifice resulted in the surge of a new cohort of martyrs, some of whom, already being converts to Islam, apostatized.⁷ The martyrdom of Eulogius, which followed in 859, extinguished ideological support for the movement. Sporadic martyrdoms continued in Córdoba throughout the tenth century, but extant notes on them are scarce.⁸ Eulogius’s works, as well as the *Vita Eulogii* and the *Indiculus luminosus* (854), two apologetic treatises composed by Eulogius’s friend, the layman Paul Alvar, are the principal narrative sources that shed light on life and thought in the mid-ninth-century Christian communities of al-Andalus.⁹

Composed a little over a hundred years after the Mozarabic chronicles, Alvar’s *Indiculus luminosus* contains evidence that the apocalyptic world view was still shared by Cordovan Christians. Alvar’s commentary on Daniel 7. 23–27 associates the empires of the prophecy with the three peoples that suffer the Islamic onslaught: the Greeks (Byzantines), the Franks (as one of the successors of the Roman Empire), and the Visigoths. Writing in 854, he anticipates the end of the fourth, Arab, empire, as imminent, and he reckons it would occur in 859.¹⁰ But

⁵ Eulogius, *Memoriale sanctorum*, II. 1, p. 401.

⁶ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, III. I–V, pp. 439–43.

⁷ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, III. II. VI, pp. 443–45. One of these new martyrs was Rudericus, in Eulogius, *Apologeticus*, 21, p. 488.

⁸ See Ann Christys, *Christians in al-Andalus: 711–1000* (Richmond, Surrey: Curzon, 2002), Chapter 2, p. 80.

⁹ On the manuscript transmission of the works of Eulogius and Alvar, see Juan Gil, *CSM*, I, 143–44; II, 24; and Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, pp. 1–5.

¹⁰ Alvar, *Indiculus luminosus*, pp. 293–95. On this passage, see John V. Tolan, *Saracens*:

in a stark contrast to the eighth-century authors of the *Chronicle of 741* and the *Chronicle of 754*, whose authors did not address Islam as a system of religious beliefs, Eulogius and Alvar energetically refute its basic tenets.¹¹ These authors reveal an extremely negative stance not only toward Muslims and Christian converts to Islam, but also toward those Christians who had been assimilating into the Arab and Muslim culture by speaking Arabic, adopting Muslim dress, marrying Muslim women, or serving in the Islamic administration.

The uncompromising nature of the martyrs' movement, and the incendiary character of Eulogius and Alvar's anti-Islamic polemic allowed modern-day nationalist scholars of Spain to claim that the Cordovan martyrs heroically preserved Visigothic culture and values, which would be later transferred intact to Asturias and León by northbound Mozarab migrants.¹² Today, however, such polemic against Islam is perceived as part of a common trend that affected Christian communities throughout the Mediterranean from around the middle of the eighth century onward: as Umayyad caliphs positioned themselves as imperial and cultural successors of Roman and Persian emperors, Christians in Muslim-occupied lands were now finding themselves in a position of having to preserve their languages, culture, and religion or face acculturation and conversion.¹³ After some Christians in Syria, Palestine, Iraq, and Egypt chose the path of active resistance by openly challenging Islam as a religion or disputing its basic precepts, these efforts found expression in polemical and apologetic literature, as well as martyrdom accounts.¹⁴

But even if the Cordovan martyrdom movement was part of a common tendency in the broader Mediterranean, why did it begin at that particular point

Islam in the Medieval European Imagination (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002), pp. 89–92; Juan Gil, 'Aproximación a la literatura latina de los mozárabes', in *Actas del I Congreso Nacional de Cultura Mozárabe*, org. by Schola Gregoriana Cordubensis, pp. 89–104, p. 98.

¹¹ See Tolan, *Saracens*, pp. 83–97.

¹² Francisco Javier Simonet, *Historia de los mozárabes de España deducida de los mejores y más auténticos testimonios de los escritores cristianos y árabes* (Amsterdam: Oriental Press, 1967; repr. of Madrid: Tip. de la Vda. e hijos de M. Tello, 1903), p. vii. See Cyrille Aillet, 'Al-Andalus, la construction d'une mémoire (VIII^e–XV^e siècle)', in *Regards sur al-Andalus (VIII^e–XV^e siècle)*, ed. by François Géral, Collection de la Casa de Velázquez, 94 (Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, 2006), pp. 1–10. See also *Conquerors and Chronicles of Early Medieval Spain*, ed., trans., and commentary by Kenneth Baxter Wolf, Translated Texts for Historians, 9, 2nd rev. edn (Liverpool: University of Liverpool Press, 1999; 1st edn, 1990), pp. 36–50.

¹³ Griffith, *The Church in the Shadow of the Mosque: Christians and Muslims in the World of Islam* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2008), p. 23; Tolan, *Saracens*, p. 38.

¹⁴ See Tolan, *Saracens*, pp. 50–67; Griffith, *The Church*, pp. 45–105.

in time (851) and what started it? Did it arise independently of precedents elsewhere in the Mediterranean or was it imported, and how? What kind of unity and institutional continuity did Eulogius search for by praising martyrdom and blaming those fellow Christians who did not support his views? Why weren't his views shared by the Cordovan Christian community at large and were his sacrifice, and his writings, of consequence? It is tempting to think that, in much the same way as the eighth-century Mozarabic chronicles are rooted in the Visigothic chronicle tradition while also partaking in an apocalyptic narrative culture that sought to explain the surge of Arab power in the broader Mediterranean, Eulogius's writings are anchored in both the local Iberian and the broader Mediterranean traditions of Christian martyrdom. This aspect of Eulogius and Alvar's writings has long been overlooked due to a certain lack of synergy between, on the one hand, Arabists and Byzantinists, who until recently rarely explored the Latin culture of Western Christendom, and, on the other, those Hispanists who focused on these authors' rootedness in Iberian monastic culture.¹⁵ As a consequence, the Cordovan martyrdom movement is often said to have been spontaneous and somewhat enigmatic with regard to both its ultimate objectives and a specific set of conditions or triggers that provoked the first self-sacrifices.

Reading Eulogius in the context of the narratives of martyrdom that developed in the seventh century as a response to the rapid Arabization of Syria, Palestine, and Egypt helps shed a new light on the origins and timing of the movement. On the other hand, being mindful of the fact that the local Andalusí cult of paleo-Christian martyrs was also Mediterranean in scope helps us better understand why such influences could have found a fertile soil in al-Andalus. We may also glean additional insights into the tepid reception of Eulogius's polemic by the Cordovan Christian community at large, if we consider how Eulogius attempts to graft the Mediterranean discourse on neo-martyrdom onto the cult of local, Iberian tradition of paleo-Christian *passiones* preserved in Córdoba. Finally, regarding the Cordovan martyrdom movement as stemming from a place where both of these traditions converge is especially important for our understanding of the logical tensions that pervade Eulogius's defence of martyrdom against the views of those Christian *dhimmīs* who sought to preserve the delicate social balance in Muslim-dominated Córdoba or had resigned themselves to Arabization. These considerations inform the discussion of the context in which Eulogius's writings emerged, how they were received,

¹⁵ Griffith's *The Church* (pp. 151–55) and Tolan's *Saracens* (pp. 55–57) are felicitous exceptions.

and why, despite having been motivated by the desire to preserve unity and institutional continuity, they ultimately contributed to dividing, rather than uniting, the Andalusí Christian community.

Seeking Unity in Times of Flux

Much of what we know today about the origins, inspiration, and goals of the Cordovan martyrs points to a singularly challenging atmosphere of social fragmentation and instability in which the movement arose. It is therefore imperative to qualify John Tolan's assertion that Eulogius and Alvar's incendiary polemic was 'to erect an impenetrable wall of violence and hatred between Muslim ruler and Christian subject', or 'to divide the community between the "us" and the "them"' — those in the Andalusí Christian community who were compelled or willing to Islamicize vs those who resisted Islamization.¹⁶ Instead, we might see Eulogius's writings as a desperate attempt to re-establish social cohesion in the face of ongoing and accelerated social, religious, and linguistic disintegration of the Andalusí Christian society.

If earlier studies held that the movement represented a unified impulse on the part of the subjugated Christian community, one aspect of the movement that has recently come to the fore, particularly in light of Jessica Coope's systematic investigation of the members' religious and social backgrounds, is the group's heterogeneous character, which may be indicative of a variety of motivations one might have had in pursuing self-sacrifice. According to Eulogius, the martyrs of Córdoba were a group of thirty-six men and nineteen women of different ages and diverse circumstances. Most of the martyrs were young, although Benilda, Witesindus, and Argimirus are referred to as being of advanced age ('femina aetate iam provecta', 'vir aetate iam plenus'), while Elias was an elderly man ('presbyter jam senes').¹⁷ Some, like Emila, Jeremia, and Aurea, were descendants of old Roman families;¹⁸ others, such as Natalia (Sabigotho), were from mixed marriages between Christians of Roman descent and Arabs;¹⁹ still others, including Isaac, Christopher, and Félix, came from Arab and Berber families and were lapsed Muslims, which constituted a punishable offence under

¹⁶ Tolan, *Saracens*, p. 88.

¹⁷ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, III. IX, p. 446; III. XIV–XVI, p. 455.

¹⁸ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. XI, p. 431 and III. XVII, pp. 456–57.

¹⁹ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. VII, p. 406.

Islamic law.²⁰ The first participants in the movement were monks and priests, but most of the would-be martyrs were laypeople. Although the martyrdom movement originated in Córdoba, its fame reached nearby and more distant confines of the former Roman province of Baetica, attracting Christians from Écija, Cabra, Carmona, and Guadix. Additionally, two child martyrs, sisters Nunilo and Alodia, lived in the Aragonese town of Huesca located in the Upper March of the emirate of Córdoba; Eulogius records their story as he heard it from Bishop Venerius of Complutum (modern-day Alcalá).²¹

Each martyrdom began as a response to different stimuli: Rudericus and Salomon apostatized from Islam;²² Columba, Nunilo, and Alodia chose the path of asceticism when faced with the prospect of having to commit themselves to marriage;²³ Aurelio and Sabigotho were already married when they opted for voluntary martyrdom;²⁴ Pomposa was a member of an entire family that chose asceticism and sought refuge in a monastery.²⁵ Although occasionally these Christians would be betrayed by families that had assimilated to Islam, as was the case with Aurea and Rudericus, the majority of them voluntarily chose to appear before Muslim authorities in order to eloquently challenge Islam and the cult of Muḥammad.²⁶ Several of the martyrs, however, did not deliberately seek execution, but were sentenced for apostasy from Islam in accordance with Islamic law after they turned down the opportunity to reconvert. Such a diverse group would have had varied motivations for seeking death by execution, and it is only in recent decades that critics began to separate Eulogius's purpose as an author from that of the martyrs themselves. Today, he is no longer considered to have been the instigator and chief leader of the movement, but rather its archivist.²⁷

²⁰ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. II, p. 402; II. VIII, p. 408.

²¹ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. VII, p. 406.

²² Eulogius, *Apologeticus*, 21–25, pp. 488–90.

²³ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, III. X, pp. 447–49; II. VII, pp. 406–07.

²⁴ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. X. 3, pp. 416–17.

²⁵ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, III. XI, pp. 430–31.

²⁶ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, III. XVII, pp. 456–59; *Apologeticus*, 21, p. 488.

²⁷ Wolf, in *Christian Martyrs*, argues that beyond personal involvement with a handful of martyrs, Eulogius likely had limited contact with them (pp. 70–71). Wolf insists that Eulogius did not originally seek martyrdom, given that his oeuvre is permeated by self-doubt with regard to his own worth as a potential martyr (pp. 44–46, 62, 74).

Further considerations arise from regarding the Cordovan martyrs as a minority, within a minority Christian community, that resisted conversion and assimilation. Eulogius clearly sets his followers apart by using terms such as *christicolae* or *catholici* with reference to the martyrs, by contrast with Christian others (for example, *aemuli*, 'the grudging'; *paruipenduli*, 'the indifferent', *aduersarii*, 'the enemies'), whom he condemns for collaborating with Islamic authorities.²⁸ As Cyrille Aillet has compellingly argued, the Andalusi Christian population was in itself a dispersed, multifaceted, and unstable group.²⁹ This condition was a result of several factors, chief among them the disintegration of Toledo as a political and ecclesiastic centre of the Visigothic kingdom in the early eighth century. As a consequence, the Mozarabic community was left without a single spiritual and doctrinal centre and in a state of flux. A secondary factor was the political emergence of the kingdom of Asturias in the late eighth–early ninth centuries. Because Asturian efforts to claim political and ecclesiastical leadership of the Iberian Peninsula entered into conflict with Mozarab attempts to represent their bishops as legitimate successors of the Visigothic Church, not only was Andalusi Christianity challenged to survive under Islam but it also found itself under pressure from Christian political entities emerging in the Iberian north.

One of the examples of this unsettling dynamic was the rejection in Asturias-León of Adoptionism, a belief that identified Jesus's human nature as a condition that made him an 'adoptive' son of God.³⁰ Having originated in Córdoba in the last quarter of the eighth century as a response to the teachings of the little-known theologian Migetius, Adoptionism spread quickly throughout the Iberian Peninsula and beyond, having found its chief promoter in Elipandus, bishop of Toledo (b. c. 716), who is believed to have been a Cordovan native.³¹ Adoptionism earned energetic condemnations in Asturias by Beatus de Liébana and Eterius, bishop of Osma, in Francia by Charlemagne and Alcuin, and in

²⁸ For example, in *Memoriale*, I, pp. 369–89; see also Luis A. García Moreno, 'Etnia goda e iglesia hispana', *HS*, 54 (2002), 415–42.

²⁹ Aillet, *Les mozarabes*, p. 45.

³⁰ The most complete treatment of Adoptionism is found in John C. Cavadini, *The Last Christology of the West: Adoptionism in Spain and Gaul, 785–820* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1993). See also Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, Chapter 3, pp. 64–85; Coope, *The Martyrs*, pp. 46–47; Cyrille Aillet, 'La formación del mozarabismo y la remodelación de la Península Ibérica (s. VIII–IX)', in *De Mahoma a Carlomagno. Los primeros tiempos (siglos VII–IX)*. *Actas de la XXXIX Semana de Estudios Medievales de Estella. 17 al 20 de julio de 2012*, ed. by Philippe Sénac (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2013), pp. 285–310 (p. 287).

³¹ For a corpus of his works, see *CSM*, pp. 68–111.

Rome by Pope Hadrian I. The possibility has been entertained that this doctrine was introduced to Córdoba by Nestorian Christians, who might have arrived in Baetica from Syria alongside the Umayyad Muslims, and that it represented an attempt to harmonize Christianity with Islam by accentuating the human nature of Christ, thereby likening him to the Prophet Muḥammad.³² Recent views, however, tend to derive Adoptionism solely from the Western, Augustinian theological tradition as articulated by Isidore and the Councils of Toledo, and attribute its association with Nestorianism as stemming from Alcuinian interpretation.³³ Whatever its debated origins may have been, the propagation of Adoptionism contributed to further dividing the Andalusī Christian community, with Alvar and his teacher Abbot Speraindeo having been among the new doctrine's vocal opponents.

With its bishops acting as official representatives of the Christian community before the Islamic authorities, the embattled Church now represented for Andalusī Christians the principal form of institutional continuity with the Visigothic period.³⁴ Eulogius expresses the awareness of this new reality when he draws a contrast between the fall of the political empire and the survival of the Church: 'Sceptrum Hispaniae post excidium et euulsionem regni Gothorum translatum est [...] sed gratia Redemptoris sui, et eius assiduo comitatu Ecclesia custodiri meretur' ('the sceptre of Spain was transferred after the fall and destruction of the kingdom of the Visigoths [...], but owing to its Redeemer and his staunch support, the Church gained protection').³⁵

Over a century after the collapse of the Visigothic state, and in the absence of a Visigothic political structure, but perhaps also because of his disapproval of the mediating role Andalusī bishops now played between the Christian *dhimmīs* and their Muslim overlords that put him at odds with Cordovan bishop Reccafred, Eulogius identifies the universal Church as the only institution with which he and his followers felt affinity.³⁶ Bishop Reccafred, as

³² See discussion in Juan Pedro Monferrer Sala, '¿Circularon los textos cristianos orientales en al-Andalus?', in *¿Existe una identidad mozárabe?*, ed. by Cyrille Aillet, Mayte Pinelas, and Philippe Roisse (Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, 2008), pp. 167–210 (p. 170).

³³ Cavadini, pp. 7 and 38–44.

³⁴ Aillet, 'La formación del mozarabismo', p. 297.

³⁵ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I. 30, p. 392.

³⁶ For Luis A. García Moreno, this represents a dialectic rupture with the Isidorian model of the *translatio imperii* from the Romans to the Visigoths, as reflected in Isidore's *History*. The archbishop of Seville had promoted an ethnic, Hispano-Gothic, rather than ecumenical, character of the Visigothic Church, which resulted in the straining of its relationship with

follows from Alvar's invective against this character in the *Vita Eulogii*, owed his appointment to the metropolitan see to the emir of Córdoba. Reccafred refused to support the martyrdom movement, intimidated his opponents, and imprisoned Eulogius in 852.³⁷ Eulogius, however, was much respected among Andalusí Christians, and, according to Alvar, was elected unanimously to the metropolitan see of Toledo after the demise of Bishop Wistremirus in 858. His appointment was never approved due to the emir's opposition.³⁸ As Alvar remarks with regard to the lack of consensus among Andalusí prelates during his lifetime, 'omnes namque sancti episcopi, non tamen omnes episcopi sancti' ('all are Holy Bishops, but not all bishops possess saintly virtues').³⁹

It is perhaps because of the significant lack of unity among church leadership in al-Andalus that Eulogius dedicates his *Memoriale sanctorum* to universal Christianity. We see this at the beginning of the treatise, where Eulogius compares himself to a figure of apostolical dimensions: 'Loquar etiam tibi, o uniuersalis ecclesiae sanctae conuentus, ut uerbum ueritatis, quod ore nostro edicitur, placidis mentium ulnis amplexens nullatenus praedicationis nostrae arcendam uelis doctrinam, quae apostolica affirmante auctoritate libera ad instructionem omnium redditur' ('I shall also speak to you, o the community of the universal Holy Church, so that you embrace with the placid arms of your spirit the word of truth that I declare, and so that you would not wish, by any means, to encircle the doctrine of my preaching, which, since it affirms apostolic authority, is delivered freely, for the instruction of all').⁴⁰ Later on, he reiterates his hope that the monastic community will assist in the universal dissemination of his work: 'Fratres carissimi et sorores beatae [...] nec inuida affectione uobismet solummodo uindicetis sanctorum patrocinia martyrum, quos nostis pro totius ecclesiae membris subisse discrimina passionum'.⁴¹ ('Dearest brothers and blessed sisters [...], do not vindicate for yourselves alone the patronage of the holy martyrs; know that they submitted themselves to passion

Rome in the seventh century. In the absence of a political structure, and under the pressure of Arabization, the martyrs' movement reverses this trend by underscoring the affinity between the Mozarabic and Roman Churches. García Moreno, 'Etnia goda', pp. 423, 436–41. On the figure of Reccafred, see Colbert, *The Martyrs*, pp. 174–80.

³⁷ Alvar, *Vita Eulogii*, 6, pp. 333–34.

³⁸ Alvar, *Vita Eulogii*, 10, p. 336.

³⁹ Alvar, *Vita Eulogii*, 10, p. 336.

⁴⁰ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I. 4, pp. 371–72.

⁴¹ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I. 37, p. 395.

for the members of the entire Church'). Reinforcing Eulogius's position, Alvar in the *Indiculus luminosus* attempts to universalize the martyrs' experience by comparing these people to the Apostles ('nos uero euangelici serbi, Christi discipuli').⁴² He states that by publicly professing their faith, the martyrs follow the apostolic model of Christian preaching realized in open forums, with Muslim subjects being likened to pagan peoples of the Bible, termed *ethnici* or *gentiles*. In order to illustrate his point, Alvar quotes Isidore's treatise *On the Nature of Things* (*De rerum naturae*):

Beatus et lumen noster Ysidorus in Rerum Nature libro euidenti eloquio et abta figura stelle cuiusdam Orionis nuntjat: 'Horiones autem', inquit, 'significant martires, nam sicut iste nascuntur in celo tempore yemis, ita in ecclesia martires procedunt tempore persecutjonis. Procedentibus Horionibus mare turbatur et terra, obortis uero martiribus terrenorum et infidelium corda tempestate iactantur.'⁴³

(Our Saint and [divine] light Isidore, with his manifest eloquence and applying the image of a star says this about Orion in his book *Of the Nature of Things*: just as the constellation of Orion arises in the sky in winter times disturbing land and sea, so in the Church martyrs surge in times of persecution. When Orion appears [in the sky], it disturbs the sea and the land, making martyrs appear on earth and shaking the hearts of the infidels.)

Lastly, like their religious brethren elsewhere in the Arab-dominated world, Cordovan Christians could no longer identify themselves as sharing a common tongue. The linguistic shift from Latin to Arabic was famously bewailed by Alvar, whose lament over Islamization and the resulting linguistic hybridization of young Andalusí Christians concludes the *Indiculus luminosus*: 'Heu pro dolor, legem suam nesciunt Christiani et linguam propriam non aduer-

⁴² Paul Alvar, *Indiculus luminosus*, 20, p. 292; see also 10, p. 282.

⁴³ Alvar, *Indiculus*, 15, p. 288. Henriët puts forward an intriguing hypothesis that the resurrection of the ancient rhetorical model of the *passio* reflects the deepening of the temporal dimension of Iberian Christianity, a compensatory strategy aimed at offsetting the reduction of its geographical scope on the peninsula under Islamic domination (Patrick Henriët, 'L'espace et le temps hispaniques vus et construits par les clercs (IX^e–XIII^e siècles)', *Annexes des CLCHM*, 15 (2003), 81–127; also in Patrick Henriët, 'Sainteté martyriale et communauté de salut. Une lecture du dossier des martyrs de Cordoue (milieu IX^e siècle)', in *Guerriers et moines: conversion et sainteté aristocratiques dans l'Occident médiéval, IX^e–XII^e siècle*, ed. by Michel Lauwers, Collection d'Etudes Médiévales, 4 (Antibes: Editions APDCA, 2002), pp. 93–139 (p. 121). We have seen, however, that the profound temporal dimension of Iberian Christianity is complemented in the martyrs' rhetoric by an expansive spatial outreach, one that transcends Iberian geographical limits, as Eulogius and Alvar appeal to universal Christianity.

tunt Latini' ('Oh how painful it is [to see] that Christians ignore their religion and speakers of Latin forget their language!').⁴⁴ From a Spain-centric view, the martyrs' fierce defence of the use of Latin by Córdoba's educated Christian elite represented one of the pillars of emerging national consciousness in the Mozarabic community. Contrary to this view, it has recently been suggested that Latin in mid-ninth-century Córdoba was primarily a language of the liturgy, and although it continued to serve as a model for cultural reference in the Mozarabic community, Arabic was progressively displacing it in all facets of everyday life.⁴⁵ Evidence has now come to the fore that since the ninth century, ecclesiastical authorities in al-Andalus translated sacred texts, such as the Gospels and Psalms, into Arabic for use in churches in an attempt to ensure the continuation of the Christian identity of the Arabized population.⁴⁶ Although Alvar's protest against Arabization is unusually vocal, and the Cordovan Latin corpus of martyrdom literature is particularly copious among the Mediterranean *dhimmi* societies, the Arabization and Islamization of the Mozarabic community, which was taking place in Eulogius and Alvar's lifetime, mirrored linguistic and cultural assimilation that had been underway in the eastern and southern Mediterranean since the late seventh century. Following the orders of the Umayyad caliph 'Abd-al-Malik (685–705), Arabic had begun replacing Greek and Syriac/Aramaic as the language of civil administration and church scholarship in late seventh century. In Islamic Egypt, Arabic began encroaching on Greek and Coptic in 705, after Arabic had been declared the official language of state record keeping.⁴⁷

⁴⁴ Alvar, *Indiculus luminosus*, pp. 314–15.

⁴⁵ See Georgio Levi Della Vida, 'I Mozarabi tra Occidente e Islam', in Georgio Levi Della Vida, *Note di storia letteraria arabo-ispánica*, ed. by Maria Nallino (Rome: Instituto Per L'Oriente, 1971), pp. 55–77 (p. 62).

⁴⁶ Philippe Roisse, 'Célébraient-on les offices liturgiques en arabe dans l'Occident musulman? Étude, édition et traduction d'un *Capitulaire Evangeliorum* arabe (Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek Cod. Aumer 238)', in *¿Existe una identidad mozárabe?*, pp. 211–54. Latin manuscripts continued to be glossed in Arabic throughout the Iberian Peninsula until the twelfth century (Cyrille Aillet, 'Recherches sur le christianisme arabisé (IX^e–XII^e siècles). Les manuscrits hispaniques annotés en arabe', in *¿Existe una identidad mozárabe?*, pp. 91–134).

⁴⁷ See Sidney H. Griffith, 'Anthony David of Baghdad, Scribe and Monk of Mar Sabas: Arabic in the Monasteries of Palestine', *Church History*, 58 (1989), 7–19 (repr. in Sidney H. Griffith, *Arabic Christianity in the Monasteries of Ninth-Century Palestine* (Aldershot: Variorum, 1992), article XI); Swanson, *The Coptic Papacy*, p. 16. See also Tonio Sebastian Richter, 'Greek, Coptic and the "Language of the Hijra": The Rise and Decline of the Coptic Language in Late Antique and Medieval Egypt', and Arietta Papaconstantinou, "What Remains Behind":

Mediterranean Connections

The growing interest on the part of scholars of the Middle East in Arabic as a language not only of Islam, but also of Christianity, has encouraged the study of similarities between Christian-Muslim relations in ninth-century Córdoba and those elsewhere in the Islamic Mediterranean. Eulogius and Alvar's texts are increasingly being viewed as a western Mediterranean manifestation of a wave of martyrdoms that radiated from former Byzantine provinces in the aftermath of the Islamic conquests of Syria (634–35), Palestine (635–37), Iraq (638), and Egypt (642). Sidney H. Griffith, for example, considers Eulogius's martyrology among half a dozen similar hagiographical texts written in Greek, Georgian, Armenian, and Arabic, as well as texts originating from Syrian/Palestinian Melkite communities. The protagonists of these narratives were apostates from Islam who, in some cases, berated the new religion and sought to convert other Muslims to Christianity.⁴⁸ They came from *dhimmi* communities that were simultaneously cut off from the Byzantine Church as a source of ecclesiastical authority, and underwent rapid Islamization shortly after the onset of 'Abbāsid rule (750–1258).

The dynamic in these Mediterranean communities strongly resembles the patterns of social change occurring in Córdoba during the first half of the ninth century. Like their Mediterranean co-religionists, Cordovan Christians underwent rapid Islamization and Arabization in the absence of a single, uniformly recognized ecclesiastical centre.⁴⁹ With reference to the eighth-century mar-

Hellenism and Romanitas in Christian Egypt after the Arab Conquest', in *From Hellenism to Islam: Cultural and Linguistic Change in the Roman Near East*, ed. by Hannah M. Cotton and others (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), pp. 401–46 and 447–66; Milka Rubin, 'Arabization versus Islamization in the Palestinian Melkite Community during the Early Muslim Period', in *Sharing the Sacred: Religious Contacts and Conflicts in the Holy Land*, ed. by Ariele Kofsky and Guy G. Stroumsa (Jerusalem: Yad Izhak Ben Zvi, 1998), pp. 149–62; Sidney H. Griffith, 'Greek into Arabic: Life and Letters in the Monasteries of Palestine in the Ninth Century: The Example of the *Summa Theologiae Arabica*', *Byzantion*, 56 (1986), 117–38 (repr. in Griffith, *Arabic Christianity*, article VIII).

⁴⁸ Griffith, *The Church*, pp. 148–49.

⁴⁹ Griffith, *The Church*, pp. 147–59; Sidney H. Griffith, 'Christians, Muslims, and Neo-Martyrs: Saints' Lives and Holy Land History', in *Sharing the Sacred*, pp. 163–207; see also Sidney H. Griffith, 'The Arabic Account of 'Abd al-Masih an-Nağrānī al-Ghassānī', *Le Muséon*, 98 (1985), 331–74 (repr. in Griffith, *Arabic Christianity*, article X); Coope, *The Martyrs*, p. 39. Coope argues that the Cordovan movement 'represented a protest against and an effort to slow the process of assimilation to Arab Islamic culture that was occurring in Córdoba as a result of the Umayyad court's new vitality' (*The Martyrs*, p. 14).

tyrdom accounts of Syrian and Palestinian origin, Mark Swanson notes that despite differences in their degrees of historicity,

the stories [...] do form a rather well defined set, with features that are repeated from story to story. The settings repeat themselves: Mt Sinai, Mar Sabas, Jerusalem, al-Ramla, Baalbek, Damascus, al-Raqqa. Again and again the martyrs appear before the highest officials in the caliphate. The offences that call for capital punishment are quickly listed: invective against Islam; conversion from Islam; making converts from Islam. And as we read the stories we notice stereotypical elements in the final confrontation between the Christian confessor and the Muslim official: the Muslim official's reluctance to pass capital sentence, the martyr's obstinacy, [...] the offer of (re-)conversion to Islam, the martyr's final confession and/or provocation.⁵⁰

To Swanson, these similarities are indicative of three things: the hagiographers' shared intent of edifying fellow clerics and congregations on differences between Christianity and Islam; assuring converts to Islam of a possibility of repentance and reconversion; and instilling what the authors believed to be the correct understanding of martyrdom as a calling from God.⁵¹ For Griffith, these narratives, composed during the period of rapid Islamization and Arabization, represent 'an important part of the effort on the part of the churchmen of the time to strengthen the faith of Christians tempted to convert to Islam.'⁵² These views are generally consistent with Hispanists' perspectives on Eulogius's writings, in particular with Wolf's assertion that Eulogius's treatises were exhortative in nature and were directed to a relatively small group of Latinate Christians residing in monasteries that supplied the movement with martyrs.⁵³ They are also congruent with Coope's assessment of the Cordovan martyrdom movement as an effort to resist assimilation and conversion to Islam, and to strengthen Christian identity toward the end of the first half of the ninth century, a period that saw the rapid rise of Islam in al-Andalus and Arabization of Cordovan society.⁵⁴

⁵⁰ Mark N. Swanson, 'The Martyrdom of 'Abd al-Masīh, Superior of Mount Sinai (Qays al-Ghassānī)', in *Syrian Christians under Islam: The First Thousand Years*, ed. by David Thomas (Leiden: Brill, 2001), pp. 107–29 (p. 119). On seventh- and eighth-century Coptic martyrs, see Robert G. Hoyland, *Seeing Islam as Others Saw it: A Survey and Evaluation of Christian, Jewish, and Zoroastrian Writings on Early Islam* (Princeton, NJ: Darwin, 1997), pp. 367–69.

⁵¹ Swanson, 'The Martyrdom', pp. 120–29.

⁵² Griffith, *The Church*, p. 149.

⁵³ Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, pp. 72–73.

⁵⁴ Coope, *The Martyrs*, p. xiii.

It is only natural that the awareness of such correspondences has begun to raise an interest in extrapeninsular influences on the martyrdom movement in Córdoba and on the narrative apparatus of Alvar and Eulogius. In what may constitute an example of *rapprochement* with Eastern Christian martyrdom scholarship, those studying Cordovan martyrs have become increasingly, albeit somewhat tentatively, interested in the role of the monk Georgius of Bethlehem, one of the martyrs in Eulogius's account, in the linking of Syro-Palestinian, North African, and Cordovan martyrdom communities.⁵⁵

Although we will not find textual evidence explicitly naming Georgius as responsible for initiating the movement, Eulogius states that he personally knew and conversed with Georgius, and describes him as a model of a martyr.⁵⁶ According to Eulogius, Georgius had spent twenty-seven years of his life in the monastery of Mar Sabas in the Judean desert with some fifty of his brethren before he was sent by Abbot David on a mission to collect donations from monasteries in northern Africa.⁵⁷ Despite earlier speculation, based on Eulogius's testimony, that Georgius was fluent in Latin, manuscript evidence does not fully support this view; it is certain, however, that he was fluent in Greek and Arabic, languages spoken at Mar Sabas.⁵⁸ Upon leaving Mar Sabas, he arrived in al-Andalus by way of Egypt, where he witnessed first-hand a Christian com-

⁵⁵ Wolf considers the role of Georgius in *Christian Martyrs*, pp. 27–29, 70; Coope names Georgius ‘the most exotic of the martyrs’ (*The Martyrs*, p. 28). Studies that support the notion that Georgius could have been the principal vehicle of transmission of martyrdom culture from the Middle East to Córdoba are Luis A. García Moreno, ‘Monjes y profecías cristianas próximo-orientales en al-Andalus del s. IX’, *HS*, 51 (1999), 91–100, and ‘Literatura antimusulmana de tradición bizantina entre los mozárabes’, *HS*, 57 (2005), 7–45; Feliciano Delgado, ‘Alvaro de Córdoba’, in *Actas del I Congreso Nacional de Cultura Mozárabe*, pp. 73–88 (pp. 85–86). For a similar but more guarded stance, see also Janna Wasilewski, ‘The “Life of Muhammad” in Eulogius of Córdoba: Some Evidence for the Transmission of Greek Polemic to the Latin West’, *EME*, 16 (2008), 333–53. Wasilewski reiterates Delgado's suggestion that the polemic biography of Muhammad, which Eulogius claimed to have found in the Iberian north-east, bears significant textual resemblances to a life of the Muslim prophet from the treatise *De haeresibus* by John of Damascus, a monk at Mar Sabas in the first half of the eighth century. However, she remarks that no direct evidence of textual transmission can be postulated beyond the possibility that Georgius could have been a vehicle of the oral transmission of the text to Eulogius in Greek (p. 333).

⁵⁶ A description of Georgius is found in Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II, 10. 22–24, pp. 424–26.

⁵⁷ The ongoing connection of the Coptic Church with Syria resulted in the presence of Syrian monks in Egypt by the early ninth century. See Swanson, *The Coptic Papacy*, p. 41.

⁵⁸ ‘Et cum uariis linguis peritus existeret, Graeca scilicet Latina atque Arabica, nec qualemcumque saltem propter has gloriam affectauit.’ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II, 10. 23, p. 426. Benjamin Z. Kedar, ‘Latin in Ninth-Century Mar Sabas?’, *Byzantion*, 65 (1995), 252–54.

munity in the throes of instability, religious persecution, and oppression by Muslim governors.

Coptic Egypt had suffered several waves of mass conversions since the mid-eighth century. The first peak occurred in 744–45, during the brief governorship of Hafs ibn al-Walīd. The second peak occurred in the mid-ninth century, when the ‘Abbāsīd caliph al-Mutawwakil (847–61) passed edicts in 850 and 853 with measures similar to those adopted by Muḥammad I in Córdoba, including the destruction of churches, the dismissal of non-Muslim civil servants, and the reinforcement of the second-class status of the *dhimmīs*. Although the ‘Abbāsīds, who replaced the Umayyads in the mid-eighth century, were more keen than their predecessors on encouraging mass conversion to Islam, measures such as those undertaken by al-Mutawwakil were similar to those that had been carried out since the fourth quarter of the seventh century by governor ‘Abd al-Azīz (d. 705) and the Umayyad caliph Umar II (r. 717–20) in that they relied in no small part on increasing the tax burden on the *dhimmīs*. Egypt’s patriarchs, who had played the role of mediators between the two religious communities and served as a point of transfer of Christian wealth to Muslim authorities since the Islamic conquest of Egypt, increasingly found themselves torn apart by conflicting obligations to the two groups.⁵⁹ This process, widely seen as a coming of the end times, had been accompanied by a surge in anti-Muslim polemic, martyrdom accounts, and apocalyptic literature.⁶⁰

Having encountered an unstable social landscape in Egypt, Georgius prudently secured permission from his superiors to continue his journey northwards to Spain (‘Sed cum ibidem uapulare asperius Dei ecclesiam incursatione tyrannorum repperisset, Hispaniam quoque eorum quibus missus fuerat consultu aggreditur’).⁶¹ He eventually settled in the monastery of Tabanos on the outskirts of Córdoba, where he found his true calling. Prior to being martyred in the city in 852, he asked Eulogius that an account of his martyrdom be edited, disseminated among his followers, and sent to his homeland (‘Commentatus est fratribus ac propinquis suis cunctisque patriae suae ciuibus

⁵⁹ Swanson, *The Papacy*, pp. 20, 33–38; Harald Suermann, ‘Copts and the Islam of the Seventh Century’, in *The Encounter of Eastern Christianity with Early Islam*, ed. by Emmanouela Grypeou, Mark Swanson, and David Thomas (Leiden: Brill, 2006), pp. 95–109 (pp. 100, 106–09).

⁶⁰ Swanson, *The Papacy*, p. 16; Suermann, ‘Copts and the Islam’, p. 104. For Coptic apocalypses, consult Hoyland, *Seeing Islam*, pp. 278–91; for Coptic martyrdom accounts, view pp. 367–69.

⁶¹ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. 10. 23, p. 425.

martyrii sui breuiarium, quod mihi causa expoliendi transmisit, ne incultior sermo fidem rei gestae quibus mittebatur adimeret').⁶² Eulogius transcribes the first-person account of Georgius's journey to martyrdom, but whether he follows a written original or codifies an oral account cannot be established.⁶³

Eulogius's transcription is also ambiguous with regard to the role of Georgius in the martyrdom movement. On the one hand, Georgius implies that he may have joined an already established martyrdom community, since Sister Sabigotho welcomes him at Tabanos by declaring that he shall be a 'comrade and colleague in our struggle' ("Promissus", inquit, "nostri certaminis comes et collega hic monachus erit").⁶⁴ On the other hand, it follows from Georgius's words, as recorded by Eulogius, that he actively designed opportunities to challenge the Islamic faith that would merit the crown of martyrdom: 'Omnes in communi coepimus cogitare quomodo ad desideratam perueniremus coronam. Et ita Deo dispensante uisum est nobis, ut pergerent sorores nostrae reuelatis uultibus ad ecclesiam, si forte nos alligandi daretur occasio; et ita factum est.'⁶⁵ ('We all began to ponder together how we would earn the desired crown [of martyrdom]. And so, with the help of God, it seemed good to us that our sisters would proceed to the church with their faces uncovered, in case an occasion presented itself to accuse us [of abandoning Islam]; and so it happened'). As a result of the group's foray into the city, five martyrs, including Sabigotho and Georgius himself, were executed by Cordovan authorities. Thus, while Eulogius's records of the Bethlehem monk do not clearly indicate that he was an instigator, his testimony does not rule out such a role, either.

The latter possibility appears particularly feasible given that Mar Sabas, the monastery where Georgius hailed from, had been known as a foremost centre of anti-Islamic polemic and martyrdom activity.⁶⁶ John of Damascus became a monk there around the year 725 and composed the *Fount of Knowledge* and the *Disputation between a Saracen and a Christian*, two of the first polemical treatises defending Christian values against what he considered to be the 'heresy' of Islam.⁶⁷ Among the few surviving accounts of eastern Mediterranean

⁶² Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. 10. 24, p. 426. Eulogius claims to have transcribed Georgius's words in 25–27, pp. 426–27.

⁶³ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. 10. 25–29, pp. 424–26.

⁶⁴ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. 10. 25, p. 427.

⁶⁵ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. 10. 27, p. 427.

⁶⁶ Their various aspects are examined in Griffith, *Arabic Christianity*.

⁶⁷ See Tolan, *Saracens*, pp. 50–55.

martyrs, two originate from Mar Sabas, with the martyrs' fate strongly resembling that of several Cordovan Christians who came from families torn apart by Islamization.⁶⁸ The account of Michael, a native of Tiberias who was a monk at Mar Sabas during the rule of 'Abd al-Malik, is preserved in Greek and Georgian versions, but believed to have been originally composed in Arabic. The text is preceded by a prologue by its narrator, who has been identified as Basil of Emesa, the late eighth-century igumenus of the monastery.⁶⁹ For refusing to embrace Islam and proclaiming the deceitful nature of the Prophet Muḥammad, Michael underwent ordeals by standing on hot coal and drinking poison. Upon surviving both, he was beheaded by orders of 'Abd al-Malik and buried at Mar Sabas; his body allegedly possessed healing powers.

The second martyr from among the monks of Mar Sabas, Daḥḥāk, was the son of Christian parents. His father converted to Islam and his mother remained a crypto-Christian. After Daḥḥāk came to Mar Sabas, he received baptism and took the name of Bacchus. On one of his forays into Jerusalem, he was recognized and captured as an apostate from Islam. When brought to the emir's court, he reaffirmed his Christian faith and was executed. Daḥḥāk's trial took place in late eighth century; his story survives in two Greek manuscripts and several Georgian documents, the earliest of them dating back to the tenth century.⁷⁰

To what extent then could the martyrdom movement in Córdoba have begun as a local adaptation of these martyrdom traditions? We do not know what triggered the first martyrdoms, and speculations on the subject have been far from convincing. It is generally agreed that although the movement included lay Christians, its leadership was made up of literate clerics and laymen, and was centred mostly at monasteries and basilicas surrounding Córdoba.⁷¹ Some, including Adriano Duque, have placed the central focus on the act of martyrdom itself as devoid of an external stimulus. Under this interpretation, which seeks the roots of the movement in the Augustinian concept of martyrdom, Islam is viewed as an environment that ensures the social exclusion and public execution of the martyr but is otherwise not related to the martyr's motiva-

⁶⁸ Swanson, 'The Martyrdom of 'Abd al-Masīḥ', pp. 107–29 and 116–17. Summarized accounts of these martyrdoms can be found in Hoyland, *Seeing Islam*, pp. 336–86.

⁶⁹ For authorship and dating, consult Hoyland, *Seeing Islam*, pp. 379–81. For the manuscript transmission and comparison of the Greek and Georgian versions, see Griffith, 'Christians, Muslims, and Neo-Martyrs', in *Sharing the Sacred*, pp. 170–83.

⁷⁰ On Bacchus, see Griffith, 'Christians, Muslims, and Neo-Martyrs', in *Sharing the Sacred*, pp. 196–98; Griffith dates the execution of Bacchus to 787/88.

⁷¹ Coope, *The Martyrs*, p. xiii.

tions.⁷² Similarly, Wolf regards martyrdom as an extension of the Mozarabic penitential system, pointing toward the primarily internal, existential motives of the martyrs themselves. He asserts that the desire to suffer martyrdom developed in the course of Cordovan monastic education, and was an outcome of an existential tension that resulted from the realization by its participants that leading temporal lives was no longer possible.⁷³ In the *Memoriale sanctorum*, however, Eulogius indisputably registers the interreligious character of the conflict when he contrasts the Christian aspiration to abandon the weight of temporal existence with the Muslim perception of eternal life as a metaphor of physical delights.⁷⁴ In Wolf's words,

It is not enough to show that the spontaneous martyrdoms were a response to obsessive concerns about personal salvation and the need to reject the Islamic world. If this were all that there was to it then why do we not see any unprovoked martyrdoms before 851, when presumably the spiritual concerns of Cordovan Christians were much the same?⁷⁵

Wolf then suggests that Isaac, the first of the voluntary martyrs reported by Eulogius, spontaneously conceived of a plan, and that he was the first to ideologically link the subjected situation of Cordovan Christians to persecutions in third-century Rome.⁷⁶ Again, what prompted Isaac to make that link is not clear, and Wolf finally suggests, not altogether convincingly, that it was Isaac's loss of his high-level administrative position as *exceptor republicae* (tax collector) in the Islamic government of Córdoba that prompted him to re-evaluate his religious identity. Had that not taken place, Wolf reckons, there would have been no martyrdom movement in Córdoba.⁷⁷ Coope names several additional social factors that may have facilitated the breeding ground for martyrdoms, including the system of familial monasteries in Córdoba with close ties shared by their members, and the new reality of the age of mass conversions, which had created mixed Christian-Muslim families with resulting religious tensions

⁷² Adriano Duque, 'Claiming Martyrdom in the Episode of the Martyrs of Córdoba', *Collectanea Christiana Orientalia*, 8 (2011), 23–48.

⁷³ For example, 'vitam hanc, quoddam discrimem immane, refugiunt', Eulogius, *Apologeticus*, 25, p. 490.

⁷⁴ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I, 7, pp. 395–96.

⁷⁵ Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, p. 117.

⁷⁶ On the martyrdom of Isaac, see *Memoriale Sanctorum*, Prologue, pp. 366–69, and II. 2, p. 402.

⁷⁷ Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 23, pp. 118–19.

among family members. However, she, too, hesitates to name a single event or influence that prompted the outbreak of martyrdoms. Even though she points out similarities between the Cordovan polemic against Islam and the writings of John of Damascus (d. 749) and entertains the possibility that the tradition of martyrdom was linked to analogous developments in Syria and Palestine, she nevertheless names the *Hispanic Passionary*, a local martyrology, as ‘the primary tradition with which Eulogius and Alvar were working’.⁷⁸

The hypothesis of the Mediterranean origin of the movement of Cordovan martyrs need not, however, be viewed as incompatible with the local tradition: in fact, an important typological trait that Andalusi martyrdom accounts share with their Syro-Palestinian and Egyptian analogues is their compositional reliance on much earlier local narrative traditions of martyrdom. This narrative feature characterizes, for example, the principal Christian source on the history of Islamic Egypt, the Arabic compilation known as the *History of the Patriarchs*. During the period of intense pressure from Islam in the seventh and eighth centuries, the Coptic Church emerged as a distinct entity not subject to Chalcedon, and the language of martyrdom in the first two-thirds of the eighth century is said to have found its models in the anti-Chalcedonian polemic of George the Archdeacon, an earlier compiler of the *History* who covered the period from the Islamic invasion of Egypt in 641 to 700. John the Deacon, an eighth-century continuator of George who witnessed tax revolts and mass conversions to Islam during the transition of power from the Umayyads to the ‘Abbāsids, depicts Coptic patriarchs Alexander II (r. 704–29) and Michael I (r. 743–67) as ‘living martyrs’, whose resignation to suffering and persistence in faith served as models for both the Church and the community as a whole.⁷⁹ Likewise, the earliest of the Syro-Palestinian martyrdom accounts — that of a Christian apostate from Islam called Cyrus of Ḥarrān — is dated to the last third of the eighth century; it is steeped in narrative traditions of anti-Christian persecutions in the Roman Empire, and sets the narrative mould for the subsequent Melkite accounts from Syria and Palestine. Griffith explains this by the fact that for the first time since they were persecuted by the Romans, Christians were facing a massive rejection of the principal tenets of their religion.⁸⁰

From this perspective, the martyrdoms in Córdoba appear not to be spontaneously conceived, but rather supported by two mutually reinforcing traditions: one that spanned several decades and geographical areas where *dhimmī*

⁷⁸ Coope, *The Martyrs*, pp. 39–40, 48.

⁷⁹ Swanson, *The Papacy*, pp. 2–24.

⁸⁰ Griffith, *The Church*, p. 147.

Christians lived in enclaves surrounded by Islamic societies; and the deeply rooted local Iberian cult of early Christian martyrs. I will now consider the latter in greater detail and assess its implications for Eulogius and Alvar's vision of Iberian unity and institutional continuity. I will also discuss how the fusion of the two martyrdom traditions produced a singularly intense logical tension in Eulogius's polemical defence of martyrdom.

Eulogius's Iberian Foundations

Hagiography, typically defined as a corpus of exemplary biographies of martyrs, confessors, and saints dedicated to the creation, promotion, and perpetuation of Christianity, is known to comprise two principal modalities: the *passio* and the *vita*.⁸¹ The former was predominantly used during the first centuries of Christianity to glorify and disseminate the deeds of martyrs. Modelled on the life and passion of Christ, a *passio* was typically centred on a character of noble extraction who sought to challenge with martyrdom and premature death the social and confessional limits of a pagan society. Such a narrative typically contained one or more episodes of persecution, torment, and physical suffering. By contrast, *vitae*, which were modelled on apostolic deeds and discourses, glorified long lives replete with temptations, miracles related to the exorcism of diabolic forces (for example, visions, apparitions, or the curing of the sick) and praiseworthy deeds (such as the destruction of pagan sanctuaries or the foundation of monastic fraternities or places of worship). As Christianity acquired political prestige, the virtues of saints and martyrs became increasingly attributed to church officials and clergy. The growing influence of the Church in the political realm, in turn, resulted in the attribution of saintly virtues to royal figures, eventually leading to the secularization of sainthood and the incorporation of hagiography into political history.⁸²

Until the early eighth century, the development of hagiography on the Iberian Peninsula followed universal vectors, with the genres of *passiones* and *vitae* developing during the Roman and Visigothic periods, respectively. The *Peristephanon*, a collection of fourteen hymns composed by Aurelius Prudentius (AD 348–

⁸¹ Baudouin de Gaiffier, 'Hagiographie et Historiographie. Quelques aspects du problème', in *La storiografia altomedievale. 10–16 aprile 1969*, Settimane, 17 (Spoleto, 1970), pp. 139–66 (p. 140).

⁸² De Gaiffier, 'Hagiographie et Historiographie', p. 141; Patrick Henriët, 'Hagiographie et historiographie en Péninsule ibérique (XI–XIII^e siècles). Quelques remarques', *CLHM*, 23 (2000), 53–86 (p. 54).

c. 413), a native of Saragossa, to commemorate the persecution of Hispano-Roman Christians during the reign of Emperors Diocletian (r. AD 284–305) and Maximian (r. AD 286–305), is the best-known example of *passiones* on the Iberian Peninsula.⁸³ There is no specific evidence that the *Peristephanon* circulated in the Visigothic and post-Visigothic Iberian Peninsula, however evidence exists that works of Prudentius were owned by Isidore of Seville and Eugenius II of Toledo (r. 647–57).⁸⁴ That Prudentius was known to Andalusí Christians is attested by an inventory of books (Real Biblioteca de El Escorial, MS R.II.18), often known as the Oviedo inventory after the cathedral library where it was housed, but strongly believed to be of Andalusí provenance.⁸⁵ Dated to 882, this document lists two unspecified works by Prudentius.⁸⁶ Additionally, there may have existed a Cordovan precursor to the eleventh-century MS *add 30845* of the British Library (London), which contains complete offices and Masses for the days of Cordovan saints including St Zoilus, and others who had been born in the Roman province of Baetica and were objects of local Cordovan, rather than broader Iberian, cult.⁸⁷

The *Peristephanon* likely contributed to forming the basis of the *Hispanic Passionary*, a corpus of martyrdom narratives whose compilation began in the fourth century and expanded over the next several hundred years to include the cults of local saints. Although the few extant passionaries, the *Passionary of Cardena*, the *Passionary of Valdeavellano*, and the *Passionary of Silos* are dated to the eleventh century, their composition sheds light on their origins: approximately a quarter of the almost two hundred saints they commemorate are of Hispanic extraction, predominantly from the Roman and Visigothic period, while the remaining portion of the saints are of Near Eastern, Roman,

⁸³ Michael Roberts, *Poetry and the Cult of the Martyrs: The 'Liber Peristephanon' of Prudentius* (Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press, 1993).

⁸⁴ Manuel Díaz y Díaz, 'La transmisión de los textos antiguos en la península Ibérica en los siglos VII–XI', in *La cultura antigua nell'Occidente latino dal VII all'XI secolo: 18–29 aprile 1974*, Settimane, 22 (Spoleto, 1975), pp. 131–74.

⁸⁵ Some lean toward the Toledan origin of this book inventory, given that it mentions Elipandus but omits Eulogius and Alvar. Andrew Breeze, 'The Transmission of Aldhelm's Writings in Early Medieval Spain', in *Anglo-Saxon England*, 21, ed. by Michael Lapidge, Malcolm Godden, and Simon Keynes (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), pp. 5–23 (p. 10).

⁸⁶ See Delgado, 'Alvaro de Córdoba,' p. 80.

⁸⁷ Manuel C. Díaz y Díaz, 'Textos litúrgicos mozárabes', in *Actas del I Congreso Nacional de Cultura Mozárabe. Córdoba, 27 al 30 de Abril de 1995*, org. by Schola Gregoriana Cordubensis (Córdoba: Publicaciones Obra Social y Cultural Cajasur, 1996), pp. 105–15 (p. 109).

or European descent.⁸⁸ The specific use of martyrs' acts and saints' lives in Mozarabic liturgy is unknown and has been the subject of some speculation as to whether liturgical texts contained simple evocations of *passiones* and *vitae* or more elaborate summaries of the martyrs' deeds. It is generally assumed that congregations would be likely familiar with the narratives of the *passions*, and it has even been suggested that these literary compositions could have been destined for slow reading, which also made them suitable for the education of the clergy.⁸⁹

Curiously, something resembling a passionary is included into the so-called *Liber ordinum*, also known as the *Calendar of Córdoba* — a compendium of practical information on agriculture and nutrition presented to Caliph al-Ḥakam II (r. 961–76). Composed in Arabic and Latin in 961, this text is attributed to Bishop Reccemundus of Elvira. Because it provides the names of the martyrs and, occasionally, the places of celebration of their cult, it is the most detailed source on the martyrdom cult in the Cordovan region. Thus we know that approximately one hundred years after Eulogius composed his works, Cordovan Christians venerated local martyrs St Zoilus, St Acisclus, and the so-called Three Saints (Faustus, Ianuarius, and Marcial); Iberian saints, including St Felix of Barcelona, St Leocadia of Toledo, St Eulalia of Mérida and her namesake of Barcelona; as well as several North African and Roman martyrs.⁹⁰

⁸⁸ On the composition of the *Hispanic Passionary*, see Javier Pérez-Embida Wamba, *Hagiología y sociedad en la España medieval. Castilla y León (siglos XI–XIII)* (Huelva: Universidad de Huelva, 2002), pp. 15–31: 'En el momento de la supresión del rito litúrgico visigótico o mozárabe, a fines del siglo XI, el pasionario hispánico que contienen los códices de Cardena y Silos está integrado por 115 unidades, correspondiendo 26 a festividades de mártires hispanos, 13 de romanos, 8 procedentes de otras iglesias italianas, 11 de Galia, 47 de mártires orientales y 1 de la región europea' (p. 20). See also Christys, *Christians in al-Andalus*, p. 84; Pilar Riesco Chueca, 'Pasionario Hispánico. Introducción, edición crítica y traducción' (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Seville, 1987).

⁸⁹ See Manuel Díaz y Díaz, 'Literary Aspects of the Spanish Liturgy', in *Visigothic Spain: New Approaches*, ed. by Edward James (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1980), pp. 61–76. Angel Fábrega Grau, based on sixth- to ninth-century testimonies of Gallican liturgy, in which acts of martyrs and passions were read during apostolic Mass, Easter, and martyrial anniversaries, proposed that the *Hispanic Passionary* should be considered as a liturgical collection. See his *Pasionario hispánico*, Monumenta Hispaniae Sacra, Serie litúrgica, 6, 2 vols (Madrid: Instituto Enrique Flórez, 1953 and 1955), II: *Estudio* (1955), pp. 274–77 (esp. p. 282).

⁹⁰ See Reinhart Pieter Anne Dozy, *Le Calendrier de Cordoue publié par R. Dozy. Nouvelle édition accompagnée d'une traduction française annotée par Ch. Pellat*, ed. by Charles Pellat, Medieval Iberian Peninsula Texts and Studies, 1 (Leiden: Brill, 1961), pp. 29, 43, 111, 139, 151, 163, 167, and 179.

Although the *Peristephanon*, the *Hispanic Passionary*, and the *Calendar of Córdoba* either pre-date or post-date the mid-ninth-century martyrdom movement, collectively these sources indicate that the local cult of paleo-Christian martyrs was already Mediterranean in its scope. Eulogius reveals his knowledge of the *passiones* in the first part of the *Memoriale Sanctorum*, when he argues against those Christians who did not support martyrdom on the grounds that Christians in Córdoba were free to practise their religion. To that, Eulogius replies that true martyrs *seek* persecution. In order to support his claim, Eulogius treats at some length St Felix of Gerona, a martyr mentioned by Prudentius.⁹¹ Felix, according to Eulogius, lived in relative safety in the city of Cesarea, in Mauretania. Upon hearing that Christians in Gerona, in the Iberian province of Tarraconensis, were persecuted by the Roman authorities, Felix abandoned his studies of literature and the liberal arts and fled to Spain in order to be martyred there 'because in his homeland he lacked martyrdom' ('martyrium, quod patriae suae deerat [...] triumphabiliter comsummauit'). In this portion of his treatise Eulogius also alludes to the martyrdom of St Julian of Antioch, and he also mentions Emeterius and Celedonius of Calahorra and St Cyprian of Carthage (both found in *Peristephanon*), Virgin Eulalia of Barcelona, St Sebastian, St Thyrsus, and Bishop Babylas of Antioch.⁹² Eulogius's list is composed of local Iberian, Roman, and North African martyrs, which parallels the composition of the *Hispanic Passionary*.

By contrast to this early period of Christian persecution in Roman Spain, accompanied by the development of the *passiones*, the institutionalization of Christianity under the Visigoths and especially the establishment of Catholicism in the Visigothic kingdom in the first half of the seventh century was accompanied by the production of *vitae* dedicated to lives of bishops, monks, priests, and secular rulers. These included two treatises titled *Of Learned Men* (*De viris illustribus*), one of which was composed by Isidore of Seville and the other by Ildefonso, bishop of Toledo (d. 667), in the tradition of Jerome.⁹³ Alvar's *Vita Eulogii* continues Visigothic tradition by emphasizing

⁹¹ Prudentius, *Peristephanon*, in *Prudentius*, trans. by Henry J. Thomson, Loeb Classical Library, 398, 2 vols (London: Heinemann, 1979), II, 98–345, Hymn IV, p. 158. Hereinafter, translations follow this edition.

⁹² Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I, 24, pp. 387–89. Emeterius and Celedonius, Prudentius, *Peristephanon*, Hymn IV, p. 158, also in the *Calendar of Córdoba*, p. 53; St Cyprian, *Peristephanon*, Hymn XI, pp. 328–37 and also in the *Calendar of Córdoba*, p. 139; St Sebastian, *Calendar of Córdoba*, p. 33; St Thyrsus, p. 35; St Eulalia of Barcelona, p. 43; St Babylus, p. 35.

⁹³ Ildefonso, bishop of Toledo, *El 'De viris illustribus' de Ildefonso de Toledo: Estudio y edi-*

ing the singularly high degree of Eulogius's learning and erudition, and his zeal in seeking and promoting knowledge. Seen through Alvar's eyes, Eulogius was an assiduous seeker of manuscripts by doctrinal, philosophical, and classical authors, and he knew both Latin metric poetry and history: 'Ubi libri errant metrici, ubi prosatici, ubi storici qui eius inuestigationem effugerent? Ubi uersi quorum ignoraret canora, ubi hymni uel peregrina opuscula que eius non percurreret pulcherrimus oculus?'⁹⁴ He was a tireless visitor of monasteries around Córdoba where he imparted knowledge to fellow Christians; his quest for knowledge takes him to Navarre, where he visits several monasteries, bringing back to Córdoba works unknown in al-Andalus, including Augustine's *City of God*, Virgil's *Aeneid*, poetry by Juvenal and Horace, and an unspecified collection of sacred hymns ('ymnorum catholicorum fulgida carmina').⁹⁵

While there is no direct evidence that the *Peristephanon* was available to the Cordovan monastic community, it is difficult to imagine that the saints commemorated therein would not form part of the common cultural memory of its most learned men. The Cordovan saints commemorated in the *Peristephanon* are St Zoilus, St Acisclus, and the Three Saints. Although there is no information on them beyond the brief mention of their names that connects them to Córdoba ('Corduba Acisclum dabit et Zoellum tresque coronas'),⁹⁶ the martyrs' movement was closely linked to their local cult. According to Alvar, Eulogius was educated at the Basilica of St Zoilus and later became a deacon and presbyter there. Following Eulogius's death, his relics were buried at St Zoilus.⁹⁷ Eulogius reports that several other martyrs were associated with St Zoilus, including Eulogius's relative Paul, who was also educated at that basilica and became a deacon there.⁹⁸ His body was buried at St Zoilus, and so were the remains of martyrs Christopher and Leovigildus.⁹⁹ Additionally, a monastery named after that saint, which was located on the outskirts of Córdoba, contributed martyrs

ción crítica, ed. by Carmen Codoñer Merino, Acta Salmanticensia, Serie Filosofía y Letras, 65 (Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 1972). See also Jacques Fontaine, 'El "De viris illustribus" de San Ildefonso de Toledo: tradición y originalidad', *Anales Toledanos*, 3 (1971), 59–76.

⁹⁴ Alvar, *Vita Eulogii*, 8, p. 335.

⁹⁵ Alvar, *Vita Eulogii*, 9, p. 335.

⁹⁶ Prudentius, *Peristephanon*, Hymn IV, p. 156. See also Díaz y Díaz, 'Textos litúrgicos mozárabes', p. 109.

⁹⁷ Alvar, *Vita Eulogii*, 2, p. 331; 15, p. 341; Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, pp. 157, 175, 187, 191.

⁹⁸ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. 6, p. 405.

⁹⁹ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. xi, pp. 430–31; Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, pp. 227, 242.

Sabinianus and Wistremundus.¹⁰⁰ Sisenandus, Perfectus, and Fandila were educated in the Cordovan Basilica of St Acisclus, which Colbert believes to have been the cathedral church of that city.¹⁰¹ Virgins Flora and María, to whom the *Memoriale sanctorum* is dedicated, met at that basilica and it was there that they revealed to each other their desire for self-immolation. After their execution, the heads of these martyrs were recovered and preserved at St Acisclus.¹⁰² Thus the memory of primitive Iberian martyrs was perpetuated at Cordovan basilicas, which functioned as centres of Christian learning. The vitality of this tradition a century later is attested in the *Calendar of Córdoba*, which lists the celebration of the passion of St Zoilus in June and the translation of his relics in November, the month when St Acisclus was also commemorated in that city.¹⁰³

We will now consider whether the *passiones* recorded in the *Peristephanon* could have likely formed a typological model for martyrdom narratives. Hymn III, one of the more elaborate hymns in the collection and the only one dedicated to a southern Iberian martyr, St Eulalia of Augusta Emerita, the modern-day Mérida, features a particularly elaborate narrative structure whose similarities with some of Eulogius's accounts of female martyrs can hardly be brushed aside as purely coincidental. Although it has been previously proposed that Eulogius and Alvar had a close knowledge of Prudentius's text, given the very scant evidence of its circulation, Prudentius's work is treated here as a plausible archetype, rather than a direct literary precursor, of martyrs' passions in Eulogius's work.¹⁰⁴

Eulalia was twelve years old when she decided to reject marriage and devote her life to God. Having noticed her vocal rejection of the cult of pagan gods, her family chose to keep her in the confinement of a country estate, away from the urban milieu where her defiant behaviour could be easily spotted by the Roman authorities. Strengthened by her resolve, Eulalia flees from home at night, miraculously guided by a pillar of light across the wild countryside. In

¹⁰⁰ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. iv–vi, pp. 403–05; Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, p. 206.

¹⁰¹ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, III. viii, p. 445; Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, pp. 212, 255–57, 404.

¹⁰² Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. viii. 9–14, pp. 412–14; III. x. 12, pp. 451–52; Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, p. 227.

¹⁰³ *Calendar of Córdoba*, pp. 163 and 167. See also Clayton J. Drees, 'Sainthood and Suicide: The Motives of the Martyrs of Córdoba, AD 850–859', *Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies*, 20 (1990), 59–89 (p. 71).

¹⁰⁴ María Jesús Aldana García and Pedro Herrera Roldán, 'Prudencio entre los mozárabes cordobeses: algunos testimonios', *Latomus*, 56 (1997), 765–83.

the morning, she presents herself to the Roman governor, declaring her faith and condemning both paganism and the Roman rulers of *Hispania*: 'Pectore et ore Deum fateor. | Isis, Apollo, Venus nihil est, | Maximianus et ipse nihil: | illa nihil, quia facta manu, | hic manuum quia facta colit, | frivola utraque et utraque nihil.' ('With heart and lips I confess God. Isis, Apollo, Venus — they are naught; Maximianus himself is naught; they because they are works of men's hands, he because he worships the works of men's hands, both worthless, both naught').¹⁰⁵ The governor presents her with a chance to abjure her beliefs and contemplate the prospect of marriage, then describes in detail the torture that would befall her were she not to heed his advice. He also urges her to touch a grain of incense in a symbolic gesture of contrition for her Christian beliefs. After Eulalia's energetic protest, which involves spitting into the governor's face, an elaborate torture begins, with physical suffering only serving to strengthen her religious conviction. As Eulalia's soul departs her body, a dove miraculously flies out of her mouth terrifying her executioners:

emicat inde Columba repens
martyris os nive candidior
visa relinquere et astra sequi;
spiritus hic erat Eulaliae
lacteolus, celer, innocuus.

colla fluunt abeunte anima
et rogos igneus emoritur
pax datur artubus exanimis,
flatus in aethere plaudit ovans
templaque celsa petit volucer

vidit et ipse satelles avem
feminae ab ore meare palam
obstupefactus et adtonitus
prosilit et sua gesta fugit,
lictor et ipse fugit pavidus.

(Thence all at once a dove whiter than snow springs forth; they see it leave the martyr's mouth and make for the stars. It was Eulalia's spirit, milk-white, swift, and sinless. Her head drops as the soul departs, and the burning fire dies down; peace is granted to her lifeless body, while the spirit far up claps her wings in triumph and flies off to heavenly regions. The executioner himself saw the bird pass plainly from

¹⁰⁵ Prudentius, *Peristephanon*, Hymn III, vv. 75–80, pp. 148–49.

the girl's mouth; amazed and confounded, he broke away and fled from what his own hands had done, and the lector, too, fled in terror.¹⁰⁶)

After Eulalia's spirit symbolically departs, a sudden snowfall covers the public square, enshrouding the martyr's body. Eulalia is buried in her native city, which, as Prudentius confirms, continues to worship her cult.

Much less narrative detail is available on the eighteen martyrs of Caesar-augusta (Saragossa) in Hymn IV, but a more or less detailed treatment is afforded St Vincent of Saragossa in Hymn V and Bishop Fructuosus of Tarraco and two of his deacons in Hymn VI. Both of these hymns, however, are more exhortative and place more emphasis on the martyrs' exploits, with particularly detailed descriptions of their torture.¹⁰⁷ Therefore, if the passion of Eulalia were to represent a reasonably complete archetype for its genre, the following narrative components could be identified: 1) the future martyr is said to be different from her peers since childhood; 2) at one point, she reveals her Christian faith; 3) her family members put pressure on her to conform to paganism, limiting her movement; 4) she escapes; 5) the martyr presents herself to the authorities and reaffirms her beliefs; 6) she is given a chance to repent; 7) she restates her convictions; 8) the torture begins and is met with an expression of joy and religious conviction; 9) executioners seek to defile the martyr's body by publicly exposing it or refusing a burial; 10) the body is recovered by Christians and the martyr is worshipped in her native city.

Eulogius was certainly familiar with Eulalia's story: he mentions Eulalia in *Memoriale sanctorum*, the first of his treatises, composed in 851, as an example of those saints who voluntarily subjected themselves to persecution.¹⁰⁸ She was well remembered in Córdoba, since the town of Fragellas on its outskirts preserved her cult in a basilica that became the burial place of Columba and Pomposa, two of the martyrs in Eulogius's first treatise. The *Calendar of Córdoba* confirms that Eulalia was still worshipped in Fragellas in 961.¹⁰⁹ How closely Eulogius could have been familiar with Eulalia's story is witnessed by Alvar in his *Vita Eulogii*, where he narrates the passion of Leocritia, a young woman who had lived under the watchful eye of her Muslim parents. She was secretly

¹⁰⁶ Prudentius, *Peristephanon*, Hymn III, vv. 161–75, pp. 152–53.

¹⁰⁷ Prudentius, *Peristephanon*, Hymn V, vv. 94–332, pp. 174–88; VI, vv. 64–119, pp. 206–10.

¹⁰⁸ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I, pp. 22–24; See Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, p. 220.

¹⁰⁹ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, III. x. 12 and III. x. 13, pp. 452, 454; Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, p. 260; *Calendar of Córdoba*, p. 179.

baptized as a child and first practised Christianity unbeknownst to her parents. After she made a decision to openly profess her faith, she inflicted upon herself punishment and oppression from her family (motifs 2 and 3 above). Through a third party, Leocritia communicated secretly with Eulogius, who abetted her in fleeing from home (motif 4). Having pretended to comply with her parents' expectations to commit to marriage and renounce Christianity, Leocritia fled home in Muslim garb. Eulogius continued to play an active role in concealing Leocritia from her family by helping her change her whereabouts until one day the emir's guards sent by her family discovered Leocritia and brought her to court. The judge presented her with an opportunity to repent but she remained firm and suffered execution by beheading (motifs 6–8).

The story of Leocritia's martyrdom is intertwined with that of Eulogius, who was brought to court and accused of abetting her escape. Eulogius responds that his obligation as a Christian presbyter was to help others practise their faith freely and that he therefore became Leocritia's mentor. After the judge threatened Eulogius with physical punishment, he responded with an invective against Islamic doctrine. He was then brought to the emir's palace, where he again refused to repent and suffered more punishment and, finally, execution. The bodies of Eulogius and Leocritia were thrown into the Guadalquivir (motif 9). Leocritia's body, which miraculously remained afloat, was recovered from the river and was buried in a local church; Eulogius was buried at St Zoilus (motif 10).¹¹⁰ Curiously, Alvar may be echoing a trope from Eulalia's passion when he recounts that, as Eulogius expires, a white dove appears on the public square:

Mox uero ut proiectus est cadauer e loco eminentiori in ductu aluei, columba miro candore niuescens uidentibus omnibus secans aera pennis, super corpus martiris alligerans sedit. Quam omnes missilibus petris hinc inde abigere conantes et nihilominus consistentem repellere non ualentes, per manibus uoluerunt ea cominus effugare. Sed illa in circuitu corporis non uolans, sed saliens, super turrem corpori imminentem propius resedit et ad corpus beatissimi uiri uultum conuertit. Nec silendum est miraculum quod ad laudem sui nominis Christus est super corpus martiris operatus.

(As the corpse was thrown from a high place above the river into the riverbed, a beautiful snow-white dove, cutting the air with her wings in full flight, landed on the body of the martyr. Everybody tried to chase her away by hurling rocks and waved their hands trying to make her flee, but were unable to drive her away. Instead of flying around the body, she took off and perched itself on top of a nearby

¹¹⁰ Alvar, *Vita Eulogii*, 13–20, pp. 337–43.

tall tower looking onto the body of the most saintly man. We shall not silence the miracle that Christ worked, in the glory of his own name, on the body of this martyr.¹¹¹)

Apart from the miracle of the dove in Alvar's *Vita Eulogii*, there is a particularly suggestive correlation between Eulalia's story and the narrative structure of Eulogius's *Memoriale sanctorum*. Colbert has observed that the *Memoriale sanctorum*, chronologically the first of Eulogius's works, narrates the deeds of female martyrs at greater length than it does those of men but does not explain why this is the case.¹¹² The reason for this could plausibly be the relatively more elaborate development of the female archetype of martyrdom as evidenced by the length of treatment afforded in the *Peristephanon* to St Eulalia vs male martyrs. Whereas a great deal is revealed about the female martyr's childhood, in the case of male martyrs, more emphasis is placed on the act of passion itself. Whereas the first part of the *Memoriale* is devoted primarily to doctrinal and polemical matters, martyrs' accounts form the bulk of Parts II and III. The stories of the very first martyrs — Perfectus, monk at Tabanos educated at St Acisclus, and Isaac, formerly an official in Cordovan Islamic administration — are the only detailed accounts, however Eulogius gives no detail about these martyrs' childhood, placing more emphasis instead on the act of martyrdom. This is generally not the case with female martyrs (Nunilo, Alodia, and Sabigotho in Part II, and especially Fandila, Digna, Columba, and Pomposa in Part III).

Sisters Nunilo and Alodia showed an unusual degree of religious devotion from early age. They fled their Muslim step-father to live with their Christian grandmother. When they were brought to court they were given a chance to abjure their beliefs and commit themselves to marriage. After they rejected Islam's earthly pleasures, the sisters were handed over to Muslim women for indoctrination, which was unsuccessful. They were publicly executed and their bodies performed unspecified miracles. Motifs 1, 4, 5, and 6 are salient in their story.¹¹³

The most coherent and uniform set of stories relates to the group comprised of Fandila, Digna, Columba, and Pomposa, who all present themselves voluntarily in front of the Muslim judge to denounce the prophet of Islam and confess their Christian beliefs (motif 5). They are executed swiftly and without torture, and their bodies are either thrown into the Guadalquivir or disposed of

¹¹¹ Alvar, *Vita Eulogii*, 19, pp. 340.

¹¹² Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, p. 255.

¹¹³ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. 7, pp. 406–08.

on the outskirts of Córdoba (motifs 9 and 10).¹¹⁴ The stories of Columba and Pomposa are particularly uniform and most resemble the passion of Eulalia. Eulogius relates that Columba was of tender age when she decided to abandon the opulence of her home and join her sister Isabel and her brother-in-law Ieremias. These Christians maintained a public semblance of a marriage but secretly led monastic lives. Columba's mother opposes her daughter's resolution and forces Columba to commit herself to marriage. Columba, who is said to be unusually virtuous, enters the monastery where she commits to fasting, vigils, and praying. After a series of visions, she leaves the monastery without announcing her departure, and, without knowing the layout of the city, miraculously finds her way to the judges' palace. Once there, she publicly confesses her faith and denounces the Prophet Muḥammad. She is given a chance to repent and is promptly executed, apparently without torture. Her body is recovered from the Guadalquivir and placed into the Basilica of St Eulalia.

The story of Pomposa immediately follows that of Columba. Pomposa was the youngest of her siblings but the most mature of them all. She is said to have possessed an unusual grace and saintly qualities. She was a nun and lived in the familial monastery of St Salvador at Pinnamellaria, near Córdoba, alongside her siblings and parents. Upon hearing of Columba's execution, Pomposa leaves the monastery unbeknownst to her family members. In order to escape their watchful eye, she leaves at night and miraculously finds her way to Córdoba at dawn. She heads directly to the tribunal, where, like Columba, she professes her faith and denounces the prophet of Islam. She is instantly sentenced to beheading and executed, her body likewise being thrown into the river. Finally, like Columba, Pomposa is buried in the Basilica of St Eulalia. We can see that, despite being set in the realities of ninth-century Córdoba, both accounts appear to follow an archetype that closely resembles Prudentius's version of Eulalia's passion. The sequencing of the narrative, the character of information revealed about the martyrs' lives, and the choice of tropes strongly suggest that, as he constructed the martyrs' narratives, Eulogius could have followed a pre-existing literary model.

¹¹⁴ Eulogius, *Memoriale*: Fandila, III. 7, pp. 444–45; Digna, III. VIII, pp. 445–46; Columba, III. x, pp. 447–52; Pomposa, III. XI, pp. 452–54.

Eulogius's Logical Impasse and its Aftermath

Since persecution becomes an irreplaceable condition for Eulogius and Alvar's ability to claim a link with the universal Church, the narrative mould of the *passio*, which required persecution and suffering as one of its constitutive elements, suited Eulogius and Alvar's political theology best. However, because it was hardly corroborated by the social dynamic of Muslim-Christian coexistence in mid-ninth-century Córdoba, the choice of *passio* was charged with grave logical tensions. First, Eulogius documents attempts to validate Christian martyrdoms by provoking persecution of Christians by the Muslims during the final years of the reign of 'Abd-al-Rahmān II (822–52). His efforts were, however, undermined by Islamic legislation, which was, for the most part, neutral and, at times, favourable to Christian communities. As was the case with Middle Eastern Christian communities during the early years of Islam, Christians in Córdoba were not persecuted unless they had apostatized from Islam, or unless they challenged the statutory protection of *dhimmī*tude, which consisted of paying a poll tax (*jizyah*) and accepting the status of second-class citizenry. As Griffith points out with regard to martyrdoms in Syria/Palestine,

this situation in turn introduced a new consideration into the Christian conception of martyrdom, one that put the accent on the personal testimony of the martyr and his disparagement of Islam, rather than on the persecutor's direct challenge of the martyr's Christian faith.¹¹⁵

In order to secure death sentences, members of the Cordovan movement challenged Muslims in public gatherings, assemblies, and mosques.¹¹⁶ Isaac, the first of the voluntary martyrs, who was bilingual and had held a prestigious administrative post in the Islamic government of Córdoba before taking a monastic habit, would strike up what initially appeared to be a casual street conversation with Muslims, only to then interrupt his interlocutors with invectives against the Islamic faith and the Prophet Muḥammad.¹¹⁷ The principal points of his doctrinal contention were the prophetic status of Muḥammad, which was denied by Christians, and the divine nature of Christ, which was

¹¹⁵ Griffith, *The Church*, 148–49; Swanson, *The Coptic Papacy*, p. 38. See also Antoine Fattal, *Le statut legal des non-musulmans en pays d'Islam*, Recherches publiées sous la direction de l'Institut de lettres orientales de Beyrouth, 10 (Beirut: Imprimerie Catholique, 1958).

¹¹⁶ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. I, p. 398; II. XII, pp. 431–32.

¹¹⁷ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, Prologue, I, pp. 367–68.

not recognized by Muslims.¹¹⁸ Although Christians were granted an opportunity to abjure their blasphemous statements in public court, the martyrs would use the occasion to continue challenging the Islamic faith and insist on receiving capital punishment. While the caliphal administration initially chose to avoid confrontation, the court appearance of monks Rogellius and Servus-Dei ('Abd Allah) was perceived as particularly scandalous and resulted in an edict by 'Abd-al-Rahmān II, which mandated the incarceration of all those who had spoken against the Prophet.¹¹⁹ According to Eulogius, in 852, under pressure from the emir, a church council presided by Bishop Reccafred, who held a mediating role between the Muslim authorities and the *dhimmīs*, condemned voluntary martyrdom, officially putting the martyrs at odds with the Cordovan Christian community.¹²⁰

Members of that community who took note of the outdated models of martyrdom confronted Eulogius, refusing to recognize the validity of the sacrifices. As Eulogius continued to write during his incarceration, he was motivated by a twofold purpose: to recruit new martyrs and, perhaps, most importantly, to change the attitude of the Christian community at large, which generally viewed the movement with guarded neutrality. Islam, therefore, became not only an object of doctrinal polemic, but also an environmental factor that reinforced Eulogius's martyrial position in the Mozarabic community. Consistent with this ideological purpose, the *Memoriale sanctorum* and the *Apologeticus martyrum* are composed as organized answers to arguments and objections levelled by unnamed sceptics in the community, with the martyrs' biographies and scriptural quotes being used to validate Eulogius's argumentation.

The two principal arguments against Christian martyrdom to which Eulogius responds stem from the polemic about the status of Islam relative to Christianity, and the debate about the importance of a miracle during a martyr's life or following his/her death. Eulogius's detractors pretended to invalidate martyrdom by insisting that the shared nature of the Islamic and Christian religions rendered such a sacrifice unnecessary. They objected that the principal justification for the early martyrdoms was the Christian imperative to destroy the cult of idols, and the consequent cruelty with which the idol-worshippers retaliated. By contrast, the new religion of Islam, being a monotheist faith, was alleged

¹¹⁸ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I. 7, 375–76; II. I, p. 398; *Apologeticus*, 23, p. 489.

¹¹⁹ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. XIII, pp. 432–33.

¹²⁰ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, II. XIV, pp. 433–34. See Colbert, *The Martyrs of Córdoba*, pp. 247–50.

to be in harmony with Christian beliefs.¹²¹ In response, Eulogius attempts to validate martyrdom by likening Islam to idolatry and mosques to pagan temples; he insists that Muslims are akin to idol-worshippers, since they deny the divine nature of Christ and the veracity of the Gospels.¹²² For him, the God of the Qur'an is not a true God, given the arrogance of Muslims who pervert the meaning of scripture.¹²³ Eulogius considers Muslim tolerance toward Cordovan Christians an obstacle to martyrdom.¹²⁴ Alvar echoes this argument, although he can think of nothing better than applying reverse logic: he states that since the martyrdoms arose, there must have been active persecution.¹²⁵

The most challenging objection to martyrdom for Eulogius — one that reveals a string of logical tensions in his polemic — is the question of whether it was necessary for one to perform miracles in order to be considered a martyr.¹²⁶ Unlike earlier local Iberian martyrs commemorated in the *Peristephanon*, the martyrs of Córdoba notoriously failed to produce any miracles. The dilemma surrounding the status of miracles was not limited to ninth-century Córdoba: its origins are found in the great logical controversy informing patristic literature. Whereas in the Old Testament a miracle was the privilege of God, and was used rhetorically to reaffirm divine authority over humanity, in the New Testament tradition Christ is not the only miracle-maker. On the contrary, the presence of magicians, fraudsters, and the Antichrist was seen as an obstacle to Christ's ability to convince the Jews of his messianic vocation. In order to resolve the logical tension of the New Testament with regard to the validity of miracles, the subsequent tradition changed the emphasis from the ostentation of a prodigious event to its interpretation as a manifestation of charity (cf. Paul's epistles) and virtue (cf. Gregory's *Dialogues*). In other words, it was proposed that the value of the miracle resided not in the sign of providence but rather in the interpretation attributed to it by people. In the patristic tradition, it is the people who bear the responsibility of distinguishing between a miracle and an act of fraud, between virtue and vice.¹²⁷

¹²¹ Eulogius, *Apologeticus*, 3, p. 477.

¹²² Eulogius, *Apologeticus*, Prologue, pp. 475–76; 1–3, pp. 476–78; 11, p. 481; 19, p. 487.

¹²³ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I, 18, p. 382.

¹²⁴ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I, 30, p. 392.

¹²⁵ Alvar, *Indiculus*, 15, p. 288.

¹²⁶ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I, 26, pp. 389–90.

¹²⁷ Marc Van Uytfgange, 'La controverse biblique et patristique autour du miracle, et ses répercussions sur l'hagiographie dans l'Antiquité tardive et le haut Moyen Âge Latin', in

Eulogius reveals his familiarity with this controversy when he emphasizes the virtue of the martyr vis-à-vis his/her miracle-making capacity:

non prodigiis atque portentis, sed integritate fidei, et professionis constantia excellentiores fieri martyres, illudque tantummodo in eis sit admirandum, quod animo fortiori mortem exceperunt propter Christum, qui dixit: 'Qui perdidit animam suam propter me, in uitam aeternam inueniet eam'.

(The martyrs excel not by miracles and portents, but rather by the integrity of their faith and persistence in its profession. Therefore, what is to be admired in them is the strength of their spirit in confronting death for the love of Christ, who said: 'Whoever loses his soul for me, will find it in eternal life'.¹²⁸)

In order to justify the absence of miracles among the martyrs, Eulogius objects that the miracle does not possess great importance, given evidence from the Gospels that people can easily be confounded by miracles performed by false prophets. Instead, Eulogius recommends that true saints be distinguished by their many virtues, which eclipse the effects of their miracles: 'Et iccirco haec dinumeratio virtutum in illis prodigiorum auctoribus potius quam ipse signorum effectus est admirandus'.¹²⁹ For Eulogius, the miracles had only been necessary in order to spread the message of early Christianity around the world; at the advanced stage, martyrs are no longer defined by miracles or portents, but by the integrity of their faith and persistence in its profession.¹³⁰

However, by negating the value of the miracle, Eulogius confronts yet another logical tension and perhaps the most intractable one: the miracle of the Prophet Muḥammad's triumph in disseminating Islam. The prodigious rise of Muḥammad and the rapid geographical expansion of the new faith appeared to Eulogius's contemporaries to be truly miraculous. This apparent contradiction shapes the rhetoric of the *Apologeticus*, a composition that includes the first known *vita* of Muḥammad in the western tradition.¹³¹ Eulogius deals with this complexity by attempting to invalidate every aspect of the life and work of the prophet as manifestations of the Antichrist, and by exposing the excessive

Hagiographie, cultures et sociétés, IV^e–XII^e siècles. Actes du Colloque organisé à Nanterre et à Paris (2–5 mai 1979), ed. by Evelyne Patlagean and Pierre Riché (Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1981), pp. 206–31.

¹²⁸ Eulogius, *Apologeticus*, 9, p. 481.

¹²⁹ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I, 15, pp. 380–81.

¹³⁰ Eulogius, *Memoriale*, I, 14, p. 380; *Apologeticus*, 7, 9, pp. 479–81.

¹³¹ Eulogius, *Apologeticus*, 15–16, pp. 483–86.

credulity of his followers who, according to Eulogius, allowed themselves to be deceived by a miracle devoid of virtue. The narrative of Muḥammad's vices is constructed in explicit contrast to the virtues of Christ and the saints as they appear in Christian *vitae*, with characteristic juxtapositions between Christ's charity and Muḥammad's greed of a nomadic trader. The humility of the fathers of the Church and Christian martyrs is contrasted with Muḥammad's arrogance in revealing claims to his prophetic mission. Chastity is contrasted with lust, as illustrated by Muḥammad's polygamy. Christian simplicity is set off against Muḥammad's Antichrist-like astuteness, which, according to Eulogius, explains his dramatic success in the conversion of African tribes to Islam. Muḥammad thus possesses qualities directly opposed to the virtues of hagiographical characters and, as Eulogius concludes, is unable to produce the miracles that the public expects.

Eulogius's logical incongruencies, which he reveals in the polemic with his Christian detractors, were of a magnitude that neither Eulogius himself nor his champion Alvar were able to successfully tackle. As a result, the martyrdom movement only succeeded in further dividing, rather than uniting, Cordovan Christians. Nevertheless, as the word of Cordovan martyrs spread beyond the geographical limits of al-Andalus, the intractable and divisive logical tensions that define Eulogius's polemic — the absence of persecution of Christians by Muslims, and the lack of miracles performed by martyrs — were forgotten, and the cult of Cordovan martyrs entered into the ideological mainstream both inside and outside the Iberian Peninsula.

The earliest such testimony is the account *De translatione sanctorum martyrum Georgii monachi, Aurelii et Nathaliae ex urbe Corduba Parisios* (*Of the Transfer of Holy Martyrs George the Monk, Aurelius, and Nathalia from the City of Córdoba to Paris*), written around 871 by Parisian monk Aimonius. It relates the transfer of the relics of three Cordovan martyrs to the monastery of Saint-Germain-des-Prés with the apparent aim of increasing the prestige of the Parisian sanctuary.¹³² The journey and transfer of the relics was undertaken in 858 by two monks of the monastery, Odilard and Usuard, the latter of whom incorporated accounts of Cordovan martyrs into his *Martyrologue*, which he

¹³² John Tolan, *L'Europe latine et le monde arabe au Moyen Âge: Cultures en conflit et en convergence* (Rennes: Presses Universitaires de Rennes, 2009), pp. 155–72. For the original text, see *De translatione sanctorum Georgii monachi, Aurelii et Nathaliae ex urbe Corduba Parisios*, PL, CXV, pp. 939–60; see Spanish translation and commentary in Juan Carlos Lara Olmo, 'El relato del traslado de los santos mártires Jorge, Aurelio y Natalia: un valioso escrito hagiográfico y documental histórico de mediados del siglo IX', *HS*, 51.103 (1999), 55–90.

dedicated to Charles the Bald.¹³³ An additional embassy was sent by Charles in order to verify the authenticity of the relics.¹³⁴ Books II and III of Aimonius's account describe several miracles performed by the Cordovan saints while in transit to Paris. It is the first testimony of the incorporation of the Cordovan martyrs into the European hagiographical tradition.

Within Iberian limits, there is no evidence that Cordovan martyrs were well known outside al-Andalus in the ninth century; however, later traditions fully exploited the movement for purposes of Iberian cohesion. The process might have begun with the ninth-century Mozarabic migration to Asturias, León, and Galicia under the auspices of Ordoño I (850–66), which eventually led to the transfer of Eulogius's remains to Oviedo in 884, during the reign of Alfonso III (866–910). The *Passio Sancti Pelagii*, the only martyrdom account shared by all extant tenth- and eleventh-century passionaries, demonstrates that the incorporation of Cordovan martyrdoms into the hagiographical mainstream was achieved in part by stripping the *passio* of logical tensions that had characterized the works of Eulogius and Alvar, and by closely integrating the later corpus with the earlier, Visigothic hagiographical tradition.

Pelagius was a seemingly historical character, a Galician hostage, who was turned over to the Muslims following the defeat of Ordoño II in 920, and executed in Córdoba in 926.¹³⁵ The text exhibits a familiar contrast between the wisdom and chastity of the Christian and the moral turpitude of the Muslim; however, the metaphoric seduction of the Christian adversary with temporal goods, which had defined the intellectual polemic between Christians and Muslims in Córdoba in the preceding century, unravels in an episode of actual seduction. Pelagius is depicted as ostensibly similar to Visigothic fathers, such as the Emeritan bishop Renovatus from the *Lives of the Fathers of Mérida* (*Vitae sanctorum patrum Emeretensium*) — tall, handsome, of noble presence, delightful to the eye as a reflection of his even greater spiritual handsomeness.¹³⁶

¹³³ Pérez-Embid Wamba, *Hagiología y sociedad*, p. 35.

¹³⁴ Pérez-Embid Wamba, *Hagiología y sociedad*, p. 36.

¹³⁵ This work, which is extant in four eleventh-century codices, was edited and translated into Spanish by Juan Gil, 'La Pasión de S. Pelayo,' *Habis*, 3 (1972), 161–200. See also Manuel Díaz y Díaz, 'La historiografía en España después de la invasión árabe hasta el siglo X,' in *La storiografía altomedieval. 10–16 aprile 1969*, Settimane, 17 (Spoleto, 1970), pp. 313–43.

¹³⁶ *Vitae sanctorum patrum Emeretensium*, ed. by A. Maya Sánchez, CCSL, 116 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1992), 5. 14. 5, p. 103. The lives of the saints and fathers of the Visigothic Church were widely circulated among the Iberian clergy, with at least six testimonies of the donation of these writings to Leonese monasteries in the ninth and tenth centuries (Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz,

The physical beauty and virginity of the thirteen-year-old Pelagius is complemented by the purity of his soul. These qualities create a complex psychological game between the martyr and his persecutors, in which the unwelcome advances of 'Abd-al-Raḥmān III (r. 912–929) serve to expose the diabolical nature of Islam. Upon hearing of the physical pulchritude of his young hostage, the caliph orders that he be brought to the palace dressed in fine garments. This is followed by attempts to seduce the adolescent with promises of material wealth, serfs, the liberation of Christian captives, and privileges for members of Pelagius's family in Córdoba. Pelagius rejects the temporal goods in favour of eternal goods represented by the figure of Christ. Instead of fighting Islam by the force of argument, he denigrates the caliph's faith by tempting his sexual appetite. Upon accusing 'Abd-al-Raḥmān of being effeminate, the martyr throws off courtly robes and ostends the physical beauty of an 'athlete of Christ'. The enraged caliph orders Pelagius to be slowly tortured. With his body disfigured and having endured a passion that exceeds even that of Christ, Pelagius preserves his soul. The caliph, rather than demonstrating tolerance toward the Christian or intending to dissuade the young man of the necessity of martyrdom, appears lustful and sadistic, as if personifying Christian arguments against Islamic doctrine. This northern *passio*, despite bearing a strong resemblance to the Cordovan martyrdom accounts with regard to the martyr's defiant adherence to Christian faith and his willingness to be executed by Islamic authorities, is devoid of any of the logical tensions that transpire in Eulogius and Alvar's polemic.

The presence of Pelagius's passion in all extant tenth- and eleventh-century versions of the *Hispanic Passionary*, and the absence of logical controversies in this account, evidence that the Cordovan martyrdom culture took on a new life in the kingdom of León. The eleventh-century *Passionary of Silos* testifies to the year-round commemoration of Cordovan martyrs Rudericus and Salomon (12 March), Eugenia (13 April), Leocritia, Eulogius (1 June), Pelagius (26 June), and Abundius (14 December) in the northern kingdoms. The cult of the Cordovan martyrs reaches its apogee during the reign of Fernando I (1037–65), when the transfer of relics, aided by the disintegration of caliphal power in al-Andalus, forms an important part of monarchical legitimation.¹³⁷ As the recovery of Christian relics and bodies of saints and warriors became an important strategy of political legitimation in the kingdom of León, we encounter

'Notas sobre los libros leídos en el reino de León hace mil años,' *CHE*, 1–2 (1944), 222–38).

¹³⁷ Pérez-Embida Wamba, *Hagiología y sociedad*, pp. 32–39.

several chronicle references to embassies charged with the transfer of relics. The *Chronicle of Bishop Pelayo*, the *Chronicon Mundi*, and the *Historia de rebus Hispanie* relate that, in order to save Christian relics from al-Manṣūr's incursion into León and Astorga, the Leonese and the Asturians transferred the remains of this martyr, along with bodies of their kings, from Astorga to Oviedo.¹³⁸ The Leonese-Castilian *Chronica Naiarensis* tells us of how Ramiro III transferred the remains of the martyr Pelagius from Córdoba to León in 967.¹³⁹

The last martyrdom account reminiscent of the plight of Cordovan Christians during the age of mass conversion to Islam is found in the twelfth-century *Chronica Naiarensis*. King Alfonso V of León (b. 994, r. 999–1028), being of tender age, arranges the marriage of his sister Theresa to an unidentified *taifa* king of Toledo; however, the forced union results in the miraculously sudden death of the Muslim. Theresa refuses to consummate what the chronicle proclaims to be sacrilegious concubinage, and warns her consort to distance himself in order to avoid celestial punishment: “Noli me tangere, quia paganus es. Si uero me tetigeris, angelus Domini interficiet te.” Tunc rex derisit eam, et concubuit cum ea semel, et statim, sicut illa predixerat, percussus est ab angelo Domini.¹⁴⁰ (“Do not touch me, for you are pagan. If, however, you touch me, an angel of God will destroy you.” Then the [Muslim] king derided her, and lay with her, and immediately, as she had predicted, was struck by an angel of God’). Although prior to his death, the king orders Theresa to be returned to León with great honours, she opts to enter voluntarily into the monastery of St Pelagius. Here again, the presence of a miracle serves as validation of Christianity's superiority over Islam, and it bears no vestige of the logical tension that had characterized Cordovan accounts.

Although Eulogius and Alvar's rhetoric was divisive and their status remained marginal in the Cordovan community, their writings were ultimately of consequence, since they eventually helped erect an ideological wall between Christian and Muslim Spain. Rid of the logical controversies that accompanied the anti-Islamic polemic in ninth-century Córdoba, the cult of martyrs sur-

¹³⁸ *Chronicon Pelagianum*, p. 65; Lucas, *Chronicon Mundi*, IV. 37, pp. 268–69. Cf. Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, v. XIV, p. 163.

¹³⁹ *Chronica Naiarensis*, II. 62, p. 79.

¹⁴⁰ *Chronica Naiarensis*, II. 75, p. 83 and II. 88, p. 88. Aillet sees these developments as part of a concerted effort to reaffirm the status of the Astur-Leonese monarchy and Church as the only legitimate heirs to the Visigothic state and its Church, as opposed to the Mozarabic Church, to which the northerners denied legitimacy on the basis of it being located in Islamic territory. Cyrille Aillet, ‘La formación del mozarabismo’, pp. 289–90.

vived in the northern kingdoms of León, where it became an important factor in the formation of political legitimation and contributed to forming the ideology of Iberian cohesion and Leonese ideological consolidation. The prompt disappearance of the cult of martyrdom after the twelfth century resulted from a liturgical reform, a sweeping change of the religious landscape initiated by Alfonso VI (r. 1065–1109) in the late eleventh century. The reform, aimed at integration with the universal Church, was carried out largely via the suppression of Visigothic liturgical particularism and its manifestations. The disappearance of Mozarabic (or Visigothic) liturgy following its five-centuries-long status as the official rite of the peninsular Church was the principal reason for the extinction of both local martyrdom cults and the narrative traditions they had inspired.¹⁴¹

¹⁴¹ Javier Pérez-Embid, 'Usos de la hagiografía durante la reforma gregoriana', in *La reforma gregoriana y su proyección en la cristiandad occidental. Siglos XI–XII*, XXXII Semana de Estudios Medievales. Estella, 18 a 22 de julio de 2005 (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2006), pp. 113–54. On the stages of Gregorian reform in León, see Gonzalo Martínez Díez, 'La iglesia de las normas: el Derecho Canónico', in *La reforma gregoriana*, pp. 53–98, and Alain Rauwel, 'La liturgie comme vecteur de la Réforme grégorienne', in *La reforma gregoriana*, pp. 99–112.

VISIGOTHIC LAW, SOVEREIGNTY, AND NORTH-EASTERN IBERIAN POLITICAL RIVALRY IN THE ASTURIAN CHRONICLE TRADITION

After a successful rebellion against the Arabs by local leader Pelagius (or Pelayo, d. 737) in 718 or 722, a new Christian power nucleus emerged in Asturias. Although traditional scholarship dates the lifespan of the Asturian kingdom to between 718 and 910, the year the royal see was moved to León, it has recently been argued that the kingdom was, in fact, not firmly established until sometime during the reign of Alfonso II (r. 791–842), since he was the first Asturian ruler to title himself *rex* in official charters.¹ The earlier dating is based on political claims of kingship found in late ninth-century Asturian narrative sources. Two texts composed during the reign of Alfonso III (r. 866–910), the *Chronicle of Albelda* (*Chronica Albeldensia*) and the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, collectively provide a glimpse into the brief history of the Asturian kingdom.

The earliest known version of the *Chronica Albeldensia* occupies fols 238^v–248^v of a richly illuminated manuscript known as the *Codex Vigilanus* (*Albeldensis*), which was compiled at the Riojan monastery of St Martin of Albelda toward 976 and contains a collection of legal, historical, and patristic texts.² Among the codex's three scribes, which are depicted on fol. 428, *Vigila*

¹ Roger Collins, *Caliphs and Kings: Spain, 796–1031* (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012), pp. 50 and 59–60.

² Madrid, Real Biblioteca del Monasterio del Escorial, d. I. 2. See *Códice Albeldense 976*:

is thought to be the planner and chief scribe of the codex; *Sarracinus* is mentioned as his *socius*, or assistant, and *Garsea*, as a disciple.³ The chronicle itself is believed to have been edited between 881 and 883. Compiled from Visigothic, Mozarabic, and properly Asturian sources, it begins with a miscellany of geographical, ethnographic, and philological data from Isidore's *Etymologies*. The chronological portion of the text that follows includes a succession of Roman emperors from Isidore's *Chronicle* and a description of Iberian Gothic origins from his *Historiae de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, revealing the chronicle's intent to inscribe the history of the Asturian kingdom into universal and Iberian history. The *Chronica Albeldensia* concludes with a detailed history of the Asturian kingdom, which is narrated under the rubric 'Ordo gothorum obetensium regum'. This portion, which will interest us the most, begins with the arrival of Pelagius in Asturias in the wake of the Arab conquest of Spain and concludes with a biography of Alfonso III.

The second text is known as the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*. It is believed to have been written during the reign of Alfonso, perhaps by the king himself, and finalized between 911 and 914, shortly after his death. Unlike the *Albeldensia*, this text is manifestly local in character. Fashioned as a continuation of Isidore's *Chronicle*, it contains the succession of kings from Recceswinth (r. 653–72) to Ordoño I (r. 850–66), father of Alfonso III. The chronicle is known in two redactions. The so-called *Rotensis* version was named after the Cathedral of Roda de Isábena (where it was discovered) and is believed to be an earlier redaction. The *Rotensis* served as a source for several posterior histories — the Leonese *Chronica Naiarensis* and the *Historia Silensis (Legionensis)*, the *Chronicon mundi* by Lucas of Tuy, and the *Historia de rebus Hispanie* by Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada.⁴ The second version of the Alfonsine chronicle is titled *Ad Sebastianum*, after the monk whose name appears in the dedication. Its authorship is also attributed to Alfonso III.⁵ Although none of the extant

original conservado en la Biblioteca del real Monasterio de San Lorenzo del Escorial (d.I.2), ed. by Francisco Javier García Turza, *Scriptorium*, 15 (Madrid: Patrimonio Nacional: Testimonio Compañía Editorial, 2002), p. 22.

³ See Manuel Díaz y Díaz, 'Escritores del Monasterio de Albelda. Vigilán y Sarracino', in *Códice Albeldense 976*, ed. by García Turza, pp. 73–133.

⁴ Juan Gil Fernández, introduction to *CA*, pp. 45–105 (p. 79). Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, 'Las crónicas de Albelda y de Alfonso III', in Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *Investigaciones sobre historiografía hispana medieval (siglos VIII al XII)* (Buenos Aires: Instituto de Historia de España, 1967), pp. 17–108 (p. 42) (first publ. in *BH*, 32 (1930), 305–25).

⁵ The hypothesis of the common source of these chronicles was first articulated by

manuscripts of *Ad Sebastianum* pre-date the sixteenth century, the existing redactions provide what is thought to be a reliable basis for the reconstruction of the original text.⁶ Both versions of the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* are believed to depend on one common source, a lost chronicle putatively composed around the year 800, during the reign of Alfonso II.⁷

Throughout its existence, the kingdom of Asturias experienced a near-constant threat to its north-eastern frontier on the Ebro, which led to the privileging of its south-western territorial expansion to the Duero River, completed under Alfonso III. This strategic challenge may have caused the eventual relocation of the axis of power away from Oviedo and toward the relative safety of León and Castile in the early tenth century.⁸ Yet this kingdom, of which not much is known, left behind a political narrative that not only became a cornerstone of ideologies of political and confessional consolidation in mediaeval León and Castile, but also eventually formed a foundation of early modern and modern definitions of Spanish nationhood. Throughout most of the twentieth century, critics who equated the history of Spain with that of Castile valued the Asturian chronicle narratives as the first manifestations of the reconquest spirit that would later flourish in Leonese and Castilian histories — evidence, as one scholar put it, that ‘Castile, simply, had history.’⁹ The portions of both chronicles that have interested scholars the most are those dedicated to Asturian royal affairs, for these narratives famously assert the Visigothic continuity of the Asturian royal dynasty and its leading role in the Iberian reconquest. Below I will explain why the traditional approach with an emphasis on Visigothic genealogical continuity, which was overwhelmingly applied to these texts throughout the twentieth century, may have exhausted its possibilities of

Zacarías García Villada in ‘Notas sobre la Crónica de Alfonso III’, *RFH*, 8 (1921), 264–66. See the discussion in Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, ‘Otra vez sobre la crónica de Alfonso III’, *CHE*, 13 (1950), 90–100 (repr. in Sánchez-Albornoz, *Investigaciones*, pp. 97–107). Sánchez-Albornoz dates the *Rotensis* version to between 883 and 886 and the *Ad Sebastianum* to 886 (p. 98).

⁶ *Crónica de Alfonso III*, ed. and introd. by Zacarías García Villada (Madrid: Sucesores de Rivadeneyra, 1918), pp. 13–33.

⁷ Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, ‘¿Una crónica asturiana perdida?’, *RFH*, 7 (1945), 105–46 (repr. in Sánchez-Albornoz, *Investigaciones*, pp. 111–60).

⁸ Manuel Gómez-Moreno, *Iglesias mozarabes: arte español de los siglos IX a XI* (Madrid: Centro de Estudios Históricos, 1919), p. 72; Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, ‘Alfonso III y el particularismo castellano’, *CHE*, 13 (1950), 19–100 (pp. 76–80).

⁹ Manuel Gómez-Moreno, ‘Las primeras crónicas de la Reconquista: el ciclo de Alfonso III’, *BRAH*, 100 (1932), 562–627 (p. 563).

fruitful interpretation. I propose instead a reading that links these texts compositionally with Visigothic political law. As its provisions governing royal power were adapted to political challenges faced by the Asturian kings in the ninth-century, the *Lex* became both a successful foundation of sovereignty in the kingdom and a key compositional feature in the Asturian chronicle narratives.

Questioning Asturias

For contemporary scholars, the traditional interpretation of these narratives presents several challenges. The first challenge concerns the relationship between the Asturian *Chronica Albeldensia* and the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* and the eighth-century Mozarabic chronicles. These were long believed to be vastly different narrative traditions, since there is a century-and-a-half-long hiatus between the composition of the *Chronicle of 741* and the *Chronicle of 754* and the birth of the Asturian chronicle tradition. Asturian claims of legitimate succession to the Visigoths remained apparently unknown to the contemporary Mozarabic community, whose sources contain no mention of the Asturian kingdom or its ruling dynasty.¹⁰

However, Asturian texts present evidence that indicates a measure of continuity rather than absolute rupture. We know that Asturian chroniclers were familiar with the Mozarabic tradition, since some manuscripts of the *Chronica Albeldensia* contain a brief miscellany of the succession of Arab caliphs and rulers of Córdoba, history, and apocalyptic prophecy known by the rather ambitious title of the *Prophetic Chronicle*.¹¹ It is sometimes attributed to Dulcidius of Toledo, a Mozarab priest who led the embassy of Alfonso III to Córdoba in 883 and brought Eulogius's works to Oviedo.¹² The *Prophetic Chronicle* demonstrates how Asturian chroniclers attempted to adapt an Eastern prophecy to their propagandistic needs. This was done by identifying the Visigoths

¹⁰ Isabel Torrente Fernández, 'Goticismo astur e ideología política', in *La época de la monarquía asturiana. Actas del simposio celebrado en Covadonga (8–10 de octubre de 2001)*, ed. by the Real Instituto de Estudios Asturianos (Oviedo: Real Instituto de Estudios Asturianos, Principado de Asturias, 2002), pp. 295–315 (pp. 301–02).

¹¹ *Chronica Albeldensia*, pp. 181–86; the title of *Crónica Profética* was first given to this fragment by Manuel Gómez-Moreno, 'Las primeras crónicas de la Reconquista: el ciclo de Alfonso III', *BRAH*, 100 (1932), 562–628 (pp. 622–27).

¹² Juan Ignacio Ruiz de la Peña, 'La cultura en la Corte Ovetense del siglo IX', in *CA*, pp. 11–42 (p. 36). On Dulcidius, see also John V. Tolan, *Saracens: Islam in the Medieval European Imagination* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002), pp. 98–100.

with the people of Gog, replacing the figure of the last Byzantine emperor in Mediterranean apocalyptic prophecies with that of an Iberian Christian ruler, and by calculating that Muslim rule in Spain would end in 883 or 884, 170 years after the invasion of Spain.¹³

This portion of the *Albeldensia* is significant for a number of reasons. Firstly, it demonstrates that many of the structural and stylistic features of the Mozarabic apocalyptic narrative remain constant through the ninth century: the inclusion of the origins of the Arabs, a chronology of Muslim rulers of Damascus and governors of al-Andalus, prophetic language with allusions to Ezekiel 38, and hyperbolic descriptions of cruelty and calamity associated with the occupation of Spain are all reminiscent of the earlier Mozarabic chronicles. The fall of Spain, for example, is described in familiar terms of fear, violence, and calamity as the chronicle predicts its impending termination: ‘omnis decor Gotice gentis pabore uel fierro periiit’ (‘the beauty of all Gothic people perished in fear’); ‘et quantum perficit Xpisti nominis dignitas tantum inimicorum tabescit ludibriosa calamitas’ (‘and the more accomplished is the dignity of Christ, the more the scornful disaster brought by the enemies vanishes’).¹⁴

Secondly, we can notice that the prophecy was purposely adapted to the political goals of the Asturian kingdom. The *Prophetic Chronicle* explicitly identifies the Visigoths with the people of Gog, who suffer providential punishment for abandoning divine precepts; it then attempts to calculate the date of the imminent end of Arab rule in Spain. The following short passage outlines the key premises of the prophecy: ‘Terra quidem Gog Spania designatur sub regimine Gotorum, in quia Smaelite propter delicta gentis Gotice ingressi sunt et eos gladio conciderunt atque tributarios sibi fecerunt, sicuti presenti tempore patet.’¹⁵ (‘The land of Gog refers to Spain under the rule of the Goths, which, because of the misdeeds of the Gothic people, was invaded by the Ishmaelites, who defeated the Goths militarily and made them tributaries, which remains in effect today.’)

We can see that the Mozarabic fragment is identifying all of Spain as the land having belonged to, and ruled by, the Visigoths. Having been symbolically abandoned by them, Spain is then conquered militarily by the Arabs. The *Prophetic Chronicle* recognizes the Visigoths as political subjects (*tributarii*) of the Arabs and confirms this situation as valid at the time of its com-

¹³ Vázquez de Parga, ‘Algunas notas sobre el Pseudo Metodio’, pp. 152–53. See also Chapter 2.

¹⁴ *Chronica Albeldensia*, pp. 182–83.

¹⁵ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 187.

position ('sicut et presenti tempore patet'). It appears to follow the *Chronicle of 754* rather closely in briefly narrating the conquest of Spain by Ṭāriq bin Ziyād during the reign of the Umayyad caliph al-Walid I (705–15).¹⁶ But unlike the eighth- and ninth-century Mozarabic texts, whose authors appear to be resigned to the loss of political power, this compilation ends with a promise of the restoration of the kingdom of Visigoths, with Alfonso III being identified as the protagonist of the apocalyptic battle between Christianity and Islam. The chronicle then states that Alfonso III would shortly become the ruler of all of Spain:

Ipsi Sarrazeni quosdam prodigiis uel austrorum signis interitum suum adpropinquare predicunt et Gotorum regnum restaurari per hunc nostrum principem dicunt; etiam et multorum Christianorum reuelationibus atque ostensionibus hic princeps noster gloriosus dominus Adefonsus proximiori tempore in omni Spania predicetur regnaturus. Sicque protegente diuina clementia inimicorum terminus quoddidie defecit et ecclesia Domini in maius et melius crescit.¹⁷

(The Saracens themselves, having observed certain portents and signs in the stars, predict their own approaching ruin and the restoration of the kingdom of the Goths by our prince. And also, according to revelations and observations made by many of the Christians, this prince of ours, the glorious Lord Alfonso [III], is said to reign in all of Spain in the near future. And so, under the protection of divine mercy, the enemy territory diminishes daily, and the Church of God grows greater and better.)

This is a notable change, since Mozarabic texts from al-Andalus are unanimous in admitting the political demise of the Visigothic kingdom.¹⁸ We therefore cannot follow Luis A. García Moreno in asserting that belief in the impending restoration of the Visigothic kingdom had always been an integral part of Mozarabic Gothic consciousness and was what ultimately made possible the development of a neo-Gothic consciousness in Asturias.¹⁹ Rather, what the

¹⁶ *Prophetic Chronicle*, pp. 182–83. Cf. the *Chronicle of 754*, 50–52, pp. 66–68.

¹⁷ *Prophetic Chronicle*, p. 188.

¹⁸ Juan Gil, who sees textual similarities between the *Prophetic Chronicle* and Byzantine Danieline prophecies, believes that this prophecy originated in the eastern Mediterranean, which is consistent with our perspective on the origins of the eighth-century Mozarabic chronicles. Juan Gil, 'Judíos y cristianos en España (s. VIII y IX)', *HS*, 31 (1979), 9–88 (pp. 56–64). See also Collins, *Caliphs and Kings*, pp. 54–55.

¹⁹ Luis A. García Moreno, 'Spanish Gothic Consciousness among the Mozarabs in al-Andalus (VIII–Xth Centuries)', in *The Visigoths: Studies in Culture and Society*, ed. by Alberto Ferreiro (Leiden: Brill, 1999), pp. 303–23 (p. 304).

Prophetica demonstrates is that an attempt was made to adapt the Mozarabic narrative to the political goals of the kingdom of Asturias by linking the prophecy with Alfonso III. Given that in the eighth and ninth centuries the Mozarabic historical narrative was predicated on the political demise of the Visigoths, the fact that the above fragment attempts to discard this basic premise by predicting the imminent return of Christian political power in Spain demonstrates that the Mozarabic narrative was perhaps seen by some as malleable enough to support the nascent power centre in Asturias, had the northern kingdom chosen to adapt the Mozarabic apocalyptic framework for its political purposes.

However, this world view did not prevail. Unlike the Mozarabic chronicles, the *Chronica Albeldensia* and the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* show absolutely no interest in ecclesiastical affairs, portents, eclipses, and apocalyptic events, concerning themselves instead with what has appeared to many modern readers as straightforward, unadorned accounts of royal, military, and civil activities.²⁰ As we shall see further in this chapter, this is because the kingdom of Asturias developed a different, highly pragmatic model of royal legitimacy that better suited the political goals of this north-western Iberian enclave.

The second challenge that the Asturian chronicles present for scholars is that while they are the only narrative sources of the history of the kingdom of Asturias, they do not shed much light on how the kingdom came into being.²¹ One of the most surprising omissions in these texts is the lack of information about the diplomatic relationship between Asturias and the Carolingian court. The heyday of Carolingian influence in Iberia included the expedition to Saragossa in 778 and the capture of Barcelona in 801, and it is believed that the decade of 790 especially was marked by a close relationship between Alfonso II (r. 791–842) and Charlemagne (r. 768–814).²² The chronicles are silent on a relationship so close that, according to Einhard, Alfonso II ‘asked to be called none other than his [Charlemagne’s] man’ (‘non aliter se apud illum quam proprium suum appellari juberet’).²³ Frankish sources inform of several Asturian embassies to Charlemagne. According to the anonymous *Vita Hludowici*

²⁰ See Gil Fernández, Introduction to *CA*, pp. 71–72.

²¹ Collins, *Caliphs and Kings*, pp. 50–59.

²² Julio Escalona, ‘Family Memories: Inventing Alfonso I of Asturias’, in *Building Legitimacy: Political Discourses and Forms of Legitimacy in Medieval Societies*, ed. by Isabel Alfonso, Hugh Kennedy, and Julio Escalona (Leiden: Brill, 2004), pp. 223–62 (pp. 226–27, 249–51).

²³ Einhard, *Vita Karoli Magni*, ed. by Georg Waitz, in *MGH*, SS. Rer. Germ., 25 (Hannover: Hahn, 1911), pp. 1–41 (p. 16).

(c. 840), the first of these took place in 795, when Alfonso II sent ambassadors to Toulouse to offer gifts to Louis the Pious (r. 814–40) and solicit an accord of friendship ('pro amicitia firmanda missit cum donis').²⁴ Because it was commissioned in the wake of the Cordovan emir Hishām I's 794 successful raid on Oviedo, and in anticipation of a new Muslim campaign approaching the kingdom in 795, it is believed that the embassy's goal was to develop a joint strategy for combatting the Arab army in Asturias.²⁵ In the winter of 797, Alfonso dispatched his ambassador Fruela to Charlemagne with a beautiful tent, of which a record exists in the *Annales Laurissenses Maiores*, which cover the years 741–801 ('uenit etiam et legatus Hadeponsi regis Galleciae et Asturiae nomine Froia papilionem mire pulchritudinis praesentans').²⁶ The final offering of trophies took place after the Asturian king's victory in Lisbon in 797 or 798, when two of Alfonso's ambassadors brought Charlemagne Muslim captives, mules, and body armour (c. 814–17).²⁷ It is difficult to disagree with Georges Martin, who regards these embassies as a likely sign of Alfonso's vassallic dependency on Charlemagne.²⁸ By the late ninth century, when the Asturian chronicles were composed, Frankish involvement in Iberian affairs had long been on the wane, but even if one assumed that the chroniclers' silencing of this inconvenient late eighth-century relationship between Alfonso II and the Carolingians reflects the new reality of the kingdom's successful expansion and political consolidation under Alfonso III, little can be learned about his rule, either.

Finally, no scholar who has sought to understand the essence of the Asturian political project has yet been able to ignore the famously puzzling declaration about Alfonso II made in the *Albeldensia*: 'omnemque Gotorum ordinem, sicuti Toletum fuerat, tam in ecclesia quam palatio in Ouetao cuncta statuit' ('and he restored the entire order of the Goths in Oviedo, according to what it had

²⁴ Anonymous (The Astronome), *Vita Hludowici*, ed. by Ernst Tremp, in *MGH, SS. Rer. Germ.*, 64 (Hannover: Hahn, 1995), pp. 279–555 (p. 306).

²⁵ Marcelin Défourneaux, 'Charlemagne et la monarchie asturienne', in *Mélanges d'histoire du Moyen Âge dédiés à la mémoire de Louis Halphen*, ed. by Charles-Edmond Perrin (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1951), pp. 177–84 (pp. 178–79).

²⁶ *Annales regni Francorum (741–829) (Annales Laurissenses Maiores)*, ed. by Friedrich Kurze, in *MGH, SS. Rer. Germ.*, 6 (Hannover: Hahn, 1895), pp. 1–178 (p. 102).

²⁷ *Annales regni Francorum*, p. 105. See Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, 'La alianza con Carlomagno y sus consecuencias bélicas', in Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *Estudios críticos sobre el reino de Asturias*, 3 vols (Oviedo: Instituto de Estudios Asturianos, 1972), II, 532–39.

²⁸ Georges Martin, 'La chute du royaume visigothique d'Espagne dans l'historiographie chrétienne des VIII^e et IX^e siècles', *CLHM*, 9 (1984), 208–33 (p. 214 and n. 22).

been in Toledo, both in the church and in the palace’).²⁹ While there is a general consensus that the chronicle refers to the resurrection of one superficial aspect of the Visigothic monarchy — the ritualistic anointment of Asturian kings — scholars continue to be divided about the precise meaning of the *ordo Gothorum* and the nature of its restoration in Asturias.³⁰ Disagreement exists as to whether what was created in the Asturias of Alfonso II should be viewed as a revival of the political corpse of the Visigothic kingdom or a completely different entity.³¹ Some see this statement as proof that the sentiment of Visigothic political continuity was felt early on in Asturias, and that not only Pelagius (the protagonist of the Battle of Covadonga) and the first Asturian kings were descendants of Visigoths, but so were the majority of the inhabitants of Asturias.³² Other scholars take a more mitigated stance, arguing in favour of the ongoing but limited survival of the Visigothic political tradition in the aftermath of 711. Such continuity is perceived to have likely been of a cultural nature, as reflected in Asturian architecture, scriptural tradition, and liturgical practice, rather than in genealogical or institutional foundations.³³ According to a still more sceptical view, the *ordo* refers to Alfonso II formally establishing a new monarchy in Asturias, since he is the first of the Asturian rulers to be found being referred to as *rex*, or king, in an authentic charter of the period.³⁴ It remains unresolved how the fugitive Visigoths were able not only to achieve integration with their former Cantabrian rivals, but to assume leadership as well, and it has been suggested that the process ought to be considered in complementary terms of military domination and political indoctrination. Under this view, the *ordo Gothorum* would refer not to the restoration

²⁹ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 174.

³⁰ See Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, ‘Sede regia y solio regio en el reino astur-leonés’, *AM*, 3 (1979), 61–86; Ruiz de la Peña, ‘La cultura en la Corte Ovetense’, p. 18.

³¹ See Hillgarth, who argues against what he considers an overly simplistic view by Thomas Deswarte that the kingdoms of Asturias and León resurrected the old Visigothic order. In Hillgarth’s words, ‘what was “restored” was very different from what has been destroyed’. Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, *Visigoths in History and Legend*, Studies and Texts, 166 (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2009), p. xi; Thomas Deswarte, *De la destruction à la restauration: l’idéologie dans le royaume d’Oviedo-Léon (VIII–XI siècles)*, Cultural Encounters in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages, 3 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2004).

³² Julia Montenegro and Arcadio del Castillo, ‘Pelayo y Covadonga: una revisión historiográfica’, in *La época de la monarquía asturiana*, pp. 112–24.

³³ José Ignacio Ruiz de la Peña Solar, ‘La realeza asturiana y la formulación del poder regio’, in *La época de la monarquía asturiana*, pp. 163–201 (p. 169).

³⁴ Collins, *Caliphs and Kings*, p. 61.

of the Visigothic kingdom but to the recovery of the lost status of the Visigoths in new political, social, and demographic circumstances.³⁵

As a consequence of these concerns, contemporary scholars no longer accept claims of Visigothic continuity in the Asturian chronicles at face value, regarding them instead as a strategic response by the Asturian monarchy to political challenges from local aristocracy and rival centres of power in the Iberian north-east.³⁶ Such an optic is indeed indispensable for our understanding of the genesis of the Asturian political narrative, but we must delve further into the nature of legitimization claims projected by Asturian political neighbours in order to understand how the sovereigns of Oviedo constructed their own. Given that, as we are about to see, virtually all of the Christian and Muslim centres of power in the Iberian north-east had sufficient reasons to claim legitimacy based on Visigothic ancestry, genealogical continuity alone could not have been a sufficient legitimization strategy in Asturias. Instead, Asturian kings relied on Visigothic law as an anchor of stability in order to leverage the political uncertainty of the frontier society. By adapting key provisions that regulated royal power in the *Lex Wisigothorum* as a framework for structuring and styling royal biographical narratives, the chroniclers legitimize Asturian kings vis-à-vis other north-eastern Iberian powers as exemplary custodians of Visigothic law. Using such a strategy involved much more than simply resurrecting the laws as they were given by Visigothic kings in the sixth and seventh centuries. The insistence of the Asturian chronicles on the exemplary law-keeping habits of Asturian kings raises the possibility that such a model could have been

³⁵ José Angel García de Cortázar, *La época medieval, Historia de España Alfaguara*, ed. by Miguel Artola (Madrid: Alianza Editorial, 1973), II, 129. See also Martín F. Ríos Saloma, 'Los trabajos de García de Cortázar: (1966–78): una apuesta por la renovación historiográfica del medievalismo español', in *Mundos medievales: Espacios, sociedades y poder*, ed. by Beatriz Arízaga Bolumburu and others, 2 vols (Santander: Publican, Universidad de Cantabria, 2012), I, 37–47 (pp. 44–45).

³⁶ It has been pointed out that during the expansion undertaken by Ramiro I (r. 842–50), Ordoño I (r. 850–66), and Alfonso III (r. 866–910), when the centre gained power over local magnates, historiographical sources seek to convey an impression of social uniformity, which originated from 'the elites most closely linked to central power, who sometimes managed to obscure real social diversity in favour of a monolithic, public image of power, based on Roman tradition' (Santiago Castellanos and Iñaki Martín Viso, 'The Local Articulation of Central Power in the North of the Iberian Peninsula (500–1000)', *EME*, 13 (2005), 1–42 (p. 42). Such legitimization was achieved 'through the development of a discourse that contrasted order with disorder, and good deeds with bad', while 'a firm association developed between divine and secular power' (Isabel Alfonso, 'Judicial Rhetoric and Political Legitimation in Medieval León-Castile', in *Building Legitimacy*, ed. by Alfonso, Kennedy, and Escalona, pp. 51–88 (p. 77)).

imported from across the Pyrenees, where the continuous exercise of royal power by the Merovingians and the Carolingians had led to the evolution of its scope from law-giving to law-keeping.

Asturias and its Political Neighbours: A Crowded Landscape

Asturian kings faced tremendous political challenges: throughout the ninth century, the competing north-eastern Iberian power nuclei were in the process of building legitimacy either by claiming blood ties with former Visigothic aristocracy or by using Visigothic laws. What follows is a brief summary of contemporary models of legitimacy in the Iberian north-east with which the Asturian kingdom likely had to contend, for it is helpful to our understanding of why genealogical continuity alone could not have been seen as a sufficient legitimisation tool in Asturias.

The principal embryonic states that opposed both domination by al-Andalus and Carolingian tutelage were Navarre, the county of Barcelona, and the realm of the Banū Qāsi, located in modern-day Aragon.³⁷ Narrative evidence of what are considered the most significant claims of legitimacy has been found in two terse accounts of Septimian origin: the *Chronologia Regum Gothorum*, composed between 774 and 800, and the *Chronicle of Moissac*, composed toward the first half of the ninth century. These texts contain no mention of the young Asturian kingdom.³⁸ Instead, they register the demise of the Visigothic kingdom and affirm the continuation of a Christian war against Islam, and allude to the people of Franks with Charlemagne at their helm as a new sovereign power that succeeds the Visigoths in defending Christianity in Spain.³⁹

³⁷ Martin, 'La chute', pp. 222–23.

³⁸ *Chronologia, et series Gothicorum regum ex Codice Regio Vaticano 667*, in *PL*, LXXXIII (Paris: Migne, 1850), cols 1116–18; *Chronicon Moissacensis*, ed. by Georg H. Pertz, in *MGH*, SS. Rer. Germ., 1 (Hannover: Hahn, 1826), pp. 280–313. See also Iván Pérez Marinas, 'Regum Gothorum y regnum Hispaniae en las crónicas hispano-cristianas de los siglos VIII y IX: continuación, fin o traslado en el relato de la conquista árabe', *Estudios Medievales Hispánicos*, 2 (2012), 175–200.

³⁹ Martin, 'La chute', pp. 212–17; see also Escalona, 'Family Memories', pp. 229–30. Previously, it was pointed out that *Annales Portucalenses Veteres*, which date from the end of the eighth century, contain a similar narrative of the demise of the Visigothic kingdom: Pierre David, *Etudes historiques sur Galice et le Portugal du VI.^e au XII.^e siècle* (Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1947), p. 317. See also José Antonio Maravall, *El concepto de España en la Edad Media* (Madrid: Instituto de Estudios Políticos, 1954), pp. 305–06 and n. 20, and a discussion in Hillgarth, *Visigoths*, p. 66.

The Visigoths of Septimania could, indeed, have perceived themselves as legitimate heirs to the defunct Visigothic government because one of Witiza's sons, Aquila, was sovereign ruler of Septimania and Tarraconensis between 711 and 713, immediately after the fallout between Witiza (r. 702–10) and Rodrigo (r. 710–11) in a conflict of Visigothic royal succession.⁴⁰ During the 750s, according to the *Chronicle of Moissac*, the Visigoths of Narbonne progressively liberated themselves from Arab tutelage following their acceptance of the sovereignty of Pippin the Short (r. 751–68), who assured them of the continuity of their laws.⁴¹ During the last three decades of the eighth century, Charlemagne confirmed his sovereignty over Narbonne and extended his influence to Navarre (with the siege of Huesca in 797) and Catalonia (with the capture of Gerona in 785 and the conquest of Barcelona in 801). The rights of the *Hispani* and *Gothi*, identified as refugees from Arab-dominated areas of Spain who had voluntarily accepted Carolingian tutelage, were subsequently confirmed by Charlemagne and Louis the Pious in acts and constitutions that ensured both the protection and relative independence of the new communities.⁴² The *Praeceptum* of Charles II the Bald (r. 843–77), issued on 11 June 844, explicitly allows the inhabitants of Barcelona to use Visigothic laws.⁴³ However, Frankish domination of the Hispanic March was put in danger by the 826 revolt of the Visigoth Aizon, who allied himself to the Arabs.

Barcelona's push for independence in the final decades of the ninth century signalled the emergence of yet another nucleus of power in north-eastern Iberia. Walter Kienast goes as far as to admit that the principle of territoriality

⁴⁰ Miguel Coll y Alentorn, 'Els successors de Witiza en la zona nordest del domini wisigoth', *BRABL*, 34 (1971–72), 281–307 (p. 287). According to some views, however, Aquila was unrelated to Witiza but was instead a Visigothic noble of local extraction. See Hillgarth, *Visigoths*, p. 54 and n. 91.

⁴¹ Year 759, *Chronicle of Moissac*, p. 294. See also Walter Kienast, 'La pervivencia del derecho godo en el sur de Francia y Cataluña', *BRABL*, 35 (1973–74), 265–300 (p. 266).

⁴² Act of 2 April 812, ed. by Alfred Boretius, in *MGH*, Capit. reg. Fr., 1 (Hannover: Hahn, 1883), no. 76, p. 169; Constitution of 1 January 815, *MGH* Capit. reg. Fr., 1, no. 132, pp. 261–63; Constitution of 10 February 816, in *MGH*, Capit. reg. Fr., 1, no. 133, pp. 263–64; Also in Philippe Depreux, 'Les préceptes pour les Hispani de Charlemagne, Louis le Pieux et Charles le Chauve', in *Aquitaine-Espagne (VIII^e–XIII^e siècle)*, ed. by Philippe Sénac (Poitiers: Université de Poitiers, 2001), pp. 19–38.

⁴³ Alfred Boretius and Victor Krause, eds, *MGH*, Capit. reg. Fr., 2 (Hannover: Hahn, 1890), no. 256, pp. 259–62. See also Michel Zimmermann, 'L'usage du droit wisigothique en Catalogne du IX^e au XII^e siècle: approches d'une signification culturelle', in *Mélanges de la Casa de Velázquez*, 9 (1973), 233–81 (p. 248 and n. 4).

in the use of Visigothic law by the counts of Barcelona (as it had been applied by the Visigoths, that is, covering the population of both Visigothic and Roman origin) was an important factor in Catalonian evolution toward independence and national consolidation. This, however, did not occur in Septimania, where the *Lex Wisigothorum* was used to separate the Visigothic population from the Franks.⁴⁴ From at least the tenth century onward, the word *Gothia* was used to designate the Hispanic March, while the counts of Barcelona referred to themselves in legal documents as Visigoths, for example *Ducis Gothiae, Princeps Gothorum*.⁴⁵

Traces of another competing narrative have survived in the fourteenth-century Aragonese *Chronicle of San Juan de la Peña*, which claims Visigothic ancestry not only for the Asturians but also for the inhabitants of Sobrarbe, Ribagorza, Aragon, Berroza, Artieda, Ordoña, Vizcaya, and Álava. This chronicle counterclaims the Asturian narrative of Pelagius's heroic resistance to the Arabs, which culminated in a battle waged from a stronghold in the mountain cave of Covadonga, with its own narrative staged in a similar setting: the chronicle claims that the mountain of Oroel, located near Jaca, served as a refuge for a handful of Christians who had escaped from the Arabs. From there, they were able to initiate the military resistance and later founded the reconquest kingdoms of Aragon and Navarre:

Christiani autem qui ad Asturias confugerant, elegerunt regem Pelagium, prout in chronicis Castellaue continetur [...]. Trecenti itaque christiani uel circa, qui euaserant a manibus sarracenorum, receperunt se in terra Aragonum, in quodam monte uocato Uruel, circa ciuitatem Iacce; et postea popularunt se in quidam terra ibi propinca uocata Panon, que hodie est Sancti Iohannis de la Peña, et ibi incepterunt construere magna fortalitia castrorum, murorum et uallorum, ut se possent deffendere ab inimicis fidei Christiane.⁴⁶

(The Christians who took refuge in Asturias chose Pelayo as king, as is related in the chronicles of Castile [...]. About three hundred Christians who had escaped the hands of the Saracens took refuge in the land of Aragon, on a certain mountain

⁴⁴ Kienast, 'La pervivencia del derecho godo', pp. 267–69.

⁴⁵ Zimmermann, 'L'usage du droit wisigothique', p. 248. See also Michel Zimmermann, 'Le concept de *Marca Hispanica* et l'importance de la frontière dans la formation de la Catalogne', in *La Marche Supérieure d'al-Andalus et l'Occident chrétien*, ed. by Philippe Sénac (Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, Universidad de Zaragoza, 1991), pp. 29–49.

⁴⁶ *Crónica de San Juan de la Peña*, ed. by Antonio Ubieta Arteta, Textos medievales, 4 (Valencia: Impr. Graf. Bautista, 1961), p. 25. Translation follows *The Chronicle of San Juan de la Peña*, trans. by Lynn H. Nelson (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1991), p. 5.

called Oroel, near the city of Jaca. They then settled in a nearby district called Pano, where San Juan de la Peña is now located. There they began to build great fortifications — castles, walls, and ditches so that they might be able to defend themselves against the enemies of the Christian faith.)

We certainly cannot give retroactive credibility to this legend given the absence of contemporary testimonies. In the aftermath of the Arab invasion, the Ebro Valley formed part of *al-ṭhaḡhr al-a‘la* (the Upper March of al-Andalus), defined as a buffer zone that separated ‘the land of Islam’ from ‘the land of infidels’, and no contemporary evidence exists of zones of Christian resistance.⁴⁷ The territories of modern-day Aragon followed separate trajectories, with Jaca oscillating between the emirate of Córdoba and the kingdom of the Franks, Ribagorza remaining in the orbit of the counts of Toulouse until the last quarter of the ninth century, and Sobrarbe remaining within the Islamic orbit until finally reconquered by Sancho of Navarre in the early eleventh century.⁴⁸ It is, however, certain that the first Christian nucleus of power in Aragon was formed in the mountain regions above the Ebro.⁴⁹ This is revealed in the *Codex of Roda*, which was compiled toward the end of the tenth century and contains not only versions of both the *Chronica Albeldensia* and the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, but also six brief genealogies of the first counts and kings of Aragon and Navarre. These include two families whose origins date back to the early ninth century — the descendants of Aragonese count Aznar Galindo and the Pamplonese dynasty of Íñigo Arista — along with the genealogy of the royal family of Sancho I Garcés of Navarre (r. 905–25).⁵⁰

The genealogy of the Arista family exemplifies the delicate balance of power in this frontier zone: Íñigo’s daughter Asona married Mūsa bin Mūsa Banū Qāsī, while her brother García Íñiguez, who ruled in the mid-ninth century and died c. 882, was allied to Ordoño I; his son Fortún Garcés (b. c. 830) spent twenty years as prisoner in Córdoba. Fortún’s daughter Onneca was married

⁴⁷ See Pedro Chalmeta, ‘El concepto de *ṭagr*’, in *La Marche Supérieure*, ed. by Sénac, pp. 15–28.

⁴⁸ José M. Lacarra, *Aragón en el pasado* (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1972), pp. 16–17; Ramón d’Abadal i de Vinyals, *Dels visigots als catalans*, 4 vols (Barcelona: Edicions 62, 1970), II (1968), p. 311; A. Miró, ‘Les comtes de Toulouse en Pallars et en Ribagorce au IX^e siècle: princes souverains ou agents du prince?’, in *Territorio, sociedad y poder: Revista de estudios medievales*, 6 (2011), 23–52.

⁴⁹ Lacarra, *Aragón en el pasado*, pp. 21–24.

⁵⁰ See José M. Lacarra, ‘Textos navarros del Códice de Roda’, *Estudios de Edad Media de la Corona de Aragón*, 1 (1945), 194–284 (p. 202).

to Emir 'Abd Allah I (b. 844, r. 888–912) and became grandmother of Emir 'Abd al-Rahmān III (r. 912–61), while his sister Jimena married Alfonso III of Asturias in 869. She in turn was mother of Ordoño II of Asturias-León (b. c. 871, r. 914–24), who married Sancha, daughter of the above-mentioned Sancho Garcés.⁵¹ Although the Navarrese dynasty is considered to be probable descendants of old Visigothic aristocracy, there is no explicit evidence in the *Codex of Roda* that the Navarrese linked themselves to the Visigoths; rather, that from the early days of the dynasty, their legitimation strategy consisted in establishing genealogical links with other powerful families in the region, including those of Visigothic stock.⁵² Additionally, the *Rotensis* codex includes the genealogies of the counts of Toulouse and the Carolingians in a manner that is perhaps indicative of the political orientation of these early centres of power in the upper Ebro, which relied on extrapeninsular support for their survival. Finally, the same *Codex Vigilanus* that contains a version of the *Chronica Albeldensia* also includes a short addendum on the dynasty of Sancho I Garcés of Pamplona: King Sancho himself, his son García (r. 925–70), and grandsons Sancho (r. 970–94) and Ramiro. Covering the years 906–76, this short text presents King Sancho I as an important protagonist in the north-eastern Iberian military theatre by virtue of having reconquered from the Muslims the strategically important area of Navarre, circumscribed by Nájera, Álava, Tudela, and Estella.⁵³

Apart from Christian rivals of Visigothic extraction, among the most formidable adversaries of the kingdom of Asturias was the *mūwallad* family of Banū Qāsī, a potent Muslim dynasty with Visigothic ancestry. The founder of the dynasty, a Visigothic count of Borja named Casius (Qāsī), is believed to have converted to Islam during his travel to Damascus shortly after the Muslim inva-

⁵¹ In Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *Orígenes del Reino de Pamplona. Su vinculación con el Valle del Ebro* (Pamplona: Institución Príncipe de Viana, Diputación Foral de Navarra, 1981), p. 30.

⁵² On this, see Ángel Martín Duque, 'Nobleza navarra altomedieval', *Príncipe de Viana*, 63.227 (2002), 667–90 (pp. 668–69); Ángel Martín Duque, 'Definición de espacios y fronteras en los reinos de Asturias-León y Pamplona hasta el siglo XI', in *Los espacios de poder en la España medieval: XII Semana de Estudios Medievales, Nájera, del 30 de julio al 3 de agosto de 2001*, coord. by José Ignacio de la Iglesia Duarte and José Luis Martín Rodríguez (Logroño: Gobierno de La Rioja, Instituto de Estudios Riojanos, 2002), pp. 315–39.

⁵³ Text in *CA*, p. 263. On the Navarrese expansion of Sancho Garcés into the Ebro Valley, see Charles Julian Bishko, 'Salvus of Albelda and Frontier Monasticism', *Speculum*, 23 (1948), 559–90 (pp. 559–61).

sion of Spain.⁵⁴ The Banū Qāsī ruled over Tudela, Tarazona, and Borja, and their sovereignty is believed to have originated in Ejea and Olite, on Navarrese plains stretching over the left bank of the Ebro. From their stronghold in Zaragoza, the administrative centre of *al-thaghr al-a'la*, the Banū Qāsī established a menacing presence in the Ebro Valley between the eighth and tenth centuries (714–924). Having risen first as clients of Damascus and secured a dynastic alliance with the family of Íñigo Arista, the Banū Qāsī subsequently became the clients of the emirate of Córdoba, while the dynasty of Pamplona gravitated toward the kingdom of the Franks in the last decades of the eighth century.

By the mid-ninth century, the Banū Qāsī had amassed enough power to seek independence from the emirate and threaten Carolingian Iberian interests. The Banū Qāsī had been engaged in warfare with the Asturian kings since 839, when Alfonso II fought Fortūn bin Mūsa (d. 874) near Álava. In 842, Alfonso sustained another attack on his eastern frontier by Mūsa bin Mūsa (d. 862). Although the Banū Qāsī clan did not leave behind a political narrative of their own, evidence of their claim to power is stated in the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*. According to this chronicle, in 850 Mūsa bin Mūsa, who was a great-grandson of Casius, rebelled against 'Abd-al-Rahman II and, following a string of successful campaigns in the Ebro valley, arrogantly proclaimed himself 'the third king of Spain' rivalling both the emirate of Cordoba and the kingdom of Asturias ('op tante uictorie causam tantum in superuia intumuit, ut se a suis tertium regem in Spania apellare precepit').⁵⁵ Mūsa again attacked Álava and Castile in 855 and was defeated by Ordoño I at Clavijo and Albelda in 859. In his heyday, he dominated lands from Huesca to Rioja and fought both the Franks and the Andalusi Muslims.

Both versions of the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* explicitly mention the Visigothic lineage of Mūsa bin Mūsa, who, during the reign of Ordoño I, controlled the zone bounded by Zaragoza, Tudela, and Huesca and had installed his son Lope (Lup) in Toledo. The *Chronicle* relates that Alfonso III sent his favourite son Ordoño to Zaragoza to be raised by the Banū Qāsī. Twentieth-century Spanish scholars attributed this inconvenient fact to the extensively documented influx

⁵⁴ See Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *El tercer rey de España* (Buenos Aires: Facultad de Filosofía y Letras, 1969); Alberto Cañada Juste, 'El posible solar originario de los Banū Qāsī', in José María Lacarra, *Homenaje a Don José María Lacarra de Miguel en su jubilación del profesorado*, 5 vols (Zaragoza: Anubar, 1977), I, 33–47 (esp. pp. 33–38), and 'Los Banū Qāsī (714–924)', *Príncipe de Viana*, 158–59 (1980), 5–95. These studies contain an extensive bibliography of Arab historians, the principal source of our knowledge about the Banū Qāsī dynasty.

⁵⁵ *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, versions *Rotensis* and *Ad Sebastianum*, pp. 146–47.

of Mozarabs into the Iberian north-east, including Asturias and León, at the end of the ninth century; Alfonso's desire to educate his son in the Arab culture; and a 'politics of friendship' with those who were considered to be of the same Visigothic bloodstock.⁵⁶ Given the problematic nature of Asturian royal claims on Visigothic descendancy, this seems a very distant possibility.⁵⁷ A more sober assessment suggests that the measure was most likely meant to secure the Asturian kingdom from possible hostility by the Banū Qāsī, and can be regarded as an example of *parias*, defined as 'a form of submission maintained because of a continued threat of violence'; such a relationship usually involved the payment of a tribute.⁵⁸ These fickle allies turned against Alfonso III in 883, and the Asturian king was forced to sign a peace treaty with three emirs of Cordoba so that he could more effectively defend the eastern frontier for the following three decades. Muḥammad bin Lope (d. 898) was able to extend his dominions into Navarre and border Rioja, and at one time dominated the area from Lleida to Toledo. He attacked Álava and Castile in 882–83, 886, and 897–98. Upon his death in 898, his son Lope bin Muḥammad (869–907) scored a victory over Wilfred, count of Barcelona. As ally of Emir 'Abd Allāh of Córdoba, he was a more formidable enemy of Alfonso than his predecessor. He took Toledo in 903, installed his brother Muṭarrif, and returned to the Ebro to fight Alfonso III with a new attack on Álava in 904.⁵⁹ The Banū Qāsī were thus an unrelenting and constant threat to Asturias until the death of Lope bin Muḥammad in 907, which marked the onset of a rapid decline in their fortunes. The dynasty became extinct in 929.⁶⁰

What this brief excursus demonstrates is that at least some of these north-eastern Iberian centres of power had sufficient reasons to claim legitimacy based on Visigothic ancestry, and all of them laid claim to military leadership. It is not clear whether these centres of power attempted to produce competing narratives coetaneous with the Asturian political narrative, since the only evidence available is scattered and post-dates the composition of Asturian chroni-

⁵⁶ Manuel Gómez-Moreno, *Iglesias mozárabes*, pp. 122–30.

⁵⁷ The idea of a 'Gothic brotherhood' between the Asturian royalty and the Banū Qāsī was put forth by Maravall, *El concepto de España*, p. 303.

⁵⁸ Julian Weiss, 'El postcolonialismo medieval: líneas y pautas en la investigación de un problema histórico', in *Literatura medieval y renacentista en España: líneas y pautas*, ed. by Natalia Fernández Rodríguez and María Fernández Ferreiro (Salamanca: La SEMYR, 2012), pp. 177–202 (pp. 193–94).

⁵⁹ Sánchez-Albornoz, *El tercer rey de España*, pp. 48–53.

⁶⁰ Cañada Juste, 'El posible solar', p. 38.

cles. But if those narratives did exist, none of them would have matched the Asturian political narrative in ideological sophistication and lasting impact. What the *Chronica Albeldensia* and the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* accomplish in this regard is nothing short of extraordinary, for not only do they proclaim Asturian royal legitimacy on the basis of blood ties with the Visigothic monarchy, but they also present Asturian monarchs as exemplary law keepers, custodians of the *Lex Wisigothorum*. Below I will focus on this second, much less studied but equally, if not more, important aspect of royal legitimation in the Asturian chronicle narratives. When viewed against the backdrop of competing political forces north and south of the Pyrenees and the perpetual lack of political stability in the Iberian north-east, this complex, nuanced strategy of weaving the language of seventh-century law into the fabric of late ninth-century royal chronicles provides an invaluable key to our understanding of the genesis of the idea of Asturian Visigothic continuity, which left a lasting mark well beyond the Asturian political project.

Reges et leges: *Defining Legitimacy*

The genealogical aspect of Asturian monarchical claims to Visigothic continuity has been extensively studied and deserves a brief summary here.⁶¹ An important programmatic document of the Asturian dynasty, the *Testamentum* of donation to the Basilica of San Salvador in Oviedo, made by Alfonso II on 16 November 812, proclaims Pelagius (Pelayo) as the providential redeemer of the errors of the last Visigothic kings and the founder of the new Asturian dynasty.⁶² The

⁶¹ See Escalona, 'Family Memories'; Manuel Carriedo Tejedo, 'Nacimiento, matrimonio y muerte de Alfonso III el Magno', *AM*, 7 (1993–94), 129–45; Isabel Torrente Fernández, 'Relaciones de parentesco en Asturias durante la Edad Media (siglos VIII a IX)', *AM*, 6 (1991), 39–57; Lucy K. Pick, 'Gender in the Early Spanish Chronicles: From John of Biclar to Pelayo of Oviedo', *La Corónica*, 32.3 (2004), 227–49; Georges Martin, 'Linaje y legitimidad en la historiografía regia hispana de los siglos IX a XIII', *e-Spania*, 11 December 2011, DOI: 10.4000/e-spania.20335.

⁶² 'In era dcc xl viiii simul cum rege roderico regni amisit gloria merito etenim arabico sustinuit gladium, ex quia peste tua dextera Christe famulum tuum eruisti pelagium, qui in principis sublime tus potential uictorialiter dimicant.' In Antonio C. Floriano Cumbreño, *Diplomática española del período astur (718–910)*, 2 vols (Oviedo: Instituto de Estudios Asturianos, 1949–51), I (1951), p. 120. Although there is no doubt about the authenticity of the *Testamentum*, the surviving copy was likely made during the reign of Alfonso III. See Elena Rodríguez Díaz, 'Notas codicológicas sobre el llamado *Testamento del Rey Casto*', *AM*, 8 (1995–96), 71–78.

Testamentum, however, does not contain any indication of blood ties between Pelagius and Visigothic royalty — in fact, it is believed that Asturians showed no concern with their Visigothic identity prior to the 880s.⁶³ The *Albeldensia*, by contrast, seeks to leave no doubt about the Visigothic origins of Pelagius: by stating that Pelagius was expelled from Toledo by Witiza, it links the Arab success in conquering Spain with Pelagius's absence from the heart of the kingdom.⁶⁴ The *Rotensis* version of the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* states that Pelagius was a *spatarius* of two of the last Visigothic kings, Witiza and Rodrigo.⁶⁵ The *Ad Sebastianum* version adds that Pelagius was of royal lineage and chosen to rule by representatives of the royal Visigothic bloodline. This is a thinly veiled allusion to the last of the Visigothic kings, Rodrigo, who was elected by an assembly of Visigothic magnates, but also an assertion that Pelagius had been elected to rule in accordance with the law.⁶⁶

Both chronicles affirm the Cantabrian origin of Alfonso I (b. 693, r. 739–57), son of local duke Pedro. The *Albeldensia* underscores his ties by marriage to the dynasty founder Pelagius by stating that he was his son-in-law, married to Pelagius's daughter Hermenesinda, and later became the maternal grandfather of Alfonso II ('Adefonsus Pelagi gener rg. an. XVIII. Iste Petri Cantabrie ducis filius fuit. Et dum Asturias uenit, Bermisindam Pelagi filiam Pelagio precipiente accepit').⁶⁷ The *Ad Sebastianum* version of the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, which claims the royal origins of Pelagius, also strengthens Alfonso's claim to legitimacy by adding that his father Pedro was of Visigothic royal lineage and related to Visigothic kings Leovigild and Reccared ('filius Petri ducis, ex semine Leuegildi et Reccaredi regum progenitus').⁶⁸ The *Ad Sebastianum* states that Alfonso was an army chief during the reigns of Egica and Witiza ('tempore Egicani et Uittizani princeps militia fuit'), while the *Rotensis* version insists that Alfonso was elected king by the people of Asturias ('ab uniuerso populo Adefonsus elegitur in regno').⁶⁹ Thus the Asturian political narrative progressively strengthens claims of legitimacy by linking Asturian kings to the

⁶³ Escalona, 'Family Memories', pp. 232–33; Hillgarth, *Visigoths*, pp. 67–68.

⁶⁴ *Chronica Albeldensia*, pp. 171–73.

⁶⁵ *Chronicle of Alfonso III, Rot.*, p. 122.

⁶⁶ *Chronicle of Alfonso III, Ad Seb.*, p. 123.

⁶⁷ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 173.

⁶⁸ *Ad Seb.*, p. 131. Note that *Rot.* also states the royal origin of Alfonso but it does so less strongly than *Ad Seb.*: 'Adefonsus filius Petri Cantabrorum ducis ex regni prosapiem Asturias aduenit', p. 130.

⁶⁹ *Rot.*, p. 130; *Ad Seb.*, p. 131.

Visigothic bloodline either by ties of consanguinity or by marriage, and by underscoring the elective, lawful nature of the Asturian monarchy.⁷⁰ This raises the question of whether, in the chroniclers' minds, Visigothic ancestry alone was sufficient to claim royal legitimacy for the Asturian dynasty: was it also necessary to comply with Visigothic law in order to be considered a legitimate ruler?

It is hardly surprising that the narrative appropriation of legal discourse for the Asturian kingdom's political goals has received such scant critical attention: the task of approaching mediaeval law in the wake of the political disintegration of the Visigothic state presents significant challenges. Recent archaeological findings give us a mixed picture of local political and territorial organization in the northern Iberian Peninsula after the dismantling of the Visigothic state in the eighth century — a picture that cannot be easily reduced to either rupture or continuity.

Firstly, in the Duero basin, there appears to be evidence of both continuity and abandonment of settlements, as well as of the creation of new, unstable rural centres of power that begin to be brought into the orbit of the Asturian monarchy in the ninth century. In the Ebro Valley, such centres of power appeared to be operating on a still smaller scale. In Galicia, by contrast, no evidence of significant changes in settlement structure has been detected. Archaeological evidence of the founding of private churches and monasteries, controlled by families and small communes, and the reuse of Iron Age hill forts for territorial control by land-owning elites demonstrates that local communities remained vital.⁷¹ The post-711 northern Iberian political landscape was thus even more fragmented, unstable, and differentiated than during the Visigothic period.

⁷⁰ On the elective nature of the Visigothic monarchy, see Marie Regina Madden, *Political Theory and Law in Medieval Spain* (New York: Fordham University Press, 1930; repr. Clark, NJ: Lawbook Exchange, 2005).

⁷¹ Juan Antonio Quirós Castillo, 'Early Medieval Landscapes in North-West Spain: Local Powers and Communities, Fifth–Tenth Centuries', *EME*, 19 (2011), 285–311; Iñaki Martín Viso, 'Espacios sin Estado: los territorios occidentales entre el Duero y el Sistema Central (siglos VIII–IX)', in Iñaki Martín Viso, *¿Tiempos oscuros?: Territorio y sociedad en el centro de la Península Ibérica (siglos VII–X)* (Madrid: Silex, 2009), pp. 107–35. These studies draw on archaeological excavations to present a nuanced and complex picture that modifies the previous view of a complete Visigothic power vacuum in the Duero basin, which was put forth by José María Mínguez, 'Ruptura social e implantación del feudalismo en el noroeste peninsular (siglos VIII–IX)', *Studia historica. Historia medieval*, 3 (1985), 7–32. See also José Carlos Sánchez Pardo, 'Power and Rural Landscapes in Early Medieval Galicia (AD 400–900): Towards a Re-Incorporation of the Archaeology into the Historical Narrative', *EME*, 21 (2013), 140–68 (pp. 160–63).

Secondly, one must also deal with the lack of solid evidence that Visigothic laws had been widely accepted in the Iberian north even prior to the dissolution of the Visigothic state. Visigothic sources that document the rebellious nature of Asturians, Cantabrians, and the Basques make it apparent that pacification of those peoples had not yet been complete in the last years of the Visigothic kingdom.⁷² Likewise, very little is known about the status of law and legal practices in the Asturian kingdom, whose diplomatic, documentary, and historiographical sources remain scarce until the last third of the ninth century.⁷³ The earliest explicit mentions of the *Lex Wisigothorum* date back to the tenth and eleventh centuries, when the royal see moves from Oviedo to León.⁷⁴ The centres of power that emerged during the ninth and tenth centuries tended to use local laws and customs, which later became consolidated as *fueros*.⁷⁵ Because most Asturian royal charters are now widely believed to be early twelfth-century forgeries by Pelayo, bishop of Oviedo (d. 1153), disappointingly little can

⁷² See, for example, Joaquín Martínez Pizarro's discussion in his edition of the *Historia Wambae* in *The Story of Wamba: Julian of Toledo's Historia Wambae regis* (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press, 2005), pp. 125–30; on Visigothic military campaigns in Asturias and Cantabria, see Francisco Diego Santos, 'De la Asturias sueva y visigoda', *AM*, 3 (1979), 17–60 (pp. 25–29). See also Abilio Barbero, 'La integración social de los "hispani" del Pirineo oriental al reino carolingio', in *Conflictos y estructuras sociales en la Hispania antigua*, ed. by Antonio García Bellido and others (Madrid: Akal, 1986), pp. 151–66. Also of interest is the thesis put forward by Sánchez-Albornoz, who called the Spanish Basque country 'Spain without Romanization' as he linked the origins of Castile to the rebellious nature of the Basques in *Orígenes del reino de Pamplona*, p. 209.

⁷³ See Floriano Cumbreño, *Diplomática*; M. Lucas Alvarez, *El reino de León en la Alta Edad Media, VIII. La documentación real astur-leonesa (718–1072)* (León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación 'San Isidoro', CSIC–CECEL, 1995); Miguel Calleja Puerta, 'La Catedral de Oviedo como centro de conservación de documentos en la alta Edad Media', in *Estudos em homenagem ao Professor Doutor José Marques*, ed. by Maria Manuel Borges, 4 vols (Porto: Faculdade de Letras da Universidade do Porto, 2006), iv, 179–91.

⁷⁴ Roger Collins, "Sicut lex Gothorum continet": Law and Charters in Ninth- and Tenth-Century León and Catalonia, in Roger Collins, *Law, Culture, and Regionalism in Early Medieval Spain* (Hampshire: Ashgate, 1992), pp. 489–512; Roger Collins, *Caliphs and Kings*, pp. 66–67; Santos Manuel Coronas González, 'El orden constitutivo del reino de Asturias (718–910)', *AHDE*, 70 (2000), 9–36 (n. 32, pp. 23–24); Enrique Gacto Fernández, Juan Antonio Alejandro García, and José María García Marín, *El derecho histórico de los pueblos de España*, 3rd edn (Madrid: Facultad de Derecho, Servicio de Publicaciones, 1982), pp. 149–61 and 175–84; Isabel Alfonso, 'Judicial Rhetoric and Political Legitimation in Medieval León-Castile', in *Building Legitimacy*, pp. 51–88.

⁷⁵ Joaquín de Azcárraga Servet and José Manuel Pérez-Prendes y Muñoz-Arraco, *Lecciones de la historia del derecho español*, 3rd edn (Madrid: Ramón Areces, 1997), p. 153.

be gleaned about the patterns of power articulation between the Asturian central administration and local aristocracy. One thing that remains fairly certain, however, is that the reign of Alfonso III marks the concluding phase in the consolidation of a central political apparatus.⁷⁶

Thirdly, between the fall of the Visigothic kingdom in the early eighth century and the emergence of Asturian royal historiography in late ninth, both the concept and practice of law undergo a significant transformation that renders the practice of explicit referrals to specific laws obsolete. The body of law is no longer perceived as a collection of individual norms and procedures contained in specific codices but rather as a set of shared normative concepts that comprise the notion of 'equity, justice, and general peace' in the collective will of its subjects. Therefore, the practice of law is meant to represent the spirit, rather than the letter, of codified law.⁷⁷ It is the current consensus among legal historians that whenever early mediaeval Iberian sources refer to a *lex* or *ordo*, they may refer to customs practised in the spirit of canon and civil law, rather than to a rigid set of norms and procedures codified in specific manuscripts.⁷⁸

This change in the way the law is understood and applied throughout the early Middle Ages transforms the role of the monarchy with regard to its production and execution. The king, formerly a legislator, now becomes the custodian of the law, since the task of creating laws is considered complete. The kingdom of the Franks provides an illuminating example of this gradual transformation of the royal legislative capacity, since it was not affected by the apparent hiatus of power that occurred on the Iberian Peninsula. The *Lex Salica*, which dates back to the sixth century, was adopted by King Clothar (c. 497–561), and, in a manner similar to Visigothic laws, which governed both

⁷⁶ Collins, *Caliphs and Kings*, p. 52; Ruiz de la Peña, 'La cultura en la Corte Ovetense', p. 31.

⁷⁷ See de Azcárraga Servert and Pérez-Prendes Muñoz-Arraco, *Lecciones*, pp. 153–56; Enrique Álvarez Cora, 'La noción de la ley posgótica', *Historia, instituciones, documentos*, 22 (1995), 1–38 (p. 3). On the status of law in the early Middle Ages, see also Patrick Wormald, 'Lex Scripta and Verbum Regis: Legislation and Germanic Kingship, from Euric to Cnut', in Patrick Wormald, *Legal Culture in the Early Medieval West. Laws as Text, Image and Experience* (London: The Hambledon Press, 1999), pp. 1–43; Coronas González, 'El orden constitutivo', p. 23.

⁷⁸ As Patrick Wormald reminds us, 'in the parts of Europe where both instructions on, and manuscripts of, the law are rare, there is scarcely a trace of the use of written law in actual cases. [...] What mattered in the promulgation and enforcement of law remained the word, whether of the king, his wise men, the judges or the local legal experts. The use of writing [...] continued to belong [...] to the margins of the administration of justice.' Wormald, 'Lex Scripta', pp. 22–23. See also Auguste Dumas, 'La parole et l'écriture dans les capitulaires carolingiens', in *Mélanges d'histoire du Moyen Âge dédiés à la mémoire de Louis Halphen*, pp. 209–16.

the Visigothic and Roman populations, applied to both Romans and Franks. It had been used continuously by the Merovingian and Carolingian Franks. Following emendations made to the law by Childebert II (r. 575–95), Pippin (r. 751–68), and Charlemagne, gradually the monarch becomes a participant in the tripartite power balance between the monarchy, the aristocracy, and the Church. In accordance with tradition, toward the ninth century, Carolingian royal capacity to govern derives from the king's will to comply with the spirit, if not the letter, of the law as recognized by the other two social groups. From 843 onward, Charles the Bald reaffirms the obligation of the citizenry to conserve the laws of their ancestors. In 860, the king orders to conserve the laws of his ancestors as well as his own, and his capitularies issued in 864 and 869 reiterate the affirmation that the conduct of the king and those in the power circle must comply necessarily with law and order. This conservative function of the law in the kingdom of the Franks, as well as the association of royalty with justice, is attributed to the Carolingian desire to justify the seizure of the throne in 751 and underscore continuity with the Merovingian tradition in which, according to the sixth-century legislation by Clothar I, royal authority obtained in violation of the law was declared null.⁷⁹

It is from this late ninth-century legal perspective that we must examine the legendary claim made by the *Chronica Albeldensia* about the restoration of Visigothic order in Asturias. This optic is particularly useful for our understanding of the words 'tam in ecclesia quam palatio', for it leads to an altogether different interpretation of the meaning of *Gothorum ordinem*, which has traditionally been understood as referring to a direct transfer of the Visigothic legal apparatus in its fossilized form to the Asturian kingdom, an allegedly natural consequence of the Asturian kings' blood ties with Visigothic monarchy.⁸⁰ What the chronicle may, in fact, be referring to are the two key components of the Visigothic legislative order itself, canon law ('in ecclesia') and political law ('palatio'), whose complementary nature is underscored by the syntactic

⁷⁹ Yves Sassier, 'Le roi et la loi chez les penseurs du royaume occidental du deuxième quart du ix^e à la fin du xi^e s.', *CCM*, 43 (2000), 257–73 (pp. 264–65); Paul Fouracre, 'Conflict, Power, and Legitimation in the Late Seventh and Eighth Centuries', in *Building Legitimacy*, ed. by Alfonso, Kennedy, and Escalona, pp. 3–26 (p. 5).

⁸⁰ See, for example, Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *La epopeya castellana a través de la literatura española* (Buenos Aires-México: Espasa-Calpe Argentina, 1946), pp. 43–44; Sánchez-Albornoz, *El reino Astur-Leonés (722 a 1037): Sociedad, economía, gobierno, cultura y vida*, in *Historia de España fundada por Ramón Menéndez Pidal*, dir. by José María Jover Zamora (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1980), VII, Chapter 5, pp. 341–586. Deswarte's *De la destruction a la restauration* is among the latest studies that promote this view.

construction ‘tam [...] quam [...]’.⁸¹ Both branches of the law are summarized in the *Lex Wisigothorum* (654), a collection that brings together the civil law recorded in *Liber Iudiciorum* (later known as the *Forum Iudicum* or *Fuero juzgo*), and the canon and political laws. The latter is codified in the first title of the *Lex* (Titulus Primus, ‘De electione principium’), which was promulgated by King Sisenand (r. 631–36) under the auspices of Isidore of Seville at the Fourth Council of Toledo in 633. Such a fusion of the two branches of law during the Visigothic period reflected the royal imperative to articulate central power over the fragmented political periphery, which, since it was governed by local aristocracy, required the ideological support of the Church.⁸² After the fall of the Visigothic kingdom, manuscripts of the civil and canon law are transmitted as separate textual traditions, and for the first time the two branches unite in the *Codex Vigilanus* and its ‘mirror codex’, a nearly identical collection known as the *Codex Emilianensis* composed in 992. The simultaneous transmission of canon law (*Liber Canonum*, or *Hispana*, fols 20–238) and civil law (*Liber Iudiciorum*, fols 358^v–427), unique to the *Codex Vigilanus*, is attributed to the desire of Sancho Garcés I of Pamplona to fashion the Navarrese dynasty on the Asturian kingdom after a successful territorial expansion jointly undertaken by the Navarrese and Asturians in the first quarter of the tenth century.⁸³

⁸¹ ‘Es probable que este viejo orden eclesial y palatino se inspirase en la tradición del *Liber Iudiciorum* y de la *Hispana*, conocida en la época más por referencias genéricas a los *Decreta Legum* y a la *Lex Canonica*’, Coronas González, ‘El orden constitutivo’, pp. 22–23. In the Visigothic kingdom, *Palatium*, or *Aula Regia*, was formed by all members of the *Officium Palatinum*, a central organism charged with the administration of the kingdom. It consisted of various sections, each headed by a *comitus*, a noble trusted by the king, and included representatives of the nobility and the Church. The *Palatium* had a consultative function as it was charged with discussing the most important matters of the kingdom as well as electing new kings. Ricardo Izquierdo Benito, ‘Toledo en época visigoda’, in *Toledo y Bizancio*, coord. by Miguel Cortés Arrese (Cuenca: Ediciones de la Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha, 2002), pp. 43–74 (pp. 53–54). See also Esther Peña Bocos and José Angel García de Cortázar y Ruiz de Aguirre, ‘El “palatium”, símbolo y centro de poder, en los reinos de Navarra y Castilla en los siglos X a XII’, *Mayurqa: revista del Departament de Ciències Històriques i Teoria de les Arts*, 22.1 (1989), 281–96.

⁸² Castellanos and Martín Viso, ‘The Local Articulation’, pp. 14–19 and 28. This pattern of power articulation is also discussed in Sánchez Pardo, ‘Power and Rural Landscapes’, p. 160.

⁸³ See García Turza, ‘El monasterio de San Martín de Albelda. Introducción histórica’, in *El Códice Albeldense*, pp. 9–27 (p. 11); Manuel C. Díaz y Díaz, ‘Escritores del monasterio de Albelda: Vigilán y Sarracino’, in *El Códice Albeldense*, pp. 73–133 (pp. 88 and 130). According to Díaz y Díaz, the *Chronica Albeldensia* was included in Vigilán’s codex as the earliest text that mentions the revival of the *ordo Gothorum* in Asturias (p. 131).

We do not, however, have similarly compelling evidence of the simultaneous textual transmission of the two branches of Visigothic law in Asturias in any period of its history.

Nevertheless, it is during the reign of Alfonso II, when the foundation of the royal see and the diocese took place in Oviedo, that traces of the circulation of the *Lex* reappear in Asturias. The Asturian evidence includes one donation of the *Liber Iudiciorum*, which, according to a document copied in Celanova in 889, was made to the Church of San Salvador of Eiras upon its restoration.⁸⁴ In addition, a legal fragment consisting of two folios (the so-called Porto fragment, named after its location at the Municipal Library of Porto) has been traced to Zaragoza.⁸⁵ References to canon law can be found in two codices. The Visigothic *Codex Ovetensis*, a miscellany of texts dated between the seventh and ninth centuries, contains a reference to the *Liber Canonum* in a book inventory dated 882 ('sub era DCCCCXX').⁸⁶ An offering of an unspecified collection of canons referred to as 'canonum unum' by Alfonso III to San Salvador of Oviedo in 908 is mentioned in another book inventory, however the royal charter in which it is contained is, according to one opinion, a twelfth-century forgery that describes an inventory of books at the library of the Cathedral of Oviedo.⁸⁷

This paucity of evidence is in stark contrast with at least nine ninth-century manuscripts written in Visigothic letters that originate from the Hispanic March, with the most ancient witness dating back prior to 828, and another four dating back to the mid-ninth century.⁸⁸ The first explicit references to court testimonies (*placita*) date as far back as 836.⁸⁹ The great majority of documents from the Hispanic March is comprised of testaments and acts of sales, exchanges, and donations. Not only are citations of the law in these documents

⁸⁴ Manuel C. Díaz y Díaz, 'La Lex Visigothorum y sus manuscritos. Un ensayo de reinterpretación', *AHDE*, 46 (1976), 163–223 (p. 178).

⁸⁵ Yolanda García López, *Estudios críticos y literarios de la 'Lex Wisigothorum'* (Alcalá: Universidad de Alcalá, 1996), p. 36.

⁸⁶ Real Biblioteca de El Escorial, MS R.II.18. This codex was discovered by Ambrosio de Morales at the Cathedral of Oviedo in 1572. See Carlos Benjamín Pereira Mira, 'Éxodo librario en la biblioteca capitular de Oviedo: el *Codex miscellaneus ovetensis* (manuscrito escorialense R.II.18)', *Territorio, Sociedad y Poder*, 1 (2006), 263–78.

⁸⁷ Gregorio de Andrés, 'Los códices visigóticos de la catedral de Oviedo', *Cuadernos bibliográficos*, 31 (1974), 1–29 (p. 7). See also Ruiz de la Peña, 'La cultura en la Corte Ovetense', p. 30.

⁸⁸ García López, *Estudios críticos*, p. 35. Another source cites two references before 900 and ten before 950 (Michel Zimmermann, 'L'usage du droit wisigothique en Catalogne', pp. 241–44).

⁸⁹ Kienast, 'La pervivencia del derecho godo', p. 266.

extraordinarily specific, as they often contain the entire wording of the law with references to the book, title, and chapter of the law they utilize, but sometimes several laws are listed in support of an argument.⁹⁰ References to Visigothic law peak in the eleventh century and gradually decline until it is officially abolished by Jaume I in 1251 in favour of the *Usatges*. The quantity and quality of extant Asturian material is thus far inferior to ninth- and early tenth-century evidence from Gothic Septimania and the Hispanic March, where references to *Lex Gotia*, *Leges Goticae*, *Lex Gothorum*, *Leges Gothorum*, *Liber Iudicum*, *Liber/Lex Iudicialis* are both abundant and precise.

Significantly, however, among the manuscripts of the *Lex* that circulated in Asturias and the Hispanic March, the ‘Titulus Primus’, which summarizes Visigothic political law, has been found only in manuscripts of Asturian, Leonese, and Galician provenance, although its earliest extant copies date back to the tenth century.⁹¹ This feature of the manuscripts originating west of the Pyrenees is unique, for, as Yolanda García López notes, it transforms the nature of the *Lex* from a procedural law, in which political law only tangentially affects judicial decisions, into a constitutional code of the kingdom.⁹² One certainly cannot retroactively apply this configuration of the law to ninth-century Asturias, nor does this modest body of evidence warrant an assertion that Asturian chroniclers composed their texts with an eye on a specific codex of the *Lex*. What is patently obvious, however, is that royal biographies in the Asturian chronicles are structured and styled to reflect a set of legal norms, codified in the *Lex*, that define the scope of royal power and its political and doctrinal challenges — rebellions of the elites, lack of civil concord among the kingdom’s constituents, and the proliferation of heresies. This is done with the aim of casting the Asturian kings as exemplary law keepers who uphold the tradition of their Visigothic ancestors.

Nowhere is this more evident than in the treatment of the concept of peace, a key category in Visigothic political law. Peace, as it was formulated in the law ‘De eleccione principium’ of the ‘Titulus Primus’, was understood in the Visigothic kingdom as civil concord between the king and his subjects, which guaranteed the permanence of the empire vis-à-vis its adversarial realm. This law draws a contrast between peoples of the Visigothic kingdom and their

⁹⁰ Based on this evidence, Zimmerman goes as far as to characterize Catalonia as a ‘society passionate by law and legalism’ (‘L’usage’, pp. 236–39).

⁹¹ Manuel C. Díaz y Díaz, ‘La Lex Visigothorum y sus manuscritos’, pp. 178, 185, 218–21; García López, *Estudios críticos*, pp. 129 and 142.

⁹² García López, *Estudios críticos*, p. 145.

external enemies, who are viewed as threats to the survival of the monarchy. The unity of *gens Gothorum*, *patria*, or *regnum* is thus juxtaposed with the diversity of *populi*, *provinciae*, and adversarial *gentes*.⁹³ Likewise, the *Liber Iudiciorum* contrasts the *ciues* and *populi*, who are the king's subjects and participants in the social contract with the monarchy, with *alieni* or *hostes*, enemies and inhabitants of surrounding lands who are neither subject to the king nor bound to him by civic obligation.⁹⁴ This is consistent with Isidore's contrast, drawn in the *Etymologies*, between *populus* and *gens/uulgus* based on inclusion in vs exclusion from the realm of law: if the former is considered to be a community defined by its use of laws ('*populus est humanae multitudinis, iuris consensu et concordia communione sociatus*'),⁹⁵ *gens* is an ethnonym defined by place of origin ('*multitudo ab uno principio orta, siue ab alia natione secundum propriam collectionem distincta, ut Graeciae, Asiae*'), while *uulgus* describes a community of people defined by its dwelling place ('*inhabitans multitudo, quasi quisque quo uult*').⁹⁶

The Visigothic vision of peace had its foundation in Roman laws, which were incorporated by the Visigoths into *Lex Wisigothorum* prior to the seventh century (these portions of the legislation are marked as 'Antiqua' in the Recceswinthan codex).⁹⁷ But unlike the *pax Romana*, wherein the pacification

⁹³ Ruiz de la Peña Solar offers a twofold interpretation of the concept of *regnum* in Asturias: (1) *regia potestas*, or the royal power, and (2) the geographical space to which it extends. *Patria* then refers to the physical location of the community of the royal subjects ('La realeza asturiana', p. 187).

⁹⁴ Title II, Book XII, p. 75. Citations follow *Los Códigos españoles concordados y anotados*, ed. by Joaquín Francisco Pacheco and Fermín de la Puente y Apezchea, 12 vols (Madrid: Rivadeneyra, 1847–51), I (1847), p. 75. Cf. VII Council of Toledo (AD 646, cl. I), and XIV Council of Toledo (AD 684, cl. II), in *Concilios visigóticos e hispano-romanos*, ed. by José Vives, Tomás Martín Martínez, and Gonzalo Martínez Díez (Barcelona-Madrid: CSIC, 1963), pp. 249 and 442.

⁹⁵ Isidore of Seville, *Etymologiae*, in *Etimologías: Edición bilingüe*, ed. and trans. by José Oroz Reta and Manuel-A. Marcos Casquero, 3rd edn, 2 vols (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2000), I, IX, 45, p. 776.

⁹⁶ Isidore, *Etymologiae*, I, IX, 2, 1, p. 742 and IX, 4, 6, p. 776.

⁹⁷ Especially the *Codex Theodosianus*, summarized by Isidore in *Etymologies*, and the *Lex Romana* by Alaric II, which dates back to AD 506. The Roman influence on Visigothic legislation has been studied by José Orlandis, 'Huellas visigóticas en el derecho de la Alta Edad Media', *AHDE*, 15 (1944), 644–58; Karl Zeumer, *Historia de la legislación visigoda* (Barcelona: Universidad de Barcelona, 1944); Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, 'Pervivencia y crisis de la tradición jurídica romana en la España goda', *Il passaggio dall'antichità al medioevo in Occidente. 6–12 aprile 1961*, Settimane, 9 (Spoleto, 1962), pp. 128–99.

of external peoples guaranteed the eternal imperial order, the *pax Visigothica* rested on the social contract between the monarchy and its subjects. *Lex Wisigothorum* signals that civil concord between the peoples of the kingdom is the necessary condition for the king's capacity to fulfil his duty of protecting his subjects from external enemies:

(1) Si salutare caput extiterit, rationem colligit qualiter curari membra caetera possint. Nam si arcem molestia occupaverit capitis, non poterit in artus dirivationes dare salutis, quas in se consumpserit iugis causa languoris. Ordinanda ergo sunt primum negotia principum, tutanda salus, defendenda vita, sicque in statu et negotiis plebium ordinatio dirigenda, ut dum salus competens prospicitur regum, fida valentius teneatur salvatio populorum.⁹⁸

(If the head is healthy it is able to heal all the other members; but if the head were ill, it would not be able to give health to the other members, since it would not have it in itself. Therefore, we must first take care of the affairs of our princes, because they are our heads, and to defend their lives, and their health, and thereafter to arrange the affairs of the people, because while the king is healthy, he is able to better defend his people.)

(2) Dum unitatis concordia a nobis retinetur, nullum patriae gentisque discidium per vim atque ambitum oriatur.⁹⁹

(While they remain of one will and act in concord, no harm will come to the people, or to the land, by force or by power.)

(3) [Princeps] externam perliminet litem unde suorum internam possederit pacem. Sicut ergo modestia principum temperantia est legum, ita quoque concordia civium victoria est hostium.¹⁰⁰

(And therefore [the king] destroys external enemies, in order to have his own people in peace. For just as from the moderation of the princes laws are born, victories over the enemies are born from the peace among peoples.)

Apart from being understood as the civil concord between the king and his subjects that enabled the monarch to defeat external enemies of the kingdom, peace in Visigothic political thought had a second, transcendental dimension:

⁹⁸ *Liber Iudiciorum*, Book II, Title I, Law IV, *Códigos españoles*, p. 3.

⁹⁹ *De electione Principum*, Law IX, *Códigos españoles*, p. 80.

¹⁰⁰ *De electione Principum*, Law III, *Códigos españoles*, p. 78. Cf. IV Council of Toledo (AD 633, cl. LXXV); V Council of Toledo (AD 636, cls II–VII); VI Council of Toledo (AD 638, cls XII–XVIII), in *Concilios visigóticos*, ed. by Vives and others, pp. 219–21, 227–30, and 241–45.

in Law I.III of 'De electione principum' as put forth by the Fourth Council of Toledo, it served as the foundation for the kingdom's eternal permanence, termed 'celestial peace'. Visigothic law thus charted the course for political peace leading to eternal peace.

The revival of this concept of peace in Asturias is retroactively confirmed by Sampiro (d. 1041), notary to King of León Bermudo II (r. 984–99). A continuator of Asturian historiographic tradition, Sampiro composed his chronicle in the first third of the eleventh century, covering the years 866–982. Sampiro alludes to certain Mozarabic prelates who, having fled the Muslim-occupied south, reinvigorated Visigothic *canones* through the celebration of a new council in the absence of a legitimate royal government in Asturias. According to Sampiro, the council attempted to legitimize the resistance to Muslims in the spirit of canon law, in which the civil concord between the citizens is considered the precondition of victory over enemies:

Nam Dominis et Saluator noster ad fidelium refugium, et sue ecclesie firmamentum, eam firmissimum erexit, in qua si omnis caritatis uinculo uincti fuerimus, ipso auxiliante, aduersariis nostris resistere, camposque defendere, ex quibus intus uictum poterimus habere. Scriptum quippe est: Ciuium concordia in hostes est uictoria.¹⁰¹

(Our Lord and Saviour raised for the refuge of the faithful the firmament of His Church, in which, if we are united with ties of charity, with Lord's help we will be able to resist our adversaries and defend our lands, and which will enable us to have victory from within. For indeed it is written: concord among citizens defeats enemies.)

Sampiro's testimony is the only notice of this event, which probably took place in the first third of the ninth century under the patronage of Alfonso II, and indicates that this king could have sought ecclesiastical support for the re-establishment of the *ordo Gothorum*.

This is precisely the model of power that the Alfonsine *Testamentum* illustrates. In the *exordium*, Alfonso attributes the rupture of political power on the Iberian Peninsula to the supreme arrogance of the last Visigothic king, Rodrigo (d. 711). Rodrigo's defeat by Muslim troops is interpreted as the re-establishment of the divine order of justice: 'merito enim arabico sustinuit gladium' ('he was justly defeated militarily by the Arabs'). By contrast, Alfonso proclaims himself as an exemplary keeper of such order through the use of laws: 'Tu es

¹⁰¹ Sampiro, *Chronicle*, p. 301. Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada mentions this council in the *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, iv. 20, p. 186.

rex regum regens celestia simulque terrestria, diligens in temporaliter iustitiam, temporaliter uero terrarum populis pro optinenda iustitia distribuis reges, leges atque iudicia' ('You are the king of kings, who rules in the celestial and terrestrial realms, and who, working for justice in the temporary world, bestows kings, laws, and sentences so that there is justice for the people on earth').¹⁰² We also find a similarly informed allusion to the law in the treatment of Pelagius, who 'won over the enemy and defended the Christian and Asturian people with a sublime victory' ('hostes percusit et christianorum asturumque gentem victor sublimando defendit').¹⁰³

In the Asturian chronicles, the notion of peace not only defines royal power, but also guides the selection of events and organization of the text. The *Albeldensia* applies to Alfonso III the title *gloriosus*, the same title that honoured lawmaking kings who promulgated new portions of legislature in the *Lex* (for example, 'Flavius gloriosus Egica Rex').¹⁰⁴ At the time of enactment of the *Lex*, this attribute alluded to the phrase 'victorious against enemies', in accordance with Isidore's etymology: 'gloriosus a laurea dictus quae datur victoribus' ('we speak of *gloriosus* when we refer to the laurel that is given to victors').¹⁰⁵ The *Chronicle of Alfonso III* applies this title twice, first to King Wamba (r. 672–80) on the occasion of his victory over the rebel duke Paulus in Gaul, and later when it summarizes Alfonso II's vital trajectory, attesting that he led a glorious life ('Adefonsus rex [...] gloriosam, castam, pudicam, sobriam atque immaculatam uitam duxit').¹⁰⁶ Of the three terms that collectively refer to a group of citizens — *gens*, *uulgus*, and *populus* (*ciues*) — the last is reserved to refer uniquely to the king's subjects as participants in the Asturian kingdom's civil concord. For example, in its account of the beginning of Alfonso I's reign, *The Chronicle of Alfonso III* attests to the legality of his reign: 'ab uniuerso populo Adefonsus elegitur in regno' ('he was elected king by the entire people').¹⁰⁷

¹⁰² Floriano Cumbreño, *Diplomática*, I, 118–30. On the strategy of legitimization of power in this text, see Martin, 'La chute', p. 218.

¹⁰³ Floriano Cumbreño, *Diplomática*, I, 120.

¹⁰⁴ *Liber Iudiciorum*, xiv. 12. On the alternate usage of titles *rex* and *princeps* in Asturian inscriptions and diplomas, with the predominant use of the former in the *Chronica Albeldensia*, see de la Peña Solar, 'La realeza asturiana', pp. 177–80. On the use of royal titles *gloriosus* and *gloriosissimus* in Asturian documents dated in 883, see Pedro Floriano Llorente, 'Los documentos reales del período astur. Su formulario', in *AM*, 1 (1972), 157–76 (p. 161).

¹⁰⁵ Isidore, *Etymologiae*, I, x. 134, pp. 820–21.

¹⁰⁶ *Chronicle of Alfonso III, Ad Seb.*, p. 115 ('gloriosi Uuambani regis'); *Rot.*, p. 142.

¹⁰⁷ *Rot.*, p. 130.

Likewise, the chronicler underscores that civil concord between the king and his subjects characterized the reign of Ordoño I: 'dilectus fuit a populus' ('he was beloved by his people').¹⁰⁸ The *Albeldensia* underscores the transcendental nature of peace during the reign of Alfonso III by linking the terrestrial and celestial realms: 'pie regat populorum, ut post longum principalis imperium de regno terre ad regnum transeat celi'.¹⁰⁹

On the other hand, the surrounding ethnicities that represented alternative centres of power — Galicians, Basques, and Arabs — are referred to either by their ethnonyms alone or as *gens/gentes* (for example, 'gens Sarracenorum').¹¹⁰ The term *gens* is also projected onto the Visigothic past, where it is used to designate the subjects of the defunct Visigothic monarchy. We encounter it with reference to the Visigoths in the famous scene of the Battle of Covadonga in both redactions of the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*. When challenged by Oppa, formerly a Catholic bishop allied to the Arabs, Pelagius, hopeful that Visigothic rule will be restored, refers to the Visigoths as *gens*, rather than *populus*:

Pelagius dixit: 'Spes nostra Christus est quod per istum modicum monticulum quem conspicias sit Spanie salus et Gotorum gentis exercitus reparatus.' (*Rot.*) / 'Confidimus enim in Domini misericordia quod ab isto modico monticulo quem conspicias sit Yspanie salus et Gotorum gentis exercitus reparatus.' (*Ad Seb.*)¹¹¹

(Pelagius said: 'We trust in the mercy of Christ / divine mercy that from this small mountain that you see the well-being of Spain and the army of the Visigoths will be restored'.)

In *Ad Sebastianum*, Pelagius also expresses his confidence in the restoration of the 'Church, people, and kingdom' ('eius [Domini] misericordiam recuperatione ecclesie seu gentis et regni expectamus').¹¹²

Thus, there appears to be a clear separation between the Visigoths, a people of the past, and the Asturians, who, while remaining connected to the Visigoths by ties of consanguinity and by the use of their laws, form a new polity. Such a scope of the term *populus* strongly resembles its use across the Pyrenees, where, as Helmut Reimitz asserts with reference to the *Histories* of Gregory of Tours, a foundational historiographical text of the Merovingian era (c. 594), the con-

¹⁰⁸ *Rot.*, p. 148; *Ad Seb.*, p. 149.

¹⁰⁹ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 178.

¹¹⁰ *Ad Seb.*, p. 121.

¹¹¹ *Rot.*, p. 126/ *Ad Seb.*, p. 127.

¹¹² *Ad Seb.*, p. 127.

tent of the term was intentionally left vaguely defined and open, as *populus* was meant to be constituted with different ethnic groups who would swear allegiance to royal authority in the course of Frankish expansion.¹¹³ Throughout the eighth and ninth centuries, during the transmission of the *Histories* by the Merovingians and the Carolingians, Reimitz argues, the identities of the Franks continued to be redefined and renegotiated, with different versions of the text attributing varying degrees of importance to Christian and ethnic aspects of the kingdom's origin and character.¹¹⁴ Given that the Asturian royal historiography reflects the period of military and political growth, this would have been a convenient model under which the different *gentes* could become royal subjects. Indeed, with reference to Asturian north-western expansion, we can encounter passages in which an ethnic group is referred to as *populus* after it becomes subjected to the king's rule by military action, for instance, '[Silo] populos Gallecie contra se rebellantes [...] bello superabit et suo imperio subiugabit' ('Silo defeated in war and subjected to his rule the peoples of Galicia, who had rebelled against him').¹¹⁵ The use of the term *populus* in Asturias also remains consistent with the Visigothic political law, which, as we have already seen, defines *populus* as a participant in the social contract with the ruler, as opposed to *gens*, a term designating ethnicity.

Lawful Narratives

In the portions of the two chronicles dedicated to Visigothic and Asturian affairs, the figure of a king organizes the narrative chronologically, while the categories of war and peace organize the narrative structurally. Because in the chroniclers' minds neither the purity of lineage nor compliance with the law alone was sufficient for the eternal survival of the kingdom, they provide much more detailed biographies of the kings who comply with both conditions and tend to omit details when describing those kings whose lineage or law-keeping practices are deemed tainted. Therefore, the chroniclers present Asturian rulers as legitimate successors of Iberian Visigothic royals both by the purity of their

¹¹³ Helmut Reimitz, 'The Providential Past: Visions of Frankish Identity in the Early Medieval History of Gregory of Tours' *Historiae* (sixth–ninth century)', in *Visions of Community in the Post-Roman World: The West, Byzantium and the Islamic World, 300–1100*, ed. by Walter Pohl, Clemens Gantner, and Richard Payne (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 109–135 (p. 117).

¹¹⁴ Reimitz, 'The Providential Past', p. 133.

¹¹⁵ *Ad Seb.*, p. 137.

lineage and by virtue of their exemplary law-keeping practices. A typical royal biography contains all or some of the following three elements:

1. The chronicle mentions whether the king obtained power peacefully and in concord with his people.
2. The chronicle proceeds to enumerate the king's peaceful and military deeds.
3. The former include the king's ability to keep civil concord and the construction of civil works and sanctuaries, while the latter comprise suppressions of internal rebellions and external invasions. The chronicle mentions whether these activities culminated in peace treaties or subjugation of the vanquished. Unlike their Mozarabic counterparts, who attribute supreme cruelty to the invading Arab troops, Asturian chroniclers justify and praise their own harsh actions in suppressing military threats whenever such acts are committed in the name of peace.
4. The chronicle ends the biography with a notice of whether the king's terrestrial reign transcended into eternity, that is, whether the guarantor of political peace earned eternal peace upon death.

In this fashion, the description of every king, including those of Visigothic kings, is checked against the ninth-century notion of the royal figure as a guarantor of peace and custodian of the law, with the aim of presenting Asturian kings as the true keepers of the *Lex Wisigothorum*.

We will now turn to consider how this narrative framework was used to justify the loss of Spain to the Arabs by the unlawful conduct of the last Visigothic kings, Rodrigo and Witiza. The accusations levelled against both kings are primarily of a legal nature. According to the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, Witiza and Rodrigo did not fulfil their duty of being good law keepers for the Visigothic people, which resulted in their loss of the kingdom: 'Et quia [Gothi] derelinquerunt Dominum ne seruirent ei in iustitia et ueritatem, derelicti sunt a Domino' ('And because [the Visigoths] abandoned God and did not serve him in justice and truth, they were abandoned by God').¹¹⁶ The loss of Spain is blamed on Witiza's violation of the laws: he abolished the legislative assembly of the Visigothic kingdom and repealed the laws in order to avoid their application to himself: 'concilia dissoluit, canones siggillauit, huxores et concubinas

¹¹⁶ *Rot.*, p. 120.

plurimas accepit et, ne aduersus eum concilium fieret, episcopis, presbiteris seu diaconibus huxores abere precepit' ('he disbanded the councils, repealed the canon laws, took on multiple wives and concubines, and instructed bishops, presbyters, and deacons to have wives so that they would not hold a council against him').¹¹⁷ Although the reigns of Rodrigo and Witiza occurred during the eighth century, when laws were still being created, the chronicle evaluates their royal conduct from a ninth-century legal perspective, according to which a king must be a good keeper of the law established by his ancestors. Correspondingly, both chronicles associate the creation of the Asturian kingdom with the re-establishment of peace. According to the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, this took place during the reign of Pelagius, who created the political foundation of the kingdom. The chronicle also states that Pelagius's death occurred from natural causes, unlike that of the last Visigothic king Rodrigo.¹¹⁸

In describing Pelagius's successors, who ruled the Asturian kingdom following the brief reign of Fáfila (737–39), both chroniclers draw a clear distinction between (1) the kings of untainted lineage, who obtained power through legitimate succession and fulfilled their mandate as outlined in *Lex Wisigothorum* and (2) those kings who did not comply with one or more of these conditions. The first group includes Alfonso I (r. 739–47), Aurelio (r. 768–74), Bermudo I (r. 789–91), Alfonso II (r. 791–842), and Ordoño I (r. 850–66). Alfonso I, Pelagius's son-in-law by marriage with his daughter Hermesinda, undertook the kingdom's expansion to the Duero River by conquest and resettlement. The *Chronica Albeldensia* underscores the civil concord during his reign by stating that he was loved by God and the people: 'Deus atque hominis amauili extitit'.¹¹⁹ The *Chronicle of Alfonso III* attributes the king a peaceful demise ('uitam feliciter in pace finiuit'). The connection between this king's earthly and celestial government is evidenced by a miracle that occurs on the night following his passing. The palace guardians charged with holding a wake over his body hear the chant of angels in which the deceased king is proclaimed to have been a just one and deserving of an eternal reign: 'Ecce quomodo tollitur iustus [...]. A facie iniquitatis sublatus est iustus; erit in pace sepultura eius' ('Here is how the just one is taken away [...]. He is lifted off from the face of iniquity; may he rest in peace').¹²⁰

¹¹⁷ *Rot.*, pp. 118 and 120; *Ad Seb.*, pp. 119 and 121.

¹¹⁸ *Rot.*, p. 130; *Ad Seb.*, p. 131.

¹¹⁹ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 173.

¹²⁰ *Rot.*, p. 133; *Ad Seb.*, p. 134.

Fruela I's cousin and successor Aurelio suppressed a rebellion by the kingdom's slaves and kept peace with peninsular Muslims. According to both chronicles, because he kept peace in the kingdom during his lifetime, in peace he rests.¹²¹ Fruela's son Bermudo I restored the legitimate order of succession by passing the throne to Alfonso II. The *Chronica Albeldensia* contains a short notice thereof, while the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* underscores Bermudo's obedience to the duty of deanship with which he had been invested prior to his ascension to the throne. The latter chronicle underscores the legitimacy of Bermudo's reign and his willingness to comply with the letter of the law. Consequently, he, too, is said to have died in peace.¹²²

The reign of Alfonso II is associated with Asturian revival. In accordance with Visigothic ritual, Alfonso is anointed king and establishes the royal court in Oviedo.¹²³ The *Chronicle of Alfonso III* provides testimony of his efforts to consolidate power over local elites, who are exemplified in the figure of Maḥamud. This *mūwallad* from Mérida ('ciues emeritensis natione mollitis'), having rebelled against the emir, becomes a client of Alfonso and settles in Galicia, but eventually arms a rebellion against him. The rebellion is described in terms of an attack on the unity of the kingdom ('contra regem uel patriam'),¹²⁴ which calls for the re-establishment of peace ('Adefonsus uictor reuersus est in pace Oueto').¹²⁵ The *Chronicle of Alfonso III* enumerates Alfonsine victories over Muslims in Asturias and Galicia, and concludes the biography with a notice of this king's passage from the terrestrial kingdom to the celestial one.¹²⁶ The *Chronica Albeldensia* links the temporal and transcendental dimensions of peace directly as it concludes Alfonso's biography: 'Qui cuncta pace egit, in pace quieuit' ('He, who always acted peacefully, passed away in peace').¹²⁷

This first group of royal law keepers also includes King Ordoño I, who had passed away by the time the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* was composed but was still ruling Asturias during the composition of the *Chronica Albeldensia*. Ordoño

¹²¹ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 174; *Ad Seb.*, p. 137.

¹²² *Ad Seb.*, p. 139.

¹²³ *Rot.*, p. 140.

¹²⁴ *Rot.*, p. 138.

¹²⁵ *Ad Seb.*, p. 139.

¹²⁶ *Rot.*, p. 177; *Ad Seb.*, p. 178. See Víctor M. Aguirre, 'La guerra entre el emirato y el reino de Asturias durante el reinado de Alfonso II (791–842)', *Boletín de Letras del Real Instituto de Estudios Asturianos*, 173–74 (2009), 181–256.

¹²⁷ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 175.

undertook the reconquest and resettlement of Leonese lands, suppressed a Basque rebellion, and expanded the kingdom to the Guadiana River basin, staving off multiple Muslim incursions. The *Chronicle of Alfonso III* underscores the civil concord between the king and his subjects and attributes transcendental meaning to his death: 'qui hic nimium dilectus fuit a populis, nunc autem letatur cun sanctis angelis in celestibus regnis' ('he who was much loved by his people now is rejoicing with the holy angels in celestial kingdoms').¹²⁸ Similarly, in the portion composed during the reign of Ordoño, the *Albeldensia* expresses hope that the king will attain the celestial kingdom following a long reign on earth ('ut post longum principalis imperium de regno terre ad regnum transeat caeli').¹²⁹

In contrast to this group of kings, comprised of just rulers who attained celestial peace by virtue of maintaining political peace in the kingdom, the sovereigns in the second group receive a much different treatment. According to the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, Alfonso I's son Fruela I (r. 757–68) staves off the kingdom's external threats when he defeats Muslim troops in Pontoibo and suppresses a rebellion of the Basques. He also undertakes legislative activity by reinstating celibacy among bishops for the first time since Witiza.¹³⁰ Yet according to the chronicle, Fruela's death does not transcend — perhaps because he commits fratricide. The *Albeldensia* concurs with this view by suggesting that Fruela's death could have been violent given the king's ferocious character.¹³¹ Aurelio's successor Silo (r. 774–83), who established his court in Pravia, keeps peace with the Muslims and suppresses a rebellion in Galicia, thereafter subjecting the rebel people to his rule. But the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* underscores that Silo was not of Visigothic lineage (he ascended to the throne by virtue of marrying Adosinda, daughter of the legitimate king Alfonso I) and so does not attribute transcendental meaning to his death. The *Albeldensia* attributes the fragile political equilibrium during Silo's reign to the king's mother ('cum Spania ob causam matris pacem habuit'); however, the precise nature of her intervention remains unknown.¹³² Following Silo's death, the legitimate succession is interrupted by Maurecatus (r. 783–89), the son of a female slave, who usurps the throne from the future King Alfonso II. While the *Chronicle of*

¹²⁸ *Rot.*, p. 148; *Ad Seb.*, p. 149.

¹²⁹ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 178.

¹³⁰ *Rot.*, p. 134; *Ad Seb.*, p. 135.

¹³¹ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 174.

¹³² *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 174.

Alfonso III gives detailed proof of the illegitimacy of his reign, the *Albeldensia* contains only a brief notice of Maurecatus's illegitimate succession.¹³³

The only king with regard to whom chronicles differ in their assessment is Ramiro I (r. 842–50), son of Bermudo I and successor to Alfonso II. During Ramiro's absence from the kingdom, Count Nepocianus, who was Alfonso's brother-in-law, was elected by the nobles to be king. The *Chronicle of Alfonso III* legitimizes Ramiro by stating that Ramiro had been lawfully elected king while Nepocianus attempted to usurp the throne illegitimately and was defeated militarily by Ramiro. The *Albeldensia* insists that Ramiro was a 'rod of justice' ('uirga iustitie').¹³⁴ The *Chronicle of Alfonso III* indicates that Ramiro confronted civil wars 'many times' and suppressed internal rebellions with utmost cruelty ('Ranimirus princeps [...] uellis ciuilibus sepissime est impulsatus | Ranimirus princeps [...] bellis ciuilibus sepe impulsus est').¹³⁵ He was successful in staving off external threats to the kingdom, such as expeditions by the Northmen to the coast of Galicia, and in continuing the architectural work of his predecessor: for example, he erected the church of St Mary at Naranco. Perhaps owing to the tumultuous nature of Ramiro's reign, the *Albeldensia* and the *Rotensis* do not attribute transcendental meaning to Bermudo's death, whereas *Ad Sebastianum* informs us that Ramiro rested in peace.¹³⁶

Royal Asturian biographies in the *Chronica Albeldensia* and the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* can then be read as chronographies of the Asturian kings' relationship with the law. While the two chronicles differ in detail, most of the time they are remarkably consistent in their evaluation of Asturian kings. By checking the conduct of Asturian leaders against Visigothic legal norms codified in the *Lex Wisigothorum*, the chroniclers underscore the legitimacy and Visigothic continuity of the Asturian monarchy. Alfonso I, Alfonso II, and Ordoño I are proclaimed good custodians of the law, while Witiza and, to the extent that it helps justify the demise of the Visigothic kingdom, Rodrigo are censored for their lack of willpower to maintain the order of the law in the Visigothic kingdom. Thus, legal rhetoric becomes an essential component of Asturian political ideology, as it helps project sovereignty over the kingdom's subjects, distinguish the monarchy favourably among its most powerful rivals, and create a long-lasting myth of its leading political role in the Iberian north-

¹³³ *Rot.*, pp. 136 and 138; *Ad Seb.*, pp. 137 and 139; *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 174.

¹³⁴ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 175.

¹³⁵ *Rot.*, pp. 142 and 144; *Ad Seb.*, pp. 143 and 145.

¹³⁶ *Rot.*, pp. 142 and 144; *Ad Seb.*, pp. 143 and 145.

east. By effectively using the law as their trump card in disputing Iberian sovereignty, the Asturian chroniclers created narratives of unity and social cohesion so effective that their impact would extend far beyond their intended regional and chronological scope.

* * *

Throughout its history, the kingdom of Asturias led a precarious existence marred by constant threats, shifting alliances, and changes in the political landscape. Under these circumstances, the *Lex Wisigothorum* perhaps remained as one of the few anchors of stability for the Asturian political leadership. However, with the exception of the apparent availability of the 'Titulus primus' in the Iberian north-west, we have little, if any, evidence that the Visigothic *lex scripta* was used in everyday life in Asturias prior to the composition of both chronicles. This is in stark contrast with the evidence of an increase in legal documents both in Carolingian and Catalan courts in the ninth and early tenth centuries, where written acts remained central to the legal procedure throughout the ninth century and beyond.¹³⁷ What are we to make of this lack of comparative evidence in Asturias, contrasted with the chronicles' heavy reliance on *Lex Wisigothorum*?

What this seems to suggest is that the Asturian monarchy defined its royal function through the ostensible use of laws, whether or not such use was widespread in practice at the time. This might seem a strangely illogical practice unless we recall that Carolingian France has now for some time been considered to be a society that relied heavily on documentation and the written word for administration and justice.¹³⁸ By positioning itself as the only legitimate successor of the Visigoths, the Asturian monarchy perhaps aspired to position itself

¹³⁷ Wormald, 'Lex scripta', p. 24. The proliferation of documents and the institutionalization of document keeping in Catalonia that occurs from the tenth century onward has been linked to the consolidation of landed estates by the aristocracy (Adam J. Kosto, 'Sicut mos esse solet: Documentary Practices in Christian Iberia, c. 700–1000', in *Documentary Culture and the Laity in the Early Middle Ages*, ed. by Warren C. Brown and others (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 259–82).

¹³⁸ See Rosamond McKitterick, *The Carolingians and the Written Word* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), and François-Louis Ganshof, 'The Use of the Written Word in Charlemagne's Administration', in *The Carolingians and the Frankish Monarchy. Studies in Carolingian History*, trans. by Janet Sondheimer (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1971), pp. 125–42. McKitterick provides documentary evidence of the increased production of written laws under Charlemagne, challenging Ganshof's views on a relative lack of literacy among Frankish laity.

on a diplomatic level equal to that of the potent Carolingian monarchy, whose authority had long derived from the *Lex Salica*. Legislative continuity between the Merovingians and the Carolingians formed the basis of Carolingian legitimation; the Asturians may have staked claims of sovereignty on a similar strategy by underscoring their continuity with the Visigoths. This would have simultaneously achieved two of their objectives, for it would (1) oppose Carolingian influence on the Iberian Peninsula by portraying the Asturian kings as political heavyweights of a Carolingian calibre; and (2) convey an image of the Asturian sovereigns as exemplary stewards of the Visigothic legal tradition and thus the only legitimate successors of the Visigoths on the Iberian Peninsula. The decline of the Carolingian empire toward the 880s and its withdrawal from the Hispanic March starting in the early ninth century could have been seen in the court of Alfonso III as affording such an opportunity.

This strategy can, indeed, be seen in the episode of the Battle of Albelda in the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, which illustrates the Asturian desire to establish a stake in the triangle of power comprised of Asturias, the Banū Qāsī of Zaragoza, and the kingdom of the Franks. Having established a nucleus of power in Zaragoza, Mūsa aspired to the status of the 'third king', on par with the emir of Cordoba and the king of the Franks. From the legitimation standpoint, perhaps, one of the biggest threats to the Asturian political project was the ability of the Banū Qāsī to claim Visigothic lineage by virtue of the Visigothic origin of Casius, the dynasty's founder, and their multiple intermarriages with local Christian families, such as that of Íñigo Arista. Asturian kings were unable to rival the Banū Qāsī in genealogy, since Alfonso II the Chaste was half Cantabrian and half Basque: he was son of Fruela I, who ascended to Cantabrian duke Pelagius, and the Basque captive Munia.¹³⁹ That the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* calls the grandson of Casius Mūsa bin Fortūn 'Visigoth by birth but Muhammedan by ritual' ('Musa quidam nomine natione gotus sed ritu mamentiano') reveals the chronicler's desire to downplay the Visigothic ancestry of the Banū Qāsī by underscoring the erroneous nature of their faith. Concerned about Mūsa's advances

¹³⁹ Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, 'Los vascos y los árabes durante los primeros años de la reconquista', in Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *Miscelánea de estudios históricos* (León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación 'San Isidoro', Archivo Histórico Diocesano, Caja de Ahorros y Monte de Piedad de León, 1970), pp. 189–203 (p. 195). Cf.: 'Mūsa b. Mūsa ibn Qasī es sobrino de Íñigo Íñiguez de Pamplona; [...] Muṭarrif b. Mūsa está casado con Velazquita, hija de Sancho, señor de Pamplona; Muḥammad b. Lubb era cuñado de Raimundo, conde de Pallarés [...]; Fortūn b. Muḥammad es yerno de Sancho Garcés, con el que colabora frente a la campaña de Mitonia.' Chalmeta, 'El concepto de ṭagr', p. 26.

in the peninsular north-east, Charles the Bald (r. 840–77) forged a diplomatic relationship with Mūsa. After a crushing defeat by Ordoño I, Mūsa's son Lope (Lup) became a subject of the Asturian king, whose spoils now included gifts sent to Mūsa by the king of the Franks: 'Ipse [Muzza] uero ter gladio confossus semiuibus euasit multumque ibi uellice adparatus siue et munera, quam ei Carolus rex Francorum direxit, perdidit et numquam postea effectum uictorie habuit'.¹⁴⁰ The chronicle's description of the redistribution of spoils, with Charles' gifts to Mūsa being emphatically appropriated by the Asturians, clearly points toward the Asturian kingdom as the only legitimate power nucleus on the Iberian Peninsula, with which the kingdom of the Franks ought to have diplomatic contact.

By the late tenth century, Asturias possessed the most developed historiographical tradition among the nascent power nuclei in the Iberian north. For most of the twentieth century, critics took at face value the chroniclers' claims that Asturian kings were direct descendants of the Visigothic royal dynasty. A natural consequence of this approach was the belief that the Asturians simply resurrected provisions of defunct Visigothic law at the royal court in Oviedo. This notion, first developed by Ramón Menéndez Pidal in the early twentieth century, gave birth to the long-standing stereotype of the Astur-Leonese kingdom's archaic character vis-à-vis that of Castile. For Menéndez Pidal and his followers, only Castile's early rebellion against Visigothic laws constituted an innovation that would ultimately bring about its Iberian leadership. But what the reading of Asturian chronicles from a legal perspective demonstrates is, in fact, the innovative character of Asturian royal legitimation. By adapting Visigothic legal provisions to reflect the changing scope of royal power (from law-giving to law-keeping), Asturian chroniclers were able to bolster the genealogical claims of the royal dynasty with claims of exemplary kingship, which enabled the Asturian monarchy to contrast itself favourably vis-à-vis other ruling dynasties in the Iberian north-east. This, in essence, invented Asturias as a sovereign centre of power, since it allowed the chroniclers to define the royal figure as a law-keeper and its subjects as participants in a newly created social contract, albeit in the Visigothic tradition. In considering whether such a model arose independently or consciously emulated other contemporary models of kingship, one ought to consider that Carolingian France was the nearest power nucleus predicated on territorial amplification and political continuity articulated through continuity in the use of laws. Given that plunderers rarely acknowledge the sources of their goods, it is perhaps not surprising that the

¹⁴⁰ *Rot.*, p. 146; *Ad Seb.*, p. 147.

chroniclers downplay the political influence of the Carolingians and silence the seemingly vassallic relationship Alfonso II held with the kingdom of the Franks: acknowledging it would have run contrary to Asturian claims of sovereignty.

We can surmise that this fusion of historiography and law points toward the royal chancery as the place of origin of the Asturian chronicles. A little over a century after their composition, Sampiro, the putative author of the only narrative source of the history of the kingdom of León in the tenth and eleventh centuries, employed a similar strategy in his own *Chronicle*. The notary of Bermudo II, Sampiro describes his patron as a prudent man who confirmed the laws established by Wamba and ordered a publication of the canons ('leges a Vambano principe conditas firmauit'; 'canones aperire iussit').¹⁴¹ Such characterizations of the king reveal Sampiro's legal background and interest in law-keeping. Like the Asturian chroniclers, Sampiro uses the notion of peace to construct his narratives of Leonese monarchs in the tenth and eleventh centuries: he indicates whether the kingdom was obtained peacefully or by usurpation, whether the king was just and orderly in its administration, whether he maintained peace in the kingdom by protecting it from internal and external enemies, and whether his earthly kingdom transcended into eternity.¹⁴²

That this conceptual framework of royal legitimacy survives throughout the Leonese period is evidenced in the prologue to Lucas of Tuy's *Chronicon mundi* (1236):

Rex dicitur a regendo, quod se et alios bene regat; cui specialius quinque sunt necessaria: primo uidelicet creatorem et regem suum, Patrem et Filium et Spiritum sanctum, unum uerum Deum in unitate substantie et in trinitate personarum agnoscere; secundo fidem catholicam moribus et uerbis confiteri; tercio regnum in pace omnimode conseruare; quarto sine acceptione personarum unicuique iusticiam exhibere; quinto uero hostes uiriliter, contemptis cunctis laboribus, expugnare.¹⁴³

(Power is said to be given to that king through his rule, so that he rules himself and others well, for which task five things are necessary. First, he should know the Creator and his king, the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit, one true God in the unity of substance and trinity of the persons. Second, he should confess his Catholic faith through his words and morals. Third, he should always keep the kingdom

¹⁴¹ Sampiro, *Chronicle*, p. 344.

¹⁴² Sampiro, *Chronicle*, pp. 53, 59, and 135.

¹⁴³ Lucas of Tuy, *Chronicon mundi*, p. 3. See also Ana Rodríguez, 'De rebus Hispanie frente a la *Chronica latina de los reyes de Castilla*: virtudes regias y reciprocidad política en Castilla y León en la primera mitad del siglo XIII', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 133–49 (pp. 134–35).

in peace. Fourth, he should exhibit justice equally to all. Fifth, he should vigorously combat enemies, which involves setting aside all [other] preoccupations.)

Out of the five royal imperatives set forth by the bishop of Tuy, three make direct references to Visigothic law: keeping the kingdom in peace ('regnum in pacem omnimode conseruare'), imparting justice ('iustitiam exhibere'), and combatting enemies of the kingdom ('hostes [...] expugnare'). It would not be an overreach to say that both Sampiro, the earliest of the Leonese chroniclers, and Lucas, the last exponent of the Leonese model of political power, build on the Asturian legal tradition as they chart the political vectors of the Leonese kingdom.

REVISITING THE RECONQUEST IN ELEVENTH- AND TWELFTH-CENTURY LEONESE CHRONICLES: A HOLY WAR OR A JUST WAR?

This chapter addresses the historiographical production that begins after the transfer of the royal see from Oviedo to León by Ordoño II in 914. A chronicle attributed to Sampiro, notary at the courts of Bermudo II (r. 984–99) and Alfonso V (r. 999–1028), subsequently appointed bishop of Astorga (c. 1035–c. 1041), is known as the only narrative source for Leonese royal history between the tenth and the eleventh centuries. The chronicle exists in several redactions. One was incorporated c. 1118 by a certain Pelayo, bishop of Oviedo, into his compilation of historical works known as *Corpus Pelagianum*; another was included in the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*) in the first half of the twelfth century.¹ Both of these redactions include events from 866, the beginning of the reign of Alfonso III of Asturias. Whereas Pelayo's chronicle ends with the death of Ramiro III in 984, the *Silensis* (*Legionensis*) continues until the death of Bermudo II. The remainder of this text, although dedicated to the deeds of Alfonso VI (r. 1065–1109), includes a history of the Visigothic kingdom and ends with a detailed account of the reign of Alfonso's predecessor Fernando I (r. 1037–65). A third redaction of Sampiro's text was

¹ See Justo Pérez de Urbel, *Sampiro, su crónica y la monarquía leonesa en el siglo X* (Madrid: CSIC, 1952), pp. 69 and 136.

incorporated into the chronicle composed at the Castilian monastery of Santa María la Real of Nájera between 1160 and 1200.²

The *Chronica Naiarensis*, despite being a Castilian composition, is considered here to the extent that it shares sources with the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*) and, where it does not follow Sampiro's account, reflects concerns with political instability in the Leonese kingdom. Serving as a narrative bridge between Leonese and Castilian history, the *Naiarensis* is divided into three parts: (I) from Creation to the end of the Visigothic monarchy, based on Asturian chronicle accounts; (II) from Pelagius (Pelayo), the legendary founder of Asturias, until the marriage of Sancha and Fernando I; and (III) the reigns of Fernando I, Sancho II, and Alfonso VI, with the inclusion of epic material on the counts of Castile. Unlike these two compilations, the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, written in the mid-twelfth century, is dedicated entirely to the reign of one king, Alfonso VII (1126–57), and continues until the Battle of Almería (1147). It is attributed, not without some doubt, to Cluniac Bishop Arnaldo of Astorga (r. 1144–52/53).³

If one had to choose a single critical concern surrounding the ideological impetus of Leonese chronicles insofar as they represent the continuation of the narrative that began in Asturias, it would be the ideological contribution of these chronicles to *reconquista*, the Spanish reconquest, a term that originally referred to the military recovery of former Visigothic Iberian dominions from the Muslims, undertaken between 711 and 1492. Although the term *reconquista* has been in use since the late eighteenth century, the centrality of the reconquest for Spanish history was first formulated in the late nineteenth century by Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo, who considered Christianity and the Catholic Church a force of national coagulation that would give Spain its unity.⁴ This significance of the reconquest for the Iberian Middle Ages was further

² *Chronica Naiarensis*, II, pp. 69–83.

³ Simon Barton, 'Islam and the West: A View from Twelfth-Century León', in *Cross, Crescent and Conversion: Studies on Medieval Spain and Christendom in Memory of Richard Fletcher*, ed. by Simon Barton and Peter Linehan (Leiden: Brill, 2007), pp. 153–74 (pp. 155–56).

⁴ Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo, *Historia de los heterodoxos españoles*, 2 vols (Madrid: Editorial Católica, 1956; first publ. 1880–82), I, 12. On the history of the term *reconquista* and an exhaustive overview of its evolution in twentieth-century Spanish historiography, see Martín F. Ríos Saloma, *La Reconquista en la historiografía española contemporánea* (Madrid: Sílex, 2013); see also Francisco García Fitz, 'La Reconquista: un estado de la cuestión', in *Clio & Crimen: Revista del Centro de Historia del Crimen de Durango*, 6 (2009), pp. 142–215. See also John V. Tolan, 'Using the Middle Ages to Construct Spanish Identity: 19th- and 20th-Century Spanish

advocated by Ramón Menéndez Pidal and Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, among others. For all of these scholars, the chronicles of Asturias, León, and Castile were faithful testimonies of the centuries-long struggle against Islam, which laid the foundation of Spain's uniqueness.⁵

During the political era of Francisco Franco (1939–75), the link between the reconquest as a defining factor in Spain's history and Castile as a national unifying force by virtue of its leadership in the reconquest was strengthened to create a unified, Castile-centric image of Spain. José Antonio Maravall, for instance, characterized the idea of the reconquest as 'a programme of mediaeval Spanish history' ('programa de nuestra historia medieval'), a project that spanned the entirety of the Middle Ages. For him, the word *España* designated the realm of the reconquest and its ultimate goal — the recovery of peninsular and confessional unity that had been achieved during the Visigothic period.⁶ Because by the mid-twentieth century the notion of the *reconquista* was firmly established as an ideological foundation of Spain's uniqueness, it was also incorporated into the model of the *convivencia* as one of the factors that explained the singularly hybrid character of mediaeval Iberian culture. For Américo Castro, the reconquest originated as a Christian response to the *jihād*, the Muslim holy war, while the cult of St James the Moorslayer, the patron of military campaigns against Muslims in León and Castile, was an ideological response to the cult of the Prophet Muḥammad.⁷ Finally, from the contemporary perspective of conservative Spanish philosopher Julián Marías, having shaped the Iberian Christian societies, the reconquest inspired claims of hegemony by the Spanish-American empire and became a self-perpetuating myth of an epic, nation-building struggle that gave the sense of purpose to Spanish history.⁸ Because throughout the twentieth century the term *reconquista* accrued such strong political and ideological overtones, few concepts

Historiography of Reconquest', in *Historiographical Approaches to Medieval Colonization of East Central Europe*, ed. by Jan M. Piskorski (Boulder, CO and New York: East European Monographs, 2002), pp. 329–47 (p. 334).

⁵ Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *La España del Cid* (Madrid: Plutarco, 1929); Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *España. Un enigma histórico*, 4 vols (Buenos Aires: Editorial Sudamericana, 1956), II.

⁶ José Antonio Maravall, *El concepto de España en la Edad Media* (Madrid: Instituto de Estudios Políticos), p. 249.

⁷ Américo Castro, *La realidad histórica de España* (México: Editorial Porrúa, 1966), p. 407. See also García Fitz, 'La Reconquista', p. 177.

⁸ Julián Marías, *España inteligible. Razón histórica de las Españas* (Madrid: Alianza Editorial, 1985).

today reflect modern preoccupations with national unification and the idea of Spain's singularity more intensely than this widely accepted anachronism.

As critical perspectives on the mediaeval world have become increasingly informed by the notion of its interconnectedness across political, religious, and ethnic boundaries, the Iberian kingdoms of Asturias, León, and Castile are now being regarded as examples of warring societies that confronted Islam elsewhere in the Mediterranean, and, more broadly, among societies that underwent significant territorial expansion in the Middle Ages.⁹ The precise ideological nature of Spain's military response to Islam continues to intrigue scholars, who now agree that Christian-Muslim coexistence in Iberia has proven to be a more complex and nuanced phenomenon than previously thought. While the validity of the term *reconquista* continues to be questioned, and the idea of the Iberian reconquest is becoming decoupled from the notion of Spain's uniqueness, the central question surrounding the process remains: was the Iberian Christian response to Muslim presence on the peninsula primarily a territorial war or a holy, sacred war? Can and should these two dimensions of the reconquest be viewed as mutually exclusive?

The starting point of the reconquest is commonly identified as the first reported Christian victory over Muslims, which took place at Covadonga in 718 or 722, but its ideological underpinnings throughout the Middle Ages continue to be a subject of conflicting interpretations.¹⁰ Late ninth-century Asturian chronicles present this battle as being fought in the name of Christ and the Virgin and won miraculously with the aid of divine intervention.¹¹ The providentialist perspective of these early accounts has led some scholars to interpret the reconquest as a holy war whose territorial claims remained secondary to its religious imperatives.¹² Lately, however, new evidence has

⁹ See, for example, *Crusaders, Condottieri, and Cannon. Medieval Warfare in Societies around the Mediterranean*, ed. by L. J. Andrew Villalon and Donald J. Kagay, History of Warfare, 13 (Leiden: Brill, 2002); José Ángel García de Cortázar, 'Sociedad y organización social del espacio castellano en los siglos VII a XII. Una revisión historiográfica', in '*Romanización*' y '*Reconquista*' en la Península Ibérica: nuevas perspectivas, ed. by María José Hidalgo, Dionisio Pérez, and Manuel J. R. Cervás (Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 1998), pp. 317–38.

¹⁰ Derek W. Lomax, *The Reconquest of Spain* (London: Longman, 1978); Bernard F. Reilly, *The Medieval Spains* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993).

¹¹ *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, versions *Rotensis* and *Ad Sebastianum*, pp. 124–29; *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 172.

¹² The use of biblical providentialism in the Visigothic tradition has been extensively commented on by Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, 'Historiography in Visigothic Spain', in *La storiografia altomedievale, 10–16 aprile 1969*, Settimane, 17 (Spoleto, 1970), pp. 261–311 (repr. in

come to the fore that casts a different light on the genesis of reconquest ideology. Contributing to this shift of perspective is Georges Martin's assertion that by claiming political continuity between the Visigothic political project and the kingdom of Asturias, the Oviedo dynasty hoped to obliterate the reality of an almost two-centuries-long political gap in Christian rule on the Iberian Peninsula — between the conquest of Spain by Arabs and Muslims in 711 and the emergence, in the late ninth century, of the Asturian kingdom as a self-professed successor to the Visigothic state.¹³ Following Martin's study, the focus on the role of providence in the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* and the *Chronica Albeldensia* has increasingly been interpreted as a late ninth-century mechanism of legitimation that sought not only to assert continuity with the Visigothic kingdom against Arab and Muslim claims of Iberian sovereignty, but also to promote the local political objectives of the Asturian monarchy. As discussed in Chapter 4, these included projecting authority over the kingdom's subjects in the course of its territorial expansion, challenging alternative centres of political power in the Iberian north-east, and countering Carolingian claims of leadership in fighting Islam on Iberian soil. It is no longer possible to ignore the fact that at least some of the narratives of the reconquest could have been composed with the aim of reinforcing local political aspirations in Asturias, León, and Castile.

Jocelyn N. Hillgarth, *Visigothic Spain, Byzantium, and the Irish* (London: Variorum, 1985), article III, pp. 262–352 (pp. 261–66). On the topic of providentialism in Asturian chronicles, see Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *Investigaciones sobre historiografía hispana medieval (siglos VIII al XII)* (Buenos Aires: Facultad de Filosofía y Letras, Instituto de Historia de España, 1967), pp. 161–202 (esp. pp. 171–72) (first publ. as 'El relato de Alfonso III sobre Covadonga', *Humanitas*, 3 (1957), 13–50); Eloy Benito Ruano, 'La historiografía en la Alta Edad Media española. Ideología y estructura', *CHE*, 17 (1952), 50–104; Luis Vázquez de Parga, 'La Biblia en el reino Astur-Leonés', *La Bibbia nell'alto Medioevo*, Settimane, 10 (Spoleto, 1963), pp. 257–80; Georges Martin, 'La chute du royaume visigothique d'Espagne dans l'historiographie chrétienne des VIII^e et IX^e siècles', *CLHM*, 9 (1984), pp. 208–33. On providentialism in the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, see *Conquerors and Chronicles of Early Medieval Spain*, trans., notes, and introd. by Kenneth Baxter Wolf, Translated Texts for Historians, 9, 2nd rev. edn (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1990), pp. 96–97. On the commentary on biblical and liturgical Latin in Sampiro's *Chronicle*, see *Sampiro*, ed. by Pérez de Urbel, pp. 241–43. On biblical imagery in the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, see *Crónica del emperador Alfonso VII*, ed. and trans. by Maurilio Pérez González (León: Universidad de León, 1997). On the use of biblical figures in the Castilian histories of Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada and Alfonso X, see Alan D. Deyermond, 'The Death and Rebirth of Visigothic Spain in the "Estoria de España"', *Revista Canadiense de Estudios Hispánicos*, 9 (1985), 345–67.

¹³ Martin, 'La chute'.

In contrast to the above, it has also been argued that the reconquest was an essentially political enterprise that transformed into a holy war under European ecclesiastical patronage. Earlier twentieth-century interpretations of Spanish history tended to emphasize the political or territorial aspect of the reconquest. For Maravall, whether by warfare or other means, its goal was the recovery of political domination of the Iberian Peninsula. Because Maravall equated the reconquest with the recovery, re-establishment, and restoration of the Visigothic political order ('recuperación, restablecimiento, restauración'), the reconquest for him was a repossession of the old, rather than the creation of something new.¹⁴ Similarly, for Menéndez Pidal, for whom the immutability of Spanish values was a defining characteristic of Spain's history, the idea of the reconquest survived unchanged until the age of the Catholic Monarchs, with the reconquest itself consisting of three phases: 1) the repopulation of lands abandoned in the aftermath of the Arab conquest (occasionally interrupted by Arab incursions into Christian territory), ongoing until the death of al-Manṣūr in 1002; 2) the political and economic protectorate by *parias* until the end of the eleventh century; and 3) the military conquest of lands, culminating in the thirteenth century with the reconquest of Córdoba, Seville, Niebla, Valencia, and Murcia.¹⁵ Maravall effectively seconded Menéndez Pidal's assertion that the reconquest was an ongoing enterprise of a mostly territorial and political nature, with the caveat that the three phases unfolded at the same time.¹⁶ Today, several historians continue to hold the view of the essentially restorative political nature of Christian reconquest, stemming from the recreation of Visigothic political order in Asturias and León.¹⁷

There are, however, those who emphasize the dynamic and evolving nature of the Christian-Muslim peninsular conflict. From Vicente Cantarino's perspective, the initial period of the reconquest was defined completely by the ideology of a territorial war, rather than by the religious character that informed the attitude to Islam in the rest of Christian Europe.¹⁸ For Cantarino, the ideol-

¹⁴ Maravall, *El concepto de España*, pp. 252, 279.

¹⁵ Menéndez Pidal, *La España del Cid*, 6th edn, 2 vols (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1967; 1st edn 1929), II, 682.

¹⁶ Maravall, *El concepto de España*, p. 252.

¹⁷ Alexander Pierre Bronish, *Reconquista y Guerra Santa: la concepción de la guerra en la España cristiana desde los visigodos hasta comienzos del siglo XII*, trans. by Máximo Diago Hernando (Granada: Universidad de Granada, 2006); Thomas Deswarte, *De la destruction à la restauration: L'idéologie dans le royaume d'Oviedo-Léon (VIII^e-XI^e siècles)* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2004).

¹⁸ Vicente Cantarino, *Entre monjes y musulmanes: El conflicto que fue España* (Madrid:

ogy of a religious war did not become influential in Spain until the establishment of a bond between the Iberian royalty and the abbey of Cluny, which was formally announced by the Council of Burgos in 1080 under the patronage of Alfonso VI. A similar view on the transformation of the reconquest from territorial expansion into a crusade is held by Joseph O'Callaghan, who argues that the Spanish reconquest and Crusades to the Holy Land were of the same nature, but differed in their degrees of success.¹⁹ Richard A. Fletcher argues that during the eleventh and early twelfth centuries, the Leonese were not interested in the reconquest as an ideological programme, as both Christians and Muslims could profitably raid the permeable and flexible frontier and enter into alliances of convenience across religious boundaries. By contrast, the period beginning at the end of the eleventh century saw, on the one hand, an influx of Cluniacs into Spain (c. 1080–1140) and, on the other, Almoravid invasions that brought to the Iberian Peninsula a more fundamentalist version of Islam (c. 1090–1120). Under these circumstances, according to Fletcher, there emerged sharp ideological divisions between Christian and Muslim camps, which were further accentuated on the Christian side by the crusader movement.²⁰ In a similar fashion, Simon Barton contrasts chronicles such as Pelayo's account and the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), which, to this scholar, manifest 'precious little interest in or knowledge of the Islamic territories that lay just beyond León's borders', or in Islam as a faith, with the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, which not only includes the Mediterranean in its geographical scope but distinguishes among several Muslim sects and is imbued with a religious spirit. Barton attributes this to the surge of crusading fervour in the wake of Pope Urban II's call for the First Crusade, pronounced at the Council of Clermont in 1095.²¹

As a result of these divergent perspectives on the ideological impetus behind the reconquest, this enterprise is sometimes perceived as a seemingly haphazard succession of 'moments of enormous religious fervour, sometimes quite violent,

Alhambra, 1978), and 'The Spanish Reconquest: A Cluniac Holy War against Islam?', in *Islam and the Medieval West: Aspects of Intercultural Relations*, ed. by Kalil I. Semaan (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1980), pp. 82–109.

¹⁹ Joseph O'Callaghan, *Reconquest and Crusade in Medieval Spain* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003), p. 209.

²⁰ Richard A. Fletcher, 'Reconquest and Crusade in Spain, c. 1050–1150', in *The Crusades: The Essential Readings*, ed. by Thomas F. Madden (Oxford: Blackwell, 2002), pp. 51–88 (p. 58).

²¹ Barton, 'Islam and the West', pp. 159–69; see also Simon Barton, 'From Tyrants to Soldiers of Christ: The Nobility of Twelfth-Century Leon-Castile and the Struggle against Islam', *Nottingham Medieval Studies*, 44 (2000), pp. 28–48.

alternating with phases of unscrupulous *Realpolitik*.²² Accepting Fletcher and Barton's theses, in particular, equals admitting that the Leonese did not possess a well-formulated reconquest ideology prior to the introduction of Cluniacs into Spain, or that what we term 'reconquest' today held little spiritual significance to them. Yet chronicles from León suggest that it was not meant to be so. In order to understand the chronicle discourse on the reconquest in eleventh- and twelfth-century León, one ought to consider how the model of royal power that developed in Asturias-León defined the scope of the kingdom's adversaries and legitimized military action against them. Seen through the prism of the *Lex Wisigothorum*, Arabs and Muslims represented one, but not the only, challenge to the stability of the kingdom, with dynastic wars and internal seditions being considered equally disruptive in undermining royal power. Secondly, despite considering Arabs and Muslims as only one among various threats to the monarchy, the Astur-Leonese chronicle tradition does formulate and continuously manifest a distinct ideology to the extent that it constructs the response to Arabs and Muslims as a symbiosis of *bellum iustum* (a conflict of political interests) and *bellum sanctum* (a holy or religious war). I suggest that the foundations of this ideology can be sought in the political framework developed by Isidore of Seville (d. 636) for the Visigothic state at the pinnacle of its territorial expansion and religious unification, less than a century before Spain's encounter with Islam. This does not equal saying that the ideology of the peninsular recovery did not change over time, but rather that Leonese chronicles' territorial and religious views on the reconquest were complementary rather than mutually exclusive, and reveal a great deal of flexibility as the Christian kingdoms' own ideologies and scope of royal power evolved.

Locating the Muslims in Leonese Chronicles

For our understanding of why Leonese chronicles seem to be less preoccupied with the reconquest than we would expect them to be, we must take into account the fundamentally king-centric scope of these texts. It is helpful to recall Manuel Rodríguez de la Peña's assertion that the eleventh- and twelfth-century Leonese model of royal power rests on the archetype of a *rex iustus* and the idea of a king as a self-sufficient ruler and actor of history — with the stipulation that, in light of what we established in the previous chapter, such a

²² Franco Cardini, *Europe and Islam*, trans. by Caroline Beamish (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001), p. 28.

construct must be seen as having first developed in Asturias.²³ What could have been the implications of this model for the legitimation of Christian military responses to Muslims?

The previous chapter discussed the contrast established in the *Lex Wisigothorum* between, on the one hand, *ciues* and *populi*, who are the king's subjects and participants in the social contract with the monarchy, and *alieni* or *hostes*, enemies and inhabitants of surrounding lands who are neither subjects to the king nor bound to him by civic obligation. We may recall that, with its foundations in the Roman law, the *Lex Wisigothorum* modelled the internal and external politics of the kingdom on the Roman imperial discourse, which was predicated on a contrast between the civilized nature of the Romans and the savagery of the barbarians. At the rhetorical level, this distinction was realized by Roman historians through a series of binary oppositions such as *humanitas* vs *feritas* (*immanitas*); *clementia* (*benignitas*) vs *crudelitas* (*saeuitia*); *fidelitas* (*constantia*) vs *perfidia* (*mutabilitas*); *grauitas* (*prudentia*) vs *uanitas*; *tranquillitas* (*pacis amor*) vs *belli furor*; *ius* vs *uis* (*iniuria*); *eruditio* vs *ruditas*.²⁴ Such rhetoric was, according to Gerhard Ladner, a manifestation of an 'ethical contrast between an empire of peace, ever to be renewed, and proud or rebellious people, unwilling to submit to it'.²⁵ The perception of an inherent bellicosity in the barbarians justified the rhythm of imperial history, in which barbarian rebellions alternated with their pacification by the Romans. The term *debellare* in the Roman imperial discourse denoted a peaceful action, since it prevented or extinguished acts of war and insubordination and guaranteed the survival of the Roman political order.²⁶ The *Chronica Naiarensis* conserves the memory of this rhythm of rebellion and pacification in Hispania in its portion related to the foundation of León by the Romans in the first century AD: 'Nerua siquidem imperator romanus XIII legionem militum in Yspaniam misit, ut ciuitates que in altum erant posite destruerent et in terre planitie ponerent, ne unquam romano possent imperio rebellare' ('Nerva, the Roman emperor, sent to Hispania fourteen legions of soldiers with orders to destroy cities located in high places and situate them on the plains, so that they would never be able to

²³ Manuel A. Rodríguez de la Peña, 'Ideología política y crónicas monásticas: la concepción cluniacense de la realeza en la España del siglo XII', *AEM*, 30 (2000), 681–734.

²⁴ Bruno Luiselli, 'L'idea romana dei barbari nell'età delle grandi invasioni germaniche', *Romanobarbarica*, 8 (1984), 33–61 (pp. 36–37).

²⁵ Gerhard Ladner, 'On Roman Attitudes toward Barbarians in Late Antiquity', *Viator*, 7 (1976), 1–26 (pp. 11–12).

²⁶ Ladner, 'On Roman Attitudes', 10.

rebel against the empire').²⁷ The barbarians, or peoples bordering the Roman Empire, were classified as either friends or enemies allied to it by peace treaties (*foedera*); by breaking the *foedus*, one ceased to be a friend and became an enemy.²⁸ The Visigoths, who became *foederati* of Emperor Theodosius in AD 356, adopted the imperial discourse in the course of the *translatio imperii* from the Romans. Isidore, in particular, reproduces the political relationship between the Romans and the *foederati* as he narrates the subjugation of the Basques by Suinthila (r. 621–31) that put an end to their incursions into Tarraconensis.²⁹

As continuators of the Isidorian tradition, post-Gothic chronicles inherit the rhythm of rebellion and pacification while adapting it to Christian-Muslim conflict. Since both the Mozarabic and the neo-Gothic chronicle traditions had common roots in Visigothic imperial discourse, both share their repertory of political tropes, albeit these are employed in much different ways. Mozarabic chronicle narratives, having conceded the *translatio imperii* to the Arabs, designate their governors as the originators of pacification in formerly Visigothic territories: 'Alaor per Spaniam lacertos iudicum mittit, atque debellando et pacificando pene per tres annos Galliam Narbonensem petit, Spaniam ulteriorem, Iberiam citeriorem se subiugit' ('Alaor sent to Spain forces of justice and, suppressing and pacifying [rebellions] in nearly three years reached Gallia Narbonensis, in Hispania Ulterior, and subjected Iberia Citerior to his rule').³⁰ Conversely, Leonese chronicles invert such a rhythm by projecting the kings as originators of the pacific action. Thus, the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*) frames the 1037 Battle of Viseu, in which Fernando I avenges the death of Alfonso V in a previously unsuccessful attempt to reconquer that city, in terms of rebellion and pacification: 'Triumphato ergo oppido Sena, ad debellandam Uisesem urbem accelerat ea scilicet intentione, ut factorum suorum reddita uice, pro Aldefonso [V] socero suo interfecto ciuitatis ilius barbari soluerent debitas penas' ('Having conquered the city of Cea, [the king] hastened to pacify the

²⁷ *Chronica Naiarensis*, II. 86, pp. 87–88.

²⁸ The passage of the Mauretanian governor from 'friend' to 'enemy' in the first century BC is the subject of *The Jugurthine War* by Sallust. In Sallust, *Works. English and Latin*, ed. and trans. by John C. Rolfe, Loeb Classical Library, 116 (London: Heinemann, 1931). In the fourth century, Ammianus Marcellinus (c. AD 325–95) hesitates to characterize the Arabs as either *amici* or *hostes* ('Saraceni tamen nec amici nobis umquam nec hostes optandi') owing to their belligerence, inconstancy, nomadic lifestyle, and lack of laws. Ammianus Marcellinus, *History*, ed. and trans. by John C. Rolfe, Loeb Classical Library, 300, 3 vols (London: Heinemann, 1950), I, XIV. IV. 1, pp. 3–5.

²⁹ Isidore, *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, long version, 63, p. 276.

³⁰ *Chronicle of 754*, 62, p. 80.

city of Viseu, with the intention of having the barbarian perpetrators of that city pay back the death of his father-in-law Alfonso').³¹ The same terminology is used in the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris* to relate the episode in which Alfonso VII (r. 1126–57) takes counsel with his nobles prior to commencing a campaign against the Toledan Almoravid ruler Yūsuf ibn Tāshufīn ('[Adefonsus] habuit cum eis [...] consilii sui, dixitque omnem intentionem suam in eo esse, ut iret ad terram sarracenorum ad debellandum eos').³²

Because the *Lex Wisigothorum* not only defined the scope of royal power in Asturias and León but also identified challenges and threats to the monarchy, Asturian and Leonese chronicles define the political periphery of the kingdom in terms reminiscent of the Visigothic response to peoples who challenged the vision of a unified Iberian Peninsula. Therefore, what was understood as *inimici* or *hostes* in Asturias-León included all enemies, both internal and external, of the monarchy. As the following passage from the panegyric to Alfonso III in the *Chronica Albeldensia* indicates, the royal figure opposes both the Arabs and the traditional enemies of the Visigoths, the Asturians and the Basques, with victories over any of the three being perceived as equally sacred:

Regni culmine datus, belli titulo abtus,
 Clarus in Astures, fortis un Uascones,
 Ulciscens Arabes et protegens ciues,
 Cui principi sacra sit uictoria data.³³

(Placed at the helm of the kingdom, | gifted in battle, | illustrious against Asturians, strong against Basques, | retaliator against Arabs and protector of citizens, | a prince to whom sacred victory is to be given.)

The *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), in the portion where it follows the *Historia Wambae*, imports the same term as that history, *externae gentes*, with reference to all peoples who had historically presented a challenge to the Visigoths and their political descendants ('a tanta ruina, preter Deum patrem [...], nemo exterarum gentium Ispaniam subleuase cognoscitur'). Included in the enemy camp are both the armies of Ṭāriq bin Ziyād and Charlemagne. Both represent challenges to political power — the former ended the political sovereignty of the Visigoths, while the latter challenged the post-Gothic Iberian sovereignty.³⁴

³¹ *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), p. 189; *Chronica Naiarensis*, III. 21, p. 97; see also Pelayo of Oviedo, *Crónica del obispo don Pelayo*, p. 71.

³² *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, p. 209.

³³ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 158.

³⁴ *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), p. 129.

Since Asturian and Leonese chronicles treat the Islamic threat as only one of the challenges to royal power, it is afforded significant narrative space and attention only when it rivals or exceeds other threats in magnitude, immediacy, and intensity. Thus, while Asturian chronicles, as they reflect the kingdom's expansion, appear equally interested in recording battles against the Arabs and the subjugation of the power nuclei of the Basques and Galicians, Leonese notices of campaigns against Muslims are interspersed with those of dynastic conflicts. For example, Bishop Pelayo, in his chronicle, is as preoccupied with the fraternal conflict between Alfonso VI of León, Sancho II of Castile, and García of Galicia, as he is with Alfonsine reconquest victories and campaigns against the Almoravids ('extraneas gentes que Almorabites uocantur').³⁵ In the mid-twelfth-century *Chronica Aldefonsi Imperatoris*, the Almoravid and Almohad invasions are narrated in the context of civil wars between Leonese-Castilian monarchs against Theresa, countess of Portugal (1080–1130) who, until 1121, refused to submit to Leonese royal power, and Alfonso I of Aragon (r. 1104–34), an ally of the Navarrese and the Franks. But we should not be misled by this apparent lack of concern with the reconquest — in fact, Leonese chronicles formulate and continuously uphold a cohesive ideology with regard to the challenge of Islam. I will now turn to discussing its rootedness in Isidore's political thought.

Framing the Reconquest: Visigothic Political Thought Prior to 711

It is helpful to recall that Muslim invasions and settlement on the Iberian Peninsula interrupted processes of self-identification that formed part of the European movement from the universalism of the Roman Empire to the particularities of the nascent European centres of power. The fall of most of the Iberian Peninsula to the Arabs in the early eighth century had a profound effect on the emerging process, which continued to develop elsewhere in Europe, of the transition from the world view of the first 'barbarian histories' — such as the *Getica* by Jordanes (551), the *Historia Francorum* by Gregory of Tours (594), the *Historia ecclesiastica gentis Anglorum* by Bede (c. 731), the late eighth-century *Historia Langobardorum* by Paul the Deacon (720–99), and the *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum* by Isidore of Seville (composed c. 619–24) — to what Gabrielle Spiegel describes as a simultaneously more local and more politically-oriented writing of history, one 'much more closely

³⁵ Pelayo, *Chronicle*, pp. 77–82.

tied to the aspirations and ambitions of kings and princes, around whom the mediaeval society was in the process of organizing itself'.³⁶

This process of mediaeval societies' self-organization around the emerging royal power was characterized, according to Jacques Fontaine, by certain trends common to all of the Christian West. In particular, Fontaine points out that the separation of new barbarian polities from Rome was balanced by Catholic unification across political frontiers. Thus, the political and ethnic divisions of the ancient world were replaced by the notion of a community united by a shared convocation by the Church.³⁷ Orosius, the first Christian historian of Spain, reflects on this change in his *Seven Books of History against the Pagans* as early as AD 418, when he registers the incorporation of a barbarian tribe into the Christian family. Echoing the ecumenical spirit of the *City of God*, this disciple of Augustine writes the following on the subjugation of the Burgundians by Tiberius and their conversion to Christianity under the reign of Valentinian (AD 364–75): 'Blande mansuete innocenterque uiuant, non quasi cum subiectis Gallis sed uere cum fratribus Christianis' ('They are now so amiable, so gentle, so innocuous to the Gauls, upon whom they look not as subjects but as their Christian brothers').³⁸

This same sentiment of universal brotherhood would come to characterize Carolingian France. Einhard, in his *Life of Charlemagne*, writes that following a prolonged war with the Saxons (772–804), peace was achieved on the condition that these former enemies of the Franks be united to them by virtue of relinquishing paganism and adopting Christianity: 'abiecto daemonum cultu et relictis patriis caerimoniis, Christianae fidei atque religionis sacramenta susciperent et Francis adunati unus cum eis populus efficerentur' ('having rejected their worship of the devil and having abandoned the religious customs of their homeland, they should accept the sacraments of the Christian faith and reli-

³⁶ Gabrielle M. Spiegel, 'Historical Thought in Medieval Europe', in *A Companion to Western Historical Thought*, ed. by Lloyd S. Kramer and Sarah C. Maza (Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2002), pp. 78–98 (pp. 92–93).

³⁷ Jacques Fontaine, 'De l'universalisme antique aux particularismes médiévaux: la conscience du temps et de l'espace dans l'antiquité tardive', in *Popoli e paesi nella cultura altomedievale*, 23–29 aprile 1981, Settimane, 29 (Spoleto, 1983), pp. 15–45.

³⁸ Paulus Orosius, *Historiarum aduersum paganos libri VII*, in *Pauli Orosii Historiarum aduersum paganos libri VII: Accedit ejusdem Liber Apologeticus*, ed. by Carl Zangemeister, Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum, 5 (Vienna: apud C. Geroldi filium, 1882), VII, 23, p. 514.

gion and, having united themselves to the Franks, should form a single people with them').³⁹

But although Fontaine counts early mediaeval Spain as a full participant in this process of confessional unification, Visigothic political thought that developed between the sixth and seventh centuries hardly fits this framework, given its ethnocentric focus and consistent identification with the geographical limits of the Iberian Peninsula. In its fullest embodiment at the onset of the Muslim invasion, Visigothic ideology claims a high degree of military, political, and confessional superiority for the Visigothic people over other Christian and barbarian peoples. It is likely that this proclamation of superiority, with its concomitant projection of political and religious insularity, was a consequence of the defeat of the Visigoths by the Franks at Vouillé in 507, which caused the expulsion of the Visigoths from their first capital at Toulouse to Iberia. As a result, the Visigoths may have created a particularly strong territorial association that eclipsed the ideal of a *res publica christiana*, which was being developed in the Christian West.⁴⁰ This rejection by the Visigoths of the ideal of confessional unity across political frontiers in order to reserve for themselves a place of honour in history also constitutes a marked separation from the earlier Iberian pan-Christian self-identification as expressed by Orosius: 'inter Romanos [...] Romanus, inter Christianos Christianus, inter homines homo legibus inploro rempublicam, religione conscientiam, communione naturam' ('a Roman [...] among Romans, a Christian among Christians, a man among men, I speak to my republic through its laws, to my consciousness through religion, to my nature through communion').⁴¹

The beginnings of this ideological separation can be found in the work of the sixth-century historian John of Biclar, who was the first properly Visigothic chronicler of the Iberian Peninsula. In his chronicle, John claims rivalry with the Byzantine empire by creating parallel accounts of Visigothic and Byzantine military victories over their respective adversaries. His *Chronicle* covers the years 565–90, between the reigns of Justinian I (527–65) and Maurice (582–602) in Byzantium and those of Athanagild (551–67) and Reccared I (586–601) on the Iberian Peninsula. In its theological dimension, John's account is first and foremost a chronicle of the conversion of the Visigoths from Arianism to

³⁹ Einhard, *Vita Caroli Magni*, ed. by Georg Waitz, in *MGH, SS. Rer. Germ.*, 25 (Hannover: Hahn, 1911), pp. 1–41 (p. 10).

⁴⁰ José L. Romero, 'San Isidoro de Sevilla: su pensamiento históricopolítico y sus relaciones con la historia visigoda', *CHE*, 8 (1947), 5–71.

⁴¹ Paulus Orosius, *Historiarum aduersum paganos libri VII*, v. 2, pp. 280–81.

Catholicism. Reflecting John's perspective, the chronicle ends with the notice of Reccared's own conversion at the Third Council of Toledo in 589.⁴²

Although similar political and theological concerns are likewise present in Isidore's *History of the Kings of Goths, Vandals, and Suevi*, the archbishop of Seville shifts John's perspective dramatically by (1) celebrating the culmination of imperial transfer from Rome to Iberia, and (2) presenting the Visigoths as a people who occupied the centre of the European political landscape by virtue of having conquered Rome and inherited its glory. As Isidore comments on the *translatio imperii*, 'the subjugated Roman soldier is the servant [of the Goths], whom he sees that so many peoples and Spain itself serve' ('subactusque seruit illis [Gothis] Romanus miles, quibus seruire tot gentes et ipsam Spaniam uidet').⁴³

This celebratory tone could well reflect the spirit of any citizen of Visigothic Spain at the beginning of the seventh century, after Leovigild (568–86) had achieved political unity and introduced a set of laws to govern the entire Iberian population, including Hispano-Romans, in the 570s and 580s. Soon thereafter, the conversion of Reccared to Catholicism laid the grounds for a religious unification. According to Isidore, the political process that was begun by Leovigild was carried to its logical conclusion by Suinthila (r. 621–31), who destroyed the remaining Byzantine redoubts on the Mediterranean coast of Spain in 621 and was the first king to achieve sovereignty over the entire peninsula. The account of this victory concludes the long version of Isidore's *History*.⁴⁴ Shortly after the Visigothic expansion project reached its apparent geographical limits, Isidore presided over the Fourth Council of Toledo (633), which declared the religious unification of the Iberian Peninsula and introduced a single liturgical practice that would later be referred to as the Mozarabic, or Visigothic, rite. The provisions of the Fourth Council represent a practical application of the Augustinian notion of Christianity as the pillar of a terrestrial state.⁴⁵ Unlike the pagan states that had perished, the Visigothic empire, by virtue of its political and confessional unity, was presented as being destined to last until the end of the world.

⁴² John of Biclár, 'La crónica de Juan Biclarense: Versión castellana y notas para su estudio,' ed. by Pablo A. Rubiano, *Analecta Sacra Tarraconensia*, 16 (1943), 7–38.

⁴³ Isidore, *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, 70, p. 86.

⁴⁴ Isidore, *Historia de regibus Gothorum*, 62, p. 274.

⁴⁵ *Concilios visigóticos e hispano-romanos*, ed. by José S. Vives, Tomás Marín Martínez, and Gonzalo Martínez Díez (Barcelona and Madrid: CSIC, Instituto Enrique Flórez, 1963), cl. 75, p. 34.

The temporal dimension of the Visigothic state is underscored in the opening of the long version of the *Histories*, where Isidore traces the origin of the Goths to Old Testament prophecies and identifies the Visigoths with the people of Magog: 'Gothorum antiquissimam esse gentem, quorum originem quidam de Magog Iafeth filio suspicantur [...]. Retro autem eruditi eos magis Getas quam Gog et Magog appellare consueuerunt.' ('The people of the Goths is very ancient. Some attribute its origin to Magog, son of Jafeth [...] But in old times, it was a custom among the learned to call them *Getae* rather than Gog and Magog').⁴⁶ By reaching far into the past and future, Isidore seeks to establish Visigothic superiority over a host of historical adversaries, not only in terms of politics and confession, but also with respect to the antiquity of Visigothic origins and their prospects for the future. Isidore sums up his political vision by introducing two concepts that would define the political and theological dimensions of the new imperial space: *dilatare* (to expand politically by means of a treaty or military action) and *sublimare* (to elevate spiritually). The passage where these concepts are introduced summarizes the reigns of Leovigild and his son Reccared:

Ille [Leouigildus] inreligiosus et bello promptissimus, hic [Recaredus] fide pius et pace praeclarus, ille armorum artibus gentis imperium **dilatans**, hic gloriosus eandem gentem fidei trophaeo **sublimans**.⁴⁷

(The former [Leovigild] was irreligious and very much disposed to war, while the latter [Reccared] was devout in his faith and renowned for his love of peace; his father expanded the rule of his nation by the skills of war, while he with greater glory elevated the same people by the victory of faith.)

The two strands of Isidore's imperial ideology, *dilatare* and *sublimare*, define the two principal aspects of the new state, the territorial and the religious. The former denotes the expansion of the Visigothic kingdom by military conquests throughout the Iberian Peninsula, and possibly beyond into the African coast, 'for previously the Gothic people were confined by narrow borders' ('nam antea gens Gothorum angustis finibus artabatur').⁴⁸ The latter strand provides a spiritual legitimization of political expansion. In the *Histories*, Isidore attributes former Gothic victories to the Goths' spiritual superiority over both pagan and Christian nations: Vandals, Basques, Romans, Byzantines, Gauls, and Franks.

Isidore's ideal of Iberian political and confessional unity under Visigothic rule was meant to set Spain apart from other European states by creating a

⁴⁶ Isidore, *Historia de regibus Gothorum*, long version, 1, p. 172.

⁴⁷ Isidore, *Historia Gothorum*, 52, p. 260; emphasis added.

⁴⁸ Isidore, *Historia Gothorum*, 49, pp. 254–55.

political and religious monolith. To that end, according to Justo Pérez de Urbel, Isidore introduced the notion of Church and state as a single political and religious entity, in which the state is subordinated to the Church in spiritual matters and the Church to the state in temporal affairs. In Isidore's thought, while neither has supremacy over the other, in case of need one can assume the other's domain, thus enabling mutual reinforcement.⁴⁹ However, this vision was never fulfilled. Continuous rebellions in Gaul stretched the military resources of the Visigothic state, while the long-coveted northern coast of Africa remained off-limits to the expansionist kings. In the late seventh century, shortly after Isidore's demise, King Wamba (r. 672–80) enforced divisions between parishes on the peninsula in order to put an end to internal ecclesiastical conflicts, while on the military front he quelled a rebellion inspired by Arian bishops in Gaul in 673.

This military campaign is the subject of the *History of Wamba* (*Historia Wambae regis*) by Archbishop of Toledo Julian (d. 690), the last known chronicle text of the Visigothic period. Wamba's address to the troops outlines the Visigothic political structure, on the one hand, in terms of a military and religious superiority that had previously been asserted by Isidore, but on the other hand, also in terms of its geographical centrality, which the archbishop of Seville did not support. In the *Etymologies*, Isidore places Spain on the margins of the Western world ('in extremo occidente') characterizing it as *ultra*, 'because it is the last one, because there is no other land beyond it' ('ultra uel quod ultima uel quod non sit post hanc ulla, hoc est alia, terra').⁵⁰ By contrast, Wamba appears to defy Isidore's geographical sense when he proclaims Gaul as peripheral to the Visigothic kingdom, referring to the rebel province as the 'last corner of the earth' ('extremo terrae').⁵¹ However, rather than being a departure from Isidore's concept of the Visigothic political realm, Wamba's harangue represents, in fact, an attempt to reinforce Isidore's Ibero-centric world view by positioning the Visigoths at the centre stage of history.

We now approach the critical moment of Visigothic history, the reign of Rodrigo (710–11), which led to the end of the empire as a political entity. Since any hypothetically existing eyewitness testimonies of the fall of Spain to Arabs and Muslims were likely lost in the ensuing turmoil, much of the account

⁴⁹ Justo Pérez de Urbel, *San Isidoro de Sevilla. Su vida, su obra y su tiempo*, 3rd edn (León: Universidad de León, 1995; first publ. Barcelona: Labor, 1940), pp. 242–43.

⁵⁰ Isidore, *Etymologiae*, in *Etimologías: Edición bilingüe*, ed. and trans. by José Oroz Reta and Manuel-A. Marcos Casquero, 3rd edn, 2 vols (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2000), II, 14. 4. 19, p. 184, and 14. 4. 29, p. 186.

⁵¹ Julian, bishop of Toledo, *Historia Wambae*, p. 255.

of Rodrigo's fate is legendary.⁵² It is significant that six centuries later in his *Chronicon Mundi*, Lucas, bishop of Tuy, demonstrates an acute consciousness of challenges faced by the Visigothic monarchy.⁵³ Nowhere is the awareness of the failed Visigothic project more pronounced than in his assessment of the role of Count Julian, the infamous traitor who plotted with Tāriq bin Ziyād to bring down Rodrigo. Having heard that Rodrigo coveted his daughter, who had been left in royal custody, Julian mounted a political offensive on both fronts. Internationally, he incited the Franks to arm a rebellion in the northern province of Gaul. Domestically, he cajoled Rodrigo into believing that absolute peace had finally been reached within the limits of his empire. He therefore convinced Rodrigo to collect all the arms and horses that were no longer needed for war and send them to Gaul and Africa. Engaged in a civil war with the followers of another Gothic noble, Witiza, Rodrigo eventually lost Gaul and his alliances in North Africa, leaving the country defenceless before the Muslim onslaught.

In Lucas's account of the loss of Spain, Julian's malicious genius exploits the two political constants of the Gothic monarchy: the satisfaction of absolute power over the Iberian Peninsula and the unfulfilled ambition to extend rule beyond its limits. Lucas's rendering of the events leading to the fall of Spain surprises us not only with the calculated precision of Julian's treacherous act, but also with the assessment of the author that a thirteenth-century audience would still identify with the nature and political impetus of the Visigothic monarchy and would therefore appreciate the very scale and precision of Julian's treason. At this point, it is appropriate to ask whether seventh-century testimonies of Visigothic political thought had exercised a significant influence on the perspective of later Iberian Christian texts toward Muslim conquerors.

Ideologies of the Reconquest in Asturias-León

Faced with the necessity of justifying the loss of Visigothic territory and statehood to the Muslims, Asturian chronicles censure the conduct of Witiza (r. 702–10) by accusing him of betraying the project of *sublimatio*: dissolving the councils, abolishing the canons (laws adopted by Visigothic councils), and openly tolerating marriage and concubinage among the clergy. In the

⁵² Legends of Spain's fall are thoroughly explored in Patricia Grieve, *The Eve of Spain: Myths of Origins in the History of Christian, Spanish, and Jewish Conflict* (Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2009).

⁵³ Lucas, bishop of Tuy, *Chronicon mundi*, 3. 62, pp. 219–21.

Albeldensia, the loss of Visigothic territory in 711 is interpreted as punishment for the king's lack of religious scruples.⁵⁴ Conversely, Alfonso III is praised for giving a new impulse to Asturian expansion in terms reminiscent of Isidore's political theology. As the chronicler enumerates the king's accomplishments (bringing the Galicians and Basques under his rule, fending off the Berber invasions, and moving the frontier southward to the bed of the Duero River), he notes: 'eius [Adefonsi] tempore ecclesia crescit et regnum ampliatur' ('in his time the Church grew and the kingdom expanded');⁵⁵ 'sique [Adefonso] protegente diuina clementia inimicorum terminus quoddidie defecit et ecclesia Domini in maius et melius crescit' ('under Alfonsine rule the confines of the enemies diminished daily and the Church of God grew larger and better').⁵⁶ In the chronicler's view, the kingdom's territorial expansion is inseparable from its religious rebirth. The *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), while following these vectors, also underscores the self-sufficient qualities of Alfonso III, presenting him as an accomplished administrator of justice, defender of the kingdom, and a zealous servant of God ('Adefonsus magnus cum in administrando regno esset seuerus et in exercitio uellorum prouidus, in desiderio placendi summo opifici Deo ualde erat perspicuus'). In accordance with this model, Alfonso's reconquest campaigns are viewed as part of the royal obligation to defend his kingdom.

We would expect a change in the portrayal of reconquest campaigns in chronicles composed in the aftermath of the Cluniac reform and the papal call for crusade, when the model of *rex iustus* becomes superseded by what Rodríguez de la Peña identifies as the new archetype of *rex pius* — an ideological construct predicated on the increased patronage of royal power by the Church and papacy. Among the texts composed between the reigns of Fernando I and Alfonso VII, the *Chronica Naiarensis* and the *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, both attributed to Cluniac monks, are distinguished by their attempt to reverse the peninsular concept of royalty as strong and self-sufficient in favour of universal ecclesiastical tutelage of the monarchy. Opposing these concepts are the *Historia Silensis* (*Legonensis*) and Sampiro's chronicle, which take an openly anti-Cluniac stance by defending the traditional Visigothic concept of royalty and Mozarabic liturgical practices. Because they had been established by the Fourth Council of Toledo, these things represented Visigothic political and theological ideals.⁵⁷ Still, the rhetoric of the sacred in the conceptualiza-

⁵⁴ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 183.

⁵⁵ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 177.

⁵⁶ *Chronica Albeldensia*, p. 188.

⁵⁷ Rodríguez de la Peña, 'Ideología política', p. 689.

tion of the reconquest is salient in both groups of texts. Leonese chronicles identify the king as *miles Christi* on several occasions. Ordoño II (914–24) is described as ‘Christi belliger’,⁵⁸ while his victory at San Esteban de Gormaz (917) is portrayed as a triumph of faith: ‘Dedit Dominus triumphum catholico rege’.⁵⁹ In the same fashion, Ramiro II is shown victorious at Simancas (939) as a Catholic king (‘rex noster catholicus’).⁶⁰ The *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*) praises Fernando I’s zeal in expelling the Muslims and consolidating Christian rule, which becomes the driving force behind his 1064 conquest of Coimbra, a ‘city that he sought to return to the Christian faith from the pagan cult, in the name of Jesus, whom he believed to be the Saviour’ (‘quod ciuitatem illam a ritibus paganorum erui et ad fidem christianorum reuerti flagitabat, profecto in nomine Ihesu, quod saluator interpretatur’).⁶¹ The *Naiarensis* follows this fairly consistently, portraying Fernando as both a *miles Christi* protected by St James at a moment of desperation during the siege of Coimbra, and as a politician who amplifies the kingdom: ‘Fernandus, intuendo et ampliando simulque exornando regno, serenissimus princeps solio suo Legionis resideret’.⁶²

Yet when Leonese chroniclers use terms such as *terras christianorum*, *metas regni christianorum*, *fines christianorum*, they mean hardly anything beyond the Iberian Peninsula, much less the entire Christian West.⁶³ By the same token, the concept *christiani* as used in these chronicles and histories implies a confessional opposition to the Muslims that is restricted to the population of the Iberian Peninsula, not a universal cause. When the *Silensis* (*Legionensis*) describes the battle at San Esteban de Gormaz led by Ordoño II against ‘Abd-al-Rahmān III (r. 912–29) in 917, its author refers to the Christian realm in this exclusive sense: ‘Barbari, [...] littora Dorii fluminis accesserunt [...] apud Santum Stephanum de Gormaz toti christianorum regno velud ruina cominabantur’ (‘the barbarians [...] came to the banks of the Duero River, and [...] threatened to ruin the entire kingdom of the Christians’).⁶⁴

⁵⁸ *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), p. 155; *Chronica Naiarensis*, II. 40, p. 61.

⁵⁹ Sampiro’s *Chronicle* following the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), p. 310; *Chronica Naiarensis*, II. 47, p. 71.

⁶⁰ Sampiro’s *Chronicle* following the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), pp. 324–25; *Chronica Naiarensis*, II. 52, p. 74.

⁶¹ *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), pp. 188–91.

⁶² *Chronica Naiarensis*, III. 25, p. 106; III. 22, pp. 98–99.

⁶³ *Chronica Naiarensis*, II. 78, pp. 84–85; *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), pp. 173, 178.

⁶⁴ *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), p. 157.

Moreover, in their treatment of several key episodes of Iberian history, both groups of texts continue to assert the traditional vectors of royal politics. First among these episodes, the invasion by al-Manṣūr in 987 constitutes the most important political challenge in early Leonese history and is recorded in Sampiro's chronicle. It occurs during the reign of Bermudo II, and Sampiro first takes care to sketch the profile of this king as someone who ascended to power peacefully, upheld laws, and ruled judiciously ('Veremudus [...] accept regnum pacifice. Vir satis prudens; leges a Vambano principe conditas firmavit; canones aperire iussit; dilexit misericordiam et iudicium; reprobare malum studuit et eligere bonum'). Only then does he turn to al-Manṣūr's devastating campaigns in Leonese territories, characterizing them as a territorial and confessional transgression. Consequently, as he is about to desecrate the sanctuary at Compostela, the Muslim leader suffers providential punishment, being struck by fear and awe ('Ad sepulcrum uero apostoli, ut illud frangerit, ire disposuerat; sed territus rediit').⁶⁵ This episode mirrors the Vandal king Gunderic's intent to desecrate the Christian sanctuary in Mérida in Isidore's *History*: 'Cum auctoritate regiae potestatis inreuerentes manus in basilicam Vincentii martyris ciuitatis ipsius extendisset, mox dei iudicio inforibus templi daemonio coreptus interiit' ('As he reached with the authority of his royal power his sacrilegious hand toward the Basilica of Vincent, the martyr of that city, he was destroyed by the devil and perished by the judgement of God').⁶⁶

Manifestly dedicated to Alfonso VI, the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*) emphasizes both the territorial and religious aspects of his struggle against Muslims, because the expansion of the kingdom was accompanied by the reconversion of reconquered provinces to Christianity: 'Huic [Adefonsus] uero in regnum Yspanorum ampliando, in barbaros exercendisque bellis, quanta animositas fuerit, prouintias ab eorum sacrilegis manibus retractas et in Christi fidem conuersas singulatim enumerando, [...] profabor.' ('I will relate [...] how much zeal there was in him for expanding the kingdom of the Spaniards and waging war on the barbarians, enumerating one by one the provinces extracted from their sacrilegious hands and returned to the faith of Christ').⁶⁷ Alfonso's reign was characterized by political stability in León-Castile and created an optimistic outlook for the prospects of the reconquest following the recapture

⁶⁵ Sampiro's *Chronicle* following the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), p. 172; *Chronica Naiarensis*, II. 67, p. 81.

⁶⁶ Isidore, *Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, 73, p. 292.

⁶⁷ *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), p. 119.

of Toledo (1085). However, the Almoravid invasion that took place toward the end of his rule was a significant political setback, which led to a conflict with three new successive North African powers: the Almoravids (1086), the Almohads (1147), and the Marinids (1275). Bishop Pelayo, continuator of Sampiro's chronicle toward 1118, describes the miracle of the Isidorian altar in León eight days prior to the demise of Alfonso VI in 1109. As water begins to drip from the stones of the altar, citizens interpret the miracle as a sign of tribulations that will plague Spain after the demise of the king.⁶⁸

Following Alfonso's death, the kingdom was immersed in the chaos of Urraca's rule. The *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris* is believed to have been written soon after the Almoravid defeat in Almería by the united peninsular forces, in the aftermath of the intrapeninsular conflict between Urraca, mother of Alfonso VII of León-Castile, and Alfonso the Battler of Aragon (r. 1104–34).⁶⁹ Alfonso VII, who assumed the throne at the end of the civil strife, followed the Leonese royal custom of dedicating the first decade of his reign to the political consolidation of his kingdom: he defeated Alfonso I the Battler, who had taken advantage of royal weakness in order to ravage Castile, secured the vassalage of García Ramírez of Navarre (r. 1134–50) and Ramón Berenguer IV of Barcelona (r. 1131–62), and defeated Afonso I of Portugal (r. 1139–85). Concerned with peninsular unity, the author abandons the chronological sequence of events in favour of a narrative structure composed of three thematic nuclei: (I) intrapeninsular struggles, (II) the campaigns against the Almoravids and Almohads, and (III) the Battle of Almería fought by a Christian alliance of Galicians, Leonese, Asturians, and Extremadurans aided by the Italians and the French.

The *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris* is an intriguing text, since some consider it to be the first properly crusader chronicle in the kingdom of León. We would therefore expect its scope to be that of universal Christianity.⁷⁰ This is, however, primarily salient in the concluding portion of the text titled *Poem of Almería*, where the battle over the Almoravid stronghold on the southern Andalusian coast is presented as blessed by the pope and fought by international forces under the sign of the cross.⁷¹ The chronicle certainly attributes more importance to the intercession of the Church in securing victories over Muslims: when the author relates the Almoravid siege of Toledo in the aftermath of the passing of Alfonso VI, he attributes Christian victory to the intense

⁶⁸ *Historia Silensis (Legionensis)*, pp. 332–36.

⁶⁹ Rodríguez de la Peña, 'Ideología política', p. 720.

⁷⁰ See Barton, n. 21 above.

⁷¹ *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, 'Praefatio de Almería', p. 257.

prayers of the Cluniac archbishop of Toledo, rather than the military prowess of Alfonso VII alone, and to the *auxilium* of Michael the Archangel, rather than to that of local patrons Isidore or Santiago:

Dum ista bella geruntur, archepiscopus domnus Bernardus Toletane ecclesie cum clericis et monachis et senibus et mulieribus et pauperibus postrati in terram in ecclesia sancta Marie unanimiter rogabant Dominum Deum et sanctam Mariam ut peccata regum ne rememorarentur et populorum, ne ipsi darentur in captiuitatem et gladium et mulieres in diuisionem et infantes eorum in predam et ciuitas eorum in exterminium et sancta lex Dei in opprobrium et in pollutionem et conculcationem. Sed Dominus Deus excelsus exaudiuit orationes eorum et misertus est populo suo et misit Michaellem archangelum, qui custodiret ciuitatem Toletanam et firmaret muros eius, ne rumperentur, et confortaret animos uirorum bellantium et defenderet corpora Christianorum, quod fieri non poterat, nisi Dominus eos custodiret.⁷²

(While these battles were taking place, Bernardo, the archbishop of Toledo, was prostrated with the clergy, the elderly, and the poor on the floor of Saint Mary's Church. They were begging the Lord and Mary not to remember the sins of the kings nor of the people. They prayed that they would not be killed or captured, nor that the women would become objects of infidel derision. Nor did they wish their children to be taken as booty. They prayed that the Lord would keep their city from destruction and his holy Law from reproach, dishonour, or contempt. God listened to their petitions and pitied his people. He sent Michael the Archangel to guard the city of Toledo and to strengthen its walls so that they would not be destroyed. He came to comfort the hearts of the warriors and to defend the Christians. All of this would not have been done, had the Lord decided not to guard the city, for as David said, 'Unless the Lord guards the city, they who guard it do so in vain'.)

Still, the second portion of the chronicle uses the term *Christiani* to refer to the citizens of Toledo rather than to Christians in the universal sense.⁷³ We also see this in the account of the reconquest of Coria (1142). Although it is imbued with the motifs of cleansing the impurity of the Muslim faith ('mundata est ab inmunditia barbarice gentis et a contaminatione Mahometis est'), what is referred to as the vindicated Christian land is again the realm situated within the former political confines of the Visigothic kingdom: 'antiquitus fuerat sedes episcopalis tempore Ildefonsi archiepiscopi et Recaredi regis, quando tota illa terra Christianorum erat, a Mediterraneo usque ad mare Oceanum' ('formerly it was an episcopal see during the time of Archbishop Ildefonso

⁷² *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, II. 6, pp. 197–98.

⁷³ *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, II. 8, p. 199.

and King Reccared, when all that territory belonged to Christians from the Mediterranean to the Ocean sea').⁷⁴

There is, however, another remarkable change: the second book of this chronicle, which is dedicated to the anti-Muslim campaigns of Alfonso VII, contains the first mention of the chanting of *Te Deum* as a formal expression of joy and rapture. This is absent from the first book, which treats Alfonso's campaigns against his rival peninsular monarchs. This hymn is said to have been performed following the reconquest of Oreja in 1139 and the defeat of the local Muslim kings of Seville and Córdoba in 1143.⁷⁵ Both ceremonies were conducted by Raymond, a Cluniac from Sauvetât who became the archbishop of Toledo (r. 1125–52). The new liturgical practice is thus registered several decades after the introduction of the Roman liturgy into Spain by the Council of Burgos (1080) and the establishment of Cluniacs at peninsular dioceses.

These references are significant, since the alignment of Iberian liturgy with the Roman ritual signals the increasing influence of Spain's Cluniac bishops on peninsular affairs. The extant copies of Mozarabic antiphonaries show no evidence that the Gregorian hymn *Te Deum* formed part of Mozarabic liturgy. Isidore prescribed the chanting of psalms followed by *Alleluia* on solemn occasions, attributing this practice to Visigothic tradition: 'Verumtamen apud nos secundum antiquam Hispaniarum traditionem praeter dies jejuniorum, vel Quadragesimae omne tempore cantatur *Alleluia*; scriptum est enim: Semper laus ejus in ore meo. [...] Post consummatam psalmorum sive lectionum *Alleluia* in fine cantatur.' ('We, however, in accordance with the ancient tradition of the Spains, always sing *Alleluia*, except on days of fasting and during Lent; for it is written: "My mouth always praises Him." [...] Upon finishing the Psalms or a reading, *Alleluia* is chanted at the end').⁷⁶ However, Asturian and

⁷⁴ *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, II. 66, p. 225.

⁷⁵ 'Datum est castellum et implete sunt turres militum Christianorum et eleuata sunt uexilla regalia super excelsam turrem. Sed hi, qui tenebant uexilla, clamabant excelsa uoce et dicebant: "Viuat Adefonsus imperator Legionis et Toleti"! Hoc audientes et uidentes episcopi et totus clerus et omnes, qui erant in castra, leuauerunt manus suas ad celum et dixerunt: "Te Deum laudamus, te Dominum confitemur" et cetera.' *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, II. 59, p. 222.

'Et sic uenerunt ante fores ecclesie sancte Marie, ubi erat presens imperatrix domna Berengaria, uxor imperatoris, et archiepiscopus Toletanus domnus Raymundus et omnis clerus et omnes milites ciuitatis et totus populus, qui uenerat ad uidendum miraculum et uictoriam. Sed postquam uiderunt capita regum Sarracenorum in summitate hastarum [...] intrauerunt in ecclesiam sancte Marie cum gaudio magno cantantes et dicentes "Te Deum laudamus, te Dominum confitemur" usque ad finem.' *Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris*, II. 75, p. 230.

⁷⁶ Isidore, *De officiis ecclesiasticis*, in *Sancti Isidori, Hispalensi episcopi, opera omnia*, ed. by

Leonese chronicles are generally silent with respect to whether the chanting of hymns accompanied celebrations of Christian victories over Muslims. Only the *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*) mentions that the Iberian clergy staunchly adhered to the Mozarabic (also known as Toledan, or Isidorian) ritual during Christmas celebrations and in the presence of Fernando I, when the chant was conducted 'the Toledan way' ('more Toletano canebant').⁷⁷

But it is Castilian texts that provide testimony that by the second third of the thirteenth century, the close association between the Visigothic concept of war and that of the reconquest was no longer active. The *Chronica latina regum Castellae* (*Latin Chronicle of the Kings of Castile*, c. 1230–39), attributed to the Cluniac Juan de Osma, and Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada's *Historia de rebus Hispanie* (1243) register the tipping point of the reconquest as victories in the Iberian south shift the peninsular balance of power in favour of Christian forces. As the reconquest advances throughout the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, the motifs of joy (*gaudia*) and rapture (*laetitia*), both of biblical origin, begin to be introduced into historical accounts. They appear in descriptions of those reconquest campaigns that result in the re-establishment of royal jurisdiction over formerly Visigothic territories. In the *Chronica latina regum Castellae*, for example, the entrance of Fernando III (1217–52) into Córdoba (1236) and the raising of the royal flag above its mosque cause an 'ineffable confusion and grief [...] to the Saracens and, by contrast, [...] ineffable joy to the Christians' ('confusionem et planctum [...] ineffabilem Sarracenis, et e contrario [...] gaudium ineffabile Christianis').⁷⁸ In Jiménez de Rada's version of the Córdoba campaign, the clergy conducts a liturgical ceremony in which the chanting of *Te Deum* marks the joy and rapture of victory: 'et cepit [...] gaudii et leticie vox audiri, clero cum pontificibus aclamante: *Te Deum laudamus, te Dominum confitemur*'.⁷⁹ By the thirteenth century, this becomes an institutionalized practice: Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, himself a promoter of integration with Rome, describes a gathering of the Cluniac bishops of Palencia, Sigüenza, Osma, Plasencia, and Avila, who accompany royal troops in the battle at Navas de Tolosa (1212) and commence the chant of *Te Deum* at the first indication of Muslim defeat.⁸⁰

Faustino Arévalo, *PL*, LXXXIII (Turnhout: Brepols, 1807), pp. 737–824 (sec. 13. 3–4, p. 751).

⁷⁷ *Historia Silensis* (*Legionensis*), p. 105.

⁷⁸ *Chronica latina regum Castellae*, p. 99.

⁷⁹ Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, IX. 16, pp. 298–99.

⁸⁰ Jiménez de Rada, *Historia*, VIII. 9, p. 274.

Concurrently, by the thirteenth century, as the propaganda of the reconquest as a holy war increasingly becomes seen as a privilege of the Church, in Castilian chronicles the scope of *just war* appears to be limited to intra-Christian and other local disputes. In the *Chronica latina regum Castellae*, such use covers both the intrapeninsular conflicts between Christians (for example, between Alfonso VII of Castile and León and Alfonso I of Aragon, or between Alfonso VIII of Castile (r. 1158–1214) and Sancho VII of Navarre (r. 1194–1234)) and conflicts between Christians and Muslims during the reign of Alfonso VIII. The first such episode is found in the account of the struggle between Alfonso VII and Alfonso I of Aragon, who had ravaged Castile and León before the Leonese king came of age. When the Castilians, Leonese, and Galicians resolved to protest against the Aragonese king coaching the adolescent son of Queen Urraca to lead the campaign, Alfonso I retreated, realizing that he was not the legitimate lord of the land and had no just cause for war: ‘Quod uidens [...] et intelligens quia non haberet iustam causam belli contra legitimum terre dominum, relicto regno, recessit in terram suam’ (‘As he saw [...] and understood that he had no just cause for war against the legitimate lord of that land, having abandoned the kingdom, he retreated into his own land’).⁸¹ On another occasion, Sancho VII of Navarre erected a fortified settlement in Logroño, since he believed he could justify his claims to Castilian territory by his ties of kinship to Alfonso VIII:

Eadem tempestate rex Nauarre Sancius, qui regi Castelle attinebat in secundo gradu consanguinitatis ex utraque parte, hedificauit castrum quoddam iuzta uineas de Loconio, quod uocauit Coruum; regnum et Castelle cepit ex illa parte uastare, cum ullam iustam causam belli crederetur habere.⁸²

(At that time Sancho, king of Navarre, who was related to the king of Castile by the second degree of kinship on both sides, erected a castle adjacent to the vineyards of Logroño, which he named Corvo; from there he began incursions into Castile, since he believed he had a just cause for war.)

The final episode refers to a peace treaty between Alfonso VIII and Zayd, a local king of Valencia. The dissolution of the caliphate of Córdoba in 1031 led to the establishment of several smaller nuclei of power in the Iberian south and east, known as the *taifa* kingdoms, which became the principal adversaries of the Christian kings. The chronicler emphasizes that the Muslim ruler of

⁸¹ *Chronica latina regum Castellae*, p. 4.

⁸² *Chronica latina*, p. 16.

Valencia acts unjustly by breaking a vassalage agreement he had signed with the Christian king: 'Pactum firmatum est inter eos, quod postea idem Aceit de Valencia tanquam uilis apostata nulla iusta causa ductus dirupit' ('A peace treaty was signed between them, which later the aforementioned Zayd of Valencia broke like a vile apostate, without any just cause').⁸³

Still, although the Cluniac authorship of the *Chronica latina regum Castellae* was a likely factor in shaping the image of Alfonso VIII as a pious, universalist Christian king, both holy, or sacred, war and just war ethics inform the account of his defeat by the Almohads at Alarcos (1195) and the story of the Castilian victory at Navas de Tolosa (1212). In this portion of the chronicle, the territorial loss at Alarcos is set against, and transcended by, a sublime victory at Navas. At Alarcos, the king confronts the Almohads on the frontier of his kingdom in order to prevent the possibility of the Almohads trespassing into Leonese-Castilian territory: 'Malebat etenim uitam et regnum exponere tanto discrimini et mittere uoluntati Dei pugnando contra supra dictum regem Maurorum, qui potentior et dicior Sarracenis omnibus habebatur, quam sustinere quod idem rex regnum eis intraret per spacium quantumcumque.' ('He preferred to expose his life and kingdom to such great peril and submit to God's will fighting the abovementioned king of the Moors, considered the most powerful and rich of all Saracens, rather than let him trespass on any amount of his kingdom's territory').⁸⁴ At Navas, by contrast, the king is portrayed as a crusader avenging the defeat at Alarcos. Upon hearing that Alfonso VIII had sent the archbishop of Toledo and his legates to France and other Christian regions in order to invite Catholics to join in the upcoming war, the Moroccan king allegedly claimed that he was powerful enough to fight a war 'against those who worshipped the sign of the Cross' ('fertur dixisse rex Marroquitanus quia ipse potens erat bellare contra omnes qui signum Crucis adorabant').⁸⁵

The evolution of chronicle narratives of war reveals that the notions of peninsular centrality and the close synthesis of royal and ecclesiastical power, which originated in Visigothic political discourse, underwent a gradual re-examination under the increased pressure for integration with European Christianity. First, the main tenets of Visigothic political theology — territorial expansion and spiritual sublimation — were adapted to the ideology of a Christian war against Muslims in Asturias and León. They continued to be influential and complementary until the thirteenth century, despite the ever-increasing chron-

⁸³ *Chronica latina*, p. 66.

⁸⁴ *Chronica latina*, pp. 13–14.

⁸⁵ *Chronica latina*, p. 32.

icle evidence of Cluniac and Roman influences on the Castilian vision of the reconquest. Although after the year 1000, Iberian contact with Cluny was ongoing — starting with the reign of Sancho III the Great of Navarre (r. 1004–35) and developing via financial support of the Cluniacs by Fernando I (r. 1037–65) and Alfonso VI of León-Castile (r. 1065/72–1109) — there is little evidence to support the claim that this contact quickly generated a sentiment for the renewed vindication of universal Christianity that replaced the paradigm of territorial war. Rather, as Charles Bishko reminds us, Fernando I, and especially Alfonso VI, transformed their originally private alliances with Cluny into explicit political bonds in order to counter papal interventions by Alexander II and Gregory VII in the affairs of León and Castile, respectively.⁸⁶ The Leonese and later Castilian alliance with Cluny served to prevent papal claims of sovereignty over Iberian territory that had been reclaimed from the Muslims, and allowed for continued local control over Iberian political and financial matters. It is not until the thirteenth century and primarily in Castilian historiographical texts that we see a shift from a king-centric model of power, predicated on the monarch being the sole defender of the kingdom, albeit blessed and protected by Isidore of Seville, to a model that reflects the increased patronage of the Church. Cluniac bishops begin to play a greater role in the institutionalization of victory celebrations in reconquest campaigns, seen as occasions to reaffirm Roman jurisdiction over Iberian affairs. By then, the ethic of a holy, or sacred, war, with its characteristic allusions to the symbol of the cross, would begin to underlie accounts of Castilian victories over Muslims.

⁸⁶ Charles J. Bishko, 'Fernando I and the Origins of the Leonese-Castilian Alliance with Cluny', in Charles J. Bishko, *Studies in Medieval Spanish Frontier History* (London: Variorum, 1980), pp. 1–136 (pp. 68–78).

TOWARD A PHILOSOPHY OF UNITY IN RODRIGO JIMÉNEZ DE RADA'S *HISTORIA DE REBUS HISPANIE*

In Chapters 4 and 5, I discussed how Asturian and, later, Leonese chronicles composed between the late ninth and twelfth centuries defined the scope of royal power and its adversarial realm by adapting relevant provisions of the *Lex Wisigothorum* to suit the evolving model of kingship. From the twelfth century onward, however, as chronicle texts composed on the periphery of the kingdom of León began to manifest the desire to break from the Leonese sphere of influence, they did so by disassociating themselves from the Visigothic myth of origins developed in Asturian and Leonese chronicles. These compositions include three Portuguese works composed after 1185: the *Vita Sancti Theotonii*, the *Chronica Gothorum* (also known as the *Chronicon Lusitanum*), which covers events from Visigothic migrations in the fourth century AD through the reign of Afonso Henriques, the first king of Portugal (r. 1139–85), and the *De expugnatione Scalabis*, a late twelfth–early thirteenth-century short chronicle text describing Afonso's siege of Santarém. Portuguese events were also incorporated into the Navarrese Romance composition *Liber regum*, dated between 1196 and 1209.¹ Among the first texts that projected a Castilian perspective,

¹ *De expugnatione Scalabis, Vita Sancti Theotonii, Chronica Gothorum*, in *Portugaliae Monumenta Historica a saeculo octauo post Christum usque ad quintumdecimum*, ed. by Alexandre Herculano and Joaquim José da Silva Mendes Leal, 4 vols (Lisbon: Academia das Ciências de Lisboa, 1856), 1: *Scriptores*, pp. 79–88, 93–95, and 5–17. See also *El 'Liber regum': estu-*

the earliest testimony is the *Chronica Naiarensis*, a Latin composition dated c. 1190 and believed to have been written by a Cluniac monk of French origin at the monastery of Santa María la Real of Nájera.²

But in the pantheon of mediaeval historians and chroniclers, it is Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada (between 1170 and 1180–1247) who holds the grand honour of being considered the inventor of Castile. Rodrigo was the archbishop of Toledo, and he served as grand chancellor under Alfonso VIII of Castile (r. 1158–1214) and, until 1230, under Fernando III of Castile/León (r. 1217/30–52).³ The *Historia de rebus Hispanie* was composed between 1243 and 1246, and survives in several thirteenth- and fourteenth-century manu-

dio linguistico, ed. by Louis Cooper, Anejos del Archivo de Filología Aragonesa, 5 (Zaragoza: Institución 'Fernando el Católico', 1960); Francisco Bautista, 'Original, versiones e influencia del *Liber regum*: estudio textual y propuesta de *stemma*', *e-Spania*, online since 11 February 2010, DOI: 10.4000/e-spania; Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *Los españoles en la historia. Ensayo introductorio de Diego Catalán* (Madrid: Espasa Calpe, 1982; first publ. 1947).

² *Crónica Najerense*, ed. and introd. by Antonio Ubieto Arteta, 2nd edn (Zaragoza: Anubar, 1985), p. 30. See also Juan A. Estévez Sola, 'La fecha de la *Crónica Najerense*', *La Corónica*, 23.2 (1995), 94–103.

³ Scholarly interest in Jiménez de Rada's legacy has largely been historical, focusing on his pragmatic leadership in affairs of Church, state, and citizenry in thirteenth-century Spain. Earlier works include Manuel Ballesteros Gaibrois, *Don Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada* (Barcelona: Labor, 1943; first publ. 1936); Hilda Grassotti, 'Don Rodrigo Ximénez de Rada, gran señor y hombre de negocios en la Castilla del siglo XIII', *CHE*, 55–56 (1972), 1–302. More recent studies include Peter Linehan, 'On Further Thought: Lucas of Tuy, Rodrigo of Toledo and the Alfonsine Histories', *AEM*, 27 (1997), 415–36; Derek W. Lomax, 'Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada como historiador', in *Actas del V Congreso Internacional de Hispanistas celebrado en Burdeos del 2 al 8 de septiembre de 1974*, ed. by Maxime Chevalier (Bordeaux: Instituto de estudios Ibéricos e Iberoamericanos, 1977), pp. 587–92; Lucy K. Pick, 'Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada and the Jews: Pragmatism and Patronage in Thirteenth-Century Toledo', *Viator*, 28 (1997), 203–22, and *Conflict and Coexistence: Archbishop Rodrigo and the Muslims and Jews of Thirteenth-Century Spain* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2004).

Among literary critics, the *De rebus Hispanie* has recently emerged from the shadow of Spain's first vernacular history, Alfonso X's *Estoria de España*, having long been regarded as Alfonso's erudite source material. Alan Deyermond, for example, comments on Jiménez de Rada's allegorical conceptualization of the fall of Spain to Islam and its resurrection in the reconquest as a precursor to what would become *Estoria de España's* organizing principle, in 'The Death and Rebirth of Visigothic Spain in the "Estoria de España"', *Revista Canadiense de Estudios Hispánicos*, 9 (1985), 345–67. The comprehensive colloquium 'Rodrigue Jimenez de Rada: histoire, historiographie', organized by Georges Martin of the Séminaire Interdisciplinaire de Recherches sur l'Espagne Médiévale in October 2002, was a major effort to renew the Jiménez de Rada scholarship, resulting in a collective issue of the *CLHM*, 26 (2003).

scripts.⁴ Rodrigo's text expresses the moment of genesis of Castilian monarchical power, when the success of Andalusian reconquest battles (Navas de Tolosa, 1212; Baeza, 1227; Úbeda, 1234; Córdoba, 1236) called for the development of ideological bases for the integration of the territory south of Toledo, while at the same time another extraordinary territorial expansion achieved through the unification of León and Castile by Fernando III in 1230 conferred on Castile political primacy over the kingdom of León.⁵ These momentous changes made urgent the elaboration of a new model of royal legitimacy. As Geoffrey West says with reference to León and Castile, 'now was the time to create a past for their present'.⁶

In a radical departure from the Astur-Leonese tradition, Rodrigo created a vision of Castilian history decoupled from the Visigothic legal heritage. Instead, as Georges Martin points out, he brought to the fore the emancipation of Castilian nobles from Leonese jurisdiction at the end of the tenth century.⁷ For Jiménez de Rada, the election of two noblemen, Nuño Rasura and Laín Calvo, known as the judges of Castile, constituted an act of rebellion against the kings of León — and because it placed Castile under its own jurisdiction, it laid the political foundation for the new kingdom.⁸ In Martin's interpretation, by underscoring the role of local magnates at the foundational moment of Castilian history, Jiménez de Rada, who was a scion of two Castilian and Navarrese aristocratic families (the Haro and the Hinojosa) sought to define the new model of Castilian royal power as a social contract between a generous king and a loyal aristocracy.⁹

⁴ For the manuscript history of the *De rebus Hispanie*, see Juan Fernández Valverde, *Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada. Historia de los hechos de España* (Madrid: Alianza Universidad, 1989), pp. 30–33.

⁵ José Manuel Nieto Soria, 'La monarquía como conflicto de legitimidades', in *La monarquía como conflicto en la corona castellano-leonesa (c. 1230–1504)*, dir. by José Manuel Nieto Soria (Madrid: Silex, 2006), pp. 13–72 (p. 19); José Manuel Nieto Soria, 'La monarquía fundacional de Fernando III', in *Fernando III y su tiempo (1201–1252)*, ed. by Fundación Sánchez-Albornoz (Ávila: Fundación Sánchez-Albornoz, 2003), pp. 31–66; On Leonese-Castilian rivalry, see Linchan, 'On Further Thought', pp. 415–36.

⁶ Geoffrey West, 'The Destiny of Nations: Treatment of Legendary Material in Rodrigo of Toledo's *De rebus Hispania*', in *The Medieval Mind: Hispanic Studies in Honour of Alan Deyermond*, ed. by Ian Macpherson and Ralph Penny (London: Tamesis, 1997), pp. 517–33 (p. 519).

⁷ Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, v. i–ii, pp. 148–51.

⁸ Georges Martin, 'Noblesse et royauté dans le *De rebus Hispaniae* (livres 4 à 9)', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 101–21; Fernández Valverde, *Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada. Historia*, pp. 34–36.

⁹ Georges Martin, 'La invención de Castilla (Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, *Historia de rebus*

In developing this concept, Rodrigo avails himself of the *Chronica Naiarensis*, which incorporates the first known textual testimony of the legend of the judges; the *Naiarensis* is also the first historiographical text to incorporate Castilian epic sources. In what constitutes the first departure from the annalistic model, wherein the exposition of events is associated with chronological markers, the *Naiarensis* is organized thematically, with a tripartite division reflecting affairs of the Visigoths, Asturias-León, and Castile.¹⁰ This same compositional framework lies at the base of Rodrigo's narrative, which incorporates the origins of the Visigoths and the history of the Visigothic kingdom until its fall (Books I–III) followed by the history of Asturias (Book IV), León (Books V–VII), and Castile (from its origins in Book V to Book IX). The division of the *De rebus Hispanie* into nine books is an early modern phenomenon: it is not found in any of its thirteenth-century Latin manuscripts or their Romance versions, and appears for the first time in Sancho de Nebrija's 1545 edition of Rodrigo's history.¹¹ However, Rodrigo did group the material thematically, and he introduced compositional novelty by dividing his account into chapters for ease of reading.¹² The emergence of such a segmentation technique is attributed to the demands of the new university culture, to which Rodrigo fully belonged, having studied law in Bologna and theology in Paris. This new textual culture, which commanded an increase in the amount and the speed of reading, also made possible a shift from chronicle to large historical compilation. Rodrigo utilizes virtually every available source of peninsular history, including Isidore's *Historia de regibus Gothorum*, Julian's *Historia Wambae regis*, the *Chronicle of 754*, the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, the chronicles of Sampiro and Pelayo, the *Historia Silense*, and Lucas

Hispaniae, V). Identidad patria y mentalidades políticas', paper posted 12 November 2006, <http://hal-univ-paris13.archives-ouvertes.fr/docs/00/11/32/84/PDF/LA_INVENCI_N_DE_CASTILLA.pdf> [accessed 25 June 2014]. See also Georges Martin, *Les juges de Castile; Mentalités et discours historique dans l'Espagne médiévale* (Paris: Klincksieck, 1992), p. 294.

¹⁰ Alberto Montaner Frutos, 'El proyecto historiográfico del *Archetypum Naiarense*', *e-Spania*, online since 3 March 2009, DOI: 10.4000/e-spania.

¹¹ *Reverendissimi ac Illustrissimi Domini Roderici Toletanae Dioecesis Archiepiscopi rerum in Hispania gestarum Chronicon Libri novem nuperrime excussi, et ab iniuria oblivionis vindicati*, ed. by Sancho de Nebrija (Granada: Xanthus et Sebastianus Nebrissensis, 1545).

¹² Inés Fernández Ordoñez, 'La técnica historiográfica del Toledano', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 187–221. See also John Ward, 'From Chronicle and History to Satire, Travelogue and *Sermo*: The Decline of the Monastic Chronicle in Twelfth- and Thirteenth-Century Europe', in *The Medieval Chronicle II. Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on the Medieval Chronicle. Driebergen/ Utrecht, 16–21 July 1999*, ed. by Erik Kooper (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2002), pp. 268–80.

of Tuy's *Chronicon mundi*. Rodrigo is also, alongside Lucas, the first peninsular historian to complement his sources with legendary material.¹³

Rodrigo's, therefore, is an integrated version of Spain's history: rather than rejecting non-Castilian strands of legitimizing and mythologizing discourse, he incorporates Visigothic, Mozarabic, Asturian, and Leonese chronicle sources in order to present Castile and its monarchy as actors that reconcile the search for Iberian unity with the demands of its diversity. Such a broadly conceived vision of history required a profound reconceptualization of Iberian space and time. Intellectual and cultural exchange across the ethnic and religious boundaries of the Mediterranean provides a particularly useful locus of analysis of Jiménez de Rada's approach to Spain's past, since the *De rebus Hispanie* defines Spain, rather paradoxically, as a space with open borders, yet still an uncompromisingly Christian space, one in whose shaping Jiménez de Rada has a direct stake as a statesman and a writer of history. But in addition to being a political history of the ascent of Castile, *De rebus Hispanie* is also an ecclesiastical history, in which Jiménez de Rada, who became the archbishop of Toledo in 1209, legitimizes his ambition to be the primate of all Spain and, as Peter Linehan has firmly established, contends with another one of his great contemporaries, Bishop of Tuy Lucas, who considered himself an ecclesiastical heir to Isidore of Seville. Lucas, in particular, argued for the primacy of the see of Seville over that of Toledo, since the former had been the setting of two of the early Visigothic councils presided over by Isidore (619) and his predecessor Leander (590).¹⁴

Mindful of Rodrigo's purpose to not only legitimize Castile as a political centre of Spain but also his own primatial ambition as the archbishop of Toledo, I will show how this historian both develops a philosophy of history that legitimizes secular power in Castile and manipulates Mozarabic and Astur-Leonese sources to assert Toledo's pre-eminence in Iberian ecclesiastical affairs. My interpretation therefore diverges from that of Lucy Pick, who considers the *De rebus Hispanie* as primarily an ecclesiastical history and argues

¹³ In West's estimation, among the legends incorporated into the *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, those of the origins of the Goths and of the fall of Spain in 711 are non-epic in origin, while those of Bernardo el Carpio and Mainete (the young Charlemagne) are prosified epic poems. West, 'The Destiny of Nations', p. 522.

¹⁴ Peter Linehan, *History and the Historians of Medieval Spain* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993); see also, by this author, 'The Invention of Toledo', in Peter Linehan, *Historical Memory and Clerical Activity in Medieval Spain and Portugal*, Variorum Collected Studies, CS1011 (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), article XI, pp. 123–41 (pp. 130–31) (first publ. in *La fractura historiográfica: las investigaciones de Edad Media y Renacimiento desde el tercer milenio*, ed. by Francisco Javier Burguillo and Laura Mier (Salamanca: SEMYR, 2008), pp. 123–141).

that Jiménez de Rada was concerned with elevating his archiepiscopal persona above the secular powers exemplified by the king of Castile.¹⁵ Taking a closer look at Rodrigo's elaboration of the concept of political power as it fits into his philosophy of history is instrumental for our understanding of the tenuous balance Rodrigo seeks to establish between the reality of Spain's fragmentation and diversity and the desire for political and confessional unity.

On the other hand, taking into the account Rodrigo's conscious strategy to promote the primacy of Toledo among other Iberian metropolitan sees necessitates a close look at Peter Linehan's assertion that Rodrigo modifies his Asturian sources in a manner that belittles Oviedo's metropolitan status vis-à-vis that of Toledo.¹⁶ Instead, and without discarding Linehan's argument, I propose that Rodrigo, even though he never missed a chance to downplay the importance of every metropolitan centre on the Toledan periphery, felt deeply ambivalent about his own primatial claims given Toledo's Mozarabic heritage, and his historiographical manipulation was therefore not straightforward. Rodrigo *needed* Oviedo in order to cleanse Toledo of its uncomfortable past, and he systematically elevated the status of the Asturian neo-Gothic chronicle narrative while simultaneously manipulating the Mozarabic chronicle sources in a manner that discredits the Mozarabs as a community tainted by centuries of forced coexistence with Islam. Rodrigo's text is the last major Latin history, which both illuminated vernacular texts beginning with the first major Castilian compilation, the *Estoria de España* (1270–84) and itself became widely available in a Romance translation and its subsequent spinoffs. Therefore, bringing into the spotlight Rodrigo's inequitable treatment of his Mozarabic and Asturian sources is crucial for our understanding of why the Asturian myth of origins enjoyed the privileged status as the principal, if not the only, post-Visigothic narrative until modern times.¹⁷

¹⁵ Pick, *Conflict and Coexistence*, p. 22.

¹⁶ Linehan, 'On Further Thought', p. 430 and n. 70.

¹⁷ The *Historia de rebus Hispanie* appeared in its first Romance versión in 1252 or 1253 as the *Estoria de los godos* (Enrique Jerez, 'La *Historia gothica* del Toledano y la historiografía romance', *CLCHM*, 26 (2003), 223–40). It also influenced another vernacular compilation dated to about 1400 (Manuel Hijano Villegas, 'Estoria del fecho de los godos', *RLM*, 20 (2008), 211–41).

Castile: Toward a New Unity

Rodrigo's is a Gothic history: at the outset, he asserts that he will establish the continuity of Spain as an uninterrupted succession of Visigothic rulers culminating with the reign of Fernando III of Castile, whom Rodrigo declares to be their descendant. This, for Rodrigo, is a challenging task, since the true story of the Visigoths has been obscured by a haphazard succession of diverse rulers, untrustworthy sources, and historians who, with equal eagerness, represented both exemplary and ignominious actors of history. Rodrigo then makes it clear that he inherits the historiographic tradition of Eusebius-Jerome and Isidore, and that his history is illuminated by the Catholic doctrine — because truth matters.¹⁸ Although a reader will infer that Rodrigo considers any deviation from these vectors not to be a good thing, this historian is deeply engaged with diversity and homogeneity, multiplicity and uniformity, rupture and continuity. Not only does he regard these categories as dilemmas that have shaped the history of the Iberian Peninsula but he also explores these concepts in their epistemological dimension, crafting the *De rebus Hispanie* as a philosophical history.

Mediterranean cultural traffic, and in particular the philosophical exchange among peninsular Christians, Jews, and Muslims, is a useful tool for approaching Rodrigo's concept of history and understanding his contribution to historiographical renovation. By the mid-thirteenth century, Castile had reached a hitherto unseen degree of exposure to Christian, Jewish, and Muslim influences. On the one hand, the Cluniac reform, spearheaded by Alfonso VI (1072–1109), had been in progress for about a century and a half, leading to Spain's better integration with the Christian West. Cluniac promoters of Christian unification had largely replaced the Mozarabic clergy through a concerted campaign led by Jiménez de Rada's predecessor Bernard of Cluny, the first archbishop of Toledo after its reconquest from the Muslims (r. 1086–1124).¹⁹ Himself a promoter of Christian universalism and learning, Jiménez de Rada praised the arrival of educated foreigners from across the Pyrenees ('Galliarum [...] de diuersis locis uiros honestos et litteratos').²⁰ One of these men of letters was Raymond of Sauvetât (r. 1125–52), an archiepiscopal successor to Bernard who established translating activity in the old Visigothic cap-

¹⁸ Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, Prologue, pp. 5–7.

¹⁹ See Juan Francisco Rivera Recio, *La Iglesia de Toledo en el siglo XII (1086–1208)*, Vestigios del pasado, 3, 2 vols (Rome: Iglesia Nacional Española, 1966–), II: *Los arzobispos de Toledo en la Baja Edad Media (s. XII–XV)* (Toledo: Diputación Provincial, 1969).

²⁰ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VI, 26, pp. 209–10.

ital of Toledo.²¹ In the meantime, many of the Jews who had fled northwards as a result of Almoravid and Almohad persecutions had chosen Toledo as a safe haven, and became an important vehicle in the transmission of culture from al-Andalus.²² The Toledo in which Jiménez de Rada resided was one of Europe's most ethnically diverse and intellectually vibrant cities. From there, Rodrigo ran the affairs of the diocese, oversaw translating activity, such as Michael Scotus's translation of Averroës' works between 1217 and 1230, and led the reconquest at a time when Christian Spain managed to briefly unite peninsular Christians in the victory at Navas de Tolosa (1212).²³ The latter event spearheaded an influx of *mudéjar* (reconquered Muslim) population into Castile, a migration that was to have a profound influence on the fabric of local life.²⁴ Located on the Christian-Muslim frontier and harbouring a large and influential Jewish community while being ruled by Christians, Toledo fully embodied Spain's historical dilemma of reconciling unity and diversity. In Rodrigo's own words:

Cum igitur Hispaniarum successus uariorum principum cruentis cladibus iteratus et linguam mutauerit et originem sue gentis pluribus intercepta dominiis sit oblita, iam fere gens et origo incolarum Hispanie ignoratur.²⁵

(Since therefore the repeated successions of various princes of Spain by bloody battles changed both the tongue and origin of its race, which, being interrupted by many dominions, was obliterated, now both the identity and the origin of the inhabitants of Spain are almost unknown.)

²¹ See Angel González Palencia, *Arzobispo Don Raymundo de Toledo* (Barcelona: Labor, 1942). More recently, greater translating activity has been attributed to the patronage of Raymond's successor Iohannes (1152–66). See Marie-Thérèse d'Alverny, 'Translations and Translators', in *La transmission des textes philosophiques et scientifiques au Moyen Age*, ed. by Charles Burnett (Aldershot: Variorum, 1994), pp. 421–62 (p. 445).

²² José S. Gil, *La escuela de traductores de Toledo y los colaboradores judíos* (Toledo: Instituto Provincial de Investigaciones y Estudios Toledanos, 1985); Marie-Thérèse d'Alverny and Georges Vaida, 'Marc de Tolède, traducteur d'Ibn Tumart', *Al-Andalus*, 16 (1951), 99–140 and 17 (1952), 1–56. See also Jonathan Ray, 'Between the Straits: The Thirteenth Century as a Turning Point for Iberian Jewry', *JMIS*, 4 (2012), 101–05.

²³ Miguel Cruz Hernández, *Historia de la filosofía española. Filosofía hispano-musulmana* (Madrid: Asociación Española para el progreso de las ciencias, 1957), p. 213.

²⁴ See Juan Zozaya Stabel-Hansen, "'Deus ex machina?'" Economic and Technological Progress in Castile at the Time of Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada', *JMIS*, 4 (2012), 119–23; Juan Carlos Ruiz Sousa, 'Castile and al-Andalus after 1212: Assimilation and Integration of Andalusí Architecture', *JMIS*, 4 (2012), 125–34.

²⁵ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, Prologue, p. 6.

As he sets out to rediscover what he believes to be the lost origins of Spain, which may hold clues to its present and future, Jiménez de Rada defines his method of inquiry against the backdrop of the contemporary philosophical debate on the nature of knowledge. What merits a brief overview here, in particular, is the Iberian side of an epistemological polemic between rationalists and theologians, which had long been debated in Muslim and Jewish communities in and outside al-Andalus, and which, by the mid-thirteenth century, had extended to Christian Europe.²⁶ As we shall see, it has a palpable bearing on Rodrigo's approach to history.

One of the central activities of the Toledan translators was the rendering of Aristotelian works from Arabic into Latin and their subsequent dissemination in Western Europe, where, in the decades preceding the composition of the *De rebus Hispanie*, rational philosophy had become a subject of an increasingly bitter controversy. Yet despite a series of papal prohibitions on the study of Aristotle, the first of which struck the University of Paris in 1215, the Christian camp would continue studying his works relatively unobstructed. Averroës' commentaries on *De Anima* and *Metaphysics* reached Paris by about 1225.²⁷ Some of the most widely circulated texts attributed to Aristotle were, however, Neoplatonic and of Near Eastern and Iberian provenance. One such text studied in Paris, titled *Liber Aristotelis de expositione bonitatis purae* (*Kitāb fī maḥd al-khair*, or *Liber de causis*), became so widespread and respected as a work of Aristotle that it formed part of the official university curriculum in Jiménez de Rada's lifetime.²⁸ Translated into Latin by Gerard of Cremona (d. 1187), *The*

²⁶ See John Inglis, 'Towards a Balanced Historiography of Medieval Philosophy', introd. to *Medieval Philosophy and the Classical Tradition in Islam, Judaism and Christianity*, ed. by John Inglis (London: Curzon, 2002), pp. 1–17 (pp. 9–10).

²⁷ Abdelali Elamrani-Jamal, 'La réception de la philosophie arabe à l'université de Paris au XIII^e siècle', in *The Introduction of Arabic Philosophy into Europe*, ed. by Charles E. Butterworth and Blake Andrée Kessel (Leiden: Brill, 1994), pp. 31–39 (p. 36). See also Cruz Hernández, *Historia de la filosofía*, p. 215.

²⁸ 'Statutum facultatis artium de modo docendi et regendi in artibus, deque libri que legendi essent', *Chartularium Universitatis parisiensis*, ed. by Henricus Denifle, 4 vols (Paris: Delalain, 1889–97), I (1889), pp. 246 and 278. Arabists and Latinists still dispute the authorship of the *Liber de causis*. The former believe it to have been originally composed in tenth-century Baghdad on the basis of the Proclean *Elements of Theology* and then translated at Toledo in the twelfth century by Gerardus of Cremona, while the latter credit with its composition and translation the converted Jew Ibn Dawūd, or Juan Hispano, a Toledan scholar. It is agreed, however, that Spain was an important hub in the transmission of this text before it became known to Europe in the last quarter of the twelfth century. See Georges C. Anawati, *Études de philosophie musulmane* (Paris: J. Vrin, 1974), pp. 158–70.

Book of Causes was a summary of the Proclean *Elements of Theology*. This led to the intermingling of Aristotelianism and Neoplatonism. The second book, *The Teachings* (or *Theology*) of Aristotle (*Kitāb Uthūlūjīyā Aristuṭālīs*), was in fact a summary of the Plotinian *Enneads* IV–VI. The *Theology of Aristotle* was allegedly produced in ninth-century Baghdad by the adherents of *kalām*, an Islamic sect believed to have originated in ‘Abbāsīd Syria, where the *mutakallimūn* turned to Greek philosophy in order to rationalize the Qur’ānic message. On the Iberian Peninsula, the text was commented on by Avicenna (980–1037) in *Kitāb al-Insāf* (*Book of Impartial Judgment*), and is known to have influenced the first Jewish philosopher of Andalusia, Ibn Gabirol, or Avicbron (c. 1021–58), whom contemporary Europeans believed to be Muslim or Christian.²⁹

Originally developed by Plotinus in AD 250 and perfected by Proclus (AD 412–85), the Neoplatonic doctrine posits the unity of the One, or the source of being, as the prime reason, cause, and organizing principle of the universe; all living, material objects in the visible world represent the least perfect of the creations and are placed at the end of the hierarchical chain of emanations descending from the prime source. Having rediscovered Greek philosophical writings, the *mutakallimūn* posited the creation of the world in opposition to the Aristotelian principle of the eternity of the world, as postulated in his *Physics*. The establishment of the secessionist Umayyad court in Córdoba, and particularly the reign of ‘Abd-al-Raḥmān III, patron of sciences and arts, was instrumental in first transplanting Neoplatonism to Iberian soil.

Following the disintegration of Umayyad rule in 1036, Muslim and Jewish Andalusī philosophers found themselves under political pressure. Averroës (1126–98), Spain’s most consistent rationalist, had seen his views suppressed by the Almohad caliph Abū Yūsuf Ya‘qūb al-Manṣūr (r. 1184–1199), and spent the last three years of his life in exile.³⁰ Although he attempted a reconciliation between philosophy and theology in the *Decisive Treatise Determining the Connection between the Law and Wisdom* (*Kitāb faṣl al-maqāl*), the Almohad religious zealotry called instead for the kind of illuminist mysticism underlying the *Conquest of Mecca* (*Futūhāt al-Makkīya*), composed by Jiménez de Rada’s contemporary Ibn ‘Arabī (1165–1240).³¹

²⁹ See Anawati, ‘Le néoplatonisme dans la pensée musulmane’, in *Études*, pp. 155–221; Paul Kraus, ‘Plotin chez les arabes’, *Bulletin de l’Institut d’Égypte*, 23 (1940–41), 263–95; *Liber de causis*, ed. and trans. by Rafael Aguila (Bilbao: Universidad del País Vasco, 2001), introd., p. 21.

³⁰ Philipp W. Roseman, ‘Averroës’, *Medieval Iberia: An Encyclopedia*, ed. E. Michael Gerli (London: Routledge, 2003), p. 131.

³¹ See Miguel Asín Palacios, *El místico murciano Abenarabi (monografías y documentos)*

Like the Muslims, the Jewish camp was also affected by the dissolution of the caliphate of Córdoba. Under the Almoravids (1086–c. 1117) and the Almohads (c. 1147–1212), peninsular Jews, who had prospered under the caliphate, fled to Christian areas of the Iberian Peninsula and southern France. There, the pursuit of philosophy at the expense of theology gradually became regarded as an attribute of the Andalusian Jewish elite.³² As Iberian Jews further turned toward their spiritual heritage, the native of Toledo Jehuda Halevi (1075–1141) exalted the Jewish faith at the expense of rationalism in *Kuzari*, a theological disputation set in the court of a Khazar king. Reconciliatory treatises by Maimonides (1135–1204), *More Nebukhim* (*Guide of the Perplexed*) and *Sepher ha-Madda* (*Book of Knowledge*), invited similar criticism by another of Jiménez de Rada's contemporaries, the Toledan rabbi Meir Halevi Abulafia (c. 1180–1244).³³

As it was politically necessary for Spain's intellectuals to reconcile reason with the tenets of their respective religions, peninsular Neoplatonism acquired several distinct features. On the one hand, Jewish intellectuals brought Neoplatonic concepts of the emanations and of the connection between the Creator and multiple creations in the visible world to bear on the imperative of executing the commandments of the faith.³⁴ This view transpires in Halevi's paraphrasing of the *Sepher Yetzirah* (*Book of Creation*), an anonymous

(Madrid: Tipografía de la RABM, 1925).

³² David Berger, 'Judaism and General Culture in Medieval and Early Times', in *Judaism's Encounter with Other Cultures*, ed. by Jacob J. Schachter (Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson, 1997), pp. 57–141 (esp. p. 75).

³³ Berger attributes this decline of philosophical study to the migration of Spanish Jews, who had been practising philosophy in al-Andalus, to northern France, whose Jewish community had been accustomed to interpreting religious literature. Berger sees the rise of mysticism as a direct consequence of this encounter ('Judaism and General Culture', pp. 85–88). This modifies Baer's earlier perspective on the restrictions imposed on Jewish communities following the 1215 Lateran Council as a decisive factor in their turning away from rational philosophy in favour of religious spirituality. See Yitzhak Baer, *A History of the Jews in Christian Spain*, trans. by Louis Schoffman, 2 vols (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1992), I, 100–06.

³⁴ On structural similarities between Neoplatonism and the kabbalah, see Arthur Green, 'The Zohar: Jewish Mysticism in Medieval Spain', in *Essential Papers on Kabbalah*, ed. by Lawrence Fine (New York: New York University Press, 1995), pp. 27–66 (p. 33); see also Sarah Pessin, 'Jewish Neoplatonism: Being above Being and Divine Emanation in Solomon ibn Gabirol and Isaac Israeli', in *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Jewish Philosophy*, ed. by Daniel H. Frank and Oliver Leaman (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 91–110.

Neoplatonic text translated into Arabic in the early tenth century and extensively commented on by kabbalists such as Isaac the Blind and Nahmanides in the 1230s and 1240s: 'Sepher Yetzirah teaches the Deity and the unity through phenomena that are varied and multifarious for one part, but for the other they are oneness and harmony, and their unity originates from the one who puts them in order'.³⁵ On the other hand, as attempts to harmonize rational philosophy with Jewish religious tradition became unpopular early on, Iberian Jewish philosophical thought tended to suppress the notion of the descending hierarchy of emanations central to Neoplatonism in favour of the idea of ascent through knowledge. This transpires in the dialogical treatise *Yanbū' al-Ḥayāh* penned by Ibn Gabirol and known by its Latin title of *Fons Vitae* (*Fountain of Life*). Ibn Gabirol states that by taking into consideration the multiplicity that emanates from the primary being, one can arrive at the primary cause and principle of all things ('Discipulus: Est uia ad attingendum scientiam essentiae primae? Magister: [...] possibile autem hoc est, scilicet scire eam sed nonisi ex suis operibus quae ab ea generata sunt').³⁶ The Toledan translator Dominicus Gundissalinus (fl. 1162–81), a Christian who rendered the text from Arabic into Latin with the help of the Jewish convert Ibn Dawūd (d. 1215), was visibly influenced by this version of Neoplatonism in his own philosophical work, *De processione mundi*, where he similarly suppresses the hierarchy of beings according to the degree of emanations: 'Inuisibilia Dei per ea, quae facta sunt, a creatura mundi intellecta conspiciuntur. Si enim uigilanter haec uisibilia conspiciamus per ipsa eadem ad inuisibilia Dei contemplanda conscendimus.' ('God's invisible things are understood by a worldly creature through things he has made. Indeed, if we observe vigilantly these visible things, we will ascend through them to contemplate God's invisible things').³⁷

³⁵ 'Sepher Yetzirah enseña la Deydad y la unidad, por cosas que son variadas y multiplicadas por una parte, pero por otra parte son unidad y concordantes, y su union proscede del uno que las ordena.' The complete text of the *Sepher Yetzirah* is believed to have been lost; my source is Jehuda ha-Levi's *Kuzari* as translated in Antwerp by the Sephardic Jew Jacob Avendana (1630–95). Citation follows the modern Spanish edition of Jehuda Halevi, *Cuzary*, ed. by Jesús Imirizaldu (Madrid: Editora Nacional, 1979), p. 201. See also Harvey J. Hames, *The Art of Conversion: Christianity and Kabbalah in the Thirteenth Century* (Leiden: Brill, 2000), pp. 31–82.

³⁶ Ibn Gabirol, *Avenebrolis (Ibn Gebirol) Fons Vitae ex arabico in latinum translatus ab Iohanne Hispano et Dominico Gundissalino. Ex codicibus Parisinus, Amploniano, Columbino*, ed. by Clemens Baeumker (Münster: Aschendorff, 1895), 1. 3, p. 6.

³⁷ Dominicus Gundissalinus, 'Des Dominicus Gundissalinus Schrift "Von dem Hervorgange der Welt" (De processione mundi)', ed. by Georg Bülow, in *Beiträge zur Geschichte der*

It is this modified version of Neoplatonism, with its principle of the intelligibility of the Creator, that permeates the textual fabric of the *De rebus Hispanie*. Dominicus's philosophical views can be seen to display a particularly close bearing on Rodrigo's vision of history, and we can assume with a significant degree of certainty Jiménez de Rada's familiarity with the *De processione mundi*. Juan Hispano, the translator of the work who assumed deanship of the Cathedral of Toledo between 1186 and 1199, bequeathed his personal library to the cathedral. In 1236, Jiménez de Rada was faulted by two prebendaries of the cathedral for having wrongfully appropriated the books in Juan's will.³⁸ Although the titles of the books in Rodrigo's library are unknown, it is tempting to assume that he was familiar with Dominicus's text as he composed the *De rebus Hispanie*, since he follows *De processione mundi* almost verbatim in the prologue, in which he lays out his definition of history.

History, for Rodrigo, is a universal project of humanity, a continual accumulation of information about the outside world and an advancement of practical skills for the benefit of future generations:

Fidelis antiquitatis et antiqua fidelitas primeuorum doctrix et genitrix posterorum creditur actibus minorari si sibi soli se genitam reputaret. Cum enim per ea que facta sunt Dei inuisibilia percepissent, quia morte interueniente non poterant permanere ea que diuina reuelatione, studio uigilanti, doctrina, usu, memoria, intellectu circa creaturarum opera ratione preuia inuenerunt, inuestigantes experimenta rerum et enigmata figurarum futurorum noticie prouiderunt et duce spiritu presencia ceperunt et futura indagiis prenouerunt. Set obliuio, que semper memorie aduersatur, pediseca negligencia subsequente, quod diligencia adinuenit, gressu obuiio liturauit.³⁹

(The faithful antiquity and ancient fidelity of the primitive people, instructress and mother of those to come, assumed she would belittle herself if she regarded herself as having been born for her own exclusive benefit. Since they perceived the invisible things of God through things made by God, our ancestors realized that death would discontinue knowledge they had previously accumulated about the

Philosophie des Mittelalters, 40 vols (Münster: Aschendorff, 1891–1965), xxiv.3 (1925), p. 1.

³⁸ Pick, *Conflict and Coexistence*, p. 115. See also Ramón González, 'El traductor maestro Juan de Toledo', *Toletum*, 11 (1981), 177–89 (p. 182). González differentiates among 1) the Jewish convert and translator Juan Avendaño, 2) a collaborator of Dominicus Gundissalinus, translator Juan Hispano (d. 1215), and 3) the translator Juan de Toledo, whom he believes to be a canon of the church of St Mary and the author of a 1239 *Testamentum* that wills a handful of goods and several translated books by Arab philosophers to Jiménez de Rada.

³⁹ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, Prologue, p. 5.

behaviour of creatures aided by divine revelation, vigilant study, doctrine, practice, memory, and intellect. By investigating [their] experiences of things and enigmas of signs, they foresaw things to come, and, with the Spirit's guidance, perceived present things and discerned future events. But oblivion, the eternal enemy of memory, with its faithful servant negligence following, obliterated with contrary steps all that diligence had learned with contrary steps.)

Rodrigo's prologue announces a new conceptual model of historiographical writing: a philosophical history. As he adapts Neoplatonic ideas to his concept of social change, Rodrigo appears to be careful at the outset not to commit his inquiry to either rationalism or mysticism, thus avoiding the ideological pitfalls that would await a philosopher or a theologian. The archbishop of Toledo noticeably holds a middle ground between earlier Arab commentators of Aristotle, who tended toward rational epistemology, and contemporary Jewish philosophers, who were inclined to honour the spiritual tradition. If Averroës had considered reason as the primary means of arriving at the ultimate truth among the learned, while consigning revelation to less educated masses ('what is primarily intended by the Law is taking care of the greater number of people without neglecting the select few, therefore, most of the methods declared in the Law are the methods shared by the greater number with respect to the concept of ascent taking place'), history for Rodrigo is a diachronic development of human intellect whereby reason harmoniously complements divine revelation.⁴⁰ Whereas Ibn Gabirol asserts the preponderance of knowledge and activity in human life as the way to achieve unity with the prime cause ('Planum est mihi [...] scientiam esse causam finalem generationis hominis; [...] per scientiam et operationem coniungitur anima saeculo altiori'), Rodrigo defends the accumulation of knowledge and experience as a guarantor of a civilization's longevity, which is obstructed by the passage of time and its chaperones, death and oblivion, the eternal enemies of history.⁴¹

To counter the adverse effects of time on knowledge, Jiménez de Rada reasons, humanity invented letters, syllables, words, and discourse, a practical tool that enabled it to preserve and transmit knowledge about the surrounding world:

Ceterum ne desidia sapientie inimica itinera studii occultaret, illi, qui pro luce sapientiam habuerunt et eam rebus omnibus pretulerunt, figurales litteras inuenerunt,

⁴⁰ Averroës, *The Book of the Decisive Treatise Determining the Connection between the Law and Wisdom*, trans. by Charles E. Butterworth (Provo, UT: Brigham Young University Press, 2001), 5. 40, p. 24.

⁴¹ Ibn Gabirol, *Fons Vitae*, 1. 2, pp. 4–5.

quas in sillabas congesserunt ut hiis compingerent dictiones, quibus ut ex trama et stamine quasi a textentibus oratio texeretur, et per hec futuris seculis preterita ut presencia nunciarent et uigilata studia arcium liberalium et officia mechanica utiliter adinuenta scriptura posteris conseruarent.⁴²

(However, lest idleness, enemy of wisdom, should obscure ways of learning, those who had wisdom for light and preferred it to all else invented figural shapes of letters, joined them together in syllables in order to compose sayings, so that they could create discourse almost like a woven fabric, by spinning and weaving, and narrate the past as the present to the future generations, and conserve in writing for posterity the careful studies of the liberal arts and useful mechanical inventions.)

Several links to Iberian philosophers are apparent here. The interpretation of literacy as a skilled material imitation of immaterial signs may bear a relationship to one of the earlier texts in the Neoplatonic corpus, the *Theology of Aristotle*, wherein the Egyptians are credited with the invention of epigraphic inscriptions in the form of hieroglyphs achieved by imitating the Supreme *Artifex*.⁴³ Several peninsular texts echo this idea as well. The *Liber de causis* interprets causality as first bestowing being itself (existence) upon creatures and then impressing (imprinting) form upon being.⁴⁴ In the *Fons vitae*, Ibn Gabirol likewise draws a parallel between the creation of the world as an act of divine will that impresses form upon matter, and speech as an impression of ideas upon the human mind via hearing ('Creatio assimilatur uerbo quod loquitur homo, quia homo cum loquitur uerbum, forma eius et intellectus imprimitur in auditu auditoris et in intellectu eius').⁴⁵ The most elaborate image of this kind is perhaps the one found in Halevi's paraphrasing of the *Sepher Yetzirah*, where a parallel is traced between the creation of the world as an act of divine intellect and writing as a creative act of human intellect that is similar to divine artistry. The Creator is compared to an emitter of words, a weaver of diverse fabrics — someone who generates physical matter by means of creative acts:

If by pronouncing the word 'man' or by painting a man's body we were able to make his form exist, we then would have the power of divine word and writing,

⁴² Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, Prologue, p. 5.

⁴³ Pseudo Aristotle, *Teología*, ed. by Luciano Rubio (Madrid: Ediciones Paulinas, 1978), p. 10.

⁴⁴ See analysis by Leo Sweeney, 'Doctrine of Creation in *Liber de causis*', in *An Etienne Gilson Tribute*, ed. by Charles J. O'Neill (Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 1959), pp. 274–89 (esp. pp. 277–87).

⁴⁵ Ibn Gabirol, *Fons Vitae*, 5. 43, p. 336.

and we would be creators, in the same way that we have some creative capacity in our intellect.⁴⁶

The interpretation of writing as an act similar to creation may explain Jiménez de Rada's approach to his sources insofar as he implies that reading, as well as contemplating the visible world, could reveal divine mysteries. Indeed, Ibn Gabirol compares reading a text created by human beings to 'reading' the created world, arguing that both the letters of a book and the visible forms contain secret, codified meanings of things ('materia prima quae sustinet omnes formas est quasi liber depictus et uolumen lineatum'; 'est comparatio formarum sensibilibium ad animam talis qualis comparatio libri ad legentem, quia quando senserit uisus figuras eius, recordabitur anima intentionum ipsarum figurarum et suae certitudinis').⁴⁷ By similarly comparing authors with artisans, Rodrigo defines text as a palpable object through which the vanished epochs of a civilization's collective past are imprinted on the reader's mind in their immediacy ('preterita ut presencía'). Thus, although Spain's past has been rendered invisible by the passage of time and obscured by its successive settlers, textual sources of its history preserve visible, material objects, whose scrutiny can reveal the ultimate truth about Spain's origins. As the *Liber de causis* postulates, 'Every knowing entity that knows its essence has accomplished a complete return to its essence' ('Omnis sciens qui scit essentiam suam est rediens ad essentiam suam reditione completa').⁴⁸ The Neoplatonic contrast between the unity of the prime cause and the multiplicity of its creations, such as the one postulated in *De processione mundi*, is transposed in the *Historia de rebus Hispanie* into one between the unity of Spain's historical origin and the multiplicity of peoples who had successively failed to establish themselves on the Iberian Peninsula.⁴⁹

This dichotomy between Spain's single, no longer discernible origin and its many historical adversaries serves as a compositional framework for Rodrigo's wholesale revision of histories and legends, in which he searches for visible signs, material 'time capsules' of Spain's past. Whether Jiménez de Rada's source

⁴⁶ 'Si pronunciando la palabra, hombre, o pintando el cuerpo de un hombre, pudiésemos hazer existir su forma: entonces tendríamos el poder de la habla Divina, y la escritura Divina, y seríamos criadores, ansi como tenemos alguna facultad semejante, en la impresion intelectual.' Jehuda Halevi, *Cuzary*, pp. 202–03.

⁴⁷ Ibn Gabirol, *Fons Vitae*, 2. 5, p. 34 and 2. 6, p. 36.

⁴⁸ *Liber de causis*, 24 (25), p. 124.

⁴⁹ Dominicus Gundissalinus, *De processione mundi*, 20, pp. 148–49. See also David B. Burrell, C. S. C., 'The Challenge to Medieval Christian Philosophy: Relating Creator to Creatures', in *Medieval Philosophy and the Classical Tradition*, ed. by Inglis, pp. 202–16.

is historiographical or legendary, Christian or Muslim, his attention is drawn to any physical vestige that survives an historical character, a military feat, or a once-powerful but forever vanished civilization: 'In multis [...] locis inueniuntur opera ab operibus nostri temporis aliena, que tanto amplius admiramur quanto ab antiquiori tempore adhuc extant' ('In many [...] places are found works alien from the works of our time, which we admire all the more the more ancient they are').⁵⁰ Rodrigo's peculiar interest in textual references to monuments, cult objects, images, and toponyms is thus a search for all instances of human creation that point toward Spain's historical origin and render it present in Rodrigo's text — and the text, in turn, is perceived as a visible, material object of the historiographer's craft.

The first three books of the *De rebus Hispanie* deal with such marks left on the Iberian Peninsula by its successive conquerors: from the Phoenicians and the Romans to the Visigoths and the Arabs. Each invading power, despite its seemingly formidable might, leaves in its wake only traces of its former glory. Hercules, the first mythical conqueror of the Iberian Peninsula, is remembered by the towers of Gibraltar, which bear his name. These constructions represent the only surviving memory of a hero who 'erected most solid towers, which today they still call Gates of Hercules, so that they would be a memory to the newcomers' ('turre fortissimas fabricauit que essent posteris in monimentum, que adhuc hodie Gades Herculis nuncupantur').⁵¹ The Segovian aqueduct and the lighthouses in Galicia and Cádiz are the only landmarks that recall his successor, the legendary Hispanus.⁵² As Jiménez de Rada addresses the fall of the Roman Empire, his attention is drawn to a story first mentioned by Orosius and then used by Isidore in his *Historia Gothorum*: a Gothic soldier plunders ceremonial vessels from a Christian sanctuary during the sack of Rome, but returns them at the order of Alaric, the pious barbarian. Jiménez de Rada transforms this account by depicting a victor drawn to contemplate these artefacts not out of greed, but rather in awe of them being the last signs of Rome's ancient glory.⁵³

In Book IV, Jiménez de Rada turns against the Carolingian empire, traditionally an object of peninsular historiographers' scorn, by reinterpreting the episode of Charlemagne's defeat at the Navarrese town of Valcarlos (778) using

⁵⁰ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, I, 7, p. 19.

⁵¹ Jiménez de Rada, I, 4, p. 15.

⁵² Jiménez de Rada, I, 7, p. 19.

⁵³ Jiménez de Rada, II, 5, pp. 45–46. Isidore, *Historiae de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum*, long version, 16, pp. 196–99.

a motif possibly drawn from the epic cycle of Bernardo del Carpio.⁵⁴ Jiménez de Rada's attention is drawn to Charlemagne's cathedral at Aachen. Rodrigo views the cathedral as a monument erected with the purpose of perpetuating the memory of the emperor's conquests; however, the commemorative inscription reserved for Iberian campaigns remains blank, a hollow sign of defeat on a landmark of imperial grandeur. As is the case with monuments of past civilizations examined in earlier books, the void in the laudatory lines acquires a material quality as a witness to France's temporary power and Spain's enduring glory in history:

Carolus [...] indignatione et confusione deiectus, tantam multitudinem suorum extinctam deplorans et clades, quas Arabibus intulerat, paruipendens ad Germaniam repedauit, ut reparato exercitu Hispaniam retemptaret. Sed termarum deliciis interceptus exercitum crastinando obiit Aquisgrani et in glorioso tumulo sepelitur, qui erat priscarum uictoriarum epitaphiis circumscriptus, ea parte uacua remanente qua Valle Caroli uindictam minitans inglorius rediit et inultus.⁵⁵

(Dispirited, indignant, and confused, Charlemagne [...] returned to Germany deploring the loss of so many of his troops and minimizing the destruction caused by the Arabs, hoping to attack Spain once his army was reassembled. But tempted by the delights of the baths and putting off the affairs of the army, he passed away in Aachen and was laid to rest in a magnificent tomb adorned with commemorative inscriptions of his past victories, with that part remaining vacant where he returned, threatening vindication, inglorious and unavenged, from Valcarlos.)

The presence of each visible sign (or, as in the case of Aachen Cathedral, a conspicuous absence of one) reaffirms something immutable in Spain's diachronic development, namely its staunch refusal, despite multiple waves of invading settlers, to deviate from the course of history set by the Creator.

Yet in the midst of this spectacle of ruins, left behind by powerful conquerors of Spain in the wake of their own destruction, the survival of the Muslim empire poses a troubling question for the future. Unlike other foreign powers, the Muslim state seemed to rejuvenate itself with each new wave of invasions. In 1195, the Almohads, a radical sect of Moroccan provenance, dealt a crushing defeat to Alfonso VIII of Castile at Alarcos, prompting a European campaign of retaliation that culminated in the Christian victory at Navas de Tolosa (1212). Searching the past for material testimony that would remit the lengthy

⁵⁴ See Valverde, *Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada. Historia*, n. 50, p. 170. On the treatment of legendary material, see also West, "The Destiny of Nations", pp. 525–29.

⁵⁵ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, iv. 10, p. 128.

Muslim presence in Spain, Rodrigo discovers what he believes to be just such a reliable object in the Arab legend of King Rodrigo's forbidden palace. Whereas Ibn al-Qūṭīyya (d. 977), the likely source of the legend, uses the motif of royal transgression to underscore King Rodrigo's illegitimacy and justify the 711 Arab and Muslim conquest of Spain, Jiménez de Rada once again shifts the focus of his scrutiny.⁵⁶ Eerie drawings of foreign horsemen on a cloth, which foretell the king's defeat and Spain's future calamities, astound Rodrigo with their historical precision, because they closely resemble Muslim warriors still encountered in the mid-thirteenth-century Spain:

Erat autem tunc temporis Toleti palacium a multorum regum temporibus semper clausum et seris pluribus obseratum. Hoc fecit rex Rodericus contra uoluntatem omnium aperiri ut sciret quid interius haberetur; putabat enim thesauros maximos inuenire. Set cum aperuit, preter unam archam repositam nil inuenit. Qua aperta reperiit quendam pannum in quo latinis litteris erat scriptum quod 'cum contingeret seras frangi, archam et palacium aperiri et uideri que inibi habebantur, gentes eius effigiei, que in eo panno erant depicte, Hispanias inuaderent et suo dominio subiugarent'. Quod rex uidens doluit aperisse et, ut erat prius, fecit archam et palacium inserari. Erant autem in panno depicte facies ut uultus, dispositio et habitus Arabum adhuc monstrat, qui sua capita tegunt uitis sedentes in equis, habentes uestes diuersis coloribus uariatas, tenentes gladios et balistas et uexilla in altum tensa; qua pictura rex et proceres timuerunt.⁵⁷

(At that time there was a palace in Toledo, always closed and sealed off with multiple locks from the times of many kings. Against everyone's will, King Rodrigo ordered it to be opened so he could find out what was inside, hoping to find great treasures there. But as he unlocked the palace, he found nothing there except one chest. When he opened the chest, he found a certain cloth where in Latin letters it was written: 'when the locks are broken, the chest and palace are opened and what was inside is seen, people like those depicted on the cloth will invade Spain and subject it to their rule'. Upon seeing this, the king regretted having opened the palace, and he ordered that the chest and the palace be sealed off as before. On the cloth were drawings of people of the same appearance, arrangement, and dress Arabs still

⁵⁶ See Samuel G. Armistead, 'Ibn al-Qūṭīyya', in *Medieval Iberia: An Encyclopedia*, ed. by Michael Gerli (London: Routledge, 2003), p. 418; Anwar Louca, 'La métaphore dans l'écriture de l'histoire: L'exemple de Fath Al-Andalus', *Romania Arabica: Festschrift für Reinhold Kontzi zum 70. Geburtstag*, ed. by Jens Lüdtke (Tübingen: Narr, 1996), pp. 201–11; Janina M. Safran, *The Second Umayyad Caliphate: The Articulation of Caliphal Legitimacy in al-Andalus* (Cambridge, MA: Center for Middle Eastern Studies of Harvard University Press, 2000), pp. 134–35.

⁵⁷ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, III. 18, pp. 99–100.

exhibit today. Their heads were circled with silk bands, and they were mounted on horseback, wearing garbs of diverse and varying colours, holding swords, cross-bows, and raised banners. This image made the king and his retinue tremble.)

It is once again a material sign in the textual source that attracts Jiménez de Rada. If other artefacts left by rival empires symbolize Spain's past, this legend captures Rodrigo's attention not on account of the relationship it bears with the past, but rather because it appears to comment on Spain's present and foreshadow its future.

To counter the portent that encapsulates with such precision the five-century-long coexistence of Christians and Muslims, Jiménez de Rada uncovers vestiges of Iberian continuity that reaffirm his vision of the Hispanic space as one more durable than the Arab and Muslim conquest. The archbishop of Toledo contemplates three of its principal aspects: the political, the confessional, and the cultural. In order to counter the political defeat at Guadalete, where King Rodrigo allegedly perished in 711 or 712, Jiménez de Rada uses an earlier testimony, according to which a tomb was found with an inscription that commemorated Rodrigo's burial place. What most intrigues the author in this source is the notice that Rodrigo's political attributes of kingship, his crown and royal garb, were salvaged from the river marsh that had engulfed his body.

Encouraged by such material proof of the kingdom's survival, Jiménez de Rada then contemplates harbingers of its comeback. He recalls how, in the snowy mountains of Asturias, Pelagius re-established political continuity with the Visigothic state 'so that at least on the narrow slopes of Asturias Christians could preserve a spark of their name' ('ut saltem in Asturiarum angustiis posset christiani nominis aliquam scintillulam conseruare').⁵⁸ The survival of Visigothic letters amid Muslim destruction constitutes, in Jiménez de Rada's vision, another guarantee of the survival of Spain's original destiny: 'Tempore enim uastationis Arabum scripta et libri cum pereunte patria perierunt, nisi quod pauca diligencium custodia euaserunt' ('During the Arab devastation, manuscripts and books perished along with the homeland, except for a few that were preserved by dint of the diligent').⁵⁹ Just like the great rivers run through the peninsula without ever altering their names ('flumina que retentis nominibus capitalia nuncupantur'), nothing is lost in Jiménez de Rada's Spain.⁶⁰ Everything is preserved, transformed, and reinvigorated, countering

⁵⁸ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, IV. 1, p. 114.

⁵⁹ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, Prologue, p. 6.

⁶⁰ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, III. 21, p. 105.

the passage of time. As the *Liber de causis* postulates, this is only possible if the connection with one's divine origin is maintained: 'Omnis autem cadentis sub corruptione non fit corruptio nisi propter separationem suam a causa sua; dum vero permanet res pendens per causam suam retinentem eam et servantem eam, non perit neque destruitur'. ('Everything that falls into corruption is only corrupted because of its separation from the cause that created it; while a thing remains dependent on its cause, which retains it and conserves it, this thing does not perish or become destroyed').⁶¹ As in the work of Iberian Neoplatonists of Christian, Muslim, or Jewish origin, the metaphor of an uninterrupted flow signifies a space that continually recreates itself throughout history. Although in the prologue to the *De rebus Hispanie*, Jiménez de Rada defines universal history as civilization's contest with time, he argues that this invisible adversary only destroys the invading powers that had previously settled on Iberian territory, and that these foreign powers exerted no corrupting influence on Spain as a political and confessional entity.

The *De rebus Hispanie* is as much an inquiry into Spain's past as it is a vision of its future. Having re-established Spain's inseverable connection to its past by adapting the Neoplatonic contrast of unity and multiplicity, Rodrigo turns his attention to locating the direction in which its historical time unfolds. Spain's search for political coherence had traditionally not only been disrupted by foreign invasions, but had also been obstructed by internal discord. The thirteenth-century Iberian Christian territory was divided into five kingdoms — Portugal, León, Castile, Navarre, and Aragon — and its unity was compromised by seemingly endless fratricidal and patricidal wars that Jiménez de Rada traces back to Athaulf (r. AD 410–15), the first Visigothic king to establish himself on the Iberian Peninsula, in AD 415.⁶² True to his sources, in Books V–VII the historian painstakingly narrates royal conflicts and civil wars, which, rather than subsiding under Muslim domination, only intensified, particularly during Leonese domination between the tenth and twelfth centuries.

In an earlier portion of his text, Jiménez de Rada employs a dualistic framework in an effort to contrast the course of universal history with that of Spain's history to the latter's advantage. In the second half of the text, he employs a similar framework by presenting Spain's internal conflict as rooted in humanity's common origins. The unity of humanity's origin is contrasted with the eventual multiplicity of the world's peoples, cultures, and languages as the

⁶¹ *Liber de Causis*, 25 (26), p. 188.

⁶² Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, III. 22, pp. 108–09.

cause of mutual hostilities. In Jiménez de Rada's interpretation, Spain's political situation is hardly unique, being rather a consequence of the universal biblical scheme, in which the Creator castigates human conceit by dividing humanity into rival tribes:

Primordia nostre originis, superbia confundente unitatem simplicium linguarum, diuisio separauit. Et quia loquale diuersitas conuictus, mores et animos uariauit unilingues, aliam et ceterarum linguarum alias sortite sunt regiones, et prout unius lingue professio exigebat, diuersos populos effecerunt, et ab inuicem segregati climata prouincias et patrias diuiserunt, et lingua alia alienationem a proximo suggererat, et non tam discidio quam odio separati loca placida elegerunt, in quibus sedes comodas locauerunt, et propriis terminis non contenti alienos inuadere presumps-erunt et ex iniuriis mors et gladius prouenerunt.⁶³

(At the beginning of our origins, we were separated by arrogance, which confounded the unity of simple languages. Because of this diversity of languages, hitherto monolingual social practices, customs, and souls varied, and as the speaking of each language required, made different peoples, and, separated from each other, they divided regions, provinces, and homelands, and each language established alienation from the neighbouring one. Separated not so much by the borders as by hatred, they chose tranquil places in which to establish comfortable dwellings, and, not satisfied with their own limits, they undertook invasions of other lands, and from this violence originated death and murder.)

Jiménez de Rada then seeks to redefine the vectors of Spain's history by placing Spain back in the universal biblical context. He envisions its recovery as a symbolic return to the time of universal concord between its peoples, now under the patronage of the Castilian monarchy.

This futuristic dimension of *De rebus Hispanie* is particularly apparent in Books VII and VIII, a compositional unit built upon the stark contrast between the defeat of Alfonso VIII of Castile at Alarcos (1195) and his victory at Navas de Tolosa (1212). Jiménez de Rada attributes Castile's painful defeat by the Almohads to the lack of ecumenical spirit among peninsular Christians. He suggests that Almohad victory was made possible by their apparent ability to unite the diverse peoples across the frontiers of Arab and Muslim world:

Surrexit princeps in multitudine magna et uariis uocibus repleuit campestria. Parthus, Arabs, Affer, Ethiops, Almohat et de Claris Montibus in exercitu eius et Vandalus Bethice ad nutum illius. Transiuit Tirrenum in stricto Hispalis et undas maris calcauit trieribus. Exercitus eius innumerabilis, multitudo illius ut arena maris.⁶⁴

⁶³ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, I. 1, pp. 9–10.

⁶⁴ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VII. 29, p. 251.

(A prince rose from the multitudes, and a diversity of voices filled the plains. Parthians, Arabs, Africans, Ethiopians, Almohads, and Moroccans from the North of Africa are in his army, and Andalusians of Baetica at his service. He crossed the Mediterranean through the Strait of Seville, rowing across the sea waves, his soldiers without number, their multitude uncountable as sands of the sea.)

Unlike the Almohads in the Alarcos campaign, Christians failed to close ranks across political divisions and particular interests: Alfonso IX of León (r. 1188–1230) and Sancho VII of Navarre (r. 1194–1234) moved to rescue Alfonso, only to turn back at the border of Castile. As a result, the Castilian king came under pressure to establish a truce with the Almohads, which, although humiliating, would allow him to undertake campaigns against rival Christian kings.⁶⁵ The sheer scale of destruction subsequently inflicted on the kingdoms of León and Navarre by Alfonso VIII finally convinced their kings to come to a truce.

This part, which paved the way for the victory at Navas, introduces the culminating point of Rodrigo's narrative. The scene of the influx of combatants into Toledo prior to the redeeming Battle of Navas de Tolosa is represented as an authentic fulfilment of Spain's universal calling under Alfonso's patronage, and it marks an important point of confluence at which the history of Castile and the model of royal power are harmonized with Jiménez de Rada's concept of Spain's history. Not only do peninsular kings, along with French and Italian troops, pour into the royal city of Toledo, but humanity itself seems to have reunited across national divisions and interests. The king of Castile is shown providing for the troops, horses, and beasts of burden from February 1212 until the onset of combat in July later that year. By royal orders, the combatants are sheltered in lush, almost pristine gardens on the outskirts of Toledo. Rodrigo's description of these lodgings is strongly reminiscent of biblical passages that describe moments of Israel's alignment with the divine will, a thinly veiled suggestion that humanity's return to the biblical times of universal concord was made possible on the banks of the Tajo:

Rex nobilis uolens eorum comodis prouidere, extra urbem circa fluentia Tagi deliciosa uiridaria, que ob regie grauitatis recreandam maiestatem coalita fuerant, eis exposuit ut sub umbraculis arborum estus iniurias euitarent; ibique ex fructiferis arboribus constructi tabernaculis usque in diem processus ad bellum in regiis sumptibus permanserunt.⁶⁶

⁶⁵ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VII. 30, p. 252.

⁶⁶ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VIII. 1, pp. 259–60. Cf. Vulgate Numbers 24. 6,

(The noble king, wishing to provide them with every necessity, made available for their use delightful gardens planted outside the city near the River Tajo because of the importance of the royalty and for royal recreation, so that they could avoid the harshness of the heat under the shade of the trees. And there they sojourned, under the tabernacles constructed with fruit trees, at royal expense, until the day of their departure to war.)

Alfonso's innate generosity possesses a universal scope, not being limited to the combatants but also including the humble, the weak and the diseased, women and children. The attribution of unlimited largesse and virtue to Alfonso VIII suggests his superiority over the rest of *milites Christi*, and endows his political persona with divine attributes, while casting Spain, and particularly Castile, as God's chosen place. Just as Castile embraces the multiplicity of nations in the wake of the Navas victory, its political leader embodies every trait of humanity. Consequently, the multitude of peoples unified by the common enterprise of Christianity finds itself reflected in the mirror of Castilian monarchy through a familiar contrast of unity and multiplicity:

Et cepit urbs regia repleri populis, habundare necessariis, insigniri armis, diuersificari linguis, uariari cultibus, nam zelo belli ex omnibus fere Europe partibus ad eam diuersarum nationum uarietas concurrebat. Nec erat qui posset alicuius rei causari deffectum, cum et ipsa ciuitas sui habundancia occurreret et prodiga manus nobilis principis omnibus ad omnia neccessaria ministraret.⁶⁷

(And the royal city began to fill with peoples and provisions, distinguish itself by arms, diversify by languages, and vary by liturgical practices as the variety of diverse nations flocked together from nearly every part of Europe, eager for battle. No one could accuse the king of leaving them in need, since not only the city hastened to offer its abundance, but the noble king's lavish hand provided everyone with every necessity.)

Adolescentes, iuuenes et quos uirilis etatis robur perfuderat, senes et decrepiti, quid laudare, quid appetere si facultas suppeteret, quid mirari, quid diligere repererunt; eius industriam in agendis stupore attoniti mirabantur, quem doni et dati perfectio sic perfecit, ut gracia et nature charismatibus habundaret, adeo ut mundi circulus fateatur Aldefonsum nobilem Hispanie se debere. [...] Et quamuis diuersus

Isaiah 1. 30, and Ezekiel 31. 3, in *Bibliorum Sacrorum Latinae versiones antiquae, seu Vetus Italica, et caeterae quaecunque in Codicibus Mss. & antiquorum libri reperiri potuerunt: Quae cum Vulgata Latina, & cum Textu Graeco comparantur*, ed. by Peter Sabatier, 3 vols (Remis: apud Reginaldum Florentain, 1743–49; repr. Turnhout: Brepols, 1976).

⁶⁷ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VIII. 1, p. 259.

esset ritus alienigenarum et in moribus ab indigenis dissiderent, quia mores omnis uirtus magistra diiudicat, potuit omnibus satisfacere, qui uirtutes omnium in se potuit conseruare et, quasi non unius patrie incola, sic mores omnium in se sciuit assumere, ut nulli uideretur a suis moribus dissidere.⁶⁸

(Adolescents, youngsters, and those hardened by vigorous age, the old and the decrepit discovered what to praise, if their conditions allowed them, what to regard, what to esteem; they marvelled in stupefaction at the industry of his deeds, and he so perfected his largesse and generosity and abounded in grace and personal gifts that the entire world acknowledged his debt to the noble Alfonso of Spain. [...] And despite the differences in religious practices and customs between the aliens and the locals, since virtue determines everyone's conduct, Alfonso VIII was able to satisfy everybody, he who knew how to unite in his persona the virtues of everyone, and almost as if a citizen of a common homeland, he knew how to represent the customs of all, so that no one regarding him felt that the king's customs differed from his own.)

This image of the king bestowing generous gifts onto loyal combatants is at the core of Rodrigo's model of Castilian royal power, which he constructs as a social contract predicated on royal largesse. Unlike his contemporary Juan de Osma, who warns against royal prodigality as a threat to effective government, Rodrigo does not contemplate limits to royal generosity as far as the warfaring nobility is concerned.⁶⁹ But we should not be deceived by Rodrigo's image of diversity and multiplicity: Rodrigo's list of combatants, which extends over three chapters and comprises nobility, bishops, Knights Templar, and Hospitallers from all over the Iberian Peninsula as well as reinforcements from France and Italy, only includes Christian peoples of Spain united by a crusading ideal ('stigmata Domini in corpora sua portantes').⁷⁰

⁶⁸ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VIII. 4, p. 263.

⁶⁹ Ana Rodríguez, 'De rebus Hispaniae frente a la *Crónica latina de los reyes de Castilla*: virtudes regias y reciprocidad política en Castilla y León en la primera mitad del siglo XIII', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 133–49 (esp. pp. 143–44); Rodríguez identifies the source of Juan of Osma's conceptualization of royal power as Aristotle's *Nichomachean Ethics*, known to have existed in a Latin translation from Arabic (p. 145). By contrast, in Martín's view, Rodrigo's vision seeks to leverage the interests of the highest nobility, to which the historian was related as a descendant of the noble Castilian families of the Hinojosa and the Haro (see n. 9 above). The writing of the *Historia* has been considered as an expression of Rodrigo's loyalty to the crown of Castile (Amaia Arizaleta, 'Ut lector agnosceret: discurso y recepción en la obra de Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada (primera mitad del siglo XIII)', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 163–86 (p. 169)).

⁷⁰ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VIII. 1–3, pp. 259–62.

This peculiar understanding of diversity is underscored when Jiménez de Rada introduces himself, rather flatteringly, as a character of history into the narrative fabric of *De rebus Hispanie*. Readers see Rodrigo, the archbishop of Toledo, upon his return from an ambassadorial mission with supplies for the Navas de Tolosa campaign, proud of the royal city and its ability to provide for the multitude of troops and guests. Rodrigo casts himself as a representative of the universal Church, whose mission is to aid in the overcoming of ethnic divisions and bring about universal concord *ex pluribus*: 'Et quia diuersarum nationum uarietas diuersitate morum, linguarum et cultuum discrepabant, de uoluntate principis in eadem urbe eiusdem urbes pontifex morabatur, ut dissidencium uarietas per eius industriam sedaretur'. ('Because the variety of diverse nations brought about differences in customs, languages, and cultures, the king wished that the archbishop of that city remain in the city, in order that the dissension be allayed by his diligence').⁷¹

The spirit of unity in *De rebus Hispanie* is unrivalled in mediaeval Iberian Latin historiography. What begins as a philosophical reflection on the meaning of history ends in a pragmatic political vision. The philosophical framework of the *Historia* serves to drive home the urgent need to eliminate dynastic conflicts, to reinvigorate intra- and extrapeninsular dialogue, and to place Spain on the universal scene under the political leadership of Castile, a political leader among the Christian nations and a beacon for the crusading world. Rodrigo's universalism is reinforced in the description of the passing of Alfonso VIII, which concludes Book VIII: 'et sicut in uita regnum uirtutibus adimpleuit, sic in morte totam Hispaniam, inmo mundum lacrimis madefecit' ('and just as in life he saturated the kingdom with his virtues, in death he filled up all of Spain, nay, the world, with tears').⁷² The depiction of the concluding triumph at Navas de Tolosa may be regarded as the logical apex of a narrative whose philosophical framework is established in the prologue. The future of Spain, in accordance with its historical origin, is the unity of multiple languages, customs, and political impetuses under the auspices of the Castilian monarchy at Toledo, the former capital of the Visigothic kingdom.

Rodrigo's artifice in crafting his vision of Spain's continuity and of Castile's monarchy is particularly salient when viewed against the alternative account of the Navas de Tolosa battle offered in the *Latin Chronicle of the Kings of Castile* (*Chronica latina regum Castellae*). This text is widely attributed to Juan of Soria

⁷¹ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VIII. 4, p. 263.

⁷² Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VIII. 15, p. 280.

(d. 1246), previously bishop of Osma and Burgos and abbot of Valladolid, who replaced Jiménez de Rada as royal chancellor by orders of Fernando III in 1230. The *Chronica latina* was composed on two occasions between 1230 and 1236, and is preserved in one manuscript dated to late fifteenth century.⁷³ It tells the history of Castile from its comital origins until the reigns of Alfonso VIII, Enrique I, and Fernando III, and covers the years 1158–1236, ending with the conquest of Córdoba. This text curiously stands alone in the Castilian historiographic tradition, for unlike Rodrigo's *De rebus Hispanie*, which absorbs Mozarabic, Asturian, and Leonese chronicle testimonies, it does not depend on any known sources and, in turn, is not utilized in the Alfonsine *Estoria de España*.⁷⁴ Juan de Osma presents as futile Jiménez de Rada's attempts to muster military support for the 'Christian people' of Spain across peninsular borders; he emphasizes the French retreat under false pretexts as an example of the traditional animosity between peninsular Christians and their extrapeninsular co-religionists.⁷⁵ The chronicle underscores the fact that the peninsular kings Sancho VII of Navarre and Pedro II of Aragon (r. 1196–1213) never signed peace treaties with Alfonso VIII in the wake of the victory, and that the demise of the Castilian king in 1214 plunged his kingdom into a damaging power vacuum.⁷⁶ But despite the gap between Rodrigo's vision and the historical reality of Castile according to the *Chronica latina*, it is Rodrigo's integrated version of Spain's history which serves as the foundation on which the subsequent vernacular tradition of Castilian historiography would be built. And it achieves this by accepting non-Castilian strands of legitimizing and mythologizing discourse, incorporating Visigothic, Mozarabic, Asturian, and Leonese chronicle sources, and reconceptualizing history.

As a key political figure, Rodrigo was instrumental in reconciling the interests of the Castilian monarchy, its nobility, the papacy, and Toledo's Jewish community. In his diplomatic capacity, he mustered international support for the decisive Battle of Navas de Tolosa against the Almohads and personally encouraged Alfonso VIII and his troops in combat. As a pragmatic citizen, he

⁷³ See Francisco J. Hernández, 'La hora de Don Rodrigo', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 15–71, and Peter Linehan, 'Don Rodrigo and the Government of the Kingdom', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 89–99.

⁷⁴ Rodríguez, 'De rebus Hispaniae frente a la *Crónica latina*', p. 138. On the sources of Rodrigo's *Historia de rebus Hispanie*, see Emma Falque, 'Lucas de Tuy y Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada: el uso de las fuentes', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 151–61.

⁷⁵ Juan of Osma, *Chronica latina*, pp. 27–33.

⁷⁶ Juan of Osma, *Chronica latina*, pp. 40–43. See also Rodríguez, 'De rebus Hispaniae frente a la *Crónica latina*'.

ensured that the city of Toledo remained a place of tolerance and reconciliation between its Christian and Jewish populations at a time when Rome promoted policies aimed at segregating Jewish communities throughout Europe. Mindful of the delicate political situation of Toledo as a frontier city with the most populous Jewish *aljama* in Castile, Rodrigo was instrumental in assisting Fernando III in reconciling the anti-Jewish canons of the IV Lateran Council (1215) with the needs of the Toledan diocese, and ensured a peaceful relationship between Christian warriors and the Toledan Jews.⁷⁷ Profoundly familiar with the Arabic language and Islamic culture, the archbishop of Toledo both led the reconquest campaigns against Muslims, including the battle at Navas de Tolosa, and sought to economically and culturally integrate the newly reconquered *mudéjar* community to benefit Castilian society.⁷⁸ Yet while Rodrigo constructs his concept of history from a synthesis of Muslim, Jewish, and Christian philosophical heritages, in championing Iberian reconquest, the author of the *De rebus Hispanie* ironically seeks to expel Muslims under the rubric of a philosophy he had inherited from the Iberian Muslims themselves. In his vision, Castile is an embodiment of 'unity in diversity', but what Rodrigo understands under this term is not what we interpret as diversity today.

Rodrigo and the Post-Gothic

The jubilant image of Toledo and of the Navas de Tolosa battle in Book VIII represents a narrative juncture where the secular and ecclesiastical aspects of Rodrigo's history merge. Rodrigo takes a sinuous path in order to arrive at this culminating point. Mindful of promoting his own primatial powers as the archbishop of Toledo, Rodrigo manipulates his Mozarabic and Asturian chronicle sources in order to disguise the problem of ecclesiastical continuity in a city that had been under Muslim rule for centuries (Rodrigo does not hesitate to break the chronological flow of his narrative to praise Alfonso VI of León and Castile for his reconquest of Toledo in 1085).⁷⁹ Throughout the Middle Ages and until Rodrigo's time, Toledo remained a centre of Mozarabic culture. Its clerics conserved the pride of having practised the 'true', original Visigothic

⁷⁷ See Rica Amran, 'El arzobispo Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada y los judíos de Toledo: la concordia del 16 de junio de 1219', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 73–85.

⁷⁸ See Zozaya Stabel-Hansen, '*Deus ex maquina?*'; Lucy K. Pick, 'What Did Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada Know about Islam?', *Anuario de Historia de la Iglesia*, 20 (2011), 221–35.

⁷⁹ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, iv. 19, pp. 142–43.

rite as instituted by Isidore and Leander, and this liturgical practice was still in use in Rodrigo's day.⁸⁰ Although Rodrigo's *History* was composed after the successful elevation of Toledo to primacy by papal orders in 1088, such a state of affairs was contested by other metropolitan sees, and Toledo needed to be cast as the original spiritual centre of Spain, untainted since the Visigothic era.

This nearly impossible task is what ultimately determines the evolution of the major strands of the post-Visigothic narrative in Rodrigo's history. Not only does Rodrigo present other potential metropolitan sees as compromised either by the problematic conduct of their bishops or by the impurity of their foundations, but his manipulation of both Mozarabic and Asturian chronicle sources becomes part of a strategy of elevating Toledo above all potential contenders for Iberian primacy. In the ultimate instance, it was Rodrigo's craft that for centuries privileged and reinforced the Asturian myth of origins and cast an unfavourable light over the Mozarabs as a community compromised by coexisting with and surviving under Islam.

Rodrigo's efforts to delegitimize the Mozarabic narrative begin in Book III, where he follows the *Chronicle of 754* as he amplifies and intensifies the lament of the destruction of Spain (discussed in Chapter 2). It is worthwhile quoting this passage at length, since this is where Rodrigo most conspicuously modifies the Mozarabic chronicle narrative in accordance with his goals:

Hispania filios suos plorat et consolari non potuit quia non sunt. [...] Que Hispaniam non pretereunt tempestates? Paruuli alliduntur, adolescentes cedibus inuoluuntur, iuuenes gladiis extinguntur, uiri preliis prosternuntur, senes excidio consumuntur, et quos senium et decrepita fecerant honorandos, hos Afrorum crudelitas abicit extirpandos; mulieres seruantur ad ignominiam et earum speciositas ad contumeliam. [...] Quis dabit capiti meo aquas et fontem oculis lacrimarum ut plorem excidium Hispanorum et miseriam gentis Gothorum? Conticuit religio sacerdotum, cessauit frequentia ministrorum, abcessit diligencia prelatorum, periit doctrina fidei et sanctorum unio soluitur patrum orthodoxorum; sanctuaria destruuntur, ecclesie diruuntur et que laudabant in cymbalis, prouocant in blasphemiiis; lignum salutis a sanctis eicitur, non est qui aspiciat ut saluetur. Sollempnia penitus cessauerunt et Ecclesie organa in blasphemiam transierunt; non est qui iubilet in ecclesiis et subsannat confessio Machometi; defedat abusio ornamenta et uasa sancta contaminant alieni; regionem deuorant inimici et omnis habitatio desolatur, cum occiditur habitator; ciuitates ignibus consumuntur et queque uiridia succiduntur. Adeo enim pestis inualuit, quod in tota Hispania non remansit ciuitas cathedralis que non fuerit aut incensa aut diruta aut optenta. Arabes

⁸⁰ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, iv. 3, p. 118.

enim quas ui non poterant subiugare, falso phedere deceperunt, Oppa filio Egice Hispalensi episcopo suadente ut subiecti Arabibus uiuerent sub tributo [...]. Et sic fraudibus circumuenti reddiderunt oppida et presidia ciuitatum. Et isti dicti sunt Mixti Arabes, eo quod mixti Arabibus conuiuebant, quorum hodie apud nos nomen perseuerat et genus. Et tali fraude Arabes fere omnia occuparunt, et omnibus occupatis, rupto phedere, thesauros ecclesiarum et diuicias incolarum pariter exauserunt, nisi quod episcopi postmodum cum reliquiis Asturiis se dederunt. Quicquid *illa Babilon* magna inter regna seculi prima a Ciro et Dario subuersa pertulit [...] quicquid Roma prouinciarum domina ab Alarico et Athaulpho Gothorum regibus et Giserico Vandalorum principe est perpressa; quicquid Hierusalem iuxta Dominicam prophetiam *lapide super lapidem* non relicto sustinuit diruta et incensa; quicquid Cartago nobilis a Scipione Romano direptione et incendio passa fuit, hoc misera Hispania omnium cladum coniectis miseriis est experta nec est qui adiciat misereri.⁸¹

(Spain bewails her children and cannot be consoled because they are gone. [...]) Which calamities did not befall Spain? Infants are massacred, adolescents are thrown to death, young people are annihilated by the sword, men are overthrown in combat, the elderly are exterminated in defeat, and those whom old age and decrepitude made worthy of respect are eliminated by the cruelty of the Africans; women are destined to live in dishonour and the most beautiful of them suffer affront. [...] Who will give my head water and my eyes a fountain of tears so that I could bewail the ruin of the *Hispani* and the calamity of the Gothic people? The sanctity of priests has been silenced, the abundance of the religious has come to an end, the dedication of the prelates has vanished, the teaching of the faith is lost, and the unity of the saintly orthodox fathers is undone; the temples are destroyed, the churches are ruined, and where once one gave praises with joy one now challenges with blasphemies; the cross has been cast from holy places, and there is no one who is concerned about salvation. Festivities have disappeared completely, and the music of the church sounds of blasphemy; no one exults [the Lord] in churches, and the proclamation of Muḥammad sounds of derision; the bad customs ruin the ornaments, and the pagans defile the sacred vessels; the enemies consume the lands, and the entire dwelling place remains hollow when its inhabitants perish; the cities are devoured by fire, and all the gardens are cut down to the ground. The calamity grew to such an extreme that in all of Spain not a cathedral see was left that was not set on fire, demolished, or conquered. Those that Arabs could not subject to their rule were deceived with false treaties, while Oppa, son of Egica and bishop of Seville, advised them to continue living subjected to the Arabs and paying them a tribute [...]. And in that fashion, enticed by this deceit, they surrendered bastions and the defences of their cities. And to those the name of Mozarabs was given, because they lived mixed with the Arabs, and whose name and lineage still survives

⁸¹ Jiménez de Rada, III. 22, pp. 106–08; *Chronicle of 754*, 55, pp. 72, 74.

among us today. And with this ruse the Arabs occupied most everything, and, once that had been accomplished, broke the treaty and plundered the treasures of the churches [...] with the exception of the bishops who shortly afterwards took refuge in Asturias with the relics. What the great Babylonia had suffered, the first of the kingdoms in history [...]; what Rome, the master of lands, endured at the hands of Alaric and Athaulf, kings of the Goths, and Geiseric, prince of the Vandals; what Jerusalem suffered, destroyed and demolished until no stone was left upon stone, according to the Lord's prophecy; what noble Carthage felt as it was looted and set on fire by the Roman [general] Scipio; all that befell poor Spain, equal to the sum of all those disasters, and there is no one to feel its pain.)

We can appreciate that Rodrigo uses many of the apocalyptic tropes found in the *Chronicle of 754*: he alludes to the prophetic books of the Old Testament by likening the fate of Spain to that of a dishonoured maiden, evoking images of loss and destruction, and inscribing Spain within the geography of the great empires of the earth. He also significantly expands the 'world upside down' trope as he amplifies the motif of the inversion of life's basic routines with parallel syntagmatic constructions that include the seven ages of man. But the motif of inenarrability, which repeats itself anaphorically in the Mozarabic chronicle, is absent from Rodrigo's description of misfortunes that befell places of worship all over Spain. Instead, Rodrigo adopts a more expository tone, which he supports with meticulously elaborated detail that matches his ideological agenda. The point Rodrigo seeks to make is that most of Spain's metropolitan sees were either defiled by Islamic religious practices or ceased to exist as Christian sanctuaries. This is achieved by associating Christian religious practices in Arab-conquered lands with terms denoting cessation ('conticuit religio sacerdotum', 'cessavit frequentia ministrorum'), passing ('abscessit diligencia prelatorum'), ruin ('periit doctrina fidei', 'sanctuariorum destruuntur'), dispersion ('ecclesie diruuntur'), and contamination ('uasa sancta contaminant alieni'). This is where Rodrigo introduces the earliest known mention of Mozarabism: by etymologically equating *mozarabes* with *mixti arabes*, he casts a shadow of doubt on the Mozarabs as a community tainted by virtue of having surrendered (although, he admits, not without deceit and coercion) to their military and religious adversaries.

Rodrigo is persistent in pointing out that such discontinuity was the case in all of Spain, with the felicitous exception of the Asturian kingdom. In the above passage, Rodrigo interrupts the chronological flow of his narrative in order to make his first reference to Asturias as a place where Christian relics were kept safe by refugee bishops, by contrast to Christian sanctuaries elsewhere in Spain that had been plundered or defiled by the Arabs; later he will

retake and amplify this argument.⁸² At this point in the narrative, Rodrigo utilizes the *Chronicle of 754* to sow the seeds of doubt about the metropolitan sees formerly located in Arab-dominated lands: in his view, they cannot claim primacy as they are guilty of impurity and discontinuity ('in tota Hispania non remansit ciuitas cathedralis que non fuerit aut incensa aut diruta aut optenta'). He particularly seeks to underscore the nefarious role of Oppa in subjecting Christians to Arab rule. In so doing, the historian casts a shadow on the metropolitan see of Seville.

All of this, however, leaves Rodrigo with the inconvenience of Toledo as a major centre of Mozarabism alongside Seville. He deals with this challenge in the first chapter of Book IV, where he turns to discussing Asturian affairs. While he follows the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* rather closely in stressing the survival of the Visigoths, Rodrigo especially points out the religious purpose of Pelagius's flight to Asturias:

Hic Pelagius, ut est dictum, fugiens a facie Witize, qui eum uoluerat excecari, licet spatarius eius fuisset, apud Cantabriam se recepit, set audiens subcubuisse exercitum christianum [...], sumpta secum sorore propria Asturiis se donauit, ut saltem in Asturiarum angustiis posset christiani nominis aliquam scintillulam conseruare, Sarraceni enim totam Hispaniam occupauerant gentis Gothice fortitudine iam contrita nec alicubi resistente, exceptis paucis reliquiis que in montanis Asturiarum, Biscagie, Alaue, Guipuscue, Ruchonie et Aragonie remanserunt, quos ideo Dominus reseruauit ne lucerna sanctorum in Hispaniis coram Domino extingueretur.⁸³

(This Pelagius, as they say, fled from the presence of Witiza, who had wanted to blind him, although Pelagius had been his arms-bearer. He fled to Cantabria but upon hearing that Christian forces had succumbed [to the Arabs] [...], having taken his own sister along, he headed for Asturias, so that, in its mountain gorges, he could maintain at least a small vestige of the Christian people, since the Saracens had occupied all Spain and defeated the Goths everywhere without resistance, with the exception of a few places in the mountains of Asturias, Vizcaya, Álava, Guipuzcoa and Aragon, which the Lord kept precisely so that, in His presence, the light of Spain's saints would not be extinguished.)

This passage retakes Rodrigo's argument from the previous book in that it again elevates Asturias as a place of holiness and spiritual continuity by contrast to *Hispania*, the term Rodrigo uses with reference to the area of the Iberian Peninsula that was conquered by the Arabs. Rodrigo also adds more detail to

⁸² Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, III. 22, pp. 107–08.

⁸³ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, IV. 1, p. 114.

his source in order to strengthen the genealogical link between Pelayo and the Visigoths. Like the *Chronicle of Alfonso III*, Rodrigo stresses that Pelayo had been the arms-bearer of King Witiza, and he relies on that chronicle for the details of the Battle of Covadonga. Rodrigo then underscores Pelayo's concern with the purity of his lineage when he describes the events leading to the battle: Munnuza, a Visigothic noble and governor of Gijón, who had allied himself to the Arabs, befriends Pelagius and sends him to Córdoba under a false pretext, so that he can marry Pelagius's sister in the meantime. Upon his return, Pelagius refuses to accept the dishonour and, having lured his sister away from Munnuza, takes refuge in the Asturian mountains. It is now Munnuza's turn to feel dishonoured, and he communicates to Tāriq the news of Pelagius's rebellion in Asturias. From Córdoba, Tāriq sends troops to combat Pelagius at his mountainous hideout in Covadonga. Thus the motif of genealogical purity is strongly present in the account of events preceding the momentous battle.⁸⁴

We may also recall that Arab troops are led by the renegade Bishop Oppa, who had allied himself to the Arabs and was charged with convincing Pelagius to surrender.⁸⁵ Rodrigo amplifies the words of Pelagius from the Asturian chronicle by adding a passage in which the Asturian leader expresses his confidence in the resurrection of the Visigothic Church: 'Sed per id modicum et momentaneum exterminii nostri [gentis Gothice] pondus adiciet Ecclesia ut resurgat, et ego sperans in misericordia Iesu Christi, hanc multitudinem cum qua uenis nullatenus pertimesco' ('But despite this small and short-lived destruction [of the Gothic people], our Church will throw off this burden in order to resurrect itself, and I have my hope in Christ's mercy and have no fear of that multitude [of troops] with which you came'). Incidentally, Rodrigo again underscores Oppa's connection to Seville: 'Oppa autem a Pelagio captis captus mansit. Ab aliquibus dicitur Oppa fuisse filius Witize, ab aliquibus frater comitis Iuliani, set uerius filius fuit Egice et frater Witize; set utrumlibet istorum fuerit, certum est fuisse archiepiscopum Hispalensem.' ('Oppa in turn became prisoner of Pelagius. Some affirm that Oppa was son of Witiza, others that he was brother of Count Julian, but it is more certain that he was son of Egica and brother of Witiza; but whatever the case might be, it is certain that he was archbishop of Seville').⁸⁶ Thus Rodrigo ends Chapter 2 by reinforcing the claim made earlier that the see of Seville was tainted by Oppa's treason.

⁸⁴ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, IV. 1, pp. 114–15.

⁸⁵ See the Introduction, 'After the Visigoths'.

⁸⁶ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, IV. 2, p. 117.

Immediately afterwards, Rodrigo refers to Asturias as a place that preserved the ecclesiastical legacy of Toledo. He begins Chapter 3 by relating that Archbishop Urban, successor of Sindered during whose tenure Toledo fell to the Arabs, sent to Asturias an ark with relics, works by St Ildefonsus, and a material sign of Toledo's survival — 'uestem sacram quam beata Virgo beato dederat Ildefonso, cum iam uideret in Hispaniis destructionem Ecclesie et populi christiani, ad Asturias dicitur detulisse et de loco in locum, ut persecutio exposcebat, a fidelibus ferebatur' ('a sacred tunic that the Holy Virgin had given St Ildefonsus when she discerned the [imminent] destruction of the Church and the Christian people of the Spains, [objects] that were carried by the faithful from place to place as was necessary under the threat of persecution'). Going back to the matter of Toledo, Rodrigo again underscores that the Visigothic capital was surrendered to the Arabs peacefully and by way of a treaty, with the Arabs later breaking its terms. Rodrigo then explains that those who remained in Toledo were from among

clerus et Christiani eiecti cum aliis, qui in Hispaniis seruituti barbarice mancipati elegerunt degere sub tributo, permissi sunt uti lege et ecclesiasticis institutis et habere pontifices et euangelicos sacerdotes, apud quos uiguit officium Isidori et Leandri et uiguet hodie in VI parrochiis Toletanis.

(Christians and their clerics, some of whom were expelled from the city and some, having been subjected to the barbaric rule, preferred to live in [the Arab-dominated portion of] Spain under tribute and obtained permission to continue using their laws and ecclesiastical norms, conserve their bishops and priests, the ecclesiastical rite as set forth by Isidore and his brother Leander, and which still survives in six of Toledo's parishes today.⁸⁷)

Although Rodrigo underscores here Toledo's continuity as a Christian, Visigothic centre of worship owing to the diligence of the faithful, one cannot leave this passage without an impression that the Mozarabs are somehow tainted and inferior to the Asturians: while both are said to be the ecclesiastical descendants of the Visigothic Church, the former obtained permission to practise their religion from the Arabs, whereas the latter resisted persecution and never surrendered. The reasons for this strategy become apparent toward the end of the chapter, but for the time being, Rodrigo intimates that one of Seville's bishops, Juan (c. 850), was so Arabicized that his Arabic was fluent and he was known by an Arab name; another, Clement, fled to Talavera fearing the Almohad persecution shortly before Rodrigo's time (Rodrigo claims

⁸⁷ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, IV. 3, p. 118.

to have personally known some of Clement's contemporaries). It is before he returns to Asturian affairs that we see Rodrigo reveal the purpose of several unflattering remarks about Seville's bishops: he ends Chapter 3 by vigorously and openly refuting the notion that Visigothic Seville had at any point held primacy over Toledo.⁸⁸ After these digressions, Rodrigo then continues to follow the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* in narrating the reigns of Asturian kings from Alfonso I to Alfonso III.

We should acknowledge here Linehan's remark that when making reference to Alfonso I re-establishing the *ordo Gothorum* in Asturias, Rodrigo alters his source from 'omnemque Gotorum ordinem, sicuti Toletu fuerat, tam in ecclesia quam palatio Ouetau cuncta statuit' in the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* to read 'Gothorum gloriam tam in ecclesiis quam in palaciis, ut olim Toleti fulserat, prout potuit, reparauit', and that he does so in order to underscore the constitutional inferiority of the kingdom of Oviedo compared to the old Visigothic capital.⁸⁹ While this indeed is so, Rodrigo's goals necessitated a balancing act in which simply downplaying the importance of Oviedo would not have been a winning strategy. Because Rodrigo seeks to establish the spiritual preponderance of Toledo, he is not primarily concerned with Asturian kings as guardians of Visigothic law and order but rather as custodians of the spiritual tradition. Thus in his description of Alfonso III of Asturias ('uir bellorum, pietatis, religionis, et iusticie'), piety precedes justice.⁹⁰ Rodrigo particularly underscores Alfonso's successful petition to Pope John VIII (r. 872–82) to establish a metropolitan see at Oviedo: this episode occupies three chapters in Book IV.⁹¹ Here, the historian favourably describes the archiepiscopal see of Oviedo as more dignified than those of Tarragona, Seville, Mérida, Braga, and even Toledo itself, since it had never been subjected to the Arabs and had newly gained metropolitan status. He strengthens the link between the Asturian and Visigothic periods of Iberian history by emphasizing that once established, the see of Oviedo began following the dispositions of the canon law set forth by the Toledan Councils.⁹² Finally, as he transitions to the history of León, Rodrigo not so subtly downplays the metropolitan importance of León as established by Ordoño II (r. 914–24): for his cathedral see, the King of León chooses a royal

⁸⁸ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, IV. 3, p. 119.

⁸⁹ Linehan, 'On Further Thought', p. 30 and n. 70, original emphasis by the author.

⁹⁰ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, IV. 15, p. 137.

⁹¹ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, IV. 17–19, pp. 140–43.

⁹² Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, IV. 19, pp. 142–43.

palace, formerly ‘a public bath of the pagans’ (‘in palacio regio, quod olim balneum fuerat paganorum, episcopalem cathedram collocavit’).⁹³

Throughout Books III–IV, we sense Rodrigo’s discomfort with the fact that the city of Toledo had been tainted by virtue of having been conquered, or, as he repeatedly emphasizes, surrendered by treaty. Therefore, he exploits the Asturian period of Spain’s history as much as possible in order to prove that the legacy of Visigothic Toledo had never been lost; in this framework, Oviedo becomes a surrogate replacement for Toledo as its untainted reincarnation. Rodrigo will, however, abandon Oviedo and redeem Toledo in Book VI, where he relates the reconquest of the ancient Visigothic capital by Alfonso VI in 1085 and the imposition of the Roman rite on its Mozarabic clergy. Echoing the lament over Spain in Book III, Rodrigo portrays Alfonso as the ruler who finally puts an end to Spain’s suffering (‘ploratus et ululatus Hispanie usque ad istum mansit absque consolatore’), and he signals that from this point onward, Oviedo no longer has the substitute function as a place too small for Alfonso’s grand designs: ‘magnitudo cordis eius [Adefonsi] infra angustias Asturiarum non potuit contineri’.⁹⁴ In Rodrigo’s rendering, the Alfonsine political project — ‘to keep the faith, to expand the kingdom, to defeat enemies, to rein in adversaries, to build churches, to restore holy places, to rebuild what was destroyed’ (‘zelare fidem, dilatare regnum, exterminare inimicos, concludere aduersarios, multiplicare ecclesias, restaurare sancta, restituere dissipata’) — represents the reversal of the tropes of cessation, abandonment, and defilement with which he generously garnished his image of Muslim-dominated Spain sourced from the *Chronicle of 754*.⁹⁵

At this point in the narrative, Rodrigo is about to accomplish his goal of redeeming Toledo. Indeed, he relates that as that city was reconquered by Alfonso VI, now was the time to cleanse it from Mozarab influences. Alfonso obtains permission from Pope Gregory VII for the primacy of Toledo in exchange for abolishing the Mozarabic, or Toledan, ritual (‘littera Gothica et translation Psalterii et officium misse institutum ab Isidoro et Leandro, quod cum translatione et littera dicitur Toletanum’).⁹⁶ This was met with much resistance by the local clergy, and the sedition prevented the new archbishop of

⁹³ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, IV. 22, p. 145.

⁹⁴ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VI. 21, p. 202.

⁹⁵ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VI. 21, p. 203.

⁹⁶ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, VI. 22–26, pp. 203–09. On the treatment of the Mozarabs of Toledo by Alfonso VI, see Linehan, *History and Historians*, p. 214.

Toledo, Bernard of Sauvetât, from participating in the First Crusade. However, in what constitutes another ploy aimed at cleansing Toledo, Rodrigo insists on establishing the connection between that city and the crusader movement. This is done both by underscoring Bernard's frustrated attempt to don crusader garb, and by vicariously linking Alfonso himself to the crusader movement through his illegitimate daughter Elvira, who, as Rodrigo says, accompanied her husband, Count Raymond of Toulouse, to Syria under the auspices of Pope Urban II:

Ipsa [Geloyra] enim cum uiro in Siriam transfretauit tempore illo quo exercitus ille magnus procedens ex partibus Galliarum, isto Raymundo comite duce ac preuio cum episcopo Anniciensi, Ierusalem, Tripolim et Antiochiam acquisiuit, hortante et personaliter in Gallis et Ytalia predicante beatissimo Urbano Papa II^o, qui primus instituit euntes in subsidium Terre Sancte in dextro humero crucis signaculo insigniri.⁹⁷

(She [Elvira] set off to Syria with her husband at the time when the great and powerful army from France, led by the said Count Raymond and the bishop of Annecy, conquered Jerusalem, Tripoli, and Antioch. That expedition was fomented by Pope Urban II, who personally preached in France and Italy, and who was the first to decree that those marching off to relieve the Holy Land should wear the insignia of the cross on their right shoulder.)

This addition is particularly noticeable, given that Rodrigo otherwise follows Lucas's *Chronicon mundi* rather closely in discussing the family of Alfonso VI.⁹⁸ This passage, which links this king's descendant to the First Crusade, is Rodrigo's addendum, as is the entire matter of Alfonso's struggle with the recalcitrant Mozarab clergy.

The peculiar spin Rodrigo puts on his Mozarabic and Asturian sources has had a long-lasting legacy of relegating the Mozarabs to the margins of history and promoting the Asturian neo-Gothic narrative as that of Spain's moral survival and reconquest success. If Alfonso VI, in Linehan's rendering, deprived the Mozarabs of their culture and spirituality by abolishing the Mozarabic ecclesiastical rite, Rodrigo deprived the Mozarabs of their narrative by portraying them as guilty of complicity in the sad fortune that befell Visigothic Spain. By strengthening instead the genealogical and spiritual continuity of Asturias with the kingdom of the Visigoths, and by portraying Oviedo as Toledo's untainted

⁹⁷ Jiménez de Rada, *De rebus Hispanie*, vi. 20, p. 202 and vi. 25, pp. 207–08.

⁹⁸ Lucas, bishop of Tuy, *Chronicon Mundi*, iv. 69, p. 303.

incarnation until the reconquest of the old Visigothic capital by Alfonso VI, Rodrigo helped shape much of the modern-day perception of the sacred role this northern royal enclave played in Spanish history.

The *Historia de rebus Hispanie* charts its ideological course through a microcosm of cultural exchanges, tensions, and conflicts, reminding us of the universal, perhaps timeless, urgency of the thirteenth-century Iberian experience, and it exemplifies the challenges of writing mediaeval Latin history as a social and cultural practice that seeks to reconcile the imperative of unity and stability with the reality of diversity and social change. Jiménez de Rada's vision of Spain as a civilization that, despite setbacks, for centuries had remained true to its origins and historical calling poses an intriguing question: was twentieth-century historical essentialism and determinism with regard to Castile's central role in Spanish nation-building a uniquely modern phenomenon, or was it constructed on ideological foundations laid out in the Middle Ages? In particular, to what extent does Ramón Menéndez Pidal's belief in the capacity of a human group to be identical to itself and to maintain immunity from outside influences throughout its history stem from Rodrigo's concept of Iberian history?

As a text that, through the treatment of its sources, both illuminates and deliberately obscures the post-Gothic period of Spanish history, the *Historia de rebus Hispanie* reminds us of the power of an historian's craft in shaping our understanding of history and ourselves. Because Rodrigo was guided by the twofold goal of promoting the political supremacy of Castile and the ecclesiastical primacy of Toledo, he decoupled the Asturian and Leonese narratives of royal legitimation from their heavy reliance on the language of Visigothic law. Thus not only did he promote the northern strand of the post-Gothic narrative but he also shaped the history of Spain as we have known it: a story of an uninterrupted Visigothic genealogical and spiritual succession. As the last major Latin historical composition before the development of Castilian vernacular historiography, this text both illuminates and problematizes the mediaeval Iberian cultural practice of Latin chronicle writing.

CONCLUSION: IN SEARCH OF CONTINUITY

Early in the twentieth century, philology and literary criticism became essential in constructing a vision of Spanish national identity. Central to this vision was the idea that Spain had always been meant to be a nation united by Castile, a leader of the Spanish reconquest and political heiress to the Visigothic kingdom. Stemming from a fundamental assumption elaborated by Ramón Menéndez Pidal, its essential postulates were that the existence of a distinct nation was predicated on the capacity of a human group to be identical to itself and to maintain immunity from outside influences throughout its history, and that such a group's immutable core values gradually manifested themselves in its literary production.¹ The prevalence of this critical approach in the first half of the twentieth century resulted in the privileging of the popular vernacular epic over the erudite Latin historiographical tradition and, more recently, of thirteenth-century Latin historical compilations that incorporated popular sources over their earlier predecessors. In the second half of the century, when advocates of *convivencia* posited that the Castilian language was an expression of the unique mediaeval synthesis of Christian, Jewish, and Muslim cultures, Latin histories and chronicles were again relegated to the margins of literary study. And because from the perspective of twentieth-century nationalism, Latin chronicles were seen through the optic of the modern-day political boundaries of Spain, for many of their scholarly readers the Asturian chronicle narrative of *Visigothic* genealogical continuity would become central to and synonymous with the *Iberian* Latin chronicle narrative — a misleading confla-

¹ Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *Los españoles en la historia*, introd. by Diego Catalán (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1982; first publ. 1947), pp. 14–15.

tion of geographies that did not necessarily reflect the political and cultural realities of pre- and post-711 Iberian Latin textual communities and their interconnectedness with the broader world. Though the recent surge of interest in mediaeval models of royal legitimation has helped bring Leonese and Castilian Latin chronicles and histories into critical focus, Mozarabic and Asturian texts have not yet been sufficiently appreciated as true innovators of the historiographical genre on the Iberian Peninsula.

By abandoning the optic of modern-day national boundaries and considering Spanish Latin chronicle writing in a Mediterranean context, I sought to provide a broader, deeper, and more nuanced look at the Latin chronicle and its central theme, the negotiation between political claims based on the ideology of peninsular unity and the reality of Iberian diversity and political fragmentation. In particular, I sought to challenge the notion that the narrative of Visigothic revival created at the royal court of Oviedo in late ninth century was the only narrative of institutional continuity that circulated on the Iberian Peninsula in the wake of the loss of Visigothic statehood in 711. I highlight several competing claims of sovereignty and parallel narratives that emerged after the fall of the Visigothic state, each reaching variable degrees of development. The most advanced of them was the mid-eighth century Mozarabic narrative of the fall of Visigothic Spain, which inscribed the latter in the broader Mediterranean narrative of the Byzantine imperial encounter with Islam. Its use of multiple chronological systems and characteristic elements of lamentation, apocalypse, and narrative ineffability reveal that it was likely a peninsular adaptation of the apocalyptic chronicle narratives that developed on the Byzantine Mediterranean periphery in the seventh century. The application of this perspective to Iberian affairs effectively positioned the Iberian Peninsula as part of the Christian Mediterranean that was being overrun by Islam. The hagiographical ramification of this narrative, which assimilated the notion of the fall of Visigothic Spain but insisted on the survival of its Church, emerged in Muslim Córdoba by the mid-ninth century in support of the voluntary movement of Christian martyrs. It, too, drew heavily on Mediterranean narrative models as it attempted to appropriate Syro-Palestinian neo-martyrdom accounts, grafting them onto the local Iberian tradition of early Christian *passiones*.

In the course of this study, I also re-examined the long-standing notion that the Asturian neo-Visigothic political narrative was based principally on the premise of genealogical continuity with the Visigothic royal dynasty. Throughout the ninth century, the Asturian narrative developed against the background of intense competition — first with Carolingian interests in the Iberian Peninsula, and later with northern Iberian power centres that were, like

Asturias, in the process of emancipating themselves from Carolingian tutelage. Because these power nuclei had sufficient basis to claim Visigothic genealogical continuity for their own ruling elites, it was necessary for the Asturians to bolster their own genealogical claims with assertions that their kings were the true custodians of Visigothic law. Whereas in the *Lex Wisigothorum*, kingship had been strongly associated with law-giving, by the late ninth century royal legitimation was predicated on the guardianship of existing laws. I suggest that Asturian chroniclers looked to Carolingian France as they adapted seventh-century Visigothic laws regulating royal power to contemporary models of kingship, and that this strategy effectively projected the Asturian kings not only as legitimate peninsular successors to the Visigoths, but also as royal figures of a Carolingian calibre. During the Leonese period, between the tenth and twelfth centuries, this neo-Gothic narrative survived setbacks in the reconquest, tensions with Rome, and competition from eastern Iberian genealogical narrative models introduced by King Sancho of Navarre, as it transformed itself into what for centuries would become the defining narrative of Spanish unity: the Castile-centric model in the work of the thirteenth-century historian Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada. This historian skilfully manipulated the principal strands of post-Visigothic historiographical narrative to assert Castile's political leadership and his own political ambitions as the archbishop of Toledo.

When viewed across a chronological continuum, the Mozarabic, Asturian, Leonese, and Castilian chronicle traditions collectively represent an ongoing narrative practice in search of an ideologically viable model of unity and continuity, even though in doing so chroniclers and historians pursued local political objectives. With regard to mediaeval Spain, Stanley Payne has provided the most succinct and insightful characteristic of this process:

The most important consequence [of the influence of Islam on Spain] was to confer on Spain a historical role of frontier and periphery, which was different from what the peninsula had experienced prior to the eighth century. Under Rome and its Visigothic successors, the peninsula had been part of the core of late Roman civilization. In the new Western civilization of Latin Christendom, which was just emerging at the time that the kingdom of Asturias was being formed, the Spanish principalities would at first be more marginal and would require half a millennium to assume full participation in the core.²

The search for such a model took place against the backdrop of a heavily politically and confessionally fragmented and fluid Iberian Peninsula, one whose

² Stanley Payne, *Spain: A Unique History* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011), pp. 70–71.

dynamic was marked by frequently shifting centres of power and learning. Thus, Mozarabic and Asturian chronicles were composed in a complete or near-complete absence of political continuity, while their counterparts in thirteenth-century Castile were faced with an unparalleled territorial expansion that called for the redefinition of royal legitimacy. In each of the new historical, political, and cultural circumstances surrounding Mozarabic Spain, Asturias, León, and Castile, peninsular unity had to be reconceptualized, relegitimized, and rewritten. In their contribution to this project, chroniclers masterfully adapted narratives developed elsewhere in the Mediterranean to reflect Iberian reality, political expediency, and the ever-shifting notions of centre and periphery.

The complexities of this process highlight, rather than refute, a significant degree of continuity between the distinct chronicle traditions. Asturians, for instance, did not perceive the Mozarabic narrative and their own as mutually exclusive: the fact that the *Codex Rotensis* contains both the *Chronicle of Alfonso III* and the Mozarabic *Prophetic Chronicle*, which links the anticipated end of Iberian Muslim rule with the figure of Alfonso III, is evidence that the Mozarabic apocalyptic narrative was acknowledged, if not embraced, in Asturias. The composition of the *Codex Vigilanus* (881–976), whose early redaction comprises the *Chronica Albeldensia*, is in itself indicative of narrative continuity and fluidity. We can see here a fusion of two traditions: on the one hand, an interest in the ‘lives of Muhammad’ and the calendar used to calculate the end of Muslim rule link us to the Mozarabic tradition; on the other hand, the *Chronica Albeldensia* and the accompanying canons of the Councils of Toledo (the *Liber Iudiciorum*, and miscellaneous civil and canon laws included in this codex) testify to the law-infused ideological character of Asturias-León. The Asturians, for whom Visigothic continuity was the cornerstone of their political ideology, by no means saw the Mozarabic view as irrelevant. They were, however, less interested in it, having instead constructed their own pragmatic and utilitarian vision, one that was highly responsive to contemporary affairs in the Iberian north-east. As we have seen, these authors were heavily invested in Visigothic law, which, adapted to the contemporary reality of Asturias-León, had become the requisite principle of royal power.

Similarly, when Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada developed the first integrated historical vision of Spain — one defined by diversity and exclusion, continuity and change — he integrated both the Mozarabic and Astur-Leonese political narratives into his Castile-centric ideology of peninsular unity. His description of the loss of Spain in Chapter 22 of Book III employs Mozarabic motifs of lamentations reminiscent of Old Testament prophets, the topoi of *mundus inversus*, and Danieline prophecies. In Books IV and V, the archbishop of Toledo

incorporates the Asturian-Leonese chronicle narrative, which he perceives as essential for his vision of the contemporary connection that exists between *Hispania* and its Visigothic past. But he rids this narrative tradition of its legal foundation as he rejects the jurisdiction of Leonese kings over Castile in favour of a model of royal power that balances royal generosity with aristocratic loyalty. As an archbishop of Toledo, he also emphasizes the spiritual superiority and genealogical continuity of Asturias in an attempt to rid Toledo, the former Visigothic capital, of its tainted Mozarabic past. Thus, the earliest manifestation of a neo-Visigothic narrative that was based solely on claims of genealogical continuity with Visigothic rulers of the Iberian Peninsula is a product of Rodrigo's strategy of Castilian legitimation and his own primatial ambition, rather than the original ideological fixture of the Asturian and Leonese chroniclers themselves.

Mediaeval Iberian civilization has been long considered distinct in its continuous effort to perpetuate the memory of brief political and confessional unification under Visigothic leadership. It is impossible to ignore the fact that the story of Spain's origin in the Visigothic period, developed in Asturias and León, has become its most influential and enduring narrative. Having been reproduced in diverse works of learned and popular literature, from late mediaeval chronicles, histories, and romances to Golden Age theatre and philosophical works of the Enlightenment and contemporary political discourse, the Visigothic myth of Spain's origins has been strangely immune to shifts in critical perspective as it continues to exercise its power over collective consciousness today. Was the Spanish national myth created in the Middle Ages or was it the fruit of modern ideological concerns? What made the narrative of Spain's Visigothic beginnings so powerful and enduring? The answer to these questions, I believe, lies in the peculiarities of how various chroniclers appropriated Mediterranean cultural traffic in the process of negotiating the desire for peninsular unity with the reality of its diversity. Iberian centres of power and learning, which successively developed either under Islamic domination or in perilous vicinity of Muslim territories, were firmly integrated in broad networks of diplomacy, knowledge, and culture while simultaneously challenging notions of coexistence, diversity, and heterogeneity — at least the way we understand them in the contemporary Western world. By rejecting the notions of the fixed, the constant, and the insular, and exploring instead the process of negotiating categories of unity and diversity in their political, geographical, and cultural contexts, I hope to have demonstrated that these early testimonies benefit from being read both as a product of Iberian diversity and, at times, as propagandistic tools for its denial.

My secondary, though no less important, goal was to advance the notion that the Latin chroniclers' craft was not limited to utilizing and manipulating earlier chronicle sources in order to contextualize current events. Latin chronicle culture underwent constant renovation in contact with a variety of non-chronicle genres and traditions that defined the textual culture of the wider Iberian and non-Iberian world. Eighth-century Mozarabic chroniclers were heavily invested in the apocalyptic world view that had been developing elsewhere in the Mediterranean since the Persian wars and early advances of Islam; ninth-century Cordovan Christians pondered the relevance of eastern Mediterranean martyrdom accounts as they developed their response to rapid Islamization; Asturians may have looked to Carolingian France throughout the ninth century as they constructed a model of kingship based on territorial expansion and legislative continuity; and Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada created his vision of Spain's unity by adapting philosophical works created and transmitted by Iberian Jews and Muslims, even though his vision would ultimately exclude these Iberian Others. Uncovering how Latin chroniclers responded to contemporary challenges by tapping into currents of thought that reached them from various confines of the Mediterranean adds an important facet to our understanding of Iberian Latin historiography as a practice that negotiates unity and diversity by blending tradition and innovation.

'A nation is not only its history; it is also a project of integration, felt and shared by all, one that looks toward a future.'³ As Spain's new king Philip VI reads his 2014 inaugural speech, he lays out his vision of a *convivencia* in a united, diverse, and tolerant Spain. Perhaps there are lessons to be learned from the chroniclers of Spain's most conflictive and uncertain age. Although the models of royal legitimacy and social cohesion they championed can hardly serve as examples of the kind of coexistence needed today, these early authors remind us that historical writing reflects history not as a straightforward path, but rather as a search for stability in the midst of a rapidly changing political, social, and cultural reality. Composed at several critical junctures in Spain's past, Mozarabic, Asturian, Leonese, and Castilian Latin chronicles and histories testify that negotiating between unity and diversity, inclusion and exclusion, integration and fragmentation is an imperative that remains as urgent today as it was before the age of nations, after the Visigoths.

³ 'Una nación no es sólo su historia, es también un proyecto integrador, sentido y compartido por todos, que mire hacia el future.' 'Mensaje de Felipe VI en su proclamación ante las Cortes', *El País Digital*, 19 June 2014, <http://politica.elpais.com/politica/2014/06/19/actualidad/1403169017_929939.html> [accessed 19 June 2014].

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Aillet, Cyrille, 'Islamisation et evolution du peuplement chrétien en al-Andalus (VIII^e–XII^e siècle)', in *Islamisation et arabisation de l'Occident musulman médiéval (VII^e–XII^e siècle)*, ed. by Dominique Valérian, Bibliothèque historique des pays d'Islam, 2 (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2011), pp. 151–87
- , 'La formación del mozarabismo y la remodelación de la Península Ibérica (s. VIII–IX)', in *De Mahoma a Carlomagno. Los primeros tiempos (siglos VII–IX). Actas de la XXXIX Semana de Estudios Medievales de Estella. 17 al 20 de julio de 2012*, ed. by Philippe Sénac (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2013), pp. 285–310
- , *Les Mozarabes. Islamisation, arabisation et christianisme en péninsule Ibérique (IX^e–XII^e siècle)* (Madrid: Bibliothèque de la Casa de Velázquez, 2010)
- , Mayte Pinelas, and Philippe Roisse, eds, *¿Existe una identidad mozárabe?* (Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, 2008)
- Alfonso, Isabel, 'Judicial Rhetoric and Political Legitimation in Medieval León-Castile', in *Building Legitimacy: Political Discourses and Forms of Legitimacy in Medieval Societies*, ed. by Isabel Alfonso, Hugh Kennedy, and Julio Escalona (Leiden: Brill, 2004), pp. 51–88
- Altschul, Nadia, *Geographies of Philological Knowledge: Postcoloniality and Transatlantic National Epic* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012)
- Alvarez Cora, Enrique, 'La noción de la ley posgótica', *Historia, instituciones, documentos*, 22 (1995), 1–38
- Arízaga Bolumburu, Beatriz, Dolores Mariño Veiras, Carmen Díez Herrera, and others, eds, *Mundos medievales: Espacios, sociedades y poder. Homenaje al Profesor José Ángel García de Cortázar y Ruiz de Aguirre*, 2 vols (Santander: Publican, Universidad de Cantabria, 2012)
- Arizaleta, Amaia, 'Ut lector agnosceret: discurso y recepción en la obra de Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada (primera mitad del siglo XIII)', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 163–86
- Aurell, Jaume, *Authoring the Past: History, Autobiography, and Politics in Medieval Catalonia* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012)
- , 'From Genealogies to Chronicles: The Power of the Form in Medieval Catalan History', *Viator*, 36 (2005), 235–64

- de Azcárraga Servert, Joaquín, and José Manuel Pérez-Prendes y Muñoz-Arraco, *Lecciones de la historia del derecho español*, 3rd edn (Madrid: Ramón Areces, 1997)
- Barton, Simon, *A History of Spain*, 2nd edn (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009)
- , 'Islam and the West: A View from Twelfth-Century León', in *Cross, Crescent and Conversion: Studies on Medieval Spain and Christendom in Memory of Richard Fletcher*, ed. by Simon Barton and Peter Linehan (Leiden: Brill, 2007), pp. 153–74
- Besga Marroquín, Armando, 'El concepto de España en el reino de Asturias', *Boletín del Real Instituto de Estudios Asturianos*, 61.170 (2007), 7–17
- Cañada Juste, Alberto, 'Los Banū Qasī (714–924)', *Príncipe de Viana*, 158–59 (1980), 5–95
- , 'El posible solar originario de los Banū Qāsī', in José María Lacarra, *Homenaje a Don José María Lacarra de Miguel en su jubilación del profesorado*, 5 vols (Zaragoza: Anubar, 1977), 1, 33–47
- Cardelle de Hartmann, Carmen, 'The Textual Transmission of the Mozarabic Chronicle of 754', *EME*, 8 (1999), 13–29
- Castellanos, Santiago, and Iñaki Martín Viso, 'The Local Articulation of Central Power in the North of the Iberian Peninsula (500–1000)', *EME*, 13 (2005), 1–42
- Colbert, Edward P., *The Martyrs of Córdoba (850–59): A Study of the Sources* (Washington, DC: University of America Press, 1962)
- Collins, Roger, *The Arab Conquest of Spain: 711–97* (Cambridge, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 1994)
- , *Caliphs and Kings: Spain, 796–1031* (Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012)
- , "'Sicut lex Gothorum Continet": Law and Charters in Ninth- and Tenth-Century León and Catalonia', in Roger Collins, *Law, Culture, and Regionalism in Early Medieval Spain* (Hampshire: Ashgate, 1992), pp. 489–512
- Coope, Jessica, *The Martyrs of Córdoba: Community and Family Conflict in an Age of Mass Conversions* (Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1995)
- Coronas González, Santos Manuel, 'El orden constitutivo del reino de Asturias (718–910)', *AHDE*, 70 (2000), 9–36
- David, Pierre, *Etudes historiques sur Galice et le Portugal du VI^e au XII^e siècle* (Paris: Belles Lettres, 1947)
- Depreux, Philippe, 'Les préceptes pour les *Hispani* de Charlemagne, Louis de Pieux et Charles la Chauve', in *Aquitaine-Espagne (VIII^e–XIII^e siècle)*, ed. by Philippe Sénac (Poitiers: Centre d'Études Supérieures de Civilisation Médiévale, 2001), pp. 19–38
- Deswarte, Thomas, *De la destruction à la restauration: l'ideologie dans le royaume d'Oviedo-Léon (VIII^e–XI^e siècles)*, *Cultural Encounters in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages*, 3 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2004)
- Díaz y Díaz, Manuel C., 'En torno a los orígenes del cristianismo hispánico', in *Las raíces de España*, ed. by José Manuel Gómez-Tabanera (Madrid: Instituto Español de Antropología Aplicada, 1967), pp. 423–43
- , 'La Lex Visigothorum y sus manuscritos. Un ensayo de reinterpretación', *AHDE*, 46 (1976), 163–223
- , 'La transmisión de los textos antiguos en la península Ibérica en los siglos VII–XI', in *La cultura antica nell'Occidente latino dal VII all'XI secolo: 18–29 aprile 1974*, *Settimane*, 22 (Spoleto, 1975), pp. 131–74

- Dozy, Reinhart Pieter Anne, *Le Calendrier de Cordoue publié par R. Dozy. Nouvelle édition accompagnée d'une traduction française annotée par Ch. Pellat*, ed. by Charles Pellat, *Medieval Iberian Peninsula Texts and Studies*, 1 (Leiden: Brill, 1961)
- Dubler, César, 'Sobre la crónica arábigo-bizantina de 741 y la influencia bizantina en la península Ibérica', *Al-Andalus*, 11 (1946), 283–350
- Escalona, Julio, 'Family Memories: Inventing Alfonso I of Asturias', in *Building Legitimacy: Political Discourses and Forms of Legitimacy in Medieval Societies*, ed. by Isabel Alfonso, Hugh Kennedy, and Julio Escalona (Leiden: Brill, 2004), pp. 223–62
- Fierro, Maribel, 'Les genealogies du pouvoir en al-Andalus', in *Islamisation et arabisation de l'Occident musulman médiéval (VII^e–XII^e siècle)*, ed. by Dominique Valérian, *Bibliothèque historique des pays d'Islam*, 2 (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2011)
- Filios, Denise K. 'Playing the Goth Card in Tenth-Century Córdoba: Ibn al-Qūṭīya's Family Traditions', *La Corónica*, 43 (2015)
- Fletcher, Richard A., 'Reconquest and Crusade in Spain, c. 1050–1150', in *The Crusades: The Essential Readings*, ed. by Thomas F. Madden (Oxford: Blackwell, 2002), pp. 51–88
- Fontaine, Jacques, 'De l'universalisme antique aux particularismes médiévaux: la conscience du temps et de l'espace dans l'antiquité tardive', in *Popoli e paesi nella cultura altomedievale. 23–29 aprile 1981*, *Settimane*, 29 (Spoleto, 1983), pp. 15–45
- García de Cortázar y Ruiz de Aguirre, José Angel, *La sociedad rural en la España medieval* (Madrid: Siglo XXI, 1988)
- , *Sociedad y organización del espacio en la España medieval* (Granada: Universidad de Granada, 2004)
- García López, Yolanda, *Estudios críticos y literarios de la 'Lex Wisigothorum'* (Alcalá: Universidad de Alcalá, 1996)
- García Moreno, Luis A., 'Colonias de comerciantes orientales en la Península Ibérica: siglos v–vii', *Habis*, 3 (1972), pp. 127–54
- , 'Etnia goda y la iglesia hispana', *HS*, 54 (2002), 415–42
- , 'Los Hispani: emigrantes y exiliados ibéricos en la Francia carolingia. Realidad y mito historiográfico', in *Movimientos migratorios, asentamientos y expansión (siglos VIII–XI): en el centenario del profesor José María Lacarra, XXXIV Semana de Estudios Medievales, Estella, 16 a 20 de julio de 2007*, ed. by José Ángel Sesma Muñoz (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, Institución Príncipe de Viana, 2008), pp. 53–76
- , 'Literatura antimusulmana de tradición bizantina entre los mozárabes', *HS*, 57 (2005), 7–45
- , 'Monjes y profecías cristianas próximo-orientales en al-Andalus del s. IX', *HS*, 51 (1999), 91–100
- , 'Spanish Gothic Consciousness among the Mozarabs in al-Andalus (VIIIth–Xth Centuries)', in *The Visigoths: Studies in Culture and Society*, ed. by Alberto Ferreiro (Leiden: Brill, 1999), pp. 303–23
- García Turza, Francisco Javier, ed., *Códice Albeldense 976: original conservado en la Biblioteca del real Monasterio de San Lorenzo del Escorial (d.I.2)*, *Scriptorium*, 15 (Madrid: Patrimonio Nacional: Testimonio Compañía Editorial, 2002)
- Gerli, Michael, 'Inventing the Spanish Middle Ages: Ramón Menéndez Pidal, Spanish Cultural History, and Ideology in Philology', *La Corónica*, 30 (2001), 111–26

- Gómez-Moreno, Manuel, 'Las primeras crónicas de la Reconquista: el ciclo de Alfonso III', *BRAH*, 100 (1932), 562–627
- Gómez Redondo, Fernando, 'Relaciones literarias entre la historiografía latina y las crónicas romances del siglo XIII', in *Actas del I Congreso de la Asociación Hispánica de Literatura Medieval. Santiago de Compostela, 2 al 6 de diciembre de 1985*, ed. by Vicente Beltrán (Barcelona: PPU, 1988), pp. 305–20
- Griffith, Sidney H., *Arabic Christianity in the Monasteries of Ninth-Century Palestine* (Aldershot: Variorum, 1992)
- , 'Christians, Muslims, and Neo-Martyrs: Saints' Lives and Holy Land History', *Sharing the Sacred: Religious Contacts and Conflicts in the Holy Land*, ed. by Arie H. Kofsky and Guy G. Stroumsa (Jerusalem: Yad Izhak Ben Zvi, 1998), pp. 163–207
- , *The Church in the Shadow of the Mosque: Christians and Muslims in the World of Islam* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2008)
- Henriet, Patrick, 'Sainteté martyriale et communauté de salut. Une lecture du dossier des martyrs de Cordoue (milieu IX^e siècle)', in *Guerriers et moines: conversion et sainteté aristocratiques dans l'Occident médiéval, IX^e–XII^e siècle*, ed. by Michel Lauwers, Collection d'Etudes Médiévales, 4 (Antibes: Editions APDCA, 2002), pp. 93–139
- Hernández, Francisco J., 'La hora de Don Rodrigo', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 15–71
- Hillgarth, Jocelyn N., *Spain and the Mediterranean in the Later Middle Ages: Studies in Political and Intellectual History*, Variorum Collected Studies, 764 (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003)
- , 'Spanish Historiography and Iberian Reality', *History and Theory*, 24 (1985), 23–43
- , *The Visigoths in History and Legend*, Studies and Texts, 166 (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 2009)
- Hitchcock, Richard, *Mozarabs in Medieval and Early Modern Spain: Identities and Influences* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008)
- Hoyland, Robert G., *Seeing Islam as Others Saw it: A Survey and Evaluation of Christian, Jewish, and Zoroastrian Writings on Early Islam* (Princeton: Darwin, 1997)
- Howell, Alfred M., 'Some Notes on Early Treatises between Muslims and the Visigothic Rulers of al-Andalus', *Actas del I Congreso de Historia de Andalucía, diciembre de 1976*, ed. by Emilio Cabrera Muñoz, 10 vols (Córdoba: Monte de Piedad y Caja de Ahorros de Córdoba, 1978), 1: *Andalucía medieval*, pp. 3–14
- Irvine, Martin, *The Making of Textual Culture*, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Literature, 19 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006)
- Kaegi, Walter E., *Byzantium and the Early Islamic Conquests* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992)
- Kienast, Walter, 'La pervivencia del derecho godo en el sur de Francia y Cataluña', *BRABL*, 35 (1973–74), 265–300
- Kosto, Adam J., 'Sicut mos esse solet: Documentary Practices in Christian Iberia, c. 700–1000', in *Documentary Culture and the Laity in the Early Middle Ages*, ed. by Warren C. Brown and others (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013)
- Lacarra, José M., 'Textos navarros del Códice de Roda', *Estudios de Edad Media de la Corona de Aragón*, 1 (1945), 194–284

- Ladner, Gerhard, 'On Roman Attitudes Toward Barbarians in Late Antiquity', *Viator*, 7 (1976), 1–26
- Levi Della Vida, Georgio, *Note di storia letteraria arabo-ispánica*, ed. by Maria Nallino (Rome: Instituto Per L'Oriente, 1971)
- Linehan, Peter, *History and the Historians of Medieval Spain* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993)
- , 'The Invention of Toledo', in *La fractura historiográfica: las investigaciones de Edad Media y Renacimiento desde el tercer milenio*, ed. by Francisco Javier Burguillo and Laura Mier (Salamanca: SEMYR, 2008), pp. 123–41; repr. in Peter Linehan, *Historical Memory and Clerical Activity in Medieval Spain and Portugal*, Variorum Collected Studies, CS1011 (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 123–41
- , 'On Further Thought: Lucas of Tuy, Rodrigo of Toledo and the Alfonsine Histories', *AEM*, 27 (1997), 415–36
- , 'Religion, Nationalism and National Identity in Medieval Spain and Portugal', *Studies in Church History*, 18 (1982), 161–99; repr. in Peter Linehan, *The Process of Politics and the Rule of Law. Studies on the Iberian Kingdoms and Papal Rome in the Middle Ages* (London: Ashgate, 1983), pp. 161–99
- López Pereira, José Eduardo, *Continuatio isidoriana hispana: crónica mozárabe de 754*, Fuentes y estudios de historia leonesa, 127 (León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación San Isidoro, Caja España de Inversiones, Archivo Histórico Diocesano, 2009)
- , *Estudio crítico sobre la Crónica Mozárabe de 754* (Zaragoza: Anubar, 1980)
- Martin, Georges, 'La chute du royaume visigothique d'Espagne dans l'historiographie chrétienne des VIII^e et IX^e siècles', *CLHM*, 9 (1984), 208–33
- , 'Después de Pidal: medio siglo de renovación en el estudio de la historiografía hispánica medieval (siglos XII y XIII)', *e-Spania*, 10 December 2010, DOI: 10.4000/e-spania.20185
- , *Les Juges de Castile: Mentalités y discours historique dans l'Espagne médiévale* (Paris: Klincksieck, 1992)
- , 'Noblesse et royauté dans le *De rebus Hispaniae* (livres 4 à 9)', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 101–21
- Martín Duque, Ángel, 'Definición de espacios y fronteras en los reinos de Asturias-León y Pamplona hasta el siglo XI', in *Los espacios de poder en la España medieval: XII Semana de Estudios Medievales, Nájera, del 30 de julio al 3 de agosto de 2001*, coord. by José Ignacio de la Iglesia Duarte and José Luis Martín Rodríguez (Logroño: Gobierno de La Rioja, Instituto de Estudios Riojanos, 2002), pp. 315–39
- Martín Viso, Iñaki, *¿Tiempos oscuros?: Territorio y sociedad en el centro de la Península Ibérica (siglos VII–X)* (Madrid: Sílex Ediciones, 2009)
- McKitterick, Rosamond, *The Carolingians and the Written Word* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989)
- Menéndez Pelayo, Marcelino, *Antología de estudios y discursos literarios*, ed. by Mario Crespo López (Madrid: Cátedra, 2009)
- Menéndez Pidal, Ramón, *La epopeya castellana a través de la literatura española* (Buenos Aires-México: Espasa-Calpe Argentina, 1946)
- , *España en su historia* (Madrid: Ediciones Minotauro, 1957)

- , *Los españoles en la historia*, introd. by Diego Catalán (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1982)
- Milà y Fontanals, Manuel, 'Oración general acerca del carácter general de la literatura española, leída ante el Claustro de la Universidad de Barcelona en la apertura del curso de 1865 a 1866', in *De la poesía heroico-popular castellana. Estudio precedido de una oración acerca de la literatura española* (Barcelona: Librería de Alvaro Verdaguer, 1874), pp. i–xxxvii
- Nieto Soria, José Manuel, 'Ideología y poder monárquico en la Península', in *La Historia Medieval en España. Un balance historiográfico (1968–1998). Actas de la XXV Semana de Estudios medievales de Estella. 14 a 18 de julio de 1998*, ed. by Angel J. Martín Duque (Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, Departamento de Educación y Cultura, 1999), pp. 335–82
- Palmer, Andrew, ed., introd., trans. and annot., *The Seventh Century in the West-Syrian Chronicles*, Translated Texts for Historians, 15 (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1993)
- Payne, Stanley, 'Nationalism, Regionalism, and Micronationalism in Spain', in *The Impact of Western Nationalisms. Essays Dedicated to Walter Z. Laqueur on the Occasion of his 70th Birthday*, ed. by Jehuda Reinharz and George L. Mosse (London: SAGE, 1992), pp. 125–38
- , *Spain: A Unique History* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011)
- Pérez-Embidi Wamba, Javier, *Hagiología y sociedad en la España medieval. Castilla y León (siglos XI–XIII)* (Huelva: Universidad de Huelva, 2002)
- Pérez Prendes y Muñoz de Arraco, José Manuel, 'Rasgos de afirmación de la identidad Visigótica desde Atanarico', *Antigüedad y cristianismo: Monografías históricas sobre la Antigüedad tardía*, 3 (1986), 27–45
- Pérez Marinas, Iván, 'Regum Gothorum y regnum Hispaniae en las crónicas hispano-cristianas de los siglos VIII y IX: continuación, fin o traslado en el relato de la conquista árabe', *Estudios Medievales Hispánicos*, 2 (2012), 175–200
- Pessin, Sarah, 'Jewish Neoplatonism: Being Above Being and Divine Emanation in Solomon ibn Gabirol and Isaac Israeli', in *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Jewish Philosophy*, ed. by Daniel H. Frank and Oliver Leaman (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 91–110
- Pick, Lucy K., *Conflict and Coexistence: Archbishop Rodrigo and the Muslims and Jews of Medieval Spain*, History, Languages, and Cultures of the Medieval Spanish and Portuguese Worlds (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2004)
- Presedo Velo, Francisco J., *La España bizantina. Prólogo de Genaro Chic García. Edición de Aurelio Padilla Monge* (Seville: Universidad de Sevilla, 2003)
- Reilly, Bernard F., 'Bishop Lucas of Tüý and the Latin Chronicle Tradition in Iberia', *The Catholic Historical Review*, 93 (2007), 767–88
- Reimitz, Helmut, 'The Providential Past: Visions of Frankish Identity in the Early Medieval History of Gregory of Tours' *Historiae* (sixth–ninth century)', in *Visions of Community in the Post-Roman World: The West, Byzantium and the Islamic World, 300–1100*, ed. by Walter Pohl, Clemens Gantner, and Richard Payne (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 109–35

- Ríos Saloma, Martín F., *La Reconquista en la historiografía española contemporánea* (Madrid: Sílex, 2013)
- Rodríguez, Ana, 'De rebus Hispanie frente a la *Chronica latina de los reyes de Castilla*: virtudes regias y reciprocidad política en Castilla y León en la primera mitad del siglo XIII', *CLHM*, 26 (2003), 133–49
- Rodríguez de la Peña, Manuel A., 'Ideología política y crónicas monásticas: la concepción cluniacense de la realeza en la España del siglo XII', *AEM*, 30 (2000), 681–734
- Sánchez-Albornoz, Claudio, *Investigaciones sobre historiografía hispana medieval (siglos VIII al XII)* (Buenos Aires: Instituto de Historia de España, 1967)
- , *Orígenes de la nación española. Estudios críticos sobre el reino de Asturias*, 3 vols (Oviedo: Instituto de Estudios Asturianos, 1972–75)
- , *El tercer rey de España* (Buenos Aires: Facultad de Filosofía y Letras, 1969)
- Sassier, Yves, 'Le roi et la loi chez les penseurs du royaume occidental du deuxième quart du IX^e à la fin du XI^e s.', *CCM*, 43 (2000), 257–73
- Swanson, Mark N., *The Coptic Papacy in Islamic Egypt, 641–1517* (Cairo: American University in Cairo Press, 2010)
- , 'The Martyrdom of 'Abd al-Masīh, Superior of Mount Sinai (Qays al- Ghassānī)', in *Syrian Christians Under Islam: The First Thousand Years*, ed. by David Thomas (Leiden: Brill, 2001), pp. 107–29
- Sweeney, Leo, 'Doctrine of Creation in *Liber de causis*', in *An Etienne Gilson Tribute*, ed. by Charles J. O'Neill (Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 1959), pp. 274–89
- Tolan, John Victor, *Saracens: Islam in the Medieval European Imagination* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002)
- , 'Using the Middle Ages to Construct Spanish Identity: 19th- and 20th-Century Spanish Historiography of Reconquest', in *Historiographical Approaches to Medieval Colonization of East Central Europe*, ed. by Jan M. Piskorski (New York: East European Monographs, 2002), pp. 329–47
- Vallejo Gírvés, Margarita, *Bizancio y la España tardoantigua (ss. V–VIII). Un capítulo de historia mediterránea* (Alcalá de Henares: Universidad de Alcalá de Henares, 1993)
- , 'Exilio bizantino: Hispania y el Mediterráneo occidental (siglos VI–VII)', in *Bizancio y la Península Ibérica. De la antigüedad tardía a la edad moderna*, ed. by Inmaculada Pérez Martín and Pedro Bádenas de la Peña (Madrid: CSIC, 2004), pp. 117–54
- Vázquez de Parga, Luis, 'Algunas notas sobre el Pseudo Metodios y España', *Habis*, 2 (1971), 143–64
- Ward, Aengus, 'Past, Present and Future in the Latin and Romance Historiography of the Medieval Christian Kingdoms of Spain', *JMIS*, 1 (2009), 147–62
- Wood, Jamie, 'Defending Byzantine Spain: Frontier and Diplomacy', *EME*, 18 (2010), 292–319
- , *The Politics of Identity in Visigothic Spain: Religion and Power in the Histories of Isidore of Seville*, Brill's Series on the Early Middle Ages, 21 (Leiden: Brill, 2012)
- Wormald, Patrick, 'Lex Scripta and Verbum Regis: Legislation and Germanic Kingship, from Euric to Cnut', in Patrick Wormald, *Legal Culture in the Early Medieval West: Laws as Text, Image and Experience* (London: Hambledon Press, 1999), pp. 1–43

- Zimmermann, Michel, 'Le concept de *Marca Hispanica* et l'importance de la frontière dans la formation de la Catalogne', in *La Marche Supérieure d'al-Andalus et l'Occident chrétien*, ed. by Philippe Sénac (Madrid: Casa de Velázquez, Universidad de Zaragoza, 1991), pp. 29–49
- , 'L'usage du droit wisigothique en Catalogne du IX^e au XII^e siècle: approches d'une signification culturelle', in *Mélanges de la Casa de Velázquez*, 9 (1973), 233–81

INDEX

- Aachen: 240
 'Abbāsids: 125, 128, 132, 232
 'Abd al-Azīz, governor of Egypt: 103, 128
 'Abd-al-Malik, Umayyad caliph: 107, 124, 130
 'Abd-al-Raḥmān I, Cordovan emir: 113
 'Abd-al-Raḥmān II, Cordovan emir: 114–15, 144–45, 168
 'Abd-al-Raḥmān II, Cordovan emir: 150, 167, 214, 232
 'Abd Allah I, Cordovan emir: 167, 169
 'Abd ar-Raḥmān al-Ghafiḳi, governor of al-Andalus: 101
 Abū Yūsuf Ya'qūb al-Manṣūr, Almohad Caliph: 232
 Abundius, Cordovan martyr: 150
 Acisclus, saint: 135, 137–38
Ad Sebastianum: 174, 189
 Adoptionism: 120–21
 Adosinda, wife of Silo: 188
 Afonso Henriques I, king of Portugal: 216, 223
 Agapius of Manbij: 89
 Agila, Visigothic king: 81
 Aimonius, *De translatione sanctorum martyrum*...: 148
 Aizon, Visigothic leader: 164
 al-Andalus: 150, 157, 163
 Christian communities: 5–8, 22–23
 Islamic populations: 17, 115, 117–18, 124–26
 reconquest of: 32
 terminology: 5, 22
see also Córdoba
 al-Ḥakam II, Cordovan caliph: 135
 al-Ḥurr, Andalusī governor: 104–05
 al-Manṣūr (Almanzor), Andalusī ruler: 36, 151, 200 215
 al-Mutawwakil, 'Abbasid caliph: 128
 al-Walid, Umayyad caliph: 158
 Alaor: 105
 Alarcos, battle of (1195): 221, 240, 243
 Alaric, Visigothic king: 239
 Álava: 165, 167–69, 254
 Albelda: 168, 191
 Alcuin of York, saint: 120–21
 Alexander II, Coptic patriarch: 132
 Alexander II, pope: 222
 Alexandria: 75, 86, 89, 89, 96
 Alfonso I the Battler, king of Aragon: 216, 220
 Alfonso I, king of Asturias: 37, 171, 182, 206, 257
 legitimacy of: 186, 188–89
 Alfonso II, king of Asturias: 153, 155, 168, 171, 181–82

- and Franks: 159–60, 193
- legitimacy of: 186–89, 191
- and *ordo Gothorum*: 160–1
- royal see, foundation of: 177
- Alfonso III the Great, king of León and Asturias: 153, 160, 174, 177, 191, 195, 205, 213, 257, 264
- biography of: 43–44, 154
- marriage: 168
- and peace: 169, 182–83
- in *Prophetic Chronicle*: 156, 158–59
- see also *Chronicle of Alfonso III*
- Alfonso V, king of León: 32, 151, 195, 204–05
- Alfonso VI, king of León and Castile: 13, 43, 45, 152, 195–96, 206, 215, 250
- and Cluniacs: 222, 229
- and Council of Burgos: 201
- death of: 216
- Toledo, recapture of: 23, 216, 258–60
- Alfonso VII, king of León and Castile: 13, 207, 213, 216–18, 220
- Alfonso VIII, king of Castile: 220–21, 240, 244–46, 248–49
- Alfonso IX, king of León: 245
- Alfonso X, king of Castile and León: 12, 33, 45, 57, 60
- Alfonso de Cartagena
- Anacephaleosis*: 12
- Rerum in Hispania gestarum Chronicon*: 12
- Alfonso de Palencia, *Gesta hispaniensia*: 12
- Algeciras see Traducta
- Alicante: 103
- Almería, battle of (1147): 196, 216
- Almohads: 5, 206, 216, 221, 230, 233, 240, 243–44
- Almoravids: 5, 201, 206, 216, 230, 233
- Alodia, Cordovan martyr: 119, 142
- Alvar, Paul: 67, 118, 127, 132, 144
- and Adoptionism: 121
- and Iberian unity: 133
- Indiculus luminosus*: 115–16, 123–24
- and martyrdom, validity of: 146, 148–51
- Vita Eulogii*: 115, 121, 136–37, 140–42
- 'Anbasah, governor of Mérida: 103
- Annales Laurissenses Maiores*: 160
- Annales Portucalenses Veteres*: 6
- Antioch: 89, 96, 259
- Antioch Strategos, *The Capture of Jerusalem by the Persians in AD 614*: 96–98
- apocalyptic literature and discourse: 17–18, 93–111, 262–63
- and Cordovan Christians: 115–17, 128
- see also Daniel, biblical prophet;
- eschatology
- Aquila, ruler of Septimania and Tarraconensis: 164
- Aragon: 165–66; see also *individual rulers*
- Ardabastus, Byzantine exile: 92
- Argimirus, Cordovan martyr: 118
- Arianism: 84, 208, 211
- Aristotle: 231–32, 236
- Armenia: 91–92, 106–07
- Arnaldo, bishop of Astorga: 196
- ars regendi*: 47
- Artieda: 165
- Asona, daughter of Íñigo Arista: 166
- Astorga: 151
- Asturias: 21, 25, 32, 41, 67–69, 149, 197–98, 264
- as centre of power: 17–20, 47, 58–59, 120, 153, 155, 194, 202
- and law keepers, royal: 185–94, 203
- and legitimacy, defining: 170–84
- and neighbours, political: 163–70
- and Visigothic continuity: 23–24, 116, 156–63, 200, 256
- see also *Chronicle of Albelda*; *Chronicle of Alfonso III*
- Athanagild, Visigothic king: 81, 208
- Augustine, saint, bishop of Hippo: 66
- City of God (De civitate Dei contra paganos)*: 67, 137, 207
- Confessions*: 65
- De doctrina christiana*: 65
- Aurea, Cordovan martyr: 118–19
- Aurelio, Cordovan martyr: 119, 148–49
- Aurelio, king of Asturias: 186–88
- Averroës: 20, 230, 236
- De anima*: 231
- Decisive Treatise Determining the Connection between the Law and Wisdom*: 232
- Metaphysics*: 231
- Avicbron see Ibn Gabirol
- Avicenna, *Kitāb al-Insāf (Book of Impartial Judgment)*: 232

- Avila: 219
 Aznar Galindo, Aragonese count: 166

 Babylon of Antioch, saint: 136
 Baetica: 67, 81, 119, 121, 134
 Baeza, battle of (1227): 225
 Baghdad: 232
 Balj: 101
 Banū Qāsī: 19, 163, 167–69, 191
 Barcelona: 25, 163
 capture of: 159, 164
 and Visigothic law: 164–65
 Basil of Emesa: 130
 Basques: 173, 183, 188, 204–06, 210, 213
 Beatus de Liébana: 110, 120
 Bede, *Historia ecclesiastica gentis Anglorum*: 206
bellum iustum: 20, 202, 220
bellum sanctum: 20, 202
 Benilda, Cordovan martyr: 118
Beowulf: 48
 Berbers: 1, 35, 39–41, 113, 118, 213
 Bermudo I, king of Asturias: 44, 68n.68, 186–87, 189
 Bermudo II, king of León: 32, 181, 193, 195, 215
 Bernard of Cluny, archbishop of Toledo: 217, 229
 Bernard of Sauvetât, archbishop of Toledo: 259
 Bernardo del Carpio: 50, 240
 Berroza: 165
 Borja: 168
 Braga: 257
 Braulio of Zaragoza: 67
 Burgos, Council of (1080): 201, 218
 Byzantines
 and chronicles: 87–101
 and heresy: 84–85
 in Iberia: 81–86, 92, 111
 and North Africa: 83–86, 90–91
 and Persia: 87–88, 96–99, 107–09, 111
 trade: 82–83

 Cabra: 119
 Cádiz (Gades): 83, 239
 Caesar-augusta *see* Saragossa
Calendar of Córdoba (Liber ordinum): 135–36, 138, 140

cantares de gesta: 52
 Carcassonne: 103
Carmen Campidoctoris: 53n.21
 Carmona: 119
 Cartagena *see* Carthago Spartaria
 Cartaginiensis: 81
 Carteya (San Roque): 82
 Carthage: 85, 109
 Carthago Spartaria (Cartagena): 82
 Casius (Qāsī), count of Borja: 167–68, 191
 Castile: 12–13, 21, 26, 41, 69, 168–69
 abbeys: 59
 as centre of power: 17, 20, 47, 155
 and Cluny: 222
 as frontier society: 58, 198
 primacy, political and linguistic: 55–61
 reconquest: 20, 197
 see also individual rulers
 Catalonia: 164
 Celanova: 177
 Celedonius of Calahorra, saint: 136
 Cesarea, Mauritania: 136
 Charlemagne, Holy Roman Emperor:
 56, 120, 163–64, 175, 205, 239–40
 and Alfonso II: 159–60
 Charles the Bald, Frankish king:
 149, 175, 192
 Praeceptum: 164
 Childebert II, Frankish king: 175
 Chindasvinth, Visigothic king: 92
 Chosroes I, Persian king: 91
 Chosroes II, Sassanid king: 85, 97–98
 Christopher, Cordovan martyr: 118, 137
Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris: 2, 13, 196, 201, 205–06, 213
 date of: 216
 naturaleza: 32
 and *Poem of Almería*: 216–17
Chronica Albeldensia (Chronicle of Albelda): 18–19, 92
 and *Codex Rotensis*: 166, 171, 189
 and *Codex Vigilanus*: 167, 264
 law keepers, royal: 186–90, 192, 199, 205
 manuscript: 153–54, 156
 on peace: 182–86
 on Pelagius: 171
 and *Prophetic Chronicle*: 156–59
 sources: 154

- unlawful conduct of kings: 185–86, 188–89
- and Visigothic law: 170, 175–83
- Chronica Byzantia-Arabica* see *Chronicle of 741*
- Chronica Gothorum* (*Chronicon Lusitanum*): 233
- Chronica latina regum Castellae*: 219–21, 248–49
- Chronica Muzarabica* see *Chronicle of 754*
- Chronica Naiarensis*: 2, 42, 60, 151, 203, 213–14
- date: 224
- sources: 154, 196, 226
- Chronica Pseudo-Isidoriana*: 72
- Chronicle of Albelda* see *Chronica Albeldensis*
- Chronicle of Alfonso III*: 7, 19, 42–44, 92, 153
- and *Ad Sebastianum*: 171, 189
- and Banū Qāsi: 168
- and *Codex Rotensis*: 166, 171, 264
- law keepers, royal: 186–90, 192, 199
- on peace: 182–86
- on Pelagius: 171, 254–55
- and *Prophetic Chronicle*: 159
- as source: 226: 254–55, 257–58
- unlawful conduct of kings: 185–86, 188–89
- versions: 154–55
- and Visigothic law: 170
- Chronicle of Bishop Pelayo*: 151
- Chronicle of Moissac*: 6, 163–64
- Chronicle of 741* (*Chronica Byzantia-Arabica*): 17, 72–74, 101, 103, 116
- apocalyptic views: 100–02, 110
- Asturian chronicles, compared to: 156
- author: 75–76, 78, 86
- chronological system: 89
- evaluation of: 77–80
- manuscripts: 73
- on Muḥammad: 108
- sources: 77, 85–86, 90
- Chronicle of 754* (*Chronica Muzarabica*): 17, 67, 72, 74, 88, 113, 116
- apocalyptic views: 100–01, 103–06, 110
- Asturian chronicles, compared to: 156, 158–59
- author: 76
- chronological system: 89–90
- evaluation of: 78–80
- manuscripts: 75
- on Muḥammad: 108
- as source: 226, 251–52, 254
- sources: 77, 85–86, 90
- Chronicle of San Juan de la Peña*: 165–66
- Chronicle of Zuqnīn*: 90
- chronicles, as genre: 41–46
- Chronicon Lusitanum* see *Chronica Gothorum*
- Chronicon mundi* (North African): 77, 151
- Chronicon Paschale* (*Easter Chronicle*): 88
- Chronologia regum Gothorum*: 6, 163
- Cid, El: 37, 49–50, 54, 60
- Clavijo: 168
- Clement, bishop of Seville: 256–57
- Clermont, Council of (1095): 201
- Clothar I, Frankish king: 174–75
- Cluniac influence: 19–20, 201–02, 217, 221–22, 224
- reform: 59, 213, 229
- and Roman liturgy: 218–19
- Codex Emilianensis*: 176
- Codex Ouetensis*: 177
- Codex of Roda* see *Codex Rotensis*
- Codex Rotensis* (*Codex of Roda*): 96, 166–67, 171, 189, 264
- Codex Vigilanus*: 167, 176, 264
- Coimbra: 214
- Columba, Cordovan martyr: 119, 140, 142–43
- Constantine IV, Byzantine emperor: 82
- Constantine V, Byzantine emperor: 87
- Constantinople: 88–89
- continuity, Visigothic: 7–8, 19, 23, 156–70, 254–59, 261, 264
- legitimacy, defining: 170–94, 199–200
- contravivencia*: 40
- conversion to Islam: 114
- convivencia*: 16, 28–29, 37, 39–40, 57–58, 266
- Coptic history: 17–18, 73, 80, 128, 132
- Córdoba: 35, 105, 166, 168, 249, 255
- battle of (1236): 225
- caliphate, dissolution of: 56, 220
- Christians: 17–18, 40, 45, 135; see also martyrdom movement, Cordovan
- conveniencia*: 40
- languages: 124–25

- martyrs *see* martyrdom movement,
 Cordovan
 reconquest of: 5, 11, 32, 36, 200, 218, 225
 social change: 125–26
 Umayyad regime: 5, 100, 103, 113–24,
 191, 232; *see also individual rulers*
 Coria: 217
 Covadonga: 1
 battle of (718 or 722): 161, 165, 183,
 198, 255
 crusader influence: 19–20, 201, 213, 259
 Cyprian of Carthage, saint: 136
 Cyrus, patriarch of Alexandria: 86
 Cyrus of Ḥarrān: 132

 Daḥḥāk of Mar Sabas, martyr: 130
 Damascus: 106, 126, 157, 167–68
 Daniel, biblical prophet: 93–95, 97,
 107–10, 264
 Dar al-Islam: 9
De expugnatione Scalabis: 223
 Desclot, Bernard, *Chronicle*: 58
dhimmīs: 114, 117, 121, 124–25, 128,
 132–33, 144
 Digna, Cordovan martyr: 142
 Diocletian, Roman emperor: 134
 Dionysius of Tel-Mahrē: 89–90
 Dominicus Gundissalinus: 20
 De processione mundi: 234–35, 238
 Duero, Valley of: 37–38, 155, 172, 186,
 213–14
 Dulcidius of Toledo: 156
 Paulus, Visigothic noble: 13

Easter Chronicle see Chronicon Paschale
 Écija: 119
 eclipses, solar: 105
 Egica, Visigothic king: 102, 105, 171, 182,
 252, 255
 Egypt: 85–86
 and martyrdom literature: 116, 125,
 127–28, 132
 see also Coptic history
 Einhard, *Life of Charlemagne*: 159, 207
 Eiras, Church of San Salvador: 177
 Ejea: 168
 Elche: 83
 Elias, Cordovan martyr: 118
 Elipandus, bishop of Toledo: 120

 Elvira, wife of Raymond of Toulouse: 259
 Emeterius, saint: 136
 Enrique I, king of Castile: 249
 Ervig, Visigothic king: 92, 105
 eschatology: 5, 114
españolía: 16
 Estella: 167
Estoria de España: 12, 58, 60–62, 228, 249
 Eterius, bishop of Osma: 120
 Eugenia, Cordovan martyr: 150
 Eugenius II, archbishop of Toledo: 134
 Eulalia of Augusta Emerita *see* Eulalia of
 Mérida
 Eulalia of Barcelona, saint: 135–36
 Eulalia of Mérida, saint: 135, 138–43
 Eulogius of Córdoba: 67, 116–24, 126, 132,
 156
 Apologeticus martyrum: 18, 43, 114–15,
 145, 147
 death and remains: 141–42, 149–50
 Documentum martyriale: 18, 45, 114–15
 election as bishop of Toledo: 122
 and Georgius of Bethlehem: 127–29
 hagiography, knowledge of: 135–43
 and Iberian unity: 133
 imprisonment of: 122
 and Leocritia, martyr: 141
 and martyrdom, validity of: 144–50
 Memoriale sanctorum: 13, 18, 114–15,
 122–23, 127–29, 131, 136, 138, 140,
 142–45
 Euric, Visigothic king: 33–34
 Eusebius of Caesarea: 42–43, 54n.23, 75,
 229
 Historia ecclesiastica: 67

 Fáfila, king of Asturias: 186
 Fandila, Cordovan martyr: 138, 142
 Faustus, saint: 135, 137
 Félix, Cordovan martyr: 118
 Felix of Barcelona, saint: 135
 Felix of Gerona, saint: 136
 Fernán González: 50
 Fernando I, king of León and Castile:
 68n.68, 150, 195–96, 213–14, 219
 and Battle of Viséu: 204–05
 and Cluniacs: 222
 Fernando III, king of León and Castile:
 32–33, 57, 225, 229, 249–50

- Córdoba, entry into: 36, 219
 Fidel, Greek physician: 84
 Flora, Cordovan martyr: 115, 138
 Fortūn bin Mūsa: 168
 Fortūn Garcés, king of Pamplona: 166
Forum Iudicum see *Liber Iudiciorum*
 Fragellas: 140
 Franco, Francisco: 27, 39, 55, 197
 Fredegar: 105
 Frederick II, king of Italy: 57
 Fredoarius, bishop of Guadix: 76
 Fructuosus, bishop of Tarraco: 140
 Fruela, Asturian ambassador to Franks: 160
 Fruela I, king of Asturias: 187–88, 191
 Fruela II, king of Asturias: 32
Fuero juzgo see *Liber Iudiciorum*
fueros: 172
- Gades see Cádiz
 Galicia (Gallaecia): 81, 149, 183, 187–89, 206, 213, 216, 239
 García I, king of Pamplona: 167
 García Íñiguez, king of Pamplona: 166
 García, king of Galicia and Portugal: 206
 García Ramírez, king of Navarre: 216
Genealogies of Roda: 15
General historia: 12
 George the Archdeacon: 132
 Georgius of Bethlehem: 127–29, 148–49, 158
 Gerard of Cremona, *The Book of Causes*: 231–32
 Gerona: 136, 164
Gesta Comitum Barcinonensium: 15
 Gibraltar: 83
grammatica: 65–66
 Granada: 5, 11
 Gregory, nephew of Heraclius: 106
 Gregory VII, pope: 222, 258
 Gregory of Tours: 105
Historia Francorum: 183–84, 206
 Guadalete: 242
 Guadix: 76, 119
 Gunderic, Vandal king: 215
- Hadrian I, pope: 121
 Hafs ibn al-Walid, governor of Egypt: 128
 hagiography: 18, 45–46, 61, 84, 126, 262
passiones: 133–44, 149–50
vitae: 133, 136–37, 148
 see also Alvar, Paul, *Vita Eulogii*;
 martyrdom, Cordovan
- Halevi, Jehuda: 20
Kuzari: 233
Sepher Yetzirah (*Book of Creation*): 233–34, 237–38
- Heraclius, Byzantine emperor: 77, 88, 91, 96, 98
 defeat of Persia: 107–08
 heresy: 84–85, 129
 Hermenesinda, daughter of Pelagius: 171, 186
- Hishām, Umayyad caliph: 74, 77
 Hishām I, Córdoba emir: 160
Hispana see *Liber Canonum*
Hispanic Passionary: 132, 134, 136, 150
Historia de rebus Hispanie: 151, 224–25
Historia Roderici (*The Latin Chronicle of the Cid*): 54, 60
Historia Silensis (*Legionensis*): 2, 13, 43, 45, 195, 213–16
 on liturgy: 219
 reconquest ideology: 19, 201, 204–05
 sources: 154, 196
- History of the Arabs*: 77
History of the Patriarchs: 132
 Horace: 137
 Huesca: 119, 164, 168
 Hydatius, bishop of Chaves, *Chronicle*: 34, 42, 54n.23, 81, 110
- Ianuarius, saint: 135, 137
 Ibn al-Qūṭīyya: 16, 103, 241
 Ibn 'Arabī, *Conquest of Mecca*: 232
 Ibn Dawūd: 234
 Ibn Gabirol (Avicbron): 20, 232, 236, 238
Fons Vitae: 234, 237
 Ildefonsus (Ildefonso), archbishop of Toledo: 67, 217, 256
De viris illustribus (*Of Learned Men*): 64, 136
Treatise on the Virginity of Mary: 64–65
Infantes de Lara: 50
 Íñigo Arista, king of Pamplona: 166, 168, 191
- ipsedad*: 56
 Iraq: 116, 125
 Isaac, Cordovan martyr: 118, 131, 142, 144

- Isaac the Blind: 234
- Isabella, queen of Aragon and Castile: 29n.58
- Isidore of Seville, saint: 4, 20, 31, 71, 121, 227, 229, 251
Chronicle: 13, 30, 54n.23, 64, 154
De fide catholica contra judaeos: 110
De officiis ecclesiasticis: 110
De ortu et obitu partum: 110
De rerum naturae: 123
De viris illustribus (*Of Learned Men*): 64, 66, 136
Etymologies: 14, 41–42, 66–67, 179, 182, 211
 and Fourth Council of Toledo: 176
Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Sueuorum: 4, 11–13, 33–34, 64, 82, 215
 and *Chronicle of 754*: 74–75
 nationalism: 30, 34–36, 206, 209–10
 as source: 13–14, 42, 77–78, 107, 154, 226
 sources of: 34, 239
 on liturgy: 110, 218, 256, 258
 political thought: 202, 204, 206, 209–11, 213
 and Prudentius: 134
Quaestiones in Vetus testamentum: 109
 as saint: 45, 217, 222
Synonyms: 64
- Jaca: 165–66
- Jacobite (West Syrian) history: 17, 73, 80, 89–90, 95
- Jaén: 32
- James the Moorslayer, saint: 197
- Jaume I, king of Aragon: 178
- Jeremia, Cordovan martyr: 118
- Jerome, saint: 42–43, 71, 75, 136, 229
- Jerusalem: 89, 96–99, 106–07, 126, 259
- jihād*: 197
- Jimena, wife of Alfonso III: 166
- Jiménez de Rada, Rodrigo, archbishop of Toledo
 as grand chancellor of Castile: 224
Historia de rebus Hispanie: 2–3, 8, 10–11, 13, 23, 35–36, 219
 and Castile, secular power of: 227–30, 244, 259, 263–66
- date: 224
 division of: 226
 and early history: 238–44, 264–65
 manuscripts: 224–25
 narrative models: 61–62
 Neoplatonism of: 235–38, 243
 philosophy of history: 20–21
 sources: 14, 154, 226–27, 235, 238, 241–43
 terminology: 32
 and Toledo, pre-eminence of: 227–28, 249–60, 263, 265
 Uclés, battle at: 37
 as inventor of Castile: 224–27
- jizyah*: 144
- John VIII, pope: 257
- John of Biclar, *Chronicle*: 30, 64, 66, 74–75, 77, 91, 107, 208–09
 and *Chronicle of 741*: 74–75, 77–78
- John of Damascus: 132
Disputation between a Saracen and a Christian: 129
Fount of Knowledge: 129
- John of Nikiu, *Universal Chronicle*: 85–86
- John the Deacon: 132
- Jordanes, *Getica*: 206
- Juan, bishop of Seville: 256
- Juan de Osma, *Chronica latina regum Castellae*: 32, 219, 247, 249
- Juan Hispano, dean of Toledo: 235
- Juan of Soria, bishop of Osma and Burgos: 248–49
- Julian, bishop of Toledo: 66
Historia Wambae regis: 4–5, 13, 30, 36, 205, 211, 226
- Julian, Visigothic count: 212, 255
- Julian of Antioch, saint: 136
- Julius Africanus: 42–43
- Justin I, Byzantine emperor: 91
- Justin II, Byzantine emperor: 92
- Justinian I, Byzantine emperor: 81–84, 208
- Juvenal: 137
- Kairawan: 71
- Láin Calvo: 225
- language of chronicles: 12, 14, 16–17; *see also* philology
- Lateran Council IV (1215): 250

The Latin Chronicle of the Cid see *Historia Roderici*

law, Visigothic: 18

branches of law: 175–77

and Byzantines: 82–83

and fall of Visigothic kingdom: 174

and Frankish kings: 164–65

gens/populus: 183–84

and kings, conduct of: 185–94

legal manuscripts, circulation of: 19

and ninth-century manuscripts: 177–78

and peace: 178–83, 193

and political sovereignty: 24, 162–63

and rulers, legitimacy of: 171–85

‘*Titulus Primus*’: 178, 190

see also *Lex Wisigothorum*; *ordo Gothorum*

Leander, bishop of Seville: 227, 251, 256, 258

Leo III, Byzantine emperor: 74, 87

Leo IV, Byzantine emperor: 87

Leocadia of Toledo, saint: 135

Leocritia, Cordovan martyr: 140–41, 150

León: 8, 13, 20–21, 25, 32, 41, 67–69, 120

abbeys: 59

as centre of power: 17, 47, 58–59, 155, 202

Cluniac influence: 201–02, 217, 229

and Cordovan martyrs: 149–52

foundation of: 203

and Isidore of Seville: 45

Latin, use of: 56

notarial documents: 55

reconquista, ideology of: 196–206, 212–22

and Church: 216–22

rhythm of rebellion and pacification: 203–05

and royal power: 205–06, 215–16

royal see: 19, 172, 195

and Visigothic continuity: 116

see also *individual rulers*

Leovigild, Visigothic king: 30, 84, 171, 209–10

Leovigildus, Cordovan martyr: 137

Lex Salica: 174–75, 191

Lex Wisigothorum: 19–20, 156, 162, 165, 170, 185–86, 190, 202

branches of law: 176–77

circulation: 177–78

earliest mention: 172

and kings, conduct of: 189, 203, 205, 223, 263

and peace: 179–80, 182

Liber Aristotelis de expositione bonitatis purae see *Liber de causis*

Liber Canonum (Hispana): 176–77

Liber de causis (Liber Aristotelis de expositione bonitatis purae): 231, 237–38, 243

Liber Iudiciorum (Forum Iudicum; Fuero juzgo): 176–77, 179, 264

Liber ordinum see *Calendar of Córdoba*

Liber regum: 12, 15, 223

Lisbon: 160

liturgy: 152, 218–19

Lives of the Fathers of Mérida: 149

Lleida: 169

Logroño: 220

Lope (Lup), son of Mūsa bin Mūsa: 168, 192

Lope bin Muḥammad: 169

Lorca: 103

Louis the Pious, Frankish king: 160, 164

Lucas of Tuy, *Chronicon mundi*: 2, 8, 226–27, 259

linguistic issues: 35–37

narrative models: 61–62

prologue: 42–43

on royal legitimacy: 193–94, 212

sources: 13–14, 154

Lusitania: 84

Maḥamud, *mūwallad* from Mérida: 187

Maimonides

More Nebukhim (Guide for the Perplexed): 233

Sepher ha-Madda' (Book of Knowledge): 233

Malaca (Málaga): 82

Málaga see Malaca

Mar Sabas: 127, 129–30

Marcial, saint: 135, 137

Maria, Cordovan martyr: 115, 138

Marinids: 216

martyrdom movement, Cordovan: 6, 18, 45, 114, 137, 266

aims of: 118, 126, 130–33

gender treatment: 142–43

- and Georgius of Bethlehem: 127–29
 Latin, use of: 124
 and León: 149–52
 as minority: 120–24
 miracles: 148–49
 origins of: 116–19, 130–33
 participants: 115, 118–19, 131
 validity of martyrdom: 144–51
 and Visigothic continuity: 116
see also Eulogius of Córdoba, *Apologeticus martyrum*, *Documentum martyriale*, *Memoriale sanctorum*
- Maurecatus (Mauregato), king of Asturias: 43, 188
- Maurice, Byzantine emperor: 91, 96, 208
- Maximian, Roman emperor: 134
- Maximus, bishop of Saragossa: 66
- Meir Halevi Abulafia: 233
- Melkites: 18, 99n.108, 125, 132
- Mérida: 83–84, 103, 138, 187, 215, 257
- mester de clerecía*: 50
- methodological approach of this volume: 2–3, 8–17
- Michael I, Coptic patriarch: 132
- Michael of Mar Saba, martyr: 130
- Migetius, theologian: 120
- Monophysitism: 17, 80, 84–85
- Mozarabs: 18–19, 21, 41
 historiographical tradition: 71–116
 sources: 77, 85–86, 90–92
 see also apocalyptic literature and discourse; Byzantines, and chronicles; *Chronicle of 741*; *Chronicle of 754*; *Prophetic Chronicle*
 and Latin: 55–56, 67, 69
 penitential system: 131
 terminology: 21–23, 45
- Muḥammad, Prophet: 43, 78, 90, 93, 107–08, 119, 130, 197, 264
 and *Apologeticus martyrum*: 115
 Christ, compared to: 121
 and Cordovan martyrs: 143–45, 147–48
- Muḥammad I, Cordovan emir: 128
- Muḥammad bin Lope: 169
- mundus inversus*: 99–99, 264
- Munnuza, governor of Gijón: 255
- Murcia: 200
- Mūsa bin Mūsa Banū Qāsi: 166, 168, 191–92
- Mūsa ibn Nuṣayr: 100–03
- Muṭarrif, brother of Lope bin Muḥammad: 169
- muwalladūn*: 17
- Nahmanides: 234
- Nájera: 167, 196
 Santa María la Real: 224
- Nanctus, North African abbot: 84
- Naranco: 189
- Narbonne: 164
 Council of (589): 83
- Natalia *see* Sabigotho
- nationalism: 30–31
- Navarre: 137, 163–65, 167, 169, 176
- Navas de Tolosa, battle of (1212): 5, 219, 221, 225, 230, 240, 243–44, 248–50
- Nebrija, Sancho de: 226
- Neo-Gothic terminology: 21, 23–24
- Neoplatonism: 20, 232–38, 243
- Nepocianus, Asturian count: 189
- Nerva, Roman emperor: 203
- Nestorians: 121
- Niebla: 200
- Nikephoros, patriarch of Constantinople, *Short History*: 77, 88
- Nunilo, Cordovan martyr: 119, 142
- Nuño Rasura: 225
- Odilard, monk of Saint-Germain-des-Prés: 148
- Olite: 168
- Onneca, daughter of Fortún Garcés: 166–67
- Oppa, bishop of Toledo: 7–8, 102, 183, 252, 254–55
- ordo Gothorum* (*Gothorum ordinem*): 160–62, 175, 181
- Ordoña: 165
- Ordoño I, king of Asturias: 149, 154, 166, 168, 183, 192
 legitimacy of: 186–89
- Ordoño II, king of Asturias-León: 19, 149, 167–69, 214
 transfer of royal see: 195, 257
- Oreja: 218
- Orihuela: 103
- Orosius: 61, 71, 239

- Historia adversum paganos libri septem*: 67, 109, 207–08
 Osma: 219
 Oviedo: 149–50, 155–56, 160, 162, 262
 royal see: 19, 172, 177, 187, 195, 199, 228, 257–59
 San Salvador basilica: 171, 177
- Palencia: 219
 Palestine: 85
 martyrdom literature: 18, 116–17, 125–26, 132, 144, 262
 Paris, University of: 231
Passio Sancti Pelagii: 149
Passionary of Cardeña: 134
Passionary of Silos: 134, 150
Passionary of Valdeavellano: 134
 Paul, brother of Eulogius: 137
 Paul, Greek physician: 84
 Paul the Deacon,
 Historia Langobardorum: 206
 Paulus, Visigothic duke: 182
 Paulus Diaconus: 105
 Pedro, duke of Cantabria: 171
 Pedro II, king of Aragon: 249
 Pelagius (Pelayo), Asturian leader: 7–8, 153, 161, 165, 254–55
 as founder of Asturian dynasty: 171–72, 182–83, 186, 191, 196, 242
 Pelagius, saint: 149–51
 Pelayo *see* Pelagius (Pelayo), Asturian leader
 Pelayo, bishop of Oviedo: 172
 Corpus Pelagianum: 195, 201, 206, 216, 226
 Perfectus, Cordovan martyr: 138, 142
Peristephanon see Prudentius
 Peter the Monk: 95–96
 Philip VI, king of Spain: 266
 philology: 16–17, 261
 and epic poetry: 48–54
 and European Romantic scholarship: 47–49, 57
 and isolation: 56
 and Latin chronicles: 16–17, 51–54, 57–58, 60–69
 and Latin, Classical: 50–51
 and Latin, vulgar: 55–56
 see also grammatica; rhetorica
 Phocas, Byzantine emperor: 88, 96
- Pippin the Short, Frankish king: 164, 175
 Plasencia: 219
 Plotinus, *Enneads*: 231
Poem of Almería: 216
Poema de Alfonso XI: 50
Poema de Mío Cid: 49, 53n.21, 54, 63
 Pomposa, Cordovan martyr: 140, 142–43
 Pravia: 188
 Proclus, *Elements of Theology*: 232
 Procopius: 105
Prophetic Chronicle (Prophetica): 19, 96, 156–59, 263
 Prosper: 75
 Prudentius, *Peristephanon*: 133–34, 136–40, 142, 146
 Pseudo-Ephraem: 95
 Pseudo-Methodius, *Apocalypse*: 95–96, 99, 107–08
- quadrivium*: 66
- Ramiro Garcés, king of Viguera: 167
 Ramiro I, king of Asturias: 189
 Ramiro II, king of León: 214
 Ramiro III, king of León: 151, 195
 Ramón Berenguer IV, count of Barcelona: 216
 Raqqāda 2003/20: 71
 Raymond, archbishop of Toledo: 218
 Raymond of Sauvetât: 229–30
 Raymond of Toulouse: 259
 Reccafred, bishop of Córdoba: 121–22
 Reccared I, Visigothic king: 30, 74, 171, 208–10, 217–18
 Reccemundus, bishop of Elvira: 135
 Recceswinth, Visigothic king: 105, 154
reconquista (reconquest) of Spain: 1, 32, 38
 centrality to Spanish history: 196–98
 and Cluniac influence: 201–02, 213, 217, 221–22
 and Leónese chronicles *see* León, ideology of *reconquista*
 as political enterprise: 200
 as term: 198
 as territorial war: 200–01
 Renovatus, bishop of Emerita: 149
rhetorica: 63–65, 203
 Ribagorza: 165–66
 Rioja: 168–69

- Ripoll: 59
 Rodrigo, Visigothic king: 7–8, 164, 171, 211–1, 241–42
 unlawful conduct of: 185–86, 189
 Rodrigo Sánchez de Arévalo, *Compendiosa historia hispanica*: 12
 Rogellius, monk: 145
romancero: 49, 52
 Rudericus, Cordovan martyr: 115, 119, 150
- Sabigotho (Natalia), Cordovan martyr: 118–19, 129, 142, 148–49
 Sabinianus, Cordovan martyr: 138
 Saint-Germain-des-Prés: 148
 Salomon, Cordovan martyr: 115, 119, 150
 Sampiro, notary of Bermudo II, bishop of Astorga, *Chronicon Pelagianum*: 19, 64n.50, 181, 193, 195–96, 213, 215, 226
 San Estaban de Gormaz, battle of (917): 214
 San Juan de la Peña: 165–66
 San Martín of Albelda: 153
 San Pedro de Cardena: 37
 San Roque *see* Carteya
 Sancha, wife of Fernando I: 196
 Sancha, wife of Ordoño II: 167
 Sancho Garcés I, king of Pamplona: 166–67, 176
 Sancho II, king of Castile: 206
 Sancho II, king of Pamplona: 167, 196
 Sancho III the Great, king of Navarre: 35, 166, 222, 263
 Sancho VII, king of Navarre: 220, 245, 249
 Santarém: 223
 Santiago de Compostela: 36
 Saragossa (Caesar-augusta): 19, 139, 159
 Scotus, Michael: 230
 Sebastian, saint: 136
 Sebeos, bishop, *History*: 73, 87, 90, 93–94, 98, 105–08
sennorío: 61
 Septimania: 83, 103, 164–65, 178
 Servus-Dei, Cordovan martyr: 145
 settlement patterns: 37–38, 172
 Seville: 17–18, 254–57
 and Isidore of Seville: 45
 reconquest of: 5, 11, 32, 200, 218
 Second Council of (619): 85, 90
Siete Partidas: 33
- Sigüenza: 219
 Silo, king of Asturias: 188
 Simancas, battle of (939): 214
 Sindered, archbishop of Toledo: 256
 Sisenandus, Cordovan martyr: 138
 Sisenand, Visigothic king: 176
 Smbat Bagratuni: 90–91
 Sobrarbe: 165–66
Song of Roland: 48
Song of the Nibelungs: 48
 Sophronius, patriarch of Jerusalem: 93–94
 Spanish-American War (1898): 26
 Spanish Civil War: 27, 54, 59
specula principum: 47
 Speraindeo, abbot: 121
 Suinthila, Visigothic king: 74, 82, 204, 209
 Syria: 41, 74–75, 85–86, 106–08, 232
 and administrative language: 124
 and Adoptionism: 121
 civil war: 101
 and crusades: 259
 martyrdom literature: 18, 116–17, 125–26, 132, 144, 262
 see also Jacobite (West Syrian) history;
 Theophilus of Edessa, *Syriac Common Source*
Syriac Common Source see Theophilus of Edessa
- Tabanos: 128–29, 142
 Talavera: 256
 Tāriq, Muslim commander: 35, 103, 255
 Tāriq bin Ziyad: 158, 205, 212
 Tarraconensis: 136, 164, 204
 Tarragona: 83, 85, 257
 Tarrazona: 168
 terminology
 gens/populus: 183–84
 Mozarabic vs Neo-Gothic: 21–24
 Spain vs Iberia: 24–37
 see also *ordo Gothorum*
Testamentum: 170–71, 181–82
 Theodemir, lord of Murcia: 103
 Theodosius, Roman emperor: 204
The Theology of Aristotle: 232, 237
 Theophanes the Confessor, *Chronicle*: 77, 88–89, 93, 98, 106–07
 Theophilus of Edessa, *Syriac Common Source*: 89, 107

- Theresa, countess of Portugal: 206
 Theresa, sister of Alfonso V: 151
 Three Saints, as named by Prudentius
 (Faustus, Ianuarius, Marcial): 135, 137
 Thyrsus, saint: 136
 Tiberias, Roman emperor: 207
 Toledo: 23, 67, 72, 76, 120, 122, 161, 169,
 245–46
 and Byzantium: 82
 Councils: 121, 264
 III (589): 32, 209
 IV (633): 90, 176, 181, 209, 213
 V (636): 90
 VIII (653): 105
 XI (675): 90
 XV (688): 90
 ecclesiastical primacy of: 20–21, 227–28,
 250–60
 Jews in: 57, 230, 233, 249–50
 fall of: 100, 102, 256
 recapture of: 216–17, 225, 241, 250, 258
 translating activity: 229–34
 Toulouse: 166–67, 208
 battle of (721): 74
 Traducta (Algeciras): 82
 Transcaucasia: 90, 107
translatio imperii
 Roman to Visigothic: 30, 204, 209
 Visigothic to Arab: 5, 7, 204
 treaties: 102–03
trivium: 66
 Tudela: 167–68
- Ubeda, battle of (1234): 225
 Uclés, battle of (1108): 37
 Umar, Arab leader: 93
 Umar II, Umayyad caliph: 128
 ‘Umar ibn Ḥafṣūn: 16
 Umayyads: 5, 85–86, 94, 107; *see also*
 Córdoba, Umayyad regime
 Umayyah: 101
 Urban II, pope: 201, 259
 Urban, archbishop of Toledo: 256
 Urraca, mother of Alfonso VII: 216, 220
Usatges: 178
 Usuard, monk of Saint-Germain-des-Prés,
 Martyrologue: 148–49
- Valencia: 200
- Valentinian, Roman emperor: 207
 Vandals: 83, 109–10, 210, 215
 Varaztirots, Armenian governor: 91
 Venerius, bishop of Complutum: 119
 Victor of Tunnuna: 42–43, 75, 91
 Vincent of Saragossa, saint: 140
 Virgil, *Aeneid*: 137
 Viseu, battle of (1037): 204–05
Vita Hludowici: 159–60
Vita Sancti Theotonii: 223
Vitae sanctorum patrum Emeretensium: 84
 Vizcaya: 165, 254
 Vouillé: 208
- Walid I, Umayyad caliph: 76
 Walid II, Umayyad caliph: 74
 Wamba, Visigothic king: 13, 182, 193, 211
 Wilfred, count of Barcelona: 169
 Wistremirus, bishop of Toledo: 122
 Wistremundus, Cordovan martyr: 138
 Witesindus, Cordovan martyr: 118
 Witiza, Visigothic king: 7, 92, 103, 164,
 171, 188, 212, 254–55
 unlawful conduct of: 185–86, 189,
 212–13
- Yūsuf ibn Tāshufīn, ruler of Toledo: 205
- Zaragoza: 100, 168, 177, 191
 Zayd, king of Valencia: 220–21
 Zoilus, saint: 134–35, 137–38, 141

CURSOR MUNDI

All volumes in this series are evaluated by an Editorial Board, strictly on academic grounds, based on reports prepared by referees who have been commissioned by virtue of their specialism in the appropriate field. The Board ensures that the screening is done independently and without conflicts of interest. The definitive texts supplied by authors are also subject to review by the Board before being approved for publication. Further, the volumes are copyedited to conform to the publisher's stylebook and to the best international academic standards in the field.

Titles in series

Chris Jones, *Eclipse of Empire? Perceptions of the Western Empire and its Rulers in Late-Medieval France* (2007)

Simha Goldin, *The Ways of Jewish Martyrdom* (2008)

Franks, Northmen, and Slavs: Identities and State Formation in Early Medieval Europe, ed. by Ildar H. Garipzanov, Patrick J. Geary, and Przemysław Urbańczyk (2008)

William G. Walker, *'Paradise Lost' and Republican Tradition from Aristotle to Machiavelli* (2009)

Carmela Vircillo Franklin, *Material Restoration: A Fragment from Eleventh-Century Echternach in a Nineteenth-Century Parisian Codex* (2010)

Saints and their Lives on the Periphery: Veneration of Saints in Scandinavia and Eastern Europe (c.1000-1200), ed. by Haki Antonsson and Ildar H. Garipzanov (2010)

Approaching the Holy Mountain: Art and Liturgy at St Catherine's Monastery in the Sinai, ed. by Sharon E. J. Gerstel and Robert S. Nelson (2011)

'This Earthly Stage': World and Stage in Late Medieval and Early Modern England, ed. by Brett D. Hirsch and Christopher Wortham (2011)

Alan J. Fletcher, *The Presence of Medieval English Literature: Studies at the Interface of History, Author, and Text in a Selection of Middle English Literary Landmarks* (2012)

Vehicles of Transmission, Translation, and Transformation in Medieval Textual Culture, ed. by Robert Wisnovsky, Faith Wallis, Jamie C. Fumo, and Carlos Fraenkel (2012)

Claudio Moreschini, *Hermes Christianus: The Intermingling of Hermetic Piety and Christian Thought* (2011)

The Faces of the Other: Religious Rivalry and Ethnic Encounters in the Later Roman World, ed. by Majastina Kahlos (2011)

Barbara Furlotti, *A Renaissance Baron and his Possessions: Paolo Giordano I Orsini, Duke of Bracciano (1541–1585)* (2012)

Rethinking Virtue, Reforming Society: New Directions in Renaissance Ethics, c. 1350–c. 1650, ed. by David A. Lines and Sabrina Ebbersmeyer (2013)

Wendy Turner, *Care and Custody of the Mentally Ill, Incompetent, and Disabled in Medieval England* (2013)

Luigi Andrea Berto, *The Political and Social Vocabulary of John the Deacon's 'Istoria Veneticorum'* (2013)

Writing Down the Myths, ed. by Joseph Falaky Nagy (2013)

Tanya S. Lenz, *Dreams, Medicine, and Literary Practice: Exploring the Western Literary Tradition Through Chaucer* (2013)

Charles Russell Stone, *From Tyrant to Philosopher-King: A Literary History of Alexander the Great in Medieval and Early Modern England* (2013)

Viking Archaeology in Iceland: Mosfell Archaeological Project, ed. by Davide Zori and Jesse Byock (2014)

Natalia I. Petrovskaia, *Medieval Welsh Perceptions of the Orient* (2015)

Fabrizio Ricciardelli, *The Myth of Republicanism in Renaissance Italy* (2015)

In preparation

Ersie C. Burke, *The Greeks of Venice, 1498–1600: Immigration, Settlement, and Integration*
The Mirror in Medieval and Early Modern Culture: Specular Reflections, ed. by Nancy M. Frelick

Ilan Shoval, *King John's Delegation to the Almohad Court (1212): Medieval Interreligious Interactions and Modern Historiography*

Graphic Signs of Identity, Faith, and Power in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages, ed. by Ildar Garipzanov, Caroline Goodson, and Henry Maguire

